



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 13, 2014 REPORT NO. HRB-14-012

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of February 27, 2014

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – 5905 Camino De La Costa**

APPLICANT: Donald and Debra Duford represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 5905 Camino De La Costa, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 5905 Camino De La Costa as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 5905 Camino De La Costa under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property is a one and two-story French Eclectic style single family residence constructed in 1934 and located on the north side of Camino De La Costa where it intersects with a public alley in the La Jolla Hermosa Subdivision of the La Jolla Community.

The building is located on APN 357-231-12-00. The property was identified in the Draft La Jolla Historic Survey in 2002 and given a Status Code of 3S, "appears eligible for NR as an individual property through survey evaluation."

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff finds that the site is not a significant historical resource under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property is a one and two-story single family residence constructed in 1934 in the French Eclectic style. The building is of standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation with floor joists and features an irregular, “U” shaped plan form with central courtyard in the rear of the property. The wood shingle roof is varied, made up of a series of high pitched hipped and gabled roof sections with shallow eave overhang and exposed rafter tails. The building is clad in a medium sand finish stucco and features portions of decorative half-timbering. Access to the main entry is gained from the public alley that spans the distance between Camino De La Costa and La Jolla Boulevard to the northeast. Fenestration is a mixture of historic and contemporary multi-light wood casement and fixed windows. The roof of the below grade, detached, two-car garage accessed from Camino De La Costa provides the space for the front yard patio at the entry.

Most of the building’s more fanciful features are concentrated around its main entry, along the angled, south-facing wall plane – here the building presents the greatest amount of original decorative half-timbering on the cantilevered second story with stout wood corbels below. Also along this elevation is the manifestation of a distinct asymmetric sloping gable and a through-the-cornice gabled dormer with 12-light fixed wood window. An original copper overhang with elaborate wrought iron detailing sits above the wood paneled entry door. Around the corner to the left of the entry is a prominent bay window featuring expansive multi-light wood windows. This high concentration of decorative features near the main entry and their conspicuous arrangement in historic photographs of the building lead staff to consider this angled, south elevation at the corner of Camino De La Costa and the adjacent public alley as the primary elevation for viewing the resource and for the purposes of evaluating the building’s historic integrity.

Modifications to the house are extensive and significantly impair the building’s integrity as it relates to the 1934 date of construction and period of significance. Of greatest concern is a prominent two story addition built in 1991 adjacent to the south-facing primary elevation. This addition was built in front of the original two story portion of the house along the southeast property line following the alley to La Jolla Boulevard, making it highly visible from the public right-of-way – both from Camino De La Costa below and particularly from the end of the public alley. The report describes this addition as being 750 square feet in size, but does not elaborate on its exact location. In fact, the architectural detailing used in the addition so closely mimics that of the original structure, that staff was unable to determine during a field inspection exactly where the original building ended and the addition began. Attachment A.5 of the applicant’s report does not accurately depict the footprint of the additions made to the original structure. The actual extent of the addition could not be determined in the field, but was finally realized upon inspection of construction plans kept on file at the Records Section of Development Services (Attachment 1).

The 1991 two story addition begins slightly forward and to the right of the main entry of the house – a stepped mass following the southeast property line, clad primarily in stucco matching

the original and secondarily in a stone veneer similar to the stone work seen at the original site wall along Camino De La Costa. The detailing and materials of the roof over the addition match that of the original. Fenestration seen in the addition is of multi-light wood casement and fixed windows, also mimicking the original portions. A second story pop-out features half-timbering and wood corbels below, similar to that seen above the entry. Below the pop-out is an oriel window with copper detailing below, analogous to the overhang at the entry door. The stucco chimney with copper accent above the addition features brick detailing similar to that in an original stucco chimney nearby.

Other modifications to the original building are relatively of lesser consequence to the building's character defining features and integrity. To the left of the entry door is a pair of 15-light French doors where an original multi-light fixed window once was. To the right of the entry door is a picture window in an original opening for a 25-light wood window seen in historic photographs. Around the building, along the southwest elevation facing Camino De La Costa, is a pair of replacement arched multi-light casement windows. Not visible from the public right-of-way, behind the area near the 1991 addition, are multiple rear additions built between 1986 and 1993 according to the Residential Building Record. Across from these additions, at the north side of the courtyard in the opposite wing of the house is a modification of unknown age including two entries areas and a chimney. Although not mentioned in the report staff believes the large chimney visible primarily from the courtyard located generally behind the main entry to the house has been veneered in brick. In the historic photos, the top of this chimney is seen above and to the left of the entry door and appears to be only stucco clad with a small amount of brick trim at the top.

The 1991 two story addition, together with other modifications to the original building, have sorely affected the building's character defining features and impair its historic character and integrity. Most importantly, such rich detailing in a prominent addition visible from the public right-of-way creates a false sense of history and is not consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards. For these reasons, staff cannot recommend designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property was designed by Master Architect Edgar Ullrich. Ullrich is responsible for the design of many substantial projects in San Diego and La Jolla in particular, including Casa de Mañana (HRB Site #212, 213) and several University of San Diego buildings. The applicant's report does little to demonstrate how the subject property is a notable work of Ullrich besides note the relative prominence and grandiosity of the building. Of greater importance, the analysis provided in the report does not consider how much this extravagance is in fact provided by non-historic fabric and detailing.

As a result of the aforementioned prominent addition and alterations to the original structure, the subject building lacks enough original integrity to honestly convey the original design and intent of the Master Architect. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 5905 Camino De La Costa not be designated under any HRB Criteria due to significant alterations that have resulted in a lack of integrity. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Junior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

CP/cw

Attachments:

1. Copy of plans showing 1991 addition
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

