

DRAFT
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF APRIL 26, 2012
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:25PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Keith Bauerle, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR March 22, 2012

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BETHKE TO APPROVE THE MARCH 22, 2012 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-2

Motion Passes

(Larimer, Rivera)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Erik Hanson – Ministerial reviews

Dan Soderberg – Demolition of resources without HRB hearing

Bruce Coons – Farmers Market

Alana Coons – Farmers Market

.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Silvas notified staff he would not be in attendance..

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Applicant's request for continuance for Item 5 – Annie Porter House
- ✓ Applicant's request for continuance for Item 8 – 2823 Juniper Street
- ✓ Letter regarding Item #6 – The Luscomb Building
- ✓ Letter regarding Item #9 – 1257 Virginia Way
- ✓ Letter regarding Item #11 – 524 Coast Boulevard South
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- I would like to take a minute to acknowledge and thank Shannon Anthony, the Board Secretary for all her hard work and support she provides to Boardmembers and staff. She is a very important part of the historical resources section and works tirelessly behind-the-scenes to keep things running smoothly in preparation for our monthly meetings. In addition, Shannon often makes the all-important first impression on City customers via phone and in person and helps consultants with document retrieval, general questions, minutes, resolutions, and all sorts of other requests. We really appreciate all you do Shannon, thanks!
- Appeal of the designation of the Anderson Furniture Building at 741 F Street is scheduled to be heard by the City Council on May 8, 2012.
- Reminder that the Balboa Park Plaza de Panama Special Meeting for the HRB recommendation on the project will be held on Friday, May 18, 2012.
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, May 2, 2012. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, May 14, 2012. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, May 14, 2012.

- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 2 referrals from Development Services, both were continued from a previous agenda; 6 individual homeowner nominations; and a National Register Nomination. There are 7 homeowner nominations in 2011 and 9 homeowner nominations in 2012 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation. We are on schedule to complete all of these nominations by the end of this calendar year.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The property owners' representative, Scott Moomjian, has requested a continuance to the May 24, 2012 hearing of the following two items:

- Item 5 – Annie Porter house located at 2126-2130 Front Street
- Item 8 – 2823 Juniper Street

Staff does not support either continuance to a date certain as the May agenda is full, but does support an indefinite continuance for both items. The applicants can work with staff to schedule these items as agenda space is available.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT A CONTINUANCE FOR ITEMS 5 AND 8 TO JULY

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – IMIG MANOR/LAFAYETTE HOTEL

ITEM 10 – LESLIE R. AND ISABEL M. SMITH/CHARLES H. SALYERS RESIDENCE

ITEM 12 – JOSH DELVALLE HOUSE

ITEM 13 – SAN DIEGO FREE SPEECH SITE AT HELLER'S CORNER

Board Discussion:

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 7, 12, AND 13 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 9-1-0
(Rivera)

Motion Passes

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATIONS

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – ANNIE PORTER HOUSE

Continued from March 2012

Applicant: Owner represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2126-30 Front Street, 92101, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1289 1-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2126-30 Front Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Annie Porter House located at 2126-30 Front Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1895 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear additions consisting of an approx 144 square feet one story addition constructed c. 1921 with an approx 144 square feet second story addition above constructed at an unknown date.

Report Number: HRB-12-008

ITEM CONTINUED TO JULY AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

ITEM 6 –THE LUSCOMB BUILDING

Continued from March 2012

Applicant: Owner represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1797 San Diego Avenue, 92110, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1797 San Diego Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate The Luscomb Building located at 1797 San Diego Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion A. The designation shall exclude the two-story building at the south end of the lot constructed in 1932.

Report Number: HRB-12-010

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Bruce Coons, Dan Soderberg

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (*Joe Holasek, Marie Lia, Adam Lorrell*), Michael Matson, John Case

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge wanted to clarify that the HRB cannot consider a project. Original intent of the building was a warehouse; Programmatic architecture can be a warehouse. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry also supports Staff's recommendation, changes are also historic.

Boardmember Bethke is on the fence, if original intent was a warehouse, then why is architecture unique. There are some integrity issues shown in the 1930's photo.

Boardmember Marrone thinks that even with the changes to the windows and doors it still conveys the Castle motif. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini mentioned that it is one of two tourist camps left on San Diego Avenue, she supports Staff's recommendation.

Chair Lemmo supports Staff's recommendation. Technical issue with resolution related to the correct address: "Castle Building" is 1797 San Diego Avenue; excluded building is 1769 San Diego Avenue.

Boardmember Rivera is on the fence, it appears to meet Criterion A, has concerns about integrity and the construction of I-5.

Boardmember Larimer has a hard time supporting Staff's findings. Why are we looking to designate under Criterion A for Programmatic architecture and not Criterion C. Findings cannot be made for Tourist Camp, does not support Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports designation under Criterion A; wanted to know if the period of significance could be expanded to 1932 to include motor court use.

Boardmember Baksh thinks that while it is unique, it has lost integrity. He does not support designation.

Boardmember Curry wanted to know if extending the period of significance would solve the problem of integrity under Criterion A, reflects history of community.

Boardmember Berge thinks there is merit to extend the period of significance from 1927-1932.

Boardmember Larimer can't support extending the period of significance as auto court.

Boardmember Berge said extension only to reflect re-use of building not auto court.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – THE LUSCOMB BUILDING PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 6-4-0

Motion Passes

(Baksh, Garbini, Larimer, Rivera)

ITEM 7 – IMIG MANOR/LAFAYETTE HOTEL

Applicant: Owner represented by Urbana Preservation & Planning, LLC

Location: 2223 El Cajon Boulevard, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 4-D)

Description: Review the National Register Nomination of the Imig Manor/Lafayette Hotel

Today's Action: Review and make a recommendation on the National Register Nomination of the Lafayette Hotel

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the Office of Historic Preservation the listing of the Imig Manor/Lafayette Hotel a resort hotel, designed by Master Architect Frank L. Hope, Jr. and constructed by San Diego homebuilder Larry Imig. Constructed in 1946 and located along El Cajon Boulevard—Historic Highway 80 and San Diego's primary east-west auto corridor, the property is recommended for listing under Criterion A for its association with community development patterns of El Cajon Boulevard and as the first Post WWII Suburban Resort Hotel Established in San Diego and under Criterion C as a significant example of Colonial Revival

style architect applied to a commercial-hotel property and as a unique example of work by Master Architect Frank L. Hope, Jr.

Report Number: HRB-12-024

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 – 2823 JUNIPER STREET

Applicant: Owner represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2823 Juniper Street, 92104, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 1-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2823 Juniper Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2823 Juniper Street under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-12-025

ITEM CONTINUED TO JULY AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

ITEM 9 – 1257 VIRGINIA WAY

Applicant: Owner represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 1257 Virginia Way, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 7-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1257 Virginia Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1257 Virginia Way under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity and insufficient passage of time to properly evaluate the historic significance of the individual associated with the house.

Report Number: HRB-12-027

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Vonn Marie May (*Ron May*) Dan Soderberg, Mark Tarasuck, Trip Bennett, Bruce Coons, Don Schmidt, Bill Eldredge

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation primarily due to the substantial remodeling that has been done and secondary to the lack of sufficient time that has passed. Hopes that Schaelchlin can be nominated in associated with another property.

Boardmember Woods agrees with Boardmember Baksh, she supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer modifications to house are not an issue, he did not think there was enough background on Patricia Schaelchlin and her body of work, he supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff's recommendation, believes that she was a key component to the community; not sure that it was significant enough to deem her home historical.

Vice-Chair Garbini commented on the comparisons made to the Mary Ward/Emmor Brooke Weaver House, but does not see the similarities between the houses. The Mary Englebook house was renovated but was not changed.

Boardmember Marrone disagrees with Staff, and agrees with the speakers. She had the privilege of knowing Schaelchlin. She was passionate about La Jolla history, her survey and book is the reference for La Jolla. The house has changed but that is where she did her work; if it is not designated who knows what the future will hold.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry thinks that the history of preservation includes movement and leaders, need to look at preservation history. She disagrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Berge also disagrees with Staff, based on testimony and past designations of the HRB for people, even if the homes have been altered.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – 1257 VIRGINIA WAY UNDER CRITERION B FOR ITS ASSOCIATION WITH PATRICIA SCHAELECHLIN WHO WAS SIGNIFICANT IN THE LOCAL HISTORY AND BASED ON HER CONTRIBUTIONS TO LA JOLLA'S PRESERVATION COMMUNITY, THE BOOKS THAT SHE AUTHORED, HER 1970'S SURVEY OF LA JOLLA AND HER SERVICE TO THE HISTORIC SITE BOARD AND THE LA JOLLA HISTORICAL SOCIETY

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 4-6-0

Motion Fails

(Baksh, Bethke, Lemmo, Larimer, Rivera, Woods)

ITEM 10 – LESLIE R. AND ISABEL M. SMITH/CHARLES H. SALYERS RESIDENCE

Applicant: Owner represented by IS Architecture

Location: 2626 Clove Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2626 Clove Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Leslie R. and Isabel M. Smith/Charles H. Salyers Residence located at 2626 Clove Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1937 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-12-028

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATIONS

ITEM 11 – 524 COAST BOULEVARD SOUTH

Applicant: Owner represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 524 Coast Boulevard South, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 7-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2023 Juniper Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 524 Coast Boulevard South under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity and insufficient passage of time to properly evaluate the historic significance of the individual associated with the house.

Report Number: HRB-12-029

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Vonn Marie May (*Ron May*) Laura Barton Williams (*Gabriela Predroza Auser*), Mary Ruth Barton, Bruce Coons, Trip Bennett, Dan Soderberg, Don Schmidt

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge is in favor of designation, they have options to consider designation under Criteria A, B, and C. We need to acknowledge our community advocates, these are the people that are down in the trenches and this home is a gem. She is in favor of designation under A, B and C.

Boardmember Curry agrees that it should be designated, strongest argument can be made for Criterion B. Designation under Criteria A and C can also be supported.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone thinks this is truly a landmark home. She supports designation under Criterion C, addition is acceptable. She also supports designation under Criteria B and under A as well, beach cottage significant to La Jolla and important to community.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports designation under Criteria A, B and C, portions of landscape should be included as well.

Chair Lemmo would like to support designation under Criterion A, but there is nothing in the report about A. If they cannot designate it today, he would like to make a motion to return the report for more information on A. Can also support under Criterion C, addition is acceptable.

Boardmember Rivera wanted to know if Odell's involvement in the end of the Vietnam War is documented. She may be able to support designation under Criterion A if there is more information provided.

Boardmember Larimer agrees with Staff's recommendation based on today's presentation. He would consider designation under Criterion A if more information is provided. He does not support designation under Criteria B and C.

Boardmember Woods also agrees with Staff's recommendation on Criteria B and C; would maybe consider Criterion A if more information is provided.

Boardmember Baksh thinks that maybe the City should find another mechanism to pay tribute to significant historic people; he supports Staff's recommendation due to the cumulative modifications of the home.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – 524 COAST BOULEVARD SOUTH UNDER CRITERION C BECAUSE IT EMBODIES DISTINCTIVE

