



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 8, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-001

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of January 22, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #6 – Foxhill**

APPLICANT: David C. Copley Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 7007 Country Club Drive, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of Foxhill located at 7007 Country Club Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate Foxhill located at 7007 Country Club Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1956 under HRB Criterion C. The designation is limited to APN 352-300-04-00 and excludes the 3,783 square foot master suite addition constructed in 2012, as well as the 1988 detached guest house, c.1990 detached recreation room and 2009 detached garage, which were all constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of French Eclectic style expressed in the symmetrical subtype, and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1956 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits wings added to the sides of the main block of the building; a massive, steeply-pitched hipped roof with the ridge paralleling the front of the house; eaves flared upward at the roof-wall junction; segmental roof dormers that are relatively small in scale; brick cladding; a symmetrical façade with a centered entry; entry doors surrounded by quoins; multi-lite casement windows; and full-length multi-lite casement windows (French Doors).

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The subject property is a large single

family home located on a 7.24 acre site on a portion of a Pueblo Lot in the hills of La Jolla. The property is accessed via a private driveway and contains a number of accessory structures built after the 1956 period of significance for Foxhill.

The building is located on APN 352-300-04-00, as shown on the map provided in Attachment 2, and is owned by the David C Copley Trust. To the east are two additional parcels under separate ownership by the Copley Press. APN 352-300-09-00 contains an accessory structure to the Copley House which no longer retains integrity, as detailed below, and APN 352-300-08-00 is a vacant lot previously cleared by staff as not historic. Neither APN 352-300-09-00 or 352-300-08-00 are included in the designation, which is limited to APN 352-300-04-00.

The subject property was identified in the 2004 Draft La Jolla Survey and given a Status Code of 7R, "Identified in Reconnaissance Level Survey: Not Evaluated." Individual resources identified in the reconnaissance survey that were not identified as a potential contributor to a potential historic district were given a Status Code of "7R" since those resources were not evaluated for integrity under the reconnaissance level survey.

The historic name of the resource, Foxhill, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the historical name by which the house was known since its construction.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees, and finds that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 7007 Country Club Drive did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or La Jolla's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The subject property was constructed by James Copley and his first wife, Jean in 1956. James and Jean divorced in 1965 and James married his second wife, Helen that same year. James took over full control of the Copley Press in 1959 and served as the chief executive officer until his death in 1973. James was considered a giant in the publishing field, and over the course of his career he tripled the circulation of the Union-Tribune; and served as president of the Inter-American Press Association, director of the Associated Press, director of the American Newspaper Publishers Association Bureau of Advertising, member of the board of the American

Newspaper Publishers' Association, president of the ANPA Research Institute, member of the American Society of Newspaper Editors, and member of the National Press Club. He was also the recipient of numerous honors and awards. Following James' death, Helen assumed control of the Copley Press until her retirement in 2001. While at the helm of the Copley Press, the afternoon *Tribune* won two Pulitzer Prizes. Helen oversaw the merger of the *Union* and *Tribune* in 1992, and the largest acquisition in Copley Press history in 1996. Helen was also heavily involved in civic and philanthropic causes, launching the San Diego Council on Literacy in 1986, and giving generously to the San Diego Symphony, the University of San Diego, the San Diego Museum of Contemporary Art, and the San Diego Animal Shelter. Helen passed away in 2004.

The applicant's historic report concludes that both James and Helen Copley would be considered historically significant individuals for their accomplishments in the field of journalism and publishing, as well as Helen's civic and philanthropic work. However, the report also concludes that the subject property does not best reflect the significance of either James or Helen Copley. In the case of James, the report concludes that James' achievements are best reflected in the extant former Copley Press corporate office at 7776 Ivanhoe Avenue. Staff concurs with this conclusion. While not presently designated, the building has been identified by staff as potentially historic. James maintained an office at this location, where he carried out the work for which he may be considered historically significant.

In regard to Helen, the report concludes that the subject property does not best reflect either her professional or civic/philanthropic accomplishments, which are better reflected in other locations, such as the James S. Copley Library. Staff has reviewed the information in the report and finds that Helen's accomplishments appeared to have occurred primarily after her husband's passing in 1973. While highly admirable, staff believes that these accomplishments are too recent to evaluate objectively within their historical context. Given more time and perspective, Helen Copley may well be found to be a historically significant individual, at which time the most appropriate representative resource can be identified.

Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion B at this time.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject building located at 7007 Country Club Drive was designed in 1955 and constructed in 1956 in the French Eclectic style with an overall irregularly-shaped floorplan. The primary massing or main block which presents to the circular driveway is symmetrical with forward-projecting bays at either end, and features a steeply-pitched hipped roof with slate roofing; seven segmental roof dormers on the front and back, each with paired 3-lite casement wood frame and sash windows; flared, boxed eaves; two wide brick chimneys; a full-brick veneer over wood frame construction, and a concrete foundation. The wood entry door is centered on the façade and is surrounded by quoin detailing. The entry is flanked by paired 3-lite wood French doors, and at either end, the projecting bays each contain two additional pairs of 3-lite wood French doors.

Three wings project off of the main block to the north, south and east. To the north, the wing containing the kitchen and maid's quarters is set back approximately 20 feet from the main

façade, and leads to the original attached 4-car garage. To the south, the wing containing the master bedroom suite is stepped back from the main façade approximately the same distance as the north wing, but jogs forward before extending further to the south, creating a courtyard terrace. The eastern wing extends 65 feet back to the east and contains a number of bedrooms and living areas. A second floor runs the length of most of the house, from the garage at the north end to the master bedroom and the south end, with the segmented dormers providing light and air to the rooms within.

Modifications to the house include replacement of the original wood shingle roof in 2008-2009 with slate roofing; and construction of a 3,783 square foot master suite addition to the south wing in 2012. The master suite addition, which is attached to the end of the southern wing and is differentiated through the use of stucco siding, and was reviewed and approved by historic resources staff as consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Rehabilitation Standards) during the permit review process. Modifications to the site include construction of a swimming pool in 1959; construction of a detached lath house in 1962 and alteration/conversion of that lath house in 2011-2012; construction of a gate and wall in 1963; construction of a 1,192 detached guest house in 1988; construction of a 412 square foot Butler's Quarters in 1990 (likely the recreation room noted in the report with a c.1990s date of construction); and construction of a 1,200 square foot detached garage in 2009. Historic resources staff reviewed and approved both the lath house modifications and the construction of the detached garage. The lath house was not considered to be potentially historic, and its alteration was therefore approved. The construction of the detached garage did not impact the main house, and was approved as consistent with the Rehabilitation Standards.

In her book *A Field Guide to American Houses*, Virginia Savage McAlester states that “French Eclectic houses were rarely built before World War I... Many Americans – among them architects and builders – served in France during World War I, and gained a firsthand familiarity with the broad spectrum of smaller French houses upon which this style is based. The style began to be somewhat fashionable in the early 1920s ... By 1930, French Eclectic houses were overtaking Tudor to become the second most popular Eclectic style during the 1930s (behind the always leading Colonial Revival.) As with most other Eclectic styles, the French faded from favor after World War II.”

McAlester notes that French Eclectic style homes were constructed predominantly between 1915 and 1945, and can be identified through their principal subtypes – symmetrical, asymmetrical and towered - and their character defining features. “In the symmetrical subtype, the massive hipped roof, normally with the ridge paralleling the front of the house, dominates a symmetrical façade with centered entry. Façade detailing is usually rather formal, inspired by smaller French manor houses rather than grand chateaus or modest farmhouses. Wings are frequently added to the sides of the main block.”

McAlester identifies key character-defining features of the style, which include a “tall, steeply pitched hipped roof (occasionally gabled in towered subtype) without dominant front-facing cross-gable; eaves commonly flared upward at roof-wall junction; commonly has segmental arch on door, windows or dormers; brick, stone or stucco wall cladding, sometimes with decorative half-timbering.” McAlester goes on to state that “...the [French Eclectic] style shows great

variety in form and detailing but is united by the characteristic roof... Doors in informal examples are usually set in simple arched openings; doors in symmetrical formal houses may be surrounded by stone quoins or more elaborate Renaissance detailing. Windows may be either double-hung or casement sashes, the latter sometimes with small leaded panes. Full-length casement windows with shutters (French doors) are sometimes used. The dominant high-pitched roof may be enhanced by one of these distinctive features that indicate a house is likely to be French Eclectic: (1) through-the-cornice dormers or windows and (2) roof dormers that are relatively small in scale or that form a high second tier of dormers on a steep roof.”

The subject property was commissioned by James and Jean Copley, who hired architect Roy Drew to design the home in the French style. The house exhibits the character defining features of the symmetrical subtype of the French Eclectic style, including wings added to the sides of the main block of the building; a massive, steeply-pitched hipped roof with the ridge paralleling the front of the house; eaves flared upward at the roof-wall junction; segmental roof dormers that are relatively small in scale; brick cladding; a symmetrical façade with a centered entry; entry doors surrounded by quoins; casement windows; and full-length casement windows (French Doors). The only aspect of the building that could be considered to be atypical of the French Eclectic style as defined by McAlester is the construction date of 1956. McAlester notes that French Eclectic homes were constructed predominantly between 1915 and 1945; and that “As with most other Eclectic styles, the French faded from favor after World War II.” However, that is not to say that no homes were constructed in the French Eclectic style post-1945, or that homes constructed post-1945 could not be considered significant examples of the style. The subject property was commissioned a mere 10 years following the end of World War II, and as detailed above, conveys all of the key character defining features of the French Eclectic style expressed in the symmetrical subtype.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the French Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style and its symmetrical subtype; including wings added to the sides of the main block of the building; a massive, steeply-pitched hipped roof with the ridge paralleling the front of the house; eaves flared upward at the roof-wall junction; segmental roof dormers that are relatively small in scale; brick cladding; a symmetrical façade with a centered entry; entry doors surrounded by quoins; multi-lite casement windows; and full-length multi-lite casement windows (French Doors). Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C, excluding the 3,783 square foot master suite addition constructed in 2012, as well as the 1988 detached guest house, c.1990 detached recreation room and 2009 detached garage, which were all constructed outside of the period of significance.

In regard to landscaping elements, Attachment E of the historic report includes an analysis by Vicki Estrada of Estrada Land Planning. The analysis evaluated the entire site for historically significant landscape elements. The analysis concluded that, “the grounds do not appear to have had a master landscape plan or other landscape drawings prepared. With the exception of the large lawn just west of the house, the grounds were constructed area by area without a master concept.” The analysis goes on to identify and evaluate six separate landscaping “zones”, concluding that none of the zones or plant materials within those zones could be considered historically significant. The analysis notes that the oldest trees are found in Zone 5, which is

comprised of Eucalyptus, Conifers and Oak trees; however, “the lack of a cohesive design and a significant designer (they were planted by gardeners), removes any historic potential.”

While the designation does apply to the entire parcel, and any modifications and improvements to the parcel would be subject to review for consistency with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, staff does not recommend inclusion of any specific landscape elements, due to a lack of documented historical significance, as detailed in Attachment E of the applicant’s historic report.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Roy Drew was a pioneering modernist architect that practiced architecture for over 50 years. Drew was the first San Diego architect to be elected on design merit to the AIA College of fellows. He received an AIA lifetime achievement award. His architecture was a leap pad for an architectural style which grew in the San Diego region in the mid 20th century.

Over the course of his career, Drew became largely known for incorporating modernist principles into his designs. While many of Drew’s projects were relatively modest in scale and stressed decorative simplicity, he nonetheless gained notoriety for his careful attention to detail as well as his respect for the natural setting. Also central to Drew’s work was the incorporation of room for future growth, as well as the employment of technological innovations into his plans.

Among other recognitions, Drew was named to the College of Fellows by the A.I.A. in 1968. Moreover, a retrospective of his work was featured in the University of San Diego’s Founder’s Gallery in 1993-1994. Along with Mosher, Drew is recognized as being a pivotal figure in San Diego’s modernist movement. Drew was established by the Board as a Master Architect in March 2001 with the designation of HRB Site #460, the Conard-Arrington House at 809 San Antonio Place.

The applicant’s historic report concludes that the subject property does not exemplify the notable work of Master Architect and modernist Roy Drew. The report states that, “Historical research indicates that Roy Drew served as the architect who specifically designed the 7007 Country Club Drive residence in a French Eclectic style for James and Jean Copley in 1955. Drew’s design came at the request of Jean Copley who wanted a French-style home. As stated previously, both Mosher and Drew have been recognized as “master architects” on the basis of the Modern style designs. In no way does the French Eclectic style of the building illustrate or exemplify Drew’s “signature” greatness in the field of Modern architecture.” Staff concurs with this analysis, and therefore does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 7007 Country Club Drive has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 7007 Country Club Drive is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that Foxhill, located at 7007 Country Club Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1956 under HRB Criterion C as a resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of French Eclectic style expressed in the symmetrical subtype, and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1956 period of significance. The designation is limited to APN 352-300-04-00 and excludes the 3,783 square foot master suite addition constructed in 2012, as well as the 1988 detached guest house, c.1990 detached recreation room and 2009 detached garage, which were all constructed outside of the period of significance. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Map Showing Limits of Designation
3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 1/22/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/22/2015, to consider the historical designation of **Foxhill** (owned by David C. Copley Trust 12-16-83, 2251 San Diego Avenue #A238, San Diego, CA 92110) located at **7007 Country Club Drive, San Diego, CA 92037**, APN: **352-300-04-00**, further described as LOT 1263 POR in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of Foxhill on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of French Eclectic style expressed in the symmetrical subtype, and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1956 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits wings added to the sides of the main block of the building; a massive, steeply-pitched hipped roof with the ridge paralleling the front of the house; eaves flared upward at the roof-wall junction; segmental roof dormers that are relatively small in scale; brick cladding; a symmetrical façade with a centered entry; entry doors surrounded by quoins; multi-lite casement windows; and full-length multi-lite casement windows (French Doors). This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 3,783 square foot master suite addition constructed in 2012, as well as the 1988 detached guest house, c.1990 detached recreation room and 2009 detached garage, which were all constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
HEATHER FERBERT,
Deputy City Attorney

7007 COUNTRY CLUB DRIVE

LIMITS OF DESIGNATION

The designation shall be limited to APN 352-300-04-00, and shall not include 352-300-09-00 or 352-300-08-00.

