



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 12, 2013 REPORT NO. HRB-13-047

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of September 26, 2013

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – David and Beverly Reed House**

APPLICANT: Casey and Maybritt Haeling represented by Scott Moomjian

LOCATION: 1541 Garrison Place, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the David and Beverley Reed House located at 1541 Garrison Place as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the David and Beverley Reed House located at 1541 Garrison Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1955-1957 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Modern Contemporary style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1955-1957 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a strong, moderate-pitch front gabled roof form with wide overhanging eaves and distinctive clerestory; original vertical redwood siding and stone cladding; attached, drive-through two car garage; and fenestration consisting of wood fixed and casement windows as well as metal casement and jalousie windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a one story Modern Contemporary style single family residence built in 1955-1957 on the south side of Garrison Place in the Fleetridge Unit No. 2 subdivision in the Peninsula Community.

The historic name of the resource, the David and Beverley Reed House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of David and Beverly Reed, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one story Modern Contemporary style single family residence constructed in 1955. The building's overall form is irregular, asymmetrical and of wood frame construction on a concrete foundation. Exterior cladding is generally made up of vertical tongue and groove redwood siding, combined with one stone wall at the northwest elevation and a broad stone chimney at the east elevation. The front gabled roof forms are moderately pitched and present dramatic eave overhang with massive exposed purlins at the gable ends. Fenestration consists of wood fixed and casement windows as well as metal casement and jalousie windows. The gable ends of the east and west roof forms prominently display a clerestory of large plate glass wood fixed windows combined with some casement windows to provide ventilation.

The main (north) elevation visible from the public right of way is effectively divided by the drive-through attached two car garage with tilt up wood doors. Visible from the east side of this main elevation, is a windowless wall of the large "Play Room" and the wide stone chimney. The west side of the main elevation includes the main entrance to the house, accessed by the original wood entry door with a single narrow pane of mottled glass and a matching narrow sidelight. Next to the entry is a stone wall installed as part of a 1957 addition and with stonework matching that of the chimney at the east elevation. This 1957 addition was built shortly after initial construction, designed by the original architect (John Reed) and is determined to have gained historical significance in its own right. The resource's period of significance (1955-1957) has therefore been extended to include this 1957 addition.

As discussed in the *San Diego Modernism Historic Context Statement*, the Modern Contemporary sub-style was a popular design style for tract communities in the 1950s and 1960s. While clusters of Contemporary tracts retaining integrity should be considered for potential designation as districts, custom residential examples like the subject property may be eligible for individual designation. The style is primarily characterized by strong roof forms typically with deep overhangs; large windows, often aluminum framed; and non-traditional exterior finishes. The subject property exhibits all the primary character-defining features of the style. Some of the secondary character-defining features that the house exhibits are found in the angular massing; attached garage; and distinctive triangular forms seen especially in the gable ends.

Modifications to the subject property are relatively minor and do not greatly affect the building's integrity as it relates to its 1955-1957 period of significance. In 1984, a pool and spa were

constructed in the rear yard. Modifications also noted in the historical report include the replacement of a single door on the south (rear) elevation (2013); the removal of the original wood fence at the northeast corner of the property (post-2011); and the placement of a new wood fence with masonry wall at the northeast corner (2013). Other modifications were noted by staff upon a site visit and review of the architect's plans. First, the original cedar roof shingles have been replaced on the building. Second, a 30-inch high stone wall specified in the plans, located at the northwest elevation and designed to match the other stone wall of the 1957 addition, has been removed. Finally, it appears that a small casement window adjacent to the front door has been replaced.

Overall, the subject property retains good integrity to its 1955-1957 date of construction and period of significance. The limited modifications do not alter the building's character defining features or significantly impair the design, materials, workmanship or feeling aspects of integrity. The house continues to convey the historic significance of Modern Contemporary style architecture by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style, including a strong, moderate-pitch front gabled roof form with wide overhanging eaves and distinctive clerestory; original vertical redwood siding and stone cladding; attached, drive-through two car garage; and fenestration consisting of wood fixed and casement windows as well as metal casement and jalousie windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property was designed by architect John Reed. Reed has not yet been established as a Master Architect by the Historical Resources Board, and the applicant's report makes no argument for that establishment. However, the applicant's report does assert that Reed's capacity as an associate in the office of Master Architect Sim Bruce Richards at the time of the building's design phase warrants the property's designation under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of Richards'. Staff disagrees, and finds that designation with this level of association with a Master Architect is wholly inappropriate. Without firm evidence of Richards' involvement in the design of the subject resource, staff cannot recommend its designation under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of Master Architect Sim Bruce Richards.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the David and Beverly Reed House located at 1541 Garrison Place be designated with a period of significance of 1955-1957 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Modern Contemporary style architecture. Designation brings with it the responsibility of

maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Planning Intern



Cathy Winterrowd
Interim Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

CP/jb/cw

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 9/26/2013

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/26/2013, to consider the historical designation of the **David and Beverly Reed House** (owned by Casey and Maybritt Haeling, 1541 Garrison Place, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **1541 Garrison Place, San Diego, CA 92106**, APN: **530-213-01-00**, further described as LOT 160 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **David and Beverly Reed House** on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Modern Contemporary style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1955-1957 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a strong, moderate-pitch front gabled roof form with wide overhanging eaves and distinctive clerestory; original vertical redwood siding and stone cladding; attached, drive-through two car garage; and fenestration consisting of wood fixed and casement windows as well as metal casement and jalousie windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney