

# Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 15, 2012 REPORT NO. HRB-12-072

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board

Agenda of November 29, 2012

SUBJECT: ITEM #8 – J. Rex and Alice Murray Spec House #1

APPLICANT: Aaron and Victoria Haberman represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 4266 Arista Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the J. Rex and Alice Murray Spec House #1

located at 4266 Arista Street as a historical resource.

# STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the J. Rex and Alice Murray Spec House #1 located at 4266 Arista Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1930 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1930 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched hipped red Mission tile roof; low overhanging eaves; exposed roof rafters; stucco exterior; stucco chimney; partial width front porch with thick wood columns, exposed beams and scored concrete flooring; large wood front door; and fenestration containing wood multi-paned casement and fixed wood windows.

# **BACKGROUND**

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The house is a one-story building with a basement and a detached, two-car garage located at the southeast corner of the property. The site is located on the northwestern side of Arista Street, south of Presidio Drive within the Mission Hills Neighborhood of the Uptown Community.

The historic name of the resource, the J. Rex and Alice Murray Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the original owners, who constructed the house on June 18, 1930 per the Notice of Completion, and sold the property on October 31, 1931 without ever living at the house, according to directory research.

#### **ANALYSIS**

A historical resource research was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property is located at 4266 Arista Street and is a one-story, asymmetrical Spanish Eclectic home with a basement constructed in 1930 and features a low-pitched hipped red Mission tile roof; low overhanging eaves; exposed roof rafters; and a slightly textured stucco exterior set on a reinforced concrete foundation. The stucco chimney is located on the south side yard elevation and contains a decorative chimney top. The front elevation features a partial width front porch with a wide roof overhang and is supported by thick wood columns and exposed beams. The porch floor features the original scored concrete and the entire porch area contains wood casement windows, French doors, a recessed entryway, and a large wood front door with sidelight windows on either side of the door. The southeast corner of the structure features a hipped turret where the living room is located. The turret contains recessed, arched wood windows with fixed upper sections and multi-paned casement sections below. The rear elevation features a rear staircase which leads to the kitchen, and below the staircase is a semi-circular arch that leads to the basement. There is also a small balcony along the western elevation which is accessed from the kitchen. Fenestration consists of wood multi-paned casement and fixed wood windows. The original detached two-car garage is located at the southeast corner of the property with the same Spanish Eclectic style as the house.

The only modification to the structure is the replacement of the original wood kitchen windows on the north elevation with jalousie windows at an unspecified date. These window modifications are not visible from the street and are the only wood windows that have been replaced. Additionally, historic resources staff recently approved interior work that includes replacing the non-historic windows with more appropriate wood windows.

Hugely popular following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition which revived the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture; the Spanish Eclectic style was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled,

cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries. The subject house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a low-pitched hipped red Mission tile roof; low overhanging eaves; exposed roof rafters; stucco exterior; stucco chimney; partial width front porch with thick wood columns, exposed beams and scored concrete flooring; and a large wood front door. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject building under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains integrity to the 1930 date of construction.

# **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

### CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the J. Rex and Alice Murray Spec House #1 located at 4266 Arista Street be designated with a period of significance of 1930 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jeffrey E. Oakley Associate Planner Cathy Winterrowd

Assistant Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

JO/ks/cw

Attachments:

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

### RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 11/29/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/29/2012, to consider the historical designation of the **J. Rex and Alice Murray Spec House #1** (owned by Aaron R. and Victoria E. N. Haberman, 4266 Arista Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **4266 Arista Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **442-703-02-00**, further described as BLK A LOT 2 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

#### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the J. Rex and Alice Murray Spec House #1 on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1930 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched hipped red Mission tile roof; low overhanging eaves; exposed roof rafters; stucco exterior; stucco chimney; partial width front porch with thick wood columns, exposed beams and scored concrete flooring; large wood front door; and fenestration containing wood multipaned casement and fixed wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.** 

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A	
	BY:
	JOHN LEMMO, Chair
	Historical Resources Board
APPROVED AS TO FORM AND	
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,	BY:
CITY ATTORNEY	KEITH BAUERLE
	Deputy City Attorney