

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF FEBRUARY 27, 2014
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:10PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Absent
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Absent
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Interim Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Junior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR October 24, 2013, December 11, 2013 and January 23, 2013

Minutes were not available

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Micaela Porte – is opposed to building stuff on the beach including the proposed Law Street Beach Canyon life guard station. Why isn't Pacific Beach a cultural resource? There are no historic reviews in Pacific Beach.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Larimer notified Staff he would not be in attendance. Vice-Chair Garbini may have a meeting conflict and will try to be in attendance

• **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Correspondence for Item 7
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

• **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 5 – GEORGE GANS SPEC HOUSE

ITEM 10 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG)

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE ON CONSENT PURSUANT TO STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION ITEM 5 AND ITEM 10; WITH THE REVISION TO THE RESOLUTION AS JUST STATED BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE FOR ITEM 5 AND WITH BOARDMEMBER BERGE'S RECOMMENDED EMPHASIS ON THE IMPORTANCE OF THE IDENTIFICATION OF THE MEXICAN-AMERICAN CULTURAL LANDSCAPE IN THE REPORT FOR ITEM 10

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – GEORGE GANS SPEC HOUSE #5

Applicant: William Turner and Carolyn Muhlstein

Location: 3125 Bancroft Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3125 Bancroft Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George Gans Spec House #5 located at 3125 Bancroft Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925-1926 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the modified detached garage at the rear of the property.

Report Number: HRB 14-010

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 6 – HENRY G. FENTON HOUSE

Applicant: Monique Jackson represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2630 Chatsworth Boulevard, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2630 Chatsworth Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Henry G. Fenton House located at 2630 Chatsworth Boulevard as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922-1951 under HRB Criterion B.

Report Number: HRB 14-011

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Chair Lemmo has enjoyed looking at this house for thirty years. Cannot go anywhere in the City or County without seeing something connected to H.G. Fenton or his family.

Boardmember Berge questioned if this is the best property to designate for Fenton. She would like to add "beloved old timer" to the resolution.

Boardmember Silvas thinks it would be good to get a map of the City. Asked if we will see any designations in the San Pasqual area?

Boardmember Bethke thinks the report and resolution needs to better reflect county-wide significance.

Boardmember Marrone agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Chair Lemmo agrees with Boardmember Bethke.

Boardmember Baksh agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods also agrees with Boardmember Bethke. She thinks Justine Fenton should also be included as she gave land in San Pasqual to the City.

Boardmember Rivera has a hard time designating under Criterion B if a person is not more well rounded e.g. successful, civically engaged and/or impactful. She does not support designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO SEND THE REPORT BACK TO THE CONSULTANT TO FLESH OUT AND EXPLICITLY EXPLAIN WHY FENTON WAS IMPORTANT, BEGINNING WITH THE WAY HE CAME AS AN ORPHAN. THERE ARE THE NEWSPAPER ARTICLES THAT TELL HOW HE HAD PEOPLE THAT WERE IMPORTANT IN HIS LIFE AND PERHAPS EVEN FIND SOME PEOPLE WHO CAN SAY HE WAS “MY MENTOR”, TO REALLY SHOW US THE IMPACT. THE MOST IMPORTANT THING THAT STANDS OUT IN TERMS OF WHEN HE ACTUALLY LIVED IN THE LA JOLLA HOUSE IS THAT RANCH AND THE SUMMER CAMP FOR THE “RANCH BOYS” THE UNDERPRIVILEGED; LOOKING BACK AT HOW HE WAS COMING AT EIGHT YEARS OLD, AN ORPHAN TO STAY WITH HIS UNCLE WHO SAID “THEY SENT ME A BABY”. THERE IS WONDERFUL INFORMATION BUT THEY HAD TO READ ALL OF THE NEWSPAPER ARTICLES AND IT WASN’T PINPOINTED AND DRAWN TOGETHER COHESIVELY IN THE CONSULTANT’S REPORT THIS LIFE AS AN ORPHAN, DOCUMENTING HIS SUCCESS AND HIS PHYSICAL AND SOCIAL IMPACTS TO NOT ONLY THE CITY BUT THE COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO.

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – 5905 CAMINO DE LA COSTA

Applicant: Donald and Debra Duford represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 5905 Camino De La Costa, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 3-F)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5905 Camino De La Costa as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 5905 Camino De La Costa under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 14-012

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (*Don Duford, Debra Duford*), Heath Fox

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Woods commends Staff for finding the plans; supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff’s recommendation.

Chair Lemmo likes the house a lot; leaning towards Staff’s recommendation. He is curious about the Board’s thoughts on Criterion D.

Boardmember Marrone stated that in 1991, the historic review and guidance from Staff wasn’t provided. The architect put a lot of thought into the addition. The addition does not create a false sense of

history and is modest in size. Addition may have been done differently today. She supports designation under Criterion C and would like to see more information for Criterion D.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff's recommendation. The alterations overshadow the home and adversely affect the feeling and massing.

Boardmember Silvas supports Staff's recommendation; however he would like to hear more about Criterion D.

Boardmember Berge could clearly recognize the original house. Criteria C and D are separate. It doesn't need to be eligible under Criterion C for designation under Criterion D. It was how Ullrich worked with his clients that made him a Master. She supports designation under Criterion D.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – GEORGE AND VIRGINIA HAYES/EDGAR ULLRICH HOUSE AS HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT UNDER CRITERION D, AS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF MASTER ARCHITECT EDGAR ULLRICH. IT RETAINS INTEGRITY AS IT RELATES TO THE ORIGINAL DESIGN PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE 1933-1934. IN PARTICULAR THE RESOURCE EXHIBITS ONE OF ULLRICH'S SIGNATURE STYLES, FRENCH ECLECTIC, THAT ULLRICH MELDED WITH THE CLIENTS' LIFE IN FRANCE. THESE FINDINGS ARE SUPPORTED BY INFORMATION IN THE HISTORIC RESEARCH REPORT, THE STAFF REPORT, AND ORAL AND WRITTEN EVIDENCE PRESENTED AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING. THE DESIGNATION INCLUDES THE PARCEL AND THE EXTERIOR OF THE BUILDING. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES ALL OF THE ADDITIONS AFTER THE ORIGINAL DATE OF CONSTRUCTION 1934.

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

ITEM WAS CONTINUED FOR 30 DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNER.

ITEM 8 – AGNES MOSHER HOUSE

Applicant: Richard Dupuis and Lauren Espinosa represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1511 29th Street, 92102, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 2-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1511 29th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Agnes Mosher House located at 1511 29th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1943 second story rear addition.

Report Number: HRB 14-013

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge has concerns about what may or may not be the original construction shown in photos 4 and 12 in the consultant report. Specifically, there is an odd roof element, the pilaster cuts into the window frame, and the stepped windows at the staircase have much deeper sills. She also noted a seam in the siding. She does not support designation.

Boardmember Bethke is not sure what to make of Boardmember Berge's comments.

Chair Lemmo was prepared to support Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation. If there are modifications, they are minor.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation. When she saw shed roof, she thought it was a bad repair job. She is not bothered by it.

Boardmember Rivera would like to see Boardmember Berge's comments addressed.

ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN BY THE OWNER

ITEM 9 – BAY VIEW HOTEL

Applicant: 12th and A Hotel Partners LP represented by Heritage Architecture & Planning

Location: 509 Park Boulevard, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (**1289 4-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 509 Park Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Bay View Hotel located at 509 Park Boulevard as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1889 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 14-016

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: David Marshall, Bruce Coons, Ron May

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke recommends designation under Criterion A as well. After reading extensive history of hotel and its role in New Town, it appears building was significant in success of New Town.

Boardmember Rivera appreciates Boardmember Bethke bringing Criteria A to their attention, and supports designation under Criterion A as well.

Boardmembers Woods, Baksh, Lemmo, Marrone, Silvas and Berge all expressed support for designation under HRB Criterion A.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 UNDER CRITERION C PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BETHKE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 – BAY VIEW HOTEL UNDER CRITERION A AS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF NEW TOWN'S HISTORICAL, ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT WITH A PERIOD OF

SIGNIFICANCE 1888-1926. SPECIFICALLY, IT WAS ONE OF THE EARLIEST HOTELS IN HORTON'S ADDITION; IT WAS INFLUENTIAL IN THE SUCCESS OF THAT PART OF SAN DIEGO; AND IT IS THE OLDEST SURVIVING HOTEL IN DOWNTOWN SAN DIEGO ON ITS ORIGINAL SITE.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 10 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT

Applicant: City of San Diego, Planning, Neighborhoods and Economic Development Department

Location: Citywide

Description: The Historical Resources Board Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation, Mayor and City Council consistent with the City's Certified Local Government (CLG) responsibilities and Municipal Code Section 111.0206 (d)(7) requirements.

Today's Action: Review, comment and approve the Annual Report.

Staff Recommendation: Direct staff to forward the Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation and the San Diego City Council, or revise the Annual Report and forward as appropriate

Report Number: HRB 14-017

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, March 27, 2014

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:52PM