



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
**Historical Resources Board**

DATE ISSUED: June 13, 2013 REPORT NO. HRB-13-033

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board  
Agenda of June 27, 2013

SUBJECT: **ITEM #12 – Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #1**

APPLICANT: Steven and Susanne Hilles Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 5166 Marlborough Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the residence located at 5166 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #1 located at 5166 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 80 square foot addition at the southwest corner of the house. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1928 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its asymmetrical façade, sand finish stucco, low-pitched Mission clay tile roof, exposed short angle-cut rafter tails, recessed partial width porch, decorative Claycraft tile, and wood lintel beams.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. This Spanish Eclectic house was built in 1928 in the Kensington Heights Unit 2 subdivision of the Kensington neighborhood. Today, the house is surrounded by single-family residences mostly reflecting the Spanish Eclectic style.

The historic name of the resource, the Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Paul and Nellie McCoy, who purchased the lot and constructed the house as a speculation house in 1928.

## ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Legacy 106, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

*CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

Constructed in 1928, this one-story Spanish Eclectic residence features an asymmetrical façade, cross-gabled roof configuration, and square shaped floor plan. A combination of roof forms are used on the house including a cross-gable roof sheathed in Mission clay tile at the front and a flat roof with parapet at the rear. A slight eave overhang and exposed rafter tails are found at the eaves of the gable roof. The exterior is clad in a textured stucco finish. Fenestration on the house is made up of a few original double hung windows and multi-light casement windows.

In the center of the asymmetrical front façade sits a partial width front porch recessed under a large wood beam and the main side-gable roof. The front porch is accessed by a stamped concrete walkway from the sidewalk, three rounded concrete steps and the original iron railing. Within the porch are two multi-light casement windows and the original side facing front door at the north side. To the right of the recessed front porch, a front facing gable projects containing an original decorative Claycraft tile depicting a Spanish style landscape above a picture window flanked by two multi-light casement windows slightly recessed within the stucco. Two additional multi-light casement windows are found to the left of the recessed porch.

The north (side) elevation is made up of a simple stucco chimney flanked by original double-hung wood windows. The south (side) elevation features a small recess containing a side entrance door below a metal awning, and an original double hung window. The rear of the house contains a pair of French doors and a single double hung window and a small addition with sliding windows at the southwest corner. Horizontal clay roof scuppers are found at the parapet throughout the flat roof portion of the house. The detached garage maintains its flat roof and parapet but has been converted to living space and now has a string of modern glass French doors at the front.

Few modifications have occurred over the years which do not impact the overall historic significance of this house. First, windows on the east and south facades have been restored to their original casement operations. When removing non-historic windows from the front and side facades, scarring was observed suggesting the original windows were casement in operation. While the light pattern is speculative, the windows have been restored to their original operation and are in their original openings. Second, a thin asbestos skim coat currently covers wood elements on the house. The wood elements have been painted brown to differentiate them from the stucco but the skim coat has still resulted in the loss of some integrity. Additional modifications include: a window opening at the southwest side has been reduced in sized, a few tiles have been installed at the front walkway, a site-wall added in 1967, in-kind replacement of the roof, and a small 80 square-foot addition at the southwest corner of the house.

Hugely popular following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition which revived the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture; the Spanish Eclectic style was the predominant

style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

The subject house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style, including the asymmetrical façade, sand finish stucco, low-pitched Mission clay tile roof, exposed short angle-cut rafter tails, recessed partial width porch, decorative Claycraft tile, and wood lintel beams. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

### OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

### CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #1 located at 5166 Marlborough Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Spanish Eclectic Architecture. The designation excludes the rear 80 square foot addition at the southwest corner of the house. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives



Sarah Vonesh  
Planning Intern



for

Cathy Winterrowd  
Assistant Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

SV/ks/cw

### Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover
3. Applicant's Historical Report Addendum

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A  
ADOPTED ON 6/27/2013

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/27/2013, to consider the historical designation of the **Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #1** (owned by Steven and Susanne Hilles Trust, 5166 Marlborough Dr., San Diego, CA 92116) located at **5166 Marlborough Drive, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **440-205-10-00**, further described as LOT 16 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Paul and Nellie McCoy Spec House #1 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1928 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its asymmetrical façade, sand finish stucco, low-pitched Mission clay tile roof, exposed short angle-cut rafter tails, recessed partial width porch, decorative Claycraft tile, and wood lintel beams. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 80 square foot addition at the southwest corner of the house.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
JOHN LEMMO, Chair  
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND  
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,  
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
CORRINE NEUFFER,  
Deputy City Attorney