



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: October 15, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-047

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of October 22, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #14 – George and Iris Goodman House**

APPLICANT: Costa Family Trust represented by Allen Hazard & Janet O'Dea

LOCATION: 5330 Le Barron Road, College Area Community, Council District 9

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the George and Iris Goodman House located at 5330 Le Barron Road as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the George and Iris Goodman House located at 5330 Le Barron Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1968 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Organic Geometric architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low, horizontal floor-plan integrated into the building site; flat, complex off-set roofs with broad overhanging eaves and wood soffits; sharp right angles in rectangular and trapezoidal forms; stucco over wood frame construction; large expanses of fixed and casement wood-framed windows and fixed and louvered clerestories that minimize the separation between indoor and outdoor spaces, particularly within the common areas of the house; covered patios supported by brick walls and columns; and a broad brick chimney.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is located on APN 461-290-03-00 in the gated residential subdivision of Alvarado Estates. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the George and Iris Goodman House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the original owners who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Allen Hazard and Janet O'Dea, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 5330 Le Barron Road did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or College Area's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 5330 Le Barron Road did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property located at 5330 Le Barron Road was constructed in 1968 in the Organic Geometric style and features a low, horizontal floor-plan integrated into the building site; flat, complex off-set roofs with broad overhanging eaves and wood soffits; sharp right angles in rectangular and trapezoidal forms; stucco over wood frame construction; and a concrete foundation. The wood soffit on the main roof features a dramatic up-swept angle. Openings in the soffits are provided at portions of the house where the soffit are particularly deep, providing light to the rooms inside. The use of large expanses of wood-framed windows and clerestories minimizes the separation between indoor and outdoor spaces, particularly within the common areas of the house. Windows are typically fixed, casement and louvered. Covered patios supported by brick walls and columns extend the house out to the yard, strengthening the connection. A broad brick chimney is present on the rear of the house, and pierces through the main roof. No notable modifications have occurred to the property.

Organic Geometric architecture is a philosophy of design which promotes a harmonious relationship between buildings and nature. Organic Geometric designers made use of natural building materials such as wood and stone and designed building respectful to the site. Like their Post and Beam Modern

contemporaries, Organic Geometric architects also used glass to minimize the separation between interior and exterior and encourage indoor/outdoor living. Buildings were carefully sited to take advantage of views and other site features, often built on steep slopes and boasting large balconies. In terms of shape, architects designed these buildings with an emphasis on rectilinear geometry, and the designs are characterized by asymmetrical facades, unusual rooflines, and angular shapes. Primary character-defining features of an Organic Geometric style house are: exposed structure and materials; square, diamond and polygon design motifs; natural materials. Secondary features are: sharp angular massing; asymmetrical facades; complex roof forms; and site specific design.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Organic Geometric style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a low, horizontal floor-plan integrated into the building site; flat, complex off-set roofs with broad overhanging eaves and wood soffits; sharp right angles in rectangular and trapezoidal forms; stucco over wood frame construction; large expanses of fixed and casement wood-framed windows and fixed and louvered clerestories that minimize the separation between indoor and outdoor spaces, particularly within the common areas of the house; covered patios supported by brick walls and columns; and a broad brick chimney. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 5330 Le Barron Road was designed by architect Rex Lottery. Lottery has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 5330 Le Barron Road has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 5330 Le Barron Road is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the George and Iris Goodman House located at 5330 Le Barron Road be designated with a period of significance of 1968 under HRB Criterion C as a property that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Organic Geometric style. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 10/22/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 10/22/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **George and Iris Goodman House** (owned by Costa Family Trust 05-04-06, 5330 Le Barron Road, San Diego, CA 92115) located at **5330 Le Barron Road, San Diego, CA 92115**, APN: **461-290-03-00**, further described as LOT 106 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the George and Iris Goodman House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Organic Geometric architecture and retains integrity to its 1968 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low, horizontal floor-plan integrated into the building site; flat, complex offset roofs with broad overhanging eaves and wood soffits; sharp right angles in rectangular and trapezoidal forms; stucco over wood frame construction; large expanses of fixed and casement wood-framed windows and fixed and louvered clerestories that minimize the separation between indoor and outdoor spaces, particularly within the common areas of the house; covered patios supported by brick walls and columns; and a broad brick chimney. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney