



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: July 9, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-027

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of July 23, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #6 – 2360-2388 Linwood Street and 4005 Arista Street**

APPLICANT: Dean Wilson Living Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 2360-2388 Linwood Street and 4005 Arista Street, Old Town San Diego
Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 2360-2388 Linwood
Street and 4005 Arista Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 2360-2388 Linwood Street and 4005 Arista Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The site contains a collection of 9 detached vernacular bungalows and two carport structures on a sloping lot (APN 443-511-20) on the north side of Linwood Street in the Old Town community. The applicant's report identifies the address range as 2360-2388 Linwood Street; however, City records indicate that site also includes the address of 4005 Arista Street. This is further supported by the water and sewer permit records (Attachment 1), which provide an address of 4005 Arista Street (note that the legal description of Lot 1, Block 508 is consistent with the subject site).

The property was identified in the 2012 Draft Old Town Survey and given a Status Code of 5S3, "Appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation." The date of construction at the time of the survey evaluation was unknown; however the survey identified the site as potentially significant within the theme of "Early American Development and Industrialization (1873-1929)" thereby indicating that the survey presumed that the buildings were older than their 1941 date of construction.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the property is not significant under any HRB Criteria, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The subject property at 2360-2388 Linwood Street and 4005 Arista Street was constructed in 1941 and 1942. The 2012 Draft Old Town Historic Context and Survey discusses this period in Old Town's history within the theme of "Great Depression and World War II (1930-1945)" (Attachment 2). The theme is also discussed and expanded upon in the applicant's report. As the build-up to World War II was under-way, the influx of defense workers significantly strained San Diego's housing supply. Restrictions on rooming houses and other temporary housing were lifted as San Diego struggled to keep up with the demand. New housing was constructed in small subdivisions within Old Town, and old trolley cars were re-purposed as temporary housing.

The Draft Old Town Historic Context Statement identifies the property types associated with this theme and the eligibility thresholds. There is no discussion of eligibility under Criterion A related to this theme. Review of City Directories reveals that, while some military and defense industry workers lived at several cottages during the first few years, there does not appear to be any significant link between the subject property and nearby defense employment. While the subject property did provide needed housing in the immediate pre-War period, it is no more unique in this regard than any other housing unit constructed during that time. There is no information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Old Town's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development; and therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 2360-2388 Linwood Street and 4005 Arista Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property at 2360-2388 Linwood Street and 4005 Arista Street contains a collection of 9 vernacular bungalows and two carport structures. The bungalows, each of standard wood frame construction, were built in 1941, with the exception of 2360 Linwood, which was built in 1942. They are vernacular in nature, with no explicit styling. All of the bungalows exhibit gable roofs and various forms of wood siding and windows, with few other design features or elements. No significant modifications of note are identified in the applicant's report, which

describes each bungalow in detail. The primary character defining features of each bungalow are summarized in the table below.

ADDRESS	YEAR BUILT	ROOF FORM & DETAIL	SIDING	WINDOWS	OTHER DETAILS
2360 Linwood	1942	Moderately pitched, side gabled, little eave overhang.	Wood board and batten.	Wood multi-lite casement.	Entry stoop with small projecting roof cover.
2370 Linwood	1941	Moderately pitched, side gabled, little eave overhang with exposed rafters.	Wood board and batten.	Wood multi-lite casement.	Entry with small projecting roof cover.
2372 Linwood	1941	Moderately pitched, side gabled, moderate eave overhang.	Wood shingles over horizontal wood siding.	Wood multi-lite casement.	Small entry stoop.
2374 Linwood	1941	Moderately pitched, side gabled, moderate eave overhang.	Wood board and batten.	Wood multi-lite casement.	Small entry deck.
2676 Linwood	1941	High pitched, front gabled, little eave overhang.	Horizontal wood siding and wood board and batten.	Wood multi-lite casement and diamond-pane.	Entry stoop with small projecting roof cover.
2380 Linwood	1941	Moderately pitched, side gabled, little eave overhang with exposed rafters.	Beveled wood siding.	Wood multi-lite casement and double-hung.	
2382 Linwood	1941	High pitched, side gabled, moderate eave overhang with exposed rafters.	Wood board and batten above horizontal wood siding.	Wood multi-lite casement.	
2384 Linwood	1941	High pitched, front gabled, moderate eave overhang with exposed rafters.	Wood board and batten and horizontal wood siding.	Wood multi-lite casement and double-hung.	Entry stoop with small projecting roof cover that wraps around the west elevation.
2386 Linwood	1941	High pitched, front gabled, moderate eave overhang with exposed rafters.	Wood board and batten and horizontal wood siding.	Wood multi-lite casement.	

The bungalows exhibit some Craftsman-like detailing but were constructed well outside of the period of significance for Craftsman architecture and lack other decorative features such as brackets and prominent porches. In addition, despite their 1941-1942 date of construction, the buildings do not express a clear Modernist design influence either. They are best categorized as simple vernacular bungalows, and do not embody the character defining features of a particular style, type, period or method of construction. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 2360-2388 Linwood Street and 4005 Arista Street failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - *Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.*

The property at 2360-2388 Linwood Street and 4005 Arista Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - *Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.*

The property at 2360-2388 Linwood Street and 4005 Arista Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 2360-2388 Linwood Street and 4005 Arista Street not be designated under any adopted HRB Criteria. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachments:

1. Water and Sewer Permits
2. Excerpt from Context Statement for the 2012 Draft Old Town Survey
3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

5A
521

TRIPPLICATE—To Sewer Div.

CITY OF SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA
DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS

SEWER CONNECTION ORDER

No 43129

Location 4005 Arista St

Make P.P. Connection

Lot 1 Blk. 508 Addn. C.S.D.

Owner Don Willard

Issued by SA Fee \$ 5.00

SERVICE TAPS MAIN

53 Ft. E From M.H.W. Line of

Street

SERVICE ENTERS PROPERTY

 Ft. From Line of

Street

J. Lepore
Foreman.

Not valid for purpose
stated unless stamped
"PAID" in this space.

1-27-41

OFFICE COPY (Via Shop)

CITY OF SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA
WATER DEPARTMENT

A 39529

SERVICE ORDER AND RECEIPT

WSP

21 1A 192

Date *1-25* 194*1*

Payment Having Been Made By *Ron Willard*
Of *Fourth Fine* Dollars (\$ *4500*)

Install *1* Service and *1"* Meter at *4005. Chatsworth St*

Lot *1* Block *508* Addition *OT*

Map Book *5* Page *521* P. C. Location *Tpk. on end of 2' main in SD area*

The undersigned hereby subscribes to and agrees to be bound by terms of agreement printed below.

Owner *Ron Willard* By _____

Mail Water Bills _____ Issued _____
To Address *401 Sprinkle Thru* By *RW.*

THIS SPACE FOR USE OF WATER FOREMAN ONLY

Service Location *200* Ft. *E* of *E.* Line of *La Villa Ave.* Street on *San Diego Ave* Street *N.*

Make of *1" Lead* Meter No. *5891655* Meter Rdg. _____ Size and Kind of Pipe Used *1" copper*

Kind of Paving _____ Date Installed *1-30* 194*1* Signed: *Carnell*

end of 2" main near of OT connection Foreman

GalvinPreservationAssociates



City of San Diego Old Town San Diego Community Plan Area Historic Resources Reconnaissance Survey Historic Context & Survey Report

Prepared for:
City of San Diego
Development Services Department, Planning Division
1222 First Avenue
San Diego, CA 92101

Prepared by:
Galvin Preservation Associates Inc.
231 California Street
El Segundo, CA 90245



March 2012



The Gila House Site Block 483 is the location of an early residence constructed in the 1850s. It has since been demolished and a historical marker has been placed at its original location at 3940 Harney Street. It was designated as a Historic Resource by the San Diego Historical Resources Board in 1970.

The Cobblestone Jail Site is the location of Haraszthy Jail constructed in 1851. Agoston Haraszthy, the namesake of the jail, was the first sheriff in San Diego County. The building also served as San Diego County's first hospital. It has since been demolished and a historical marker has been placed at its original location at 2360 San Diego Avenue. It was designated as a Historic Resource by the San Diego Historical Resources Board in 1970.

Theme: Early American Development and Industrialization (1873-1929)

Since the 1830s, the citizens of San Diego had attempted to establish a direct rail link to the east. This was an integral component to the vision Alonzo Horton held of San Diego as a modern city and a major seaport. 1868 and 1869 were boom years, with steady growth over the next four years until the economic panic of 1873. The population dropped to 1,500 in 1875, but then rebounded. However, San Diego's civic leaders continued to focus on the development of the railroad. By 1876 both San Francisco and Los Angeles had direct rail links to the East Coast and for San Diego to establish itself as one of California's top destinations it needed one as well. Frank Kimball represented San Diego in its venture to establish a transcontinental rail link to the East and by the 1870s he had struck a deal with the Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe Railroad.⁴³ In July of 1881, the newly formed California Southern began building a line from San Diego to San Bernardino, via Oceanside and Fallbrook, which neared completion in September of 1882.⁴⁴ However, the Southern Pacific



Figure 9: San Diego's Santa Fe Depot, 1887.
Source: <http://www.sandiegohistory.org/journal/85fall/railroadimages.htm>

prevented San Diego's upstart line to cross their already established line at Colton. This interference allowed only local trains to run from San Diego to Colton, until, November 26, 1885, when the first transcontinental train arrived in San Diego.

⁴³ James N. Price. "The Railroad Stations of San Diego County: Then and Now," *The Journal of San Diego History*, Vol. 34, No. 2, (Spring 1988). <http://www.sandiegohistory.org/journal/88spring/railroad.htm>; accessed April 1, 2010.

⁴⁴ Ibid.



Once a transcontinental line had been established, trade increased and San Diego's population boomed to 40,000. This expansion in trade brought an increase in the availability of building materials. Wood buildings gradually began to replace adobe structures. Some of the earliest buildings to be erected in the American Period were "kit" buildings, built on the East Coast of the United States and shipped in sections around Cape Horn and reassembled in San Diego.⁴⁵ During this period of time, the area of Uptown located immediately northeast of Old Town began to develop. Development during this period prior to the expansion of the railroads was slow in Old Town. Residences were constructed in the vicinity of the plaza, but much of the construction that occurred during these years occurred in New Town. Few resources from the 1870s and 1880s remain; one example is the Gatewood House at 2515 San Diego Avenue. It is a wood-framed residence that was constructed by *The Union* newspaper founder in 1873. It is designated as HRB Site #34 and is included within the Old Town State Historic Park designation of 1970.

Between 1885 and 1890 no fewer than five independent railroad lines were organized and constructed in response to the population boom. One of the first independent rail lines to be constructed was the San Diego & Old Town Railway, which began operation in 1887. However, as the line progressed toward its eventual terminus in La Jolla in 1894 its name changed to: the San Diego, Old Town & Pacific Beach in 1888, and the San Diego, Pacific Beach & La Jolla in 1894.⁴⁶ This line was also known as the "Abalone Limited".

Additional transportation advances at this time included the Santa Fe's construction of a new rail link from Oceanside to Orange County, called the "Surf Line". And on July 3, 1886, Elisha S. Babcock Jr. and Hampton L. Story launched the San Diego Streetcar Company, the city's first horse drawn trolley.⁴⁷ The following year, the Electric Rapid Transit Company debuted San Diego's first electric streetcar transit system. This line ran from Kettner Boulevard (then Arctic) to Old Town.⁴⁸ In conjunction streetcar transit franchises were handed out indiscriminately to keep up with the demand.⁴⁹ John D. Spreckels formed the San Diego Electric Railway Company in 1891. The line began in what is now downtown, eventually expanding into Balboa Park and Old Town after the turn of the century.

Despite the growing prosperity of the city, San Diego's boom quickly went bust in the 1890s as a general depression hit the U.S. In the decade that followed San Diego's population decreased by half and many of the smaller independent railroads were consolidated or literally washed away by heavy rains in 1892. However, as the turn of the century approached the city began to recover and new industries started to emerge. Although the majority of San Diego's industrial development was occurring outside of Old Town, there was limited industrial growth occurring within it. By 1900, Edward W. Akerman and Robert Alfred Tuffley brought the olive processing

⁴⁵ *San Diego Modernism Context Statement*, City of San Diego, Submitted to the State of California Office of Historic Preservation, (October 17, 2007), p. 18.

⁴⁶ Note: in 1906, the owners of the San Diego and Old Town line planned connecting service to the north and it became known as the Los Angeles & San Diego Beach Railroad, however it never went farther north than La Jolla.

⁴⁷ Gena Holle. "Transit in San Diego: ASCE Anniversary Project," *The Journal of San Diego History*, Vol. 48, No. 1, (Winter 2002). <http://www.sandiegohistory.org/journal/2002-1/holle.htm>; accessed April 1, 2010.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*

⁴⁹ *Ibid.*



industry to Old Town, when they relocated their Old Mission Olive Works Company to the former Casa de Bandini. The two business partners remodeled the first floor to house offices and rooms for olive processing and packing. The second floor functioned as housing for family and close friends of Akerman and Tuffley.



Figure 10: Casa de Bandini as the Old Mission Olive Works processing plant, 1909.
Source: Copyright, The San Diego Historical Society No. 1136.



Figure 11: Workers labeling olive oil bottles at the Old Mission Olive Works, 1908.
Source: Copyright, San Diego Historical Society No. 5728

By 1910, San Diego had fully recovered from the 1890s depression and in 1911, Akerman and Tuffley announced plans to build a new modern olive processing plant. The plant was designed by a professional architect in the Mission Revival style and covered almost an entire square block at the base of Juan Street within Old Town block 409.⁵⁰ The building was completed in 1915.⁵¹ Akerman and Tuffley continued to run their business from their new plant until 1919 when the two retired and sold their company to a corporation with local and New York investors.⁵² Five years following the sale, the company was rebranded as Old Mission

Products Company and expanded into the packaging of other agricultural products. In 1951, the original 1915 Akerman and Tuffley processing plant was demolished.

As industry continued to grow in the 1910s, rail service throughout San Diego County was

⁵⁰ Carter, 150-151.

⁵¹ Ibid.

⁵² Ibid.



further consolidated. Following the 1890s and multiple rail line purchases, by 1917, only two railroad lines operated within San Diego County, the Santa Fe and John Spreckels' San Diego & Arizona. The San Diego Electric Railway line began in what is now downtown, eventually expanding around Balboa Park by 1909 and into the park by 1912.⁵³ In 1910, the San Diego Electric Railway was expanded into Old Town on India Street at Winder Street, to California Street up La Jolla Avenue (now part of San Diego Avenue), crossing northeast to San Diego Avenue to Mason Street in the plaza.⁵⁴ The San Diego and Old Town Railroad discontinued its service in 1917. Two years later its tracks were taken up and eventually became part of John Spreckels' holdings when he constructed a San Diego Electric line to La Jolla in 1923, using much of the same rail bed.⁵⁵ Rail service flourished in the 1920s with 1924 being a peak year of trolley ridership. However, the invention and popularity of the automobile began to significantly impact rail line service.

The Pacific Highway was one of the first paved roads through the area. At one time, it was part of Highway 101. While the southern terminus of Highway 101 is now Los Angeles, it used to travel all the way south through San Diego to the Mexican border in San Ysidro. However, this portion was decommissioned and replaced in the late 1960s by Interstate 5. Significant portions of Highway 101 were historically part of El Camino Real, the route that connected Alta California's missions, presidios, and pueblos. It served as the main north-south road in California until the 1920s. Highway 101 was one of the first highways designated by the Bureau of Public Roads in 1925. Existing sections of roadway were designated routes and marked by signs so that motorists could find their way from one town to the next. Long distance automobile runs became a popular form of amusement, and soon auto camps were developed to provide over night accommodations.

The expansion of rail lines to Old Town at the turn of the 20th century likely encouraged commercial, residential, and institutional development in the area, though the pace of development was moderate, with single- and multi-family residences constructed, largely along Harney and Congress Streets. Light commercial development occurred, but it remained scattered along Congress Street and San Diego Avenue. The institutional development during the period included the construction of the Immaculate Conception Church on San Diego Avenue between Twiggs and Harney Streets.

Associated Property Types

While the early transportation improvements during the late 19th and early 20th centuries influenced the later development of the plan area, there are no directly related property types remaining. Industrial development within Old Town during this period was limited to the Old Mission Olive Works, which relocated its olive processing plant to Casa de Bandini (HRB Site #14-C) in 1900. Casa de Bandini is already listed and more reflective of the Mexican Period. The

⁵³ Richard V. Dodge, *Rails of the Silver Gate: The Spreckels San Diego Empire* (San Marino, CA: Pacific Railway Journal, 1960), 19.

⁵⁴ Dodge, 43.

⁵⁵ Price, <http://www.sandiegohistory.org/journal/88spring/railroad.htm>; accessed April 1, 2010.



larger plant building Akerman and Tuffley constructed in 1915 was demolished in 1951. Although Old Town as a whole was subdivided in 1870, a small pocket subdivision known as the Hinton Subdivision was laid out between 1900-1920. This subdivision was located along Taylor Street, between Chestnut (currently Presidio Drive) and Whitman Streets. However, there are no buildings remaining from this subdivision's original development.⁵⁶ According to the reconnaissance survey, the other buildings remaining from this period are residential, commercial, and institutional buildings just outside Old Town's original core. This development likely occurred as a result of the construction of the San Diego and Old Town Railway and the expansion of the San Diego Electric Railway into the area. The construction of these building types was scattered and largely occurred on Harney and Congress Streets and San Diego Avenue.

Residential - Single-family Residences

New residents to Old Town constructed small houses just outside the already established core area in the early part of the 19th century. These residences are concentrated along the 2400-2500 blocks of Congress Street with smaller groupings constructed immediately to the southeast. These residences were primarily vernacular cottages, Craftsman bungalows, or Spanish Colonial Revival style residences. The vernacular cottages and Craftsman bungalows are typically one-story in height, sheathed in wood clapboard or shingles, and covered by gabled roofs. The Spanish Colonial Revival style residences are typically one-story in height, sheathed in smooth stucco, and covered by either gabled or flat roofs clad with terracotta tile.

Criteria: San Diego Register Criteria B & C

Evaluation of Individual Resources: Single-family residences may be individually significant under Criterion B if they were homes of persons significant in local history. Single-family residences may also be eligible under Criterion C if they embody the distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction. These buildings will possess the character-defining features of the style they represent (See Architectural Styles in Appendix A).

Essential Factors of Integrity: Under Criterion B, location, setting, feeling, and association must be strongly present. Setting, design, materials, and feeling must be retained in the evaluation under Criterion C. In both cases, the use of the building may have changed. It is assumed that the general setting will have changed since the period of significance; however, the immediate setting should remain intact.

Residential – Multi-family Residences

Similar in style to the small single-family residences constructed at this time, multi-family residences with two to four units were also built. These residences were located in close proximity to Casa de Bandini and the former location of the 1915 Old Mission Olive Works

⁵⁶ Subdivided Lands, City of San Diego Map 1900-1942. Historical Planning Maps, City of San Diego. <http://www.sandiego.gov/city-clerk/inforecords/historicalmaps.shtml>; accessed January 15, 2011.



plant. The occupants of these residences may have been employed at the Old Mission Olive Works Company. Most of these residences can be described as vernacular turn of the century duplexes and bungalow courts. They are typically one story in height, sheathed in wood clapboard or shingles, and covered by gabled roofs with separate exterior entrances for each unit. Examples of this type of resource can be found along Conde Street.

Criteria: San Diego Register Criteria B & C

Evaluation of Individual Resources: Multi-family residences may be individually significant under Criterion B if they were homes of persons significant in local history. Multi-family residences may also be eligible under Criterion C if they embody the distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction. These buildings will possess the character-defining features of the style they represent (See Architectural Styles in Appendix A).

Essential Factors of Integrity: Under Criterion B, location, setting, feeling, and association must be strongly present. Setting, design, materials, and feeling must be retained in the evaluation under Criterion C. In both cases, the use of the building may have changed. It is assumed that the general setting will have changed since the period of significance; however, the immediate setting should remain intact.

Commercial – Retail Stores

Although few commercial buildings were constructed within Old Town during this period, there are a couple remaining examples. These buildings are typically small, one-story, wood-framed buildings, sheathed in either clapboard siding or smooth stucco with Western False Front facades. The majority of surviving examples are concentrated near Old Town's original core and are interspersed along San Diego Avenue and Harney and Congress Streets. They can be generally described as early 20th Century commercial buildings. Example of this type of property can be found at 2505 and 2515 San Diego Avenue.

Criteria: San Diego Register Criterion C

Evaluation of Individual Resources: Commercial buildings may be individually significant under Criterion C if they embody the distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction. These buildings will possess the character-defining features of the style they represent (See Architectural Styles in Appendix A). Considering the fact that few commercial buildings remain from the early American development and industrialization period, even representative examples of types and styles may qualify.

Essential Factors of Integrity: Under Criterion C setting, design, materials, and feeling must be retained in the evaluation. In both cases, the use of the building may have changed. It is assumed that the general setting will have changed since the period of significance; however, the immediate setting should remain intact. Signage may have changed unless it was an integral component of the architecture.



Institutional – Religious Properties

There is only one prime example of a religious property associated with this theme in the plan area, the Immaculate Conception Church. Constructed in 1917, the Immaculate Conception Church replaced the Old Adobe Church, as the primary place of worship for Catholics in Old Town. The church was dedicated in 1919, and has been in continuous operation since that time.

Criteria: San Diego Register Criteria A & C



Figure 12: Catholic Church of Immaculate Conception

Evaluation of Individual Resources: Religious buildings may be individually significant under Criterion A as a rare surviving example of a property type that played an important role in the development of Old Town San Diego during the early American Period. Examples of these property types may also be significant under Criterion C, if they embody the distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction. Good examples of religious buildings will reflect their original use, and layout from the era in which they were constructed. Related buildings such as parsonages, Sunday school buildings and social halls should also be

evaluated as a part of the properties if they were present during the period of significance and retain their physical integrity. Considering the fact that few religious buildings remain within the plan area, even representative examples may qualify.

Essential Factors of Integrity: Location, design, materials, and feeling must be retained in the evaluation under Criteria A and C. The primary character-defining features such as the exterior materials, roof forms, main entryway, and fenestration should remain intact.

Theme: Automobile, Early Tourism and Preservation in Old Town

In Old Town there were two distinct periods of development directly influenced by tourism and preservation. The first phase occurred from 1904 to 1939 and revolved around the impact of the automobile. This phase was characterized by early motorists' interest in buildings remaining from the Spanish and Mexican Periods in Old Town. The second phase was characterized more by the restoration, reconstruction, relocation, and recordation of existing resources that became tourist attractions in the first phase. Since there is a significant break in time between these two periods, as a result of World War II, they will be discussed separately below.

Phase 1: The Automobile, Early Tourism and Preservation (1904-1939)

In the early 1900s, the popularity of the automobile had led to auto touring as a recreational activity. By 1904 Southern California had been described as a "paradise" for car enthusiasts.



Commercial – Restaurants



Figure 16: 4620 Pacific Coast Highway

As a result of the tourism industry there are numerous restaurants in the plan area. There are two typical types of restaurants within the Old Town plan area. They are either one-story freestanding buildings surrounded by surface parking lots or they are located within commercial strips that are one to two stories in height at pedestrian level. These buildings were typically constructed in the Spanish Colonial

Revival style due to enforced design guidelines established with the Old Town Planned District. However, some examples remain of other styles that were popular during the post-war period. A good example of this property type can be found at 4620 Pacific Highway.

Criteria: San Diego Register Criterion C

Evaluation of Individual Resources: Restaurants may be individually significant under Criterion C if they embody the distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction. These buildings will possess the character-defining features of the style they represent (See Architectural Styles in Appendix A as well as the San Diego Modernism Historic Context Statement).

Essential Factors of Integrity: Under Criterion C setting, design, materials, feeling and workmanship must be retained in the evaluation. The use of the building may have changed and it is assumed that the general setting will have changed since the period of significance; however, the immediate setting should remain intact.

Theme: Great Depression and World War II (1930-1945)

Unlike most of the nation, San Diego did not immediately experience the effects of the 1929 stock market crash. The city experienced a much more gradual decline since its industrial base was still in its development stages. However in the years that immediately followed, real estate sales declined and development largely ceased. In order to generate economic development, state and federal government relief programs were created to fund a variety of infrastructure, civic, and residential construction projects in the 1930s.



Figure 17: FHA Demonstration House in Mesa AZ, 1936.

Source: National Register Bulletin: Historic Residential Suburbs p. 63.

During this period, focus shifted to the improvement of American domestic life, advocating home ownership and standardized construction practices. However, as housing construction continued to decline during the deepening depression, the



ideal of the small house took on new urgency. The 1931 President's Conference for the design of residential neighborhoods resulted in recommendations from the nation's foremost experts on how to stimulate the construction industry while improving the quality of housing for the average American family.⁷² This goal was largely achieved by the Federal Housing Administration (FHA) established in 1934. The FHA approved properties for mortgage insurance and published construction standards for housing.

In 1936 the FHA published its first guide to efficient comfortable living, titled *Planning Small Houses*. The publication featured five house types that would provide maximum accommodation within a minimum amount of space.⁷³ By 1940, the "FHA minimum house" originally presented in the 1936 guide, had been reworked to allow for expansion and the design could be influenced by individual style preferences with the addition of gables, porches, materials, roof types, windows, and shutters. During the 1930s and 1940s the minimum house was being expressed in the Streamline Moderne and Minimal Traditional styles.

Within Old Town, the ideals of the 1930s FHA publications emerged in the development of a residential neighborhood constructed in the Minimal Traditional style, along Jackson, Sunset, and Juan Streets, located just below the San Diego Presidio Site. This development spanned Block 450 and Lot 1 of Block 449 of the original Old Town San Diego plat map. The new subdivision map was filed on January 18, 1938 at the request of land owner, George W. Marston and Percy H. Broell.⁷⁴ Development within these two blocks began in 1938 and continued up through 1945.

However, this was not the only new subdivision George Marston was developing within Old Town during this period. In addition to his subdivision along Jackson, Sunset, and Juan Streets, he also began developing a new subdivision to the northwest eight years earlier. This subdivision included Block 423 of the Old Town San Diego plat map, and a portion of the Hinton subdivision. This section of Marston's land was re-mapped on June 12, 1930 to accommodate the continuation of Jackson Street. This subdivision was bounded by Taylor, Whitman, Chestnut (currently Presidio Drive) and Wallace Streets.⁷⁵

The latter half of the 1930s saw the continuation of the efforts in Old Town to preserve its early history. As a part of the Historic American Buildings Survey, the Casa de Bandini, Casa de Estudillo, and the Casa de Lopez were recorded in 1937. The Works Progress Administration (WPA) completed numerous projects in Old Town. WPA funds provided for the rebuilding of the Adobe Chapel of the Immaculate Conception near its original site in 1937.⁷⁶ WPA funding also allowed for the construction of a wall in Presidio Park, which was built to represent the

⁷² "Hoover Stresses Need for Easier Home Buying," *Los Angeles Times*, December 3, 1931, 1.

⁷³ "Booklets to Guide Home Building Offered," *Los Angeles Times*, June 28, 1936, E4.

⁷⁴ Record of Survey No. 631, Block 450 and Lot 1 of Block 449 of Old San Diego, San Diego California, January 18, 1938.

⁷⁵ Licensed Surveyors Map No. 409. Licensed Survey of Lots G, H, I, & J, Hinton Subdivision & Portions of Block 423 Old San Diego, San Diego California June 12, 1930.

⁷⁶ California Office of Historic Preservation, "California Historical Landmarks: San Diego County," http://www.parks.ca.gov/?page_id=21478 (accessed August 9, 2011).



eastern wall of the original presidio.⁷⁷ The agency also constructed an outlook structure at the head of the Franciscan garden and created trails and pathways within the park.⁷⁸

In the mid-1930s San Diego's economy began to recover and on October 20, 1935, the city received a huge industrial economic boost when Ruben H. Fleet relocated Consolidated Aircraft to the Midway area, just southwest of Old Town. Fleet came to San Diego with \$9 million in unfilled orders and 800 employees.⁷⁹ Shortly after the company's relocation, Consolidated Aircraft received one of its largest contracts from the Navy for 60 twin-engine PBV-1 patrol bombers.⁸⁰ As the Great Depression came to a close Consolidated Aircraft had 9,000 employees and by 1941 its workforce had jumped to 25,000 when the U.S. entered World War II.⁸¹

Following the bombing of Pearl Harbor on December 7, 1941, military bases along the Pacific Coast became prime strategic locations for the Pacific fleets. Between the recruitment of military personnel and defense contract workers, the population of San Diego soared. From 1940 through the summer of 1943, San Diego's growth far surpassed its ability to provide housing and services for thousands of defense workers.⁸² This increase in population impacted everything from housing, to transportation and schools.



Figure 18: Old trolley cars at the foot of Presidio Hill serving as temporary housing.

Source: <http://www.sandiegohistory.org/journal/93spring/suburbs.htm>

Within Old Town, during this period, circulation patterns were transformed to accommodate the construction of La Jolla Avenue (currently part of San Diego Avenue) and the Pacific Highway expansion, which resulted in the closure and remapping of a variety of Old Town's original streets and subdivision blocks.⁸³

The City attempted to assist in the search for homes by developing a Defense Housing Commission, which listed available vacancies

within the area.⁸⁴ The City also lifted ordinances against rooming houses in residential zones, but

⁷⁷ James Mills, "A Spanish Wall," *The Journal of San Diego History* Vol. 2, No. 3 (July 1956), <http://www.sandiegohistory.org/journal/56july/wall.htm> (accessed August 9, 2011).

⁷⁸ Thomas L. Scharf, ed. "Presidio Park: A Statement of George W. Marston in 1942," *The Journal of San Diego History* Vol. 32, No. 2 (Spring 1986), <http://www.sandiegohistory.org/journal/86spring/presidio.htm> (accessed August 9, 2011).

⁷⁹ William Wagner. *Ryan, The Aviator: Being the Adventures and Ventures of Pioneer airman and Businessman, T. Claude Ryan*. (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1971), 182-183.

⁸⁰ *Ibid*, 185.

⁸¹ Mike Davis, Kelly Mayhew and Jim Miller. *Under the Perfect Sun: The San Diego Tourists Never See*. (New York: The New Press, 2003).

⁸² Mary Taschner, "Boomerang Boom: San Diego 1941-1942," *Journal of San Diego History*. Volume 28, Number 1. (Winter, 1982), <http://www.sandiegohistory.org/journal/82winter/boom.htm>; accessed April 1, 2010.

⁸³ Record of Survey Map No. 752, July 31, 1939; Record of Survey Map No. 929, June 13, 1941; Record of Survey Map 1799, April 22, 1943; Old San Diego, San Diego California.

⁸⁴ *Ibid*.



nothing could meet the continuous immigration of defense workers. Soon military and defense workers began to seek housing in Old Town due to its close proximity to the Midway area. Existing housing within the Old Town San Diego Community Plan Area had already become filled to capacity like most of San Diego. In an effort to provide temporary housing, old trolley cars were relocated to a vacant lot within Old Town, along Juan and present-day Taylor Streets. Auto-camps previously used for traveling motorists within Old Town also began to be utilized as temporary housing and the U.S. Navy took possession of the former Mrs. Hubbel's Western Bakery buildings, to aid in housing military operations and personnel.⁸⁵

Finally, in 1940, the Federal government passed the Lanham Act, which appropriated \$150 million to the Federal Works Agency to provide massive amounts of housing in congested defense industry centers. The development of defense housing units within the city would be located in undeveloped areas both east and north of the city's downtown.⁸⁶

Between 1940 and 1942 two smaller subdivisions were developed within Old Town. One was located just north of Taylor Street, along Juan and Gains Streets, and the other consisted of a section of government housing projects constructed along Calhoun and Juan Streets between Harney and Mason Streets. However, both areas have since been redeveloped with few buildings remaining from this period.⁸⁷

Associated Property Types

According to Sanborn maps, property types associated with this theme include the adaptive re-use of tourist motor courts, auto courts, and even old trolley cars as temporary housing for the influx in defense and military personnel. However no examples of this type of temporary housing remain. In addition to temporary residential accommodations, permanent single-family residences were constructed. A concentrated pocket of single-family residences constructed during this time is still present just below Presidio Hill. The only industrial development within Old Town during this period was the construction of Mrs. Hubbel's Bakery located along Pacific Highway.

Residential - Single-family Residences

The single-family residences constructed during this period are concentrated below Presidio Park along Sunset, Mason, Twiggs and Jefferson Streets. The majority of the homes were designed in the Minimal Traditional style with a few constructed in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. These residences tend to be one story to one and half stories in height depending on grading with moderate setbacks and landscaped front yards. Good examples of this property type can be found along the 2600 block of Sunset Street.

Criteria: San Diego Register Criteria B & C

⁸⁵ Sanborn 1940 cor. 1945.

⁸⁶ *San Diego Modernism Context Statement*, 33.

⁸⁷ Subdivided Lands, City of San Diego Map 1900-1942. Historical Planning Maps, City of San Diego. <http://www.sandiego.gov/city-clerk/inforecords/historicalmaps.shtml>; accessed January 15, 2011.



Figure 19: 4119-21 Mason Street

Evaluation of Individual Resources: Single-family residences may be individually significant under Criterion B if they were the homes of persons significant in local history. Single-family residences may also be eligible under Criterion C if they embody the distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction. These buildings will possess the character-defining features of the style it represents (see the Architectural Styles in Appendix A).

Evaluation of Historic Districts: A contiguous grouping of similar single-family residences from this period may be eligible for listing as a historic district under Criteria A-E. Once a district has been listed individual buildings may qualify as contributors under Criterion F. A contributing building should reflect the architectural style and form that it would have possessed at the time of construction. Historic districts must retain a substantial majority of buildings dating from the period of significance and collectively reflect a particular style or period.

Essential Factors of Integrity: Setting, location, feeling, and association must be strongly present. A contributing building to a historic district should reflect the architectural style and form that it would have possessed at the time of construction.

Theme: Post World War II (1946-1970)

Following World War II, San Diego experienced a continued population increase as veterans and defense workers began to permanently settle in the area. By 1950, San Diego's population had increased from 203,341 in 1940 to 334,387, creating a massive demand for permanent housing.⁸⁸ In response, developers began constructing large suburban tract homes along the city's outskirts. At the end of the 1940s the role of the developer had been transformed with the Housing Act of 1949. This act made it profitable for developers to construct multiple houses from stock plans rather than having the homeowner construct their own residence. The residences tended to be affordable, and modest in scale with simple floor plans.

Within Old Town, there was a surge of new development. Pockets of residential tract homes began to be constructed within the area's already existing housing developments. These homes were similar to the outlying suburban developments in their repetitive style however they were constructed on a smaller scale and varied between single- and multi-family residential units. Examples of this type of post-war housing can be seen along the 2200 block of Congress Street and the 2600 block of Juan Street.

⁸⁸ Oscar Kaplan, "A Housing Report on the San Diego Metropolitan Area," prepared for the San Diego Chamber of Commerce, August 1952.