

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

FEBRUARY 23, 2006

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM – 12TH FLOOR
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Schwartz at 1:06 PM.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Chairperson	Lloyd Schwartz	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Absent
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Absent
Boardmember	Don Harrison	Present
Boardmember	Donna Jones	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present (left meeting at 2:05 PM)
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present
Boardmember	Timothy Murphy	Present
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in attendance: Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
Diane Kane, Senior Planner/Historian
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Jacqueline Lindsay, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF JANUARY 26, 2006

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER JONES TO APPROVE THE JANUARY 26, 2006 MINUTES AS DRAFTED WITH NO MODIFICATIONS.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-1 (Silvas). Motion passes.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

- Bruce Coons from SOHO spoke about working on the Downtown Community Plan.
- Matt Peterson representing property owner Jim Allen requested the issue of a revocation hearing to remove the historical designation on the Carrey Crest property be brought to the Policy Subcommittee and the full HRB as soon as possible.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information

Notification of Absences

- Boardmember Emme notified staff that he would be out of town and would not be able to attend the meeting.

B. Subcommittee Reports

The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on February 1 and considered a proposed remodel to the Cave Store in La Jolla, the NTC Sign Plan, and modifications to the Tourist Hotel on Market Street. The next meeting will be on Wednesday, March 1, at 3 PM.

The Policy Subcommittee met on February 13th and considered the general issue of when it would be appropriate to remove the historical designation of a property, without discussing any specific projects, and the Quieter Homes Program was discussed. The next meeting will be on Monday, March 13, at 3 PM.

The Archaeology Subcommittee did not meet in February but will meet on March 13, at 4:00 PM.

-

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

Conflicts of interest

- Mr. Marshall declared a conflict of interest with Item #5 – Warehouse Thematic District.

Ex parte communications

None.

Failure to visit sites for designation

None.

D. Staff Report

- With the departure of Gail Goldberg, Betsy McCullough has been appointed Acting Planning Director. She will continue to attend HRB meetings and be involved in historic resource issues but may be spending some what less time directly supervising the Historical Resources Program. Kelly Saunders, previously with the Historical Resources Section of Planning will be rejoining our group in March. She has been in Development Services for the past year or so and will bring that recent experience together with her love of and past experience with historical resources back to Planning. Progress is being made in filling the Senior Clerk position and Lois Stowell, long-time previous Secretary to the Board, is helping out at today's meeting.
- Boardmembers will note that staff has scheduled four designation requests from the public on today's agenda. Staff has received 9 new designation requests from members of the public since the last HRB meeting, bringing the total number of designation requests that are waiting to be reviewed by staff to 58. We will continue to review and docket these voluntary designations as staff time allows.
- Following up on discussions at Policy Subcommittee and last month's Board meeting, the staff recommendation for two items on the agenda includes a second recommendation directing staff to address the issue of visibility in a Mills Act Agreement, if the property is designated. We are not asking the Board to provide any specific guidance or requirements beyond the intent of the recommendation which is for staff to work with the property owner at the time of a request for a Mills Act Agreement. These two cases happen to relate to visibility however, it is anticipated that staff will be making recommendations similar to these or addressing other possible issues that need to be part of a Mills Act Agreement on future designations. Also, the staff recommendations in this month's agenda are more extensive than in prior agendas in order to make the record clear in terms of the basis for designation.
- May is Preservation Month and California Archaeology Month and we thought it would be fitting to hold Board's annual retreat this year on Saturday May 13. We are looking for a venue and are putting together an agenda focusing on our current practices and policies related to designation and project review. It is possible that new Board Members will be appointed prior to the retreat. Hopefully, Ms. Sewell and Mr. Delawie can hold on another month or two. More information on the retreat will be forthcoming.
- The National Trust for Historic Preservation has sent a Request for Proposals to the City to host the 2010 National Conference. Diane has been in contact with the San

Diego Convention and Visitors Bureau who would take the lead in preparing the RFP. A huge funding raising commitment would be required to host this conference but if it can be pulled together it would be terrific and a huge boost to historic tourism in San Diego.

E. Requests for Continuances

None.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- **ITEM 6 – CARLETON & FRANCES BUNCE/LOUISE SEVERIN HOUSE**
- **ITEM 7 – HARRY MILLER HOUSE**
- **ITEM 8 – BISHOP CHARLES FRANCES BUDDY HOUSE**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE ITEMS 6, 7, AND 8 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 11-0-0. Motion passes.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – WAREHOUSE THEMATIC DISTRICT

Applicant: Save Our Heritage Organisation (SOHO)

Location: Various addresses within study area boundaries, defined by mid-block Island to the north, the railroad easement along Harbor Drive, Commercial Avenue, and National Avenue to the south, the west side of Fourth Avenue to the west, and the east side of Fifteenth Street to the east, Centre City Community, Council District 2 or 8

Description: First hearing to consider the designation of the Warehouse Thematic Historic District as a Historical Resource

Today's Action: Determine whether the district application is complete and take public testimony to establish the level of owner support for district designation.

Staff Recommendation: If public testimony is favorable, direct staff to bring a district nomination forward at the March 23, 2006 HRB meeting for historical designation.

Report Number: HRB-06-007

Staff report given by Diane Kane. Updated information including a revised District boundary map, updated information on owner consent, and potential HRB Options for action were provided to the HRB at the meeting.

Testimony Received:

In support: Bruce Coons, David Swarens, Beth Montes, Welton Jones, Bob Sinclair, Mike Madigan.

In opposition: Scott Moomjian, Matt Peterson, Michael Witkin, Lee Morrison.

Public testimony was closed.

Board discussion that establishment of the larger, original district would not be consistent with the HRB district policy regarding owner consent in establishing Historical Districts. Chairman Schwartz took an informal poll of Boardmembers and there was not sufficient support to suspend the current HRB District Policy requiring majority of owner support to establish a district. Board discussion on establishing a smaller District, west of Park Boulevard, consistent with the East Village proposal that meets HRB policy. CCDC requested clarification of review process for properties located outside the smaller district boundaries (specifically for buildings identified as Survey #28 and #22). Staff responded that those properties located outside the proposed District boundaries would be treated as individual properties.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL FOR STAFF TO PREPARE AND BRING TO A FUTURE BOARD MEETING A DISTRICT NOMINATION TO ESTABLISH A SMALLER WAREHOUSE THEMATIC HISTORIC DISTRICT PER THE EAST VILLAGE ASSOCIATION PROPOSAL, BOUNDED ON THE EAST BY PARK BOULEVARD (12TH AVENUE), EXCLUDING THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 536 7TH AVENUE AND THE PROPERTIES WHERE THE OWNERS HAVE NOT GIVEN CONSENT (444 6TH AVENUE; 502-522 7TH AVENUE; 372 4TH AVENUE; 418 10TH AVENUE; 410 10TH AVENUE;), AND INCLUDING THOSE PROPERTIES REPORTED AS ABSTAINING IF OWNER CONSENT IS GIVEN PRIOR TO THE NEXT HEARING. AS AMENDED ON APRIL 27, 2006, THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 502-522 7TH AVENUE AND 536 7TH AVENUE ARE NOT TO BE CONSIDERED CONTRIBUTORS FOR PURPOSES OF DESIGNATION WITHIN THE AFOREMENTIONED WAREHOUSE THEMATIC HISTORIC DISTRICT.

Seconded by Boardmember Jones. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BURNETT TO ADOPT THE WAREHOUSE DISTRICT HISTORICAL REPORT AS A SURVEY FOR USE IN PLANNING AND TO SUPPORT SOHO IN DISTRICT DESIGNATION AT THE STATE AND/OR FEDERAL LEVEL.

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 6 – CARLETON & FRANCES BUNCE/LOUISE SEVERIN HOUSE

Applicant: Beth Montes on behalf of David P. Hess

Location: 4179 Norfolk Terrace, Kensington Community Planning Area, Council District 3

Description: Single-story Spanish Colonial Revival style house built by Louise M. Severin in 1929.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate 4179 Norfolk Terrace as a historical building under Criterion C, as a fine example of Spanish Colonial Revival architecture embodying the distinctive characteristics of the style with a shallow-pitched red tile roof, rustic patterned stucco, wood-frame windows (many with multi-pane upper sashes), and rusticated front door. It is also recommended that the property be designated under HRB Criterion D as representative of the work of Master Builder Louise Severin.

Report Number: HRB-06-008

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D.

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 11-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 7 – HARRY MILLER HOUSE

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia on behalf of Mr. Keith Horne

Location: 2003 Sunset Boulevard, Uptown Community Planning Area, Council District 2

Description: Prairie-style house built in 1919 for Harry Miller.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: 1) Designate the Harry Miller House under HRB Criterion C, due to its intact and excellent example of the Prairie style of architecture, and exclude from the designation the decks and stairs on the east (Arden Way side) that are clearly new and reversible, the small single-story attached shed, also reversible and sympathetic in design to the house, that was added at the west elevation, as well as the new open wrought iron entry gate, new open wrought iron side panels, and associated new stucco-faced low columns near the property line on Sunset Blvd.
2) Direct staff to include specific provisions in a Mills Act Agreement requiring the property owner to maintain or increase the current level of public visibility of the primary façade of the house.

Report Number: HRB-06-009

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER HRB CRITERION C AND INCLUDE SPECIFIC PROVISIONS IN A MILLS ACT AGREEMENT REQUIRING THE PROPERTY OWNER TO MAINTAIN OR

INCREASE THE CURRENT LEVEL OF PUBLIC VISIBILITY OF THE PRIMARY FAÇADE OF THE HOUSE.

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 11-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 8 – BISHOP CHARLES FRANCES BUDDY HOUSE

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia on behalf of Ms. Jennifer Sefton

Location: 2031 Sunset Boulevard, Uptown Community Planning Area, Council District 2

Description: House constructed in 1922 in the Italian Renaissance style.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Bishop Charles Frances Buddy House under HRB Criteria B and C, as Bishop Buddy was instrumental in the development of the Roman Catholic Church dioceses in San Diego, as well as church-related academic, health care and social facilities during his residency at 2031 Sunset Blvd., and due to its excellent example of the Italian Renaissance style, in particular as viewed from the public right-of-way. Include in the designation the more recent chapel structure (exclusive of the paintings), fountain and terrace due to their association with Bishop Buddy; and exclude from the designation the current garage built in 1993 and a pergola that appears to have been built when a sacristy structure originally attached to the chapel that was removed.

Report Number: HRB-06-010

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER HRB CRITERIA B AND C AND INCLUDE IN THE DESIGNATION THE MORE RECENT CHAPEL STRUCTURE (EXCLUSIVE OF THE PAINTINGS), FOUNTAIN AND TERRACE DUE TO THEIR ASSOCIATION WITH BISHOP BUDDY; AND EXCLUDE FROM THE DESIGNATION THE CURRENT GARAGE BUILT IN 1993 AND A PERGOLA THAT APPEARS TO HAVE BEEN BUILT WHEN A SACRISTY STRUCTURE, ORIGINALLY ATTACHED TO THE CHAPEL WAS REMOVED.

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 11-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 9 – EDWARD ALLING/WILLIAM STERLING HEBBARD HOUSE

Applicant: Scott A. Moomjian on behalf of the Glassman Family Trust dated July 30, 2002

Location: 3226 Curlew Street, Uptown Community Planning Area, Council District 2

Description: Flat Roof Italian Renaissance style single-family residence designed by Master Architect William Sterling Hebbard and constructed in 1912.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: 1) Designate the Edward Alling/William Sterling Hebbard House under HRB Criteria C and D as an excellent representative example of the Italian Renaissance architectural style, particularly the Flat Roof subtype, and as a notable work of Master Architect William Sterling Hebbard; exclude from the designation the more recent additions of a swimming

pool, small deck, and stairway along the southwest elevation. 2) Direct staff to include specific provisions in a Mills Act Agreement requiring the property owner to maintain or increase the current level of public visibility of the primary façade of the house.

Report Number: HRB-06-011

Staff report given by Michael Tudury.

Testimony Received:

In support: Scott Moomjian, representing the owner, Glassman Family Trust. Mr. Moomjian urged designation of the house and stated that the recent work on the house does not affect the historic integrity of the resource.

In opposition: None.

Public testimony was closed.

Boardmember Sewell identified that the research report was not correct and that there had been extensive renovations to the house under the direction of an architect in 1987 and that although beautifully done the current materials are not original. Boardmember Marshall commented that the staff report given at the meeting was not consistent with the written staff report, particularly with regard to changed windows and doors and questioned whether there was enough of the original fabric and character defining features to designate. Boardmember Schaefer requested that the DPR form and the historic report be revised to reflect the correct history of the property.

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D AND INCLUDE SPECIFIC PROVISIONS IN A MILLS ACT AGREEMENT REQUIRING THE PROPERTY OWNER TO INCREASE THE CURRENT LEVEL OF PUBLIC VISIBILITY OF THE PRIMARY FAÇADE OF THE HOUSE

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 11-0 -0. Motion passes.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SCHAEFER THAT THE HISTORICAL RECORD BE CORRECTED BY THE CONSULTANT BY REVISING THE DPR FORM AND REPORT TO REFLECT THE CORRECT HISTORY OF THE PROPERTY.

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 11-0 -0. Motion passes.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 4:15 PM.

NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego Planning Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by call the Department at 619-235-5200.