

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF FEBRUARY 26, 2015
NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE
202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:11PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Absent
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Absent
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
 Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
 Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
 Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Heather Ferbert, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for January 22, 2015

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR
JANUARY 22, 2015 AS WRITTEN**

Seconded by Chair Lemmo	Vote: 6-0-1	Motion Passes
	<i>(Silvas)</i>	

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Curry, Rivera and Marrone notified Staff they would not be in attendance.
Boardmember Larimer has to leave at 4:00pm.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Request for Continuance for Item 5-7007 Country Club Drive
- ✓ Request for Continuance for Item 6-3127 McKinley Street
- ✓ Request for Continuance for Item 10-7991-7993 Prospect Place
- ✓ Revised Draft SDP Findings for Item 9-2119 Kettner Blvd
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 5-7007 Country Club Drive
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 7-4079 1st Avenue
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 10-7991-7993 Prospect Place
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Boardmember Woods was approached by a neighbor while doing the site visit for Item 7; the neighbor told her he didn't want the house designated.

Vice-Chair Garbini – completed independent research on Item 5

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Boardmember Silvas was not able to do a site visit for Item 6-7007 Country Club Drive.

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO INVOKE THE WAIVER FOR THE BOARDMEMBER SILVAS PER HRB PROCEDURES 1 AND 2

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 4-2-1

Motion Passes

(Larimer, Garbini) (Silvas)

C. STAFF REPORT

- It is HRB Annual Awards season once again! The City is currently accepting nominations for the 2015 Historic Preservation Awards. Awards are given each year in the categories of Agency; Archaeology; Architectural Restoration, Rehabilitation and Reconstruction; Community History; Cultural Diversity; Cultural Landscape; Education; History; Individual and Preservation Advancement. Nominations are due by April 3rd, and the Awards will be presented at the May 28th HRB Hearing. Nomination forms are available online and on the City's website.
- On February 2nd the City Council considered the appeal of historic designation of the Alliene and Edna Treadwell House, located at 579 San Elijo Street. The Council granted the appeal and overturned the designation based on a violation of hearing procedures and new information presented regarding alterations to the building.

- As a reminder, the Mills Act application period is currently open, and closes on March 31st. The application and more information is available on our website.
- The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, March 4, 2015 at 4:00 PM in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, March 9, 2015 at 3:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, Monday, May 11, 2015.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Diane Kane is requesting a 30-day continuance for Item 5-7007 Country Club Drive to the March 26, 2015 agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

NO ACTION

The Applicant for Item 6-3127 McKinley Street is asking for another 30-day continuance to the March 26, 2015 agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEM 6 – 3127 MCKINLEY STREET TO THE MARCH 2015 AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

Joe La Cava is requesting a 30-day continuance for Item 10-7991-7993 Prospect Place to the March 26, 2015 agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

NO ACTION

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 9 – KETTNER LOFTS- SDP (2119 Kettner Boulevard-HRB# 1162)

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE ITEM 9 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – FOXHILL

Continued from January 2015

Applicant: David C. Copley Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 7007 Country Club Drive, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 1-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7007 Country Club Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate Foxhill located at 7007 Country Club Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1956 under HRB Criterion C. The designation is limited to APN 352-300-04-00 and excludes the 3,783 square foot master suite addition constructed in 2012, as well as the 1988 detached guest house, c.1990 detached recreation room and 2009 detached garage.

Report Number: Memo dated February 12, 2015 and Staff Report Number HRB 15-001

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Greg Shannon, Greg Noonan, Dean Dwyer, Vicki Estrada, Leslie Davis, Joe LaCava

Boardmember Silvas chose to abstain from participating and voting on this item

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO RETURN REPORT TO CONSULTANT FOR MORE INFORMATION ON HARRIET WIMMER AND THE GARDENS

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini

Vote: 3-2-1

Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Larimer) (Baksh)

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER LARIMER TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – JAMES COPLEY HOUSE LOCATED AT 7007 COUNTRY CLUB DRIVE AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1956-1973 UNDER HRB CRITERION B. THIS RECOMMENDATION IS BASED ON THE FOLLOWING FINDING: THE RESOURCE IS IDENTIFIED WITH JAMES COPLEY, WHO IS A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PERSON TO THE HISTORY OF SAN DIEGO AND RETAINS INTEGRITY FOR THAT ASSOCIATION. SPECIFICALLY, JAMES COPLEY WAS CONSIDERED A GIANT IN THE PUBLISHING FIELD, AND OVER THE COURSE OF HIS CAREER HE TRIPLED THE CIRCULATION OF THE UNION-TRIBUNE; AND SERVED AS PRESIDENT OF THE INTER-AMERICAN PRESS ASSOCIATION, DIRECTOR OF THE ASSOCIATED PRESS, DIRECTOR OF THE AMERICAN NEWSPAPER PUBLISHERS ASSOCIATION BUREAU OF ADVERTISING, MEMBER OF THE BOARD OF THE AMERICAN NEWSPAPER PUBLISHERS' ASSOCIATION, PRESIDENT OF THE ANPA RESEARCH INSTITUTE, MEMBER OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF NEWSPAPER EDITORS, AND MEMBER OF

THE NATIONAL PRESS CLUB. HE WAS ALSO THE RECIPIENT OF NUMEROUS HONORS AND AWARDS. THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE FROM 1956-1973 REFLECTS THE PERIOD THAT THE RESOURCE WAS THE PRIMARY RESIDENCE OF MR. COPLEY FROM THE TIME OF ITS CONSTRUCTION UNTIL THE TIME OF HIS DEATH IN 1973. THIS FINDING IS FURTHER SUPPORTED BY INFORMATION IN THE STAFF REPORT, THE HISTORICAL RESEARCH REPORT, AND WRITTEN AND ORAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING.

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 5-1-1
(Lemmo)(Silvas)

Motion Fails

ITEM 6 – 3127 MCKINLEY STREET
Continued from January 2015

Applicant: Justin Clapper represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 3127 McKinley Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 7-F)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3127 McKinley Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 3127 McKinley Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: Memo dated February 20, 2015 and Staff Report Number HRB 15-006

CONTINUED TO THE MARCH 2015 AGENDA

ITEM 7 – 4079 1st AVENUE

Applicant: Urban Edge, LLC represented by Scott Moomjian

Owner: Lou Jack Johnson

Location: 4079 1st Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 5-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4079 1st Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 4079 1st Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 15-009

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Darel Handley, Richard Haynie, Brott Farwell, John Wold, Lou Johnson

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – 4079 1st AVENUE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – 215 WEST WASHINGTON STREET

Applicant: City of San Diego represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 215 West Washington Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 5-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 215 West Washington Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 215 West Washington under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 15-015

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Nancy Carol Carter, Ben Meza, Sepi Amirazizi, Cynthia Meinhardt, Phyllis Marion, Kevin Nolen

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – 215 WEST WASHINGTON STREET PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 9 – KETTNER LOFTS (2119 KETTNER BOULEVARD-HRB# 1162)

Applicant: Beardsley Family Trust represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 2119 Kettner Boulevard, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (1288 1-J)

Description: Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.

Today's Action: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to designated historical resources.

Staff Recommendation: The Historical Resources Board recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit related to the designated historical resource (HRB Site #1162-the John O'Day Commercial Building) as presented.

Report Number: HRB 15-008

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 10 – MANZANITA COTTAGE

Applicant: Kevin and Melissa Steel represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 7991-7993 Prospect Place, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-F)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7991-7993 Prospect Place as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate Manzanita Cottage located at 7991 Prospect Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1910 under HRB Criterion A. The designation excludes the rear residence identified as 7993 Prospect Place.

Report Number: HRB 15-012

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Matt Peterson, Kevin Steel, Melissa Steel, Heath Fox

In Opposition: Leslie Davis

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 – MANZANITA COTTAGE AND SHAMISAL COTTAGE UNDER CRITERION A AS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF LA JOLLA’S HISTORICAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC AND ARCHITECTURAL DEVELOPMENT AND RETAINS INTEGRITY TO THE 1910 DATE OF CONSTRUCTION AND PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE.

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 2-5-0

Motion Fails

(Larimer, Lemmo, Woods, Garbini, Baksh)

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 – MANZANITA COTTAGE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, March 26, 2015

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:10PM