



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 8, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-004

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of January 22, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – Carl and Matilda Hays/Elmer and Susie McCoy Spec House #1**

APPLICANT: Jeffrey Toff and Velita Worden represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 4117 Middlesex Drive, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Carl and Matilda Hays/Elmer and Susie McCoy Spec House #1 located at 4117 Middlesex Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Carl and Matilda Hays/Elmer and Susie McCoy Spec House #1 located at 4117 Middlesex Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1930 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1975 detached recreation room at the rear of the property. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1930 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource features asymmetrical façades; varied hipped and shed roof forms of Mission clay tile with modest eave overhang and exposed rafters; irregular stucco cladding; accented feature windows at or near the primary elevation; and fenestration consisting largely of multi-light wood casement windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a one story single family residence built in 1930 the Spanish Eclectic style, and located on the south side of

Middlesex Drive, between Canterbury Drive and Marlborough Drive in the Kensington Heights Unit 1 Subdivision of the Kensington-Talmadge Community.

The building is located on APN 440-192-09-00. The property was identified in the 1996 Mid-City Survey as a Contributing Structure within the Kensington Potential Historic District and given a Status Code of 5D2, "Contributor to a district that is eligible for local listing or designation."

The historic name of the resource, the Carl and Matilda Hays/Elmer and Susie McCoy Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Carl and Matilda Hays and Elmer and Susie McCoy, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one story single family residence constructed in 1930 in the Spanish Eclectic style. The building features an irregular plan form and asymmetrical primary façade. The building is of standard and above-standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation, and clad in an irregular, hand-troweled stucco finish. The house exhibits a varied gabled roof form of Mission clay tile set in front of a flat roof with parapet. At the front, the roof shows very modest eave overhang with exposed rafters. Fenestration consists primarily of one over one wood double hung windows. The primary elevation presents a covered entry with arched openings leading to a solid wood entry door with original hardware. To the left of the entry is a low-walled patio set in front of a large fixed wood focal window. To the right, a prominent front gable exhibits round clay tile vents with a pair of wood double hung windows below. At the rear of the property is an original detached garage with replacement garage door. Just behind the rear, southwest corner of the house is a detached recreation room addition built in 1975.

The applicant's report recommends the designation include the living room fireplace and hearth with decorative Claycraft tiles. The inclusion of interior features in historic designations is entirely voluntary, and the property owner has reconsidered and elected not to include any interior elements. Therefore staff does not recommend any interior elements be included in the designation.

Impacts to integrity and character defining features have been greatly reduced through the application of a more historically appropriate stucco texture to replace the non-historic texture that had been applied at an unknown date. The new stucco texture was carefully applied to match the original portions that remain visible on the detached garage. On the east (side) elevation, a

small recessed patio behind the chimney has been enclosed with a simple shed roof and aluminum windows. Other modifications include three windows retrofitted with aluminum double hung windows, and one with a garden window. These four window modifications are located at the rear of both the east and west side elevations and were made within existing, original wood window openings. Finally, simple contemporary tiling has been added to the front patio and covered entry floor. Overall, the alterations do not affect the essential physical features critical to the Spanish Eclectic style of the building – there is no significant impact to composition, massing, scale or decorative elements. Accordingly, the alterations do not greatly impair the building’s overall integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling. Thus, the building remains eligible under HRB Criterion C.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including asymmetrical façades; varied hipped and shed roof forms of Mission clay tile with modest eave overhang and exposed rafters; irregular stucco cladding; accented feature windows at or near the primary elevation; and fenestration consisting largely of multi-light wood casement windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Carl and Matilda Hays/Elmer and Susie McCoy Spec House #1 located at 4117 Middlesex Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1930 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style. The designation excludes the 1975 detached recreation room at the rear of the property. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 1/22/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/22/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **Carl and Matilda Hays/Elmer and Susie McCoy Spec House #1** (owned by Jeffrey R Toff and Velita Worden, 4117 Middlesex Drive, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4117 Middlesex Drive, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **440-192-09-00**, further described as BLK 6 LOT 25 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Carl and Matilda Hays/Elmer and Susie McCoy Spec House #1 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1930 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource features asymmetrical façades; varied hipped and shed roof forms of Mission clay tile with modest eave overhang and exposed rafters; irregular stucco cladding; accented feature windows at or near the primary elevation; and fenestration consisting largely of multi-light wood casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1975 detached recreation room at the rear of the property.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
HEATHER FERBERT,
Deputy City Attorney