

CITY OF SAN DIEGO
M E M O R A N D U M

DATE: October 15, 2015

TO: Historical Resources Board and Interested Parties

FROM: Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt/Cliff May House**

This item was previously docketed for review by the Historical Resources Board on July 23, 2015, at which time staff recommended designation of the property under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Monterey style with a 1936 period of significance (Attachment 2). The item was not heard at that time, and was continued at the request of the applicant to allow time to update the historic report with new information regarding an association with Master Architect Cliff May.

The applicant has since provided a revised report with additional information and analysis addressing Criterion D, including copies of original plans signed by Cliff May and dated April 2, 1936 (Attachment 3). The plans' title block identifies the building as a "Monterey [sic] for Adm & Mrs A Farenholt." The applicant's revised report identifies ten resources attributed to Master Architect Cliff May that are currently listed on the local register. With one exception, these May-designed homes were built between 1932-1936, and none have been identified as Monterey in style.

Some discrepancies exist between the subject building and the original plans provided in the report, but are not considered significant indications of integrity loss. First, the plans call for a variety of outswing casement windows, which the building retains. The elevation drawings, however, do not show the operations or light patterns in a way that precisely matches the field conditions. Second, there are no louvered shutters present on the house as shown in the elevation drawings. No historic documentation has been presented to indicate whether this was a field change, or that the building originally had shutters which were then removed at a later date.

Master Architect Clifford May was a sixth-generation San Diego native and a descendant of the pioneering Estudillo family. He did not have formal architectural training, but learned his craft on the job, finding inspiration in his personal connection and detailed knowledge of the region's Spanish colonial architectural heritage. Before leaving for Los Angeles in 1938 May designed approximately fifty houses in San Diego. As undisputed father of the modern ranch house, most of his works reflect traditional adobe hacienda architecture, but featured the newest materials and construction techniques. They are typically low in scale and spread out on the parcel to create definition between the street and private courtyard space for the resident. Nearly all May-designed works on the local register reflect these design characteristics and his signature California Hacienda or California Rancheria style. By contrast, the subject property is in the Monterey style with a taller, 2-story form and no clearly defined courtyard feature. It is notable as it offers a unique perspective of May's breadth of style in a Monterey variety, while still drawing from the Spanish colonial roots that he so appreciated.

Staff's recommendation for designation under Criterion C remains unchanged. In consideration of the additional Criterion D information and analysis provided in the revised report, staff's recommendation is modified to include Criterion D as follows:

Designate the Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt/Cliff May House located at 3626 Hyacinth Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1936 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 1966 two story addition to the northeast wing of the property. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Monterey style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1936 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features two-storied massing; low-pitched hipped roof of Mission clay tile with moderate eave overhang and exposed rafters; full length second story balcony, cantilevered and covered by the principal roof; smooth stucco cladding; deeply inset, central primary entry; and fenestration consisting primarily of 3-light and 4-light wood double casement windows.
2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect Cliff May and retains integrity as it relates to the original 1936 design. Specifically, the resource demonstrates characteristic excellence of craftsmanship and design, and is a unique example of May's early work in the Monterey style.



Camille Pekarek
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

- Attachments:
1. Updated Draft Resolution
 2. Staff Report HRB-15-032 dated July 9, 2015
 3. Applicant's Revised Historical Research Report dated August 6, 2015 (under separate cover)

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 10/22/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 10/22/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt/Cliff May House** (owned by Terence M. Choate, 3626 Hyacinth Drive, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **3626 Hyacinth Drive, San Diego, CA 92106**, APN: **450-170-05-00**, further described as BLK C LOT 6 NE 1/2 LOT 5 & ALL in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt/Cliff May House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Monterey style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1936 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features two-storied massing; low-pitched hipped roof of Mission clay tile with moderate eave overhang and exposed rafters; full length second story balcony, cantilevered and covered by the principal roof; smooth stucco cladding; deeply inset, central primary entry; and fenestration consisting primarily of 3-light and 4-light wood double casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Architect Cliff May and retains integrity as it relates to the original 1936 design. Specifically, the resource demonstrates characteristic excellence of craftsmanship and design, and is a unique example of May's early work in the Monterey style. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1966 two story addition to the northeast wing of the property.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: July 9, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-032

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of July 23, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt House**

APPLICANT: Terence M. Choate represented by Archaeos

LOCATION: 3626 Hyacinth Drive, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt House located at 3626 Hyacinth Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt House located at 3626 Hyacinth Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1936 under HRB Criteria C. The designation excludes the 1966 two story addition to the northeast wing of the property. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Monterey style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1936 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features two-storied massing; low-pitched hipped roof of Mission clay tile with moderate eave overhang and exposed rafters; full length second story balcony, cantilevered and covered by the principal roof; smooth stucco cladding; deeply inset, central primary entry; and fenestration consisting primarily of 3-light and 4-light wood double casement windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a two-story Monterey style singly-family residence built in 1936 on the east side of Hyacinth Drive, just north of Narcissus Drive in the Plumosa Park Subdivision of the Peninsula Community.

The building is located on APN 450-170-05-00. The property was identified in the Quieter Home Program (QHP) Phase 4 in 2008 and given a status code of 3D, “Appears eligible for NR as a contributor to a NR eligible district through survey evaluation.”

The historic name of the resource, the Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt House, has been identified consistent with the Board’s adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Archaeos, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The resource is a two-story, single-family residence built in 1936 in the Monterey style. The building is of standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation and retains a primarily rectangular plan form. The building is clad in smooth stucco and generally demonstrates a symmetrical, box-like appearance. The low-pitch hipped roof is sheathed in Mission clay tile and exhibits moderate eave overhang with decorative exposed rafter tails. Most striking along the primary elevation is a full-length, cantilevered second story balcony covered by the principal roof, and highly indicative of the Monterey style. The primary entry is centrally located, deeply recessed and includes a paneled wood door with original hardware. A stucco clad chimney is located on the south (side) elevation. Fenestration consists primarily of 3-light or 4-light wood double casement windows. Two side wings project rearward from the primary mass of the structure – one story to the south and two stories to the north. The original, flat-roofed detached garage is located to the rear, at the southeast corner of the property.

The Monterey style is one of California’s few indigenous architectural styles and was popular during the first half of the twentieth century. The style blended old Spanish building characteristics with the architectural language of New England that was being brought to California at the time. Character defining features of this style include low-pitched gabled or hipped roofs, and cantilevered second floor balconies with wood railings covered by the principal roof. It is not uncommon to have wood railings replaced with decorative iron railings in the Creole French variant. Roofs are usually covered in wood shingle or tile, and walls are typically clad in stucco, brick or wood. Door and window surrounds sometimes mimic the Territorial examples of the Spanish Colonial prototypes; paired windows and false shutters are common.

Alterations to the subject resource are fairly limited and do not significantly detract from the building’s character defining features or overall integrity. In 2009, original windows and doors were replaced in-kind and in original openings as part of the San Diego Quieter Home Program.

Brick planters have been added to the front elevation and a brick courtyard and walkways were added at the north end of the property. A picture window at the rear elevation at the east wing is believed to be a replacement of unknown age, while a window pair also at the rear elevation was replaced with a single window in an existing opening in 2015. The house has been restuccoed in a smooth texture similar to the original and in keeping with the character of the building. Finally, a 1966 two-story addition to the northeast rear wing of the building is fairly close to the original stylistically but can still be distinguished by a differing roof plane and differing header height in the fenestration. This addition is set back from the primary elevation and does not overwhelm the original structure on the whole. Overall, impacts to the building's character defining features have been limited and do not greatly impact integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling.

Significance Statement: Limited modifications allow the house to continue to convey the historic significance of the Monterey style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including two-storied massing; low-pitched hipped roof of Mission clay tile with moderate eave overhang and exposed rafters; full length second story balcony, cantilevered and covered by the principal roof; smooth stucco cladding; deeply inset, central primary entry; and fenestration consisting primarily of 3-light and 4-light wood double casement windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The applicant's report asserts that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of Master Architect Richard Requa. The report further suggests the building is distinguished among other historically designated Requa-designed works in that it is representative of a later period of productivity, and in that it is in the Monterey style rather than in the Spanish Eclectic style, for which he is more popularly known.

The report does not provide clear supporting evidence that Requa is in fact responsible for the property's design. The report only notes that Requa owned the property prior to the Farenholts when they were deeded the property in 1936, and identifies speculation made about the property's designer from the 2008 QHP survey documentation. The date of construction, according to the Assessor's Building Record, is 1936. The water and sewer connection records are dated June 1, 1936, and the owner is listed as A. Farenholt. The Requas transferred the property to the Farenholts in March of 1936, and it is not known for certain whether the property was sold with or without improvements on the site. While the property's general design and ownership history may suggest a connection to Requa, and while the Criteria Guidelines allow an association with a Master to be substantiated through a design and quality of detailing similar to other known works by the Master, that substantiation has not been fully demonstrated in the report. Furthermore, while the subject property is certainly an example of quality construction and design, its Monterey style is atypical of Requa's more well-known body of work, which has been almost uniformly characterized as Spanish Eclectic.

The applicant has not adequately corroborated the building's association with Master Architect Richard Requa to distinguish the property as a notable work of the Master. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt House located at 3626 Hyacinth Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1936 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Monterey style. The designation excludes the 1966 two story addition to the northeast wing of the property. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 7/23/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 7/23/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt House** (owned by Terence M. Choate, 3626 Hyacinth Drive, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **3626 Hyacinth Drive, San Diego, CA 92106**, APN: **450-170-05-00**, further described as BLK C LOT 6 NE 1/2 LOT 5 & ALL in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Monterey style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1936 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features two-storied massing; low-pitched hipped roof of Mission clay tile with moderate eave overhang and exposed rafters; full length second story balcony, cantilevered and covered by the principal roof; smooth stucco cladding; deeply inset, central primary entry; and fenestration consisting primarily of 3-light and 4-light wood double casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1966 two story addition to the northeast wing of the property.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
INGA LINTVEDT,
Deputy City Attorney