

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF MARCH 27, 2014
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:10PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Absent
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present <i>arrived @ 1:18PM</i>
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Interim Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Junior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR October 24, 2013 and December 11, 2013

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR OCTOBER 24, 2013 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 7-0-2

Motion Passes
(Curry, Larimer)

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR DECEMBER 11, 2013 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Baksh

Vote: 6-0-3

Motion Passes
(Berge, Curry, Larimer)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

John Eisenhart – City Council Appeal of Spreckels Brothers Commercial Company Warehouse: factual errors in information by Boardmembers. City Council does not have the expertise. He wants input from the Board with regards to the appeal process. Items should be sent back to HRB to rehear designation.

Bruce Coons – Toni Atkins has introduced a new state bill AB1999; investment credit for historical buildings similar to the Federal Tax Credit.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Marrone notified Staff she would not be in attendance

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Request for Continuance for Item 5 – 5905 Camino De La Costa
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Woods: Go Aztecs!

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmember Berge will recuse herself from Items 13 and 14

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Annual Awards nominations can be found online at www.sandiego.gov/historic
- An appeal has been filed for 7727-7729 Lookout Drive, a date has not set

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Staff is requesting a Continuance to the April 24, 2014 HRB for Item 9-1400 Virginia Way

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEM 9 – 1400 VIRGINIA WAY TO THE APRIL 24, 2014 AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

The Owner for Item 5-5905 Camino De La Costa is asking for a continuance.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEM 5 – 5905 CAMINO DE LA COSTA TO THE MAY 22, 2014 AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 12 – UNITED STATES HOLDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE

ITEM 13 – ABRAHAM AND MARY SCOTT HOUSE

ITEM 14 – LESLIE AND LOUISE ATHERTON HOUSE

ITEM 15 – AMENDMENT TO THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD PROCEDURES

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE ITEMS 12 AND 15 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION, WITH A CORRECTION TO ITEM 15 CHANGING “SHALL” TO “SHOULD”.

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE ITEMS 13 AND 14 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 9-0-1

Motion Passes

(Berge)

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 5905 CAMINO DE LA COSTA

Continued from February 2014

Applicant: Donald and Debra Duford represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 5905 Camino De La Costa, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 **(1247 3-F)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5905 Camino De La Costa as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 5905 Camino De La Costa under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated March 20, 2014 and HRB 14-012

ITEM WAS CONTINUED TO THE MAY 22, 2014 AGENDA AT THE OWNER’S REQUEST

ITEM 6 – THE OLAF NORSVEN HOUSE

Applicant: Andre and Dawn Coors Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 833 Island Court, 92109, Mission Beach Community, Council District 2 **(1267 2-J)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 833 Island Court as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Olaf Norsven House located at 833 Island Court as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1930 under HRB Criteria C.

Report Number: HRB 14-018

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (*Andrew Coors, Dawn Coors*)

Board Discussion:

Chair Lemmo mentioned that it was occupied by most important woman in legal history of San Diego.

Boardmember Rivera does not support Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation. Small beach cottage, not elaborate, tells story of Mission Beach.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry supports Staff's recommendation.

Chair Lemmo does not support Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer agrees with Staff but questions significance, on the fence. He is surprised to see the lack of a survey.

Boardmember Bethke thinks that Criterion B should be addressed, agrees with consultant in regard to significance under Criterion C. Boardmember Woods' comments speak to Criterion A, but it is not addressed in the report. He would support sending the report back for more information on Criteria A and B.

Boardmember Silvas is also surprised by the lack of survey. He can only think of one building in Mission Beach that is designated. This house is one of a few left in the neighborhood, style tells history.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Staff's recommendation, but has questions with regards to how much of the garage is original. Thinks report should be sent back for more information on Criterion A, the planning and development of Mission Beach and how property fits into the history of Mission Beach. Also needs more information on the garage.

Boardmember Larimer stated that the significance would be that this home as a small cottage built in the Spanish Eclectic style in Mission Beach with its tight lot lines; which dictated its size and its height and its massing is significant in the development of Mission Beach because of all those pieces that influenced its design.

Boardmember Curry asked how we should address resources in a community that has a different history. Style is important in context of the location and history of the area in which it is found.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – OLAF NORSVEN SPEC HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: EXCLUDE THE PRESENT GARAGE DUE TO QUESTIONS OF INTEGRITY AND INCLUDE THE STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE MADE BY BOARDMEMBER LARIMER

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 6-4-0

Motion Passes

(Rivera, Lemmo, Larimer, Bethke)

ITEM 7 – 3745 3rd AVE

Applicant: Darren Bwy represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 3745 3rd Ave, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3745 3rd Ave as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 3745 3rd Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 14-019

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian (*Darren Bwy*)

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge thanked applicant for Lot and Block book, supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Silvas supports Staff’s recommendation, feels sorry for this house.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer supports Staff’s recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff’s recommendation.

Chair Lemmo supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Curry supports Staff’s recommendation but questioned how much of the alterations can be reversed.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff’s recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – 3745 3RD AVE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – ROBERT ASTON HOUSE

Applicant: Whalen Family Community Property Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 953 Braemar Lane, 92109, Pacific Beach Community, Council District 2 (1247 7-J)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 953 Braemar Lane as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Robert Aston House located at 953 Braemar Lane as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1966 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 14-020Staff

Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (*Mark Silva*)

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Woods thought it is a good example of Contemporary Style and has many of the Contemporary features. She supports designation.

Boardmember Baksh is on the fence.

Boardmember Curry thinks the home has history and has integrity; style does not end on a specific year. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Chair Lemmo is in favor of designation, style appears to be a hybrid of International and Contemporary.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports designation as the International style. The Board has set precedent with 800 Prospect Street designation.

Boardmember Larimer struggles with why it is significant. Why is it more special than other homes of this style?

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Boardmember Larimer, does not support designation.

Boardmember Silvas is on the fence.

Boardmember Berge agrees with consultant, it is not significant under style.

Boardmember Rivera does not support designation.

Boardmember Curry mentioned that Modern styles are harder to recognize.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – ROBERT ASTON HOUSE
PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini

Vote: 4-6-0

Motion Fails

(*Rivera, Baksh, Bethke, Larimer, Silvas, Berge*)

ITEM 9 – WISE COTTAGE

Applicant: Myers Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1400 Virginia Way, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-F)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1400 Virginia Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Wise Cottage located at 1400 Virginia Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1914 under HRB Criteria A and C. The designation includes the mature pine tree at the corner of the lot near Virginia Way and Exchange Place. The designation excludes the attached casita and detached garage constructed in 1993.

Report Number: HRB 14-021

ITEM WAS CONTINUED TO THE APRIL 24, 2014 AGENDA AT STAFF'S REQUEST

ITEM 10 – 1845 29th STREET

Applicant: James and Johannah Valentine represented by Johnson & Johnson

Location: 1845 29th Street, 92101, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 1-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1845 29th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1845 29th Street under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 14-023

Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Paul Johnson, Sarai Johnson, Johanna Valentine

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge recommends that it goes back to DAS for further review.

Boardmember Silvas thought Miguel Lopez was a contractor.

Boardmember Bethke is not troubled by the window, he has seen worse. Questioned why it is significant, he is on the fence.

Boardmember Larimer thinks the octagonal window is troublesome, but wasn't sure if it was enough to detract from home.

Vice-Chair Garbini asked about the front walls.

Chair Lemmo thinks the octagonal window is strikingly odd and was surprised it didn't come up at DAS. He doesn't like doing analysis of significance on the spot, but supports designation under Criterion C.

Boardmember Curry thinks that it may be significant under Criterion A. Property still has integrity, supports designation.

Boardmember Baksh stated that it is a nice house and appreciates all of the work. He supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods also commends the owner; she is on the fence for designation under Criterion C. May be possible to designate under Criterion A.

Boardmember Rivera was in support of Staff's recommendation but is not sure now if it just comes down to a window.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEM 10 – 1845 29TH STREET INDEFINITELY TO GIVE THE APPLICANT AN OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK MORE AT THEIR PROPERTY AND GO TO THE DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 11 – LEVI AND HANNAH LINDSKOOG SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Joshua and Brooke Hesseltine represented by Johnson & Johnson

Location: 2435 Bancroft Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1289 1-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2435 Bancroft Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Levi and Hannah Lindskoog Spec House #1 located at 2435 Bancroft Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 14-024

Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Rivera questioned where the tile was. The removal of the side entry door is significant. The addition of the exterior walkway tile and site wall also impacts the integrity of the original home.

Boardmember Berge is not troubled by the removal of the secondary door and new site wall.

Boardmembers Woods, Baksh, Curry, Garbini, Larimer, Bethke, Silvas and Berge expressed support for the staff recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – LEVI AND HANNAH LINDSKOOG SPEC HOUSE #1 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 9-1-0

Motion Passes

(Rivera)

ITEM 12 – THE UNITED STATES HOLDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE

Applicant: Charles and Sally Stovall represented by Jaye MacAskill

Location: 2304 Juan Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2304 Juan Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the United States Holding Company Spec House located at 2304 Juan Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of ca. 1953 under HRB Criteria C.

Report Number: HRB 14-025

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

