



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: August 13, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-035

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of August 27, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – William Joel Butler Spec House #1**

APPLICANT: Elisa Cleland and John Niles represented by Allen Hazard & Janet O’Dea

LOCATION: 1125 Fort Stockton Drive, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the William Joel Butler Spec House #1 located at 1125 Fort Stockton Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the William Joel Butler Spec House #1 located at 1125 Fort Stockton Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1909 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 432 square foot 1976 rear bedroom addition. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman Bungalow style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1909 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitch, side-gabled roof and front gable dormer; wood-capped columns on the concrete full-width front porch; 4 inch wood lap siding on the first story with wood shingles on the dormer; exposed rafter tails and simple triangular knee brackets; and multi-light and single-light wood windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a one-and a half-story Craftsman style single family residence built in 1909, and is located on the south side of Fort Stockton Drive between Jackdaw and Ibis Street, in the Arnold and Choates Subdivision of Mission Hills.

The building is located on APN 444-405-02-00. The property was identified in the draft 2007 Uptown Survey and given a status code of “5D3,” Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation.

The historic name of the resource, the William Joel Butler Spec. House #1 has been identified consistent with the Board’s adopted naming policy and reflects the name of William Joel Butler, a building contractor who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Allen Hazard and Janet O’Dea, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one and a half story Craftsman bungalow built in 1909 as a single family residence. The house is constructed of wood cladding on battered concrete foundation. Wood lap siding covers all sides of the house with a square-corbels decorated stringcourse. The property exudes Craftsman style with its low pitched gabled roof, simple wood shingles on the upper dormer, full-width front porch with wood-capped columns supporting a covered porch with a low point area, triangular knee brackets, overhanging eaves, and exposed rafter tails. The front includes a door slightly off center with an older—but not original—floral design glass window pane. Paired 10-light French doors are set to the left, and a fixed window with 16 upper lights is set to the right. All wooden casings and 1:1 double hung windows on the house are original with the exception of one windowpane on the eastern side. The building also has eight over two muntin picture windows, and French doors in the front and rear.

The property was originally constructed as a two bedroom, one bathroom 864 square foot house; which later expanded to 1,104 square feet in 1976, when an additional bedroom and bathroom was added to the rear. An original 1909 rear garage or shed is believed to have been demolished in the process.

Modifications to the original building neither greatly impair its integrity nor detract from the building’s character defining features. Other than the 1976 rear addition, few alterations have been made to the property. A new wooden fence and gate surrounds the property and is constructed in a simple fashion. Alterations do not affect essential physical features critical to the Craftsman style and the building retains its integrity of design, materials, workmanship, and feeling. Thus, the building remains eligible under HRB Criterion C. As the 1976 rear addition does not date to the period of significance and has no part in contributing any style significance of its own, it should not be included within designation.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by

Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled or hipped roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including wood frame construction; prominent front porch gable roof cover with exposed rafters and wood-capped columns; first-story wood lap siding and wood shingles on the upper level; simple triangular knee brackets and a combination of multi-light and single-light wood windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C. Staff does not recommend the inclusion of the rear 1976 addition.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the William Joel Butler Spec House #1 located at 1125 Fort Stockton Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1909 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the Craftsman style. The designation excludes the 1976 rear bedroom addition. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jane Kang
Planning Intern



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JK/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 8/27/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/27/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **William Joel Butler Spec. House #1**(owned by Elsa E. Cleland and John O. Niles III, 1125 Fort Stockton Drive, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **1125 Fort Stockton Drive, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **444-405-02-00**, further described as BLK 57 LOTS 1 THRU 4 W 37 FT OF E 73 FT in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the William Joel Butler Spec House #1 on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1909 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitch, side-gabled roof and front gable dormer; wood-capped columns on the concrete full-width front porch; 4 inch woodlap siding on the first story with wood shingles on the dormer; exposed rafter tails and simple triangular knee brackets; and multi-light and single-light wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1967 rear bedroom addition.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
INGA LINTVEDT,
Deputy City Attorney