

# THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	June 21, 2012	REPORT NO. HRB-12-016
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of June 28, 2012	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #9 – Hans and Mabel Hirte House	
APPLICANT:	Joe Cordileone	
LOCATION:	2465 Curlew Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3	
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Hans and M 2465 Curlew Street as a historical resource.	

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Designate the Hans and Mabel Hirte House located at 2465 Curlew Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1923 under HRB Criterion C. The designation shall exclude the smaller detached brick structure addressed at 427 West Laurel Street, as is not highly reflective of the Spanish Eclectic architecture for which the site is significant. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1923 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the one and two story resource exhibits a hipped roof with red clay Roman tiles at the two-story massing and a flat roof with simple parapet at the one-story massing; overhanging eaves with decorative cut rafter tails; heavy dash stucco; a stucco-coated brick chimney; brick trim at the basement level; a shed roof with Roman clay tiles supported on carved wood brackets above the entry; and fenestration consisting of arched and squared wood frame in sash windows in fixed and double hung varieties, some with divided lites.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building located at 2465 Curlew Street is a one and two story single family home located on the southeast corner of Curlew and Laurel Streets in the Uptown subdivision of Horton's Addition. The house shares the lot with a smaller structure addressed at 427 West Laurel Street, which predates the larger house by roughly eight years. The structure is a small, single story brick dwelling constructed c.1914-1915 at the extreme east end of the lot. The lot was sold to Hans and Mabel Hirte by Alonzo and Margaret Horton in July 1916. City Directory listings for the Hirtes show them living at 427 West Laurel

**Development Services Department** 1222 First Avenue, MS 512 • San Diego, CA 92101-4155 Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 446-5499 Street beginning in 1915, around the time it was constructed. It is possible that this building was intended as a temporary residence while the larger home was constructed on the west end of the lot at Curlew Street. This smaller is not highly reflective of Spanish Eclectic architecture, and the owner is not proposing to include it in the designation. Should the owner wish to evaluate and nominate this structure is the future, the designation could be amended.

The historic name of the resource, the Hans and Mabel Hirte House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the original owners Hans and Mabel Hirte, who had the house constructed as their personal residence.

## ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by the owners, Joe Cordileone and Dr. Diana Cordileone, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

# CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject house located at 2465 Curlew Street was constructed in 1923 in the Spanish Eclectic style and features a rectangular footprint with a two story massing concentrated at the corner of Curlew and Laurel Streets; a hipped roof with red clay Roman tiles at the two-story massing and a flat roof with simple parapet at the one-story massing; overhanging eaves with decorative cut rafter tails; heavy dash stucco over wood frame construction; a stucco-coated brick chimney on the north façade; brick trim at the basement level; and a concrete foundation. The west elevation fronts on to Curlew Street directly abutting the sidewalk. This elevation features three tri-partite windows, one a the second floor and two at the first floor, featuring a large fixed single pane flanked by 1-over-1 double hung windows. Two small wood frame and sash windows with original wrought iron grilles at set at the basement level. The entry is accessed off of Curlew Street along the south side elevation, and features a wall-mounted tile fountain with the entry door and sidelights to the left and a pair of 1-over-1 double hung windows to the right, all recessed under a shed tile roof supported by decorative wood brackets. Remaining fenestration at this façade consists of 1-over-1 double hung and single lite fixed wood frame and sash windows. The north façade fronting on to West Laurel Street exhibits a variety of windows and doors, including small 6-lite arched windows, tri-partite windows with a large fixed single pane flanked by 1-over-1 double hung windows, and a decorative side service door with sidelights and an arched transom above. All window and doors along the north, west and south elevations are original.

Modifications are highly limited, and include removal of the divided lites from the side service door and arched transom along the north elevation, which were replaced with wood paneling and a single pane of glass, respectively; and the addition of non-historic decorative wrought iron window grilles, primarily along West Laurel Street, presumably for security. The heavy dash stucco has received several coats of paint, slightly dulling the texture, and the stucco on the west elevation is particularly worn from wind traveling up Laurel Street from the bay. A wrought iron railing was also added at the second floor balcony.

Hugely popular following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition which revived the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture; the Spanish Eclectic style was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries. The subject house conveys the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style, including the Roman tile hipped roofs and flat roofs with parapets; heavy dash stucco walls; arched and squared single and divided lite windows; wrought iron detailing; and an entry accented by a water feature and a shed tile roof on carved wood brackets, as detailed above. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

### **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

### CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Hans and Mabel Hirte House located at 2465 Curlew Street be designated with a period of significance of 1923 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture. The designation shall exclude the smaller detached brick structure addressed at 427 West Laurel Street, as is not highly reflective of the Spanish Eclectic architecture for which the site is significant. Should the owner wish to evaluate and nominate this structure is the future, the designation could be amended. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Kelley Stanco Senior Planner

KS/cw

Attachments:

Cathy Sunternol

Cathy Winterrowd Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

Draft Resolution
Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

### RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 6/28/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/28/2012, to consider the historical designation of the **Hans and Mabel Hirte House** located at **2465 Curlew Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92101**, APN: **533-075-01-00**, further described as BLK 274 LOT A in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Hans and Mabel Hirte House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1923 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the one and two story resource exhibits a hipped roof with red clay Roman tiles at the two-story massing and a flat roof with simple parapet at the one-story massing; overhanging eaves with decorative cut rafter tails; heavy dash stucco; a stucco-coated brick chimney; brick trim at the basement level; a shed roof with Roman clay tiles supported on carved wood brackets above the entry; and fenestration consisting of arched and squared wood frame in sash windows in fixed and double hung varieties, some with divided lites. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**. The designation shall exclude the smaller detached brick structure addressed at 427 West Laurel Street, as is not highly reflective of the Spanish Eclectic architecture for which the site is significant.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, CITY ATTORNEY JOHN LEMMO, Chair Historical Resources Board

BY: \_

KEITH BAUERLE Deputy City Attorney