



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 12, 2013 REPORT NO. HRB-13-044

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of September 26, 2013

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – William Chadwick Spec House #2**

APPLICANT: Jovanovic Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 3112 Grape Street, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the William Chadwick Spec House #2 located at 3112 Grape Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the William Chadwick Spec House #2 located at 3112 Grape Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1950s altered detached garage at the rear of the property. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1920 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features original wood clapboard siding with a wide and narrow pattern; low pitch gabled roof; wide eave overhang with exposed rafter tails; a partial width front porch with battered stucco columns; and fenestration consisting primarily of wood double hung and fixed windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a one story Craftsman style single family residence built in 1920 on the north side of Grape Street, just to the east of 31st Street in the Watkins and Biddle's Addition of the Greater Golden Hill Community.

The historic name of the resource, the William Chadwick Spec House #2, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of William Chadwick, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property is a one story Craftsman style bungalow built in 1920 of wood frame construction on a concrete foundation. The building exhibits a simple rectangular form and is clad in wood siding with a wide and narrow board pattern. The low pitch front gable roof form is sheathed in composition shingle and features wide overhanging eaves with exposed rafters and vertical slat attic vents at the gable ends. The partial width front porch features a front gabled roof supported by battered stucco columns. Fenestration consists primarily of wood double hung windows in 1 over 1 and 8 over 1 light patterns, and wood fixed windows of both single light and 8 over 1 divided light patterns – all with wood sills and wide wood plank style casings. The original Craftsman style front entry door continues the 8-light pattern of the windows with eight of its own glazed square panels.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties. One-story vernacular examples are often referred to as craftsman bungalows.

Modifications to the subject property are fairly minimal and impose little negative effect on the building's integrity as it relates to the 1920 period of significance. Sometime in the 1950s, the original single car detached rear garage facing the back alley was expanded. Modifications to the main residence include a shed roof extension over the northeast (rear) corner patio area; the addition of a small horizontal aluminum window at the east (side) elevation; a simple replacement square balustrade railing at the front porch; and the trimming back of the rafter tails by a few inches to accommodate a rain gutter system. A single rafter tail remains at its original length at the back of the east side of the front porch roof.

The limited modifications to the subject building do not alter its character defining features or significantly impair the integrity as it relates to the 1920 date of construction and period of significance. The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including the low pitch front gabled roof form; wood clapboard siding with distinct board pattern; wide unenclosed eaves with

exposed rafters; fenestration consisting of wood double hung and fixed windows; and the partial width front porch with battered stucco columns. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C, excluding the modified detached rear garage.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the William Chadwick Spec House #2 located at 3112 Grape Street be designated with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Craftsman style architecture. The designation excludes the 1950s altered detached garage at the rear of the property. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Planning Intern



Cathy Winterrowd
Interim Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

CP/jb/cw

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 9/26/2013

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/26/2013, to consider the historical designation of the **William Chadwick Spec House #2** (owned by Jovanovic Family Trust 09-12-11, 3112 Grape Street, San Diego, CA 92102) located at **3112 Grape Street, San Diego, CA 92102**, APN: **539-172-26-00**, further described as BLK 2 LOTS 3 & 4 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **William Chadwick Spec House #2** on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1920 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features original wood clapboard siding with a wide and narrow pattern; low pitch gabled roof; wide eave overhang with exposed rafter tails; a partial width front porch with battered stucco columns; and fenestration consisting primarily of wood double hung and fixed windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1950s altered detached garage at the rear of the property.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney