

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	November 5, 2015	REPORT NO. HRB-15-056
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of November 20, 2015	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #9 – Alexander Schreiber Spec Ho	ouse #7
APPLICANT:	Michael Tuke represented by Urbana Presen	rvation & Planning
LOCATION:	1429 Dale Street, Greater Golden Hill Com	munity, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Alexander a located at 1429 Dale Street as a historical result.	1

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Alexander Schreiber Spec House #7 located at 1429 Dale Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1916 under HRB Criteria C and D. Interior elements included in the designation are original gumwood base, wainscot, window and door surrounds, crown moulding, built-in buffet, built-in fireplace cabinets, and associated interior doors located in the living room, sitting room and dining room. The designation excludes the non-historic north side balcony and the modified detached garage and studio structure at the rear of the property. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

- 1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1916 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a prominent low-pitched roof with wide eave overhang and decorative rafters, beams and verge boards; redwood shingle cladding and vertical wood slat attic vents; fenestration consisting primarily of groupings of single-lite wood double hung windows or multi-lite wood casements; and a partial width front with massive stucco columns and decorative beams.
- 2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is the oldest among Schreiber-built homes on the local register and is notable as an early demonstration of Schreiber's quality of design and craftsmanship at the onset of his career as a building contractor.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a two-story single-family residence built in 1916 in the Craftsman style on the east side of Dale Street, between Ash Street and Beech Street in the South Park Addition of the Greater Golden Hill Community.

The building is located on APN 539-412-04-00. The property was identified in the 1996 Mid-City Survey as a potentially individually significant structure within the South Park Potential Historic District.

The historic name of the resource, the Alexander Schreiber Spec House #7, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Urbana Preservation & Planning, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A, C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D, but not HRB Criterion A. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 1429 Dale Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Greater Golden Hill Community's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. The applicant's report asserts that the resource is a special element of the neighborhood's cultural and architectural development as one third of an intact assemblage of three Craftsman style homes in a row, built by Alexander Schreiber consecutively along Dale Street between 1916 and 1917. Besides showing Schreiber's efficiency as a speculation home builder, no detailed evidence or analysis has been provided in the report that would demonstrate that the subject property influenced the neighborhood's cultural or architectural development to any greater extent than other homes of the period. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a two-story Craftsman style single-family residence built in 1916 of standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation. The building exhibits an asymmetrical primary façade and a rectangular plan form with a partial width front porch. The

prominent low-pitched gabled roof presents wide eave overhang with decorative, upswept rafters, beams and verge boards. The building is clad in redwood shingle and offers vertical wood slat attic vents in the front and rear-facing gable ends. A concrete walkway and stairs lead up to the front porch marked by its massive stucco columns topped by decorative beams to match the roof elaborations, and the 3-lite wood entry door. The building's copious fenestration consists primarily of 1-over-1 wood double hung windows and 3-over-1 wood casement windows, appearing typically in groups. At the north (side) elevation a stucco chimney simply trimmed with brick is flanked by a pair of square-shaped fixed wood windows. On the south elevation, a bow window provides ample light and space for the dining room. A detached garage and studio structure at the rear, southeast corner of the property has been modified to match the existing house and is proposed for exclusion from the designation.

The applicant proposes a number of interior elements be included in the designation (Attachment 2). Proposed interior elements include original gumwood base, wainscot, window and door surrounds, crown moulding, built-in buffet, built-in fireplace cabinets, and associated interior doors. These proposed features are limited only to the living room, sitting room and dining room of the house. Interior doors included are the French and bi-fold doors at the east and north walls of the sitting room, and the solid swinging door at the east wall of the dining room. Staff supports the inclusion of these original, Craftsman style interior elements in the designation of this resource.

Alterations to the subject property are fairly limited and do not greatly affect the building's character defining features or integrity. At the north side of the building, a balcony has been added over a flat roofed section located between two side gabled roofs. Though clad in a matching wood shingle, the balcony does not overwhelm the overall structure in terms of bulk and scale, nor does it significantly impact character-defining features. The report also identifies two replacement square-shaped metal casement windows on the south side of the sitting room. Other alterations include a non-historic pavers applied at the driveway and a small portion of non-historic walkway added at the front. Overall, the modifications to the resource do not impair its ability to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The resource retains a great deal of original architectural detailing and continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a prominent low-pitched roof with wide eave overhang and decorative rafters, beams and verge boards; redwood shingle cladding and vertical wood slat attic vents; fenestration consisting primarily of groupings of single-lite wood double

hung windows or multi-lite wood casements; and a partial width front with massive stucco columns and decorative beams. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C. Interior elements included in the designation are original gumwood base, wainscot, window and door surrounds, crown moulding, built-in buffet, built-in fireplace cabinets, and associated interior doors located in the living room, sitting room and dining room. The designation excludes the non-historic north side balcony and the modified detached garage and studio structure at the rear of the property.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Alexander Schreiber was born in Kansas in 1887 and moved to San Diego in 1912, at age 25. Little is known of his early career in San Diego; however, in 1912 he was listed as a carpenter in the City Directory. He progressed to the building contractor profession by 1916 and in the mid 1920s he operated a real estate office in the then burgeoning district of Hillcrest. While his dealing in real estate has yet to be fully researched, his primary occupation was as a building contractor until his retirement in the 1940s.

During his career, Schreiber was a prolific builder, designing and building houses and commercial buildings throughout the City in neighborhoods including North and South Park, University Heights, Loma Portal, Encanto and Mission Hills. Most of his house designs were in the Craftsman and Spanish Eclectic vernacular so popular in the 1920s and 30s, though he did design at least two houses in Mission Hills in the Prairie style. In addition to being a skilled builder, he was an early experimenter in the use of electricity in houses, his obituary crediting him with building the first home in San Diego completely wired for electrical appliances. There are presently eleven designated historic resources listed on the City's register which were built by Schreiber and designated for that association.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The subject property at 1429 Dale Street was built by Schreiber as a speculation house. The resource retains a good level of integrity to its 1916 date of construction and is notable as the oldest among historically designated Schreiber-built structures, revealing early on his attention to high quality and distinctive architectural character in the Craftsman style. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion D, as a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Alexander Schreiber Spec House #7 located at 1429 Dale Street be designated with a period of significance of 1916 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the

Craftsman style; and HRB Criterion D as a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber. Interior elements included in the designation are original gumwood base, wainscot, window and door surrounds, crown moulding, built-in buffet, built-in fireplace cabinets, and associated interior doors located in the living room, sitting room and dining room. The designation excludes the non-historic north side balcony and the modified detached garage and studio structure at the rear of the property. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Camille Pekarek Associate Planner

CP/ks

Kelley Stanco Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

Attachments:

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Interior Elements included in the designation
- 3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 11/20/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/20/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **Alexander Schreiber Spec House #7** (owned by Rosa Tuke Trust 07-09-2014, 1429 Dale Street, San Diego, CA 92102) located at **1429 Dale Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92102**, APN: **539-412-04-00**, further described as BLK 24 LOT 3 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Alexander Schreiber Spec House #7 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1916 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a prominent low-pitched roof with wide eave overhang and decorative rafters, beams and verge boards; redwood shingle cladding and vertical wood slat attic vents; fenestration consisting primarily of groupings of single-lite wood double hung windows or multi-lite wood casements; and a partial width front with massive stucco columns and decorative beams. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is the oldest among Schreiber-built homes on the local register and is notable as an early demonstration of Schreiber's quality of design and craftsmanship at the onset of his career as a building contractor. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall include the original gumwood base, wainscot, window and door surrounds, crown moulding, built-in buffet, built-in fireplace cabinets, and associated interior doors located in the living room, sitting room and dining room.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the non-historic north side balcony and the modified detached garage and studio structure at the rear of the property.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

JOHN LEMMO, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, CITY ATTORNEY

BY:

CORRINE NEUFFER, Deputy City Attorney

Site Plan – 1429 Dale Street

Interior elements proposed for designation: original gumwood base, wainscot, window and door surrounds, crown moulding, built-in buffet, built-in fireplace cabinets, and associated interior doors located in the living room (A), sitting room (B) and dining room (C).

