



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 8, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-005

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of January 22, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – John and Cora Watson House**

APPLICANT: Edward Blough represented by Jaye MacAskill

LOCATION: 1319 Granada Avenue, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the John and Cora Watson House located at 1319 Granada Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the John and Cora Watson House located at 1319 Granada Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1921 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1949 rear bedroom addition. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1921 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a symmetrical primary façade; wood shingle siding over single wall construction; prominent front and side porch covers with exposed rafters and beams and tapered wood columns; brick exterior chimney; flat roof with wide overhang; and fenestration of 3-over-2 divided light wood casement windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a one story single family residence built in 1921 in the Craftsman style, and is located on the east side of Granada Avenue, just north of A Street in the South Park Addition to the Greater Golden Hill Community.

The building is located on APN 539-403-05-00. The property was identified as “Non-Contributing” to the potential South Park Residential Historic District in the Draft Greater Golden Hill 2011 Historic Survey.

The historic name of the resource, the John and Cora Watson House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of John and Cora Watson, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Jaye MacAskill, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one story Craftsman style single family residence built in 1921 of single-wall construction on a concrete foundation. The building is clad in wood shingle and exhibits a distinctive, flat roof form with broad enclosed eave overhang. The original scored concrete walkway and porch stoop lead to the 18-light entry door and symmetrical primary façade, presented with a broad central front porch cover with conspicuously exposed rafters and beams supported by full-height tapered wood porch columns. A matching covered side porch on the south elevation provides access from the scored concrete driveway. Fenestration consists primarily of wood casement windows with a 3-over-2 divided light pattern. A brick chimney pierces the wide roof overhang along the south (side) elevation. The original detached garage remains at the rear, southeast corner of the property and matches the residence with its single-wall construction and flat roof with wide overhang.

The applicant lists several interior elements to be included in the designation including most of the interior finishes in the walls, floors and ceilings of the "public" areas of the house. These include board and batten walls, wood floors, paper ceiling, interior doors, wood built-ins, brick fireplace and kitchen skylight. Staff conducted an interior site visit to evaluate and photograph the proposed interior features. While the exposed wood of the interior finishes provide charm and rich warmth, the proposed comprehensive designation of various features throughout the house is not supported by staff primarily because the features listed are not considered especially significant or unique. Secondly, the interior designation is not supported because some of the features would pose some regulatory difficulties, particularly as it relates to the single-wall construction of the house. Including the interior walls in any designation is not only redundant given they are part of the exterior structure which would already be protected; regulatory complications could arise should a future property owner wish to insulate the house.

Few modifications have been made to the property. A modern replacement garage door has been installed at the garage, and the Residential Building Record notes a 1949 rear bedroom addition at the northeast corner of the residence. The bedroom addition, while it utilizes matching exterior materials, is built of traditional 2x4 construction and projects slightly north and east from the original footprint, making it easier to read as an addition. The modifications do not significantly impair the building's integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling – there is no

significant impact to composition, massing, scale or decorative elements. The report proposes the 1949 rear bedroom addition be included as part of any designation due to its relative age. Staff does not support the inclusion of the rear addition as it does not fall within the resource's 1921 period of significance established by the original date of construction. The addition does not add character-defining value or historic significance to the original structure sufficient to warrant the expansion of the period of significance to include it.

The Craftsman influence is recognized by the applicant as the dominant style in the subject property, particularly with the strong visual statement made by the wide front porch with exposed roof structure and tapered wood columns, brick chimney, and extensive use of wood cladding and fenestration. Unusual to typical Craftsman vocabulary, however, is the flat roof with broad enclosed overhangs seen in the subject house. The report identifies this as evidence of a Prairie style influence. While the broad flat roof and rows of windows do set off a horizontal emphasis typical of the Prairie style, the effect is nominal due to the small size of the house, and it is not a quality exclusive to the Prairie style. It should also be noted that a flat roof form is not particularly common for either Craftsman or Prairie style homes. Any Prairie influence expressed in the house, intentionally or otherwise, is not robust enough to overcome the strong Craftsman appearance. Staff feels that the subject resource can be effectively described as merely Craftsman in style.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled or hipped roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including symmetrical primary façade; wood shingle siding over single wall construction; prominent front and side porch covers with exposed rafters and beams and tapered wood columns; brick exterior chimney; and fenestration of 3-over-2 divided light wood casement windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C. Staff does not recommend the inclusion of any interior elements.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the John and Cora Watson House located at 1319 Granada Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1921 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style. The designation excludes the 1949 rear bedroom addition. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 1/22/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/22/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **John and Cora Watson House** (owned by Edward G Blough, 1319 Granada Avenue, San Diego, CA 92102) located at **1319 Granada Avenue, San Diego, CA 92102**, APN: **539-403-05-00**, further described as BLK 29 LOT 6 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the John and Cora Watson House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1921 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a symmetrical primary façade; wood shingle siding over single wall construction; prominent front and side porch covers with exposed rafters and beams and tapered wood columns; brick exterior chimney; flat roof with wide overhang; and fenestration of 3-over-2 divided light wood casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1949 rear bedroom addition.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
HEATHER FERBERT,
Deputy City Attorney