

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF FEBRUARY 28, 2008
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12TH FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

***** SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS*****

New Boardmembers; Gail Garbini, John Lemmo and Paul Johnson, and Reappointed Boardmembers; Abel Silvas, Priscilla Berge and Jerry Schaefer, were sworn in at the beginning of meeting.

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Vice-Chairperson Schaefer at 1:04 pm

Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	John Eisenhart	Present
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Paul Johnson	Present
Boardmember	John Lemmo	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Brian McGarrigle, Interim Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM SEPTEMBER 27, 2007

November 8, 2007 and November 29, 2007 minutes were not available for approval

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR
SEPTEMBER 27, 2007 AS WRITTEN**

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall

VOTE: 5-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Curry was not present.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

None

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Eisenhart reported that 3 properties in South Park, that were recently designated, are currently undergoing restoration renovations

Boardmember Berge while surfing the web, discovered that the Office of Historic Preservation website has posted the City of San Diego's Historic Modernism Context Statement

Boardmember Silvas updated the Board on the Airplane Bungalow, big house is complete, but on the side there is a plaque engraved with historic information of the property

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmember Marshall recused himself from Item 6 due to a conflict of interest

Boardmember Eisenhart recused himself from Item 10 due to a conflict of interest

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Introduce Jodie Brown and Jennifer Hirsch new Senior Planners in Historic Preservation section.
- The HPE of the General Plan Update is scheduled for adoption at the March 10, 2008 City Council meeting.

- Annual Excellence in Historic Preservation Awards coming up in May 2008. Nomination form available on website and printed copies on table. Due date is Friday, April 4, 2008.
- Schedule of 2008 HRB hearing dates on back table. Note the November hearing will be on November 21, 2008, the third Friday of the month, due to the Thanksgiving holiday and hearing room availability.
- Next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, March 5, 2008. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, March 10, 2008. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, March 10, 2008.

Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes three referrals from Development Services, one CCDC development permit review, one individual homeowner nominations, a nomination from SOHO, a proposed addition to the Ocean Beach Historic District, the Annual CLG Report, and Policy Subcommittee appointments to HRB standing subcommittees. Two of these items were continued from the January 24, 2008 meeting. There are 23 individual homeowner nominations that were submitted in 2006, 68 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007, and 9 individual homeowner nominations submitted 2008 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The San Diego Airport Authority, the property owner of the Western Salt Company Salt Works, submitted a written request for a continuance of Item 6

Marie Lia on behalf of the owners, Olivetas Associates LLC, submitted a written request for a continuance of Item 7

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE CONTINUENCE OF ITEM 6 UNTIL THE APRIL HEARING

Seconded by Boardmember Eisenhart

Vote: 8-0-1

Motion Passes

(Marshall)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EISENHART TO APPROVE THE CONTINUENCE OF ITEM 7 UNTIL THE MARCH HEARING

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

E. INFORMATION ITEMS

Update on City's Response to Loss of Historic Structures from the 2007 Wildland Fires

THIS ITEM HAS BEEN POSTPONED

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- ITEM 8 – ERNEST S. AND MARY SHIELDS/ROBERT P. SHIELDS AND SON HOUSE at 2019-2021 Granada Avenue
- ITEM 9 – OCEAN BEACH COTTAGE EMERGING HISTORICAL DISTRICT – PHASE VIII CONTRIBUTING SITE DESIGNATION at 4760 Del Monte Avenue
- ITEM 11 – GILES W. BROWN HOUSE at 4617 East Talmadge
- ITEM 12 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge has questions about Item 9, and would like to pull Items 8 and 11 from consent

Boardmember Eisenhart would like to pull Item 9 from consent

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION OF CONSENT FOR ITEM 12 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT

Seconded by Boardmember Emme

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

**ITEM 5 – KETTENBURG BOAT WORKS
(Continued from January 24, 2008)**

Applicant: Marie Lia on behalf of Prism Investments Inc, applicant and Dean Wilson Living Trust, owner (Referred from the City of San Diego Development Services Department)

Location: 1271 Scott Street and 2810 Carleton Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the properties at 1271 Scott Street and 2810 Carleton Street, consisting of Lots 1 – 11 of Block 29 in the Roseville Subdivision (Map 4956) as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Kettenburg Boat Works site, located at 1271 Scott Street and 2810 Carleton Street and consisting of Lots 1 – 11 of Block 29 in the Roseville Subdivision (Map 4956), under HRB Criterion A as a special element of San Diego's maritime history; and HRB Criterion B, for its association with the Kettenburg family, who played a significant role in San Diego's maritime industry. The designation encompasses all of lots 1 – 11 of Block 29, including the structures at 1271 Scott Street and 2810 Carleton Street and excluding accessory sheds and other structures.

Report Number: HRB-08-002 and Memo dated February 14, 2008.

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Marie Lia (*Scott Moomjian, Dean Wilson, Rand Wassem, Bill Kettenburg, Morgan Miller, Robert Smith*)

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Garbini thought this was similar to the designating sites relating to the aircraft industry, does not see the tie in to the site as a historic or significant to the Kettenburg's, will support the fact that it is a historic site for the marine industry.

Boardmember Marshall had a question for Staff if there were any specific criterion they should be using when designating sites without buildings.

Vice-Chair Schaefer wanted to remind the board they have the option to designate the site with or without the buildings included, or reconfiguring designations here that might vary from the Staff recommendation.

Boardmember Eisenhart wanted to know if there were any remnants of boat building on the site today, or in the yard at all. Marie Lia responded that there wasn't, there are only stored boats on the site.

Boardmember Schaefer mentioned that there is the potential for some archeological material, including evidence of early technology used and materials related to the Kettenburg Boat Works that might be significant. Marie Lia responded that archeology is required under the Environmental Analysis Section.

Boardmember Emme based on the testimony today this site wasn't about stores and retails, but boat building and winning races

Boardmember Eisenhart asked if it was possible for an actual boat to be on display on the site to serve as a reminder of what this site was used for, boat building and to honor the Kettenburg's as well

Boardmember Berge wanted to know if the period of significance should be modified to reflect the boat building (Kettenburg) period

Boardmember Marshall expressed his concerns about making sure that the recognitions are done and that they are enforceable, wants to make sure that name is maintained. Staff responded that with designation of the site alone, there would still be a review under CEQA.

Boardmember Schaefer agrees that the two structures are secondary or even tertiary to the site, and supports Boardmember Lemmo's motion

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5, KETTENBURG BOAT WORKS UNDER CRITERION A AND CRITERION B, SPECIFICALLY EXCLUDING THE STRUCTURES AT 2810 CARLETON STREET AND 1271 SCOTT STREET

Seconded by Boardmember Emme

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 6 — WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS

(Continued from January 24, 2008)

Applicant: Save Our Heritage Organisation (SOHO)

The property is owned by the San Diego Airport Authority

Location: 1470 Bay Boulevard, Otay Mesa-Nestor Community, Council District 8

Description: Consider the designation of the Salt Works located at 1470 Bay Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Salt Works located at 1470 Bay Boulevard under HRB Criterion E. The resource shall be listed as an individually significant resource, with the eleven elements identified as “contributing” included in the designation as character defining elements of the resource; and the four elements identified as “non-contributing” excluded from the designation as non-character defining elements.

Report Number: HRB-08-005

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM HAS BEEN CONTINUED AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNER

ITEM 7 — CASA DEL HORIZONTE

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of the owner, Olivetas Associates LLC

(Referred from the City of San Diego Development Services Department)

Location: 7417-7427 Olivetas Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7417-7427 Olivetas as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Casa del Horizonte, located at 7417-7427 Olivetas Avenue, under HRB Criterion A as the only Contemporary style bungalow court in La Jolla, a limited building type in the community; and HRB Criterion C as a very good example of a post-WWII, Contemporary style bungalow court with high integrity.

Report Number: HRB-08-009

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM HAS BEEN CONTINUED AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNER

ITEM 8 -- ERNEST S. AND MARY SHIELDS/ROBERT P. SHIELDS AND SON HOUSE

Applicant: Beth Montes and Christianne Knoop on behalf of Ed and Angela Landsberg, property owners

Location: 2019-2021 Granada Avenue, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2019-2021 Granada as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Ernest S. and Mary Shields/R.P. Shields and Son House located at 2019-2021 Granada Avenue as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C, as an outstanding example of an Arts and Crafts Bungalow in the Swiss Chalet style architecture and Criterion D, as the notable work by proposed master builder R.P. Shields and Son.

Report Number: HRB-08-010

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Christianne Knoop, Ed, Landsberg, Ron May, Dale Ballou May

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge raised questions regarding the Criterion D; Master Builder, are we identifying an individual or a company? Is this particular house a notable example under our Criteria? She has trouble with this site under Criterion D, but supports Criterion C.

Boardmember Marshall is in support of Staff's recommendation, feels that the roof has more Asian influence rather than Chalet style, also wanted to mention that the chimney is significantly leaning and advises that the owner have a structural engineer look at it.

Boardmember Schaefer wanted Boardmember Marshalls opinion on the sliding glass doors in the front

Boardmember Marshall agrees with Staff that the sliding glass doors should be replaced with French Doors as part of a Mills Act condition

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY MARSHALL TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8, ERNEST S. AND MARY SHIELDS/ROBERT P. SHIELDS AND SON HOUSE, PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER CRITERION C AND CRITERION D

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

MOTION BY MARSHALL TO MOVE THAT PRIOR TO THE CITY ENTERING INTO A MILLS ACT AGREEMENT THAT THE NON-HISTORIC ALUMINUM DOORS ON THE FRONT BE REPLACED WITH APPROPRIATE FRENCH DOORS AS A CONDITION OF THE CONTRACT

Seconded by Boardmember Eisenhart

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 9 - OCEAN BEACH COTTAGE EMERGING HISTORICAL DISTRICT - PHASE VIII CONTRIBUTING SITE DESIGNATION

Applicant: Wendy Tinsley of Urbana Preservation, on behalf of Bill Corwin, owner

Location: 4760 Del Monte Avenue, Ocean Beach Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of one additional contributing site located at 4760 Del Monte Avenue to the Ocean Beach Cottage Emerging Historical District.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the property located at 4760 Del Monte Avenue under HRB Criterion F as a contributing site to the Ocean Beach Cottage Emerging Historical District.

Report Number: HRB-08-012

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Wendy Tinsley, Bill Corwin

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge questioned why the Staff and Consultant reports had different maps of the emerging Ocean Beach District, wanted clarification on which was the most current. Staff responded Attachment 1 of Staff's report is the most current map.

Boardmember Emme is glad that Boardmember Berge pulled this Item, feels that the three-story additional overwhelms the resource, will not be supporting Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Eisenhart agrees with Boardmember Emme, the three-stories compromises the resource, finds it difficult to support designation

Boardmember Johnson agrees that the massing is overbearing and three-story is unfortunate

Boardmember Marshall had the same reaction as other Boardmembers, this is complicated by the fact that this is not intended to be individually historic but part of a district, which has a lower threshold. The addition is very prominent, and not sure if it rises to the lower threshold of a contributor to larger district, rather than individually

Boardmember Berge feels the front house is wonderful, but also agrees that the addition is troublesome and wonders if there is a way to make the owner correct the addition as a condition of the Mills Act.

Boardmember Emme feels that there are other more significant homes that qualify, this detracts from the district, and by designating this resource we will be setting a bad precedent

Boardmember Schaefer feels that the main portion is intact and the addition abuts on the back of the house rather than intruding more into the building. Given that it is a district and that the thresholds are lower, he will support Staff's recommendation, with reservations expressed by other Boardmembers

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9, 4760 DEL MONTE AVENUE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER CRITERION F AS A CONTRIBUTING SITE TO THE OCEAN BEACH COTTAGE EMERGING HISTORICAL DISTRICT

Seconded by Boardmember Johnson

Vote: 6-3-0

Motion Passes

(Eisenhart, Emme, Berge)

ITEM 10 — THE A. W. PRAY RENTAL HOUSE/THE Q PROJECT

Applicant: Jonathan Segal, owner

Location: 1907 Kettner, Little Italy District of the Downtown Community Planning Area, Council District 2

Description: Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.

Today's Action: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions or denial of the permit related to designated historical resources.

Staff Recommendation: That the Historical Resources Board recommend that the Planning Commission approve Centre City Site Development Permit 2007-38 for the relocation of the A. W. Pray Rental House and adopt the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit subject to conditions

Report Number: HRB-08-011 and CCDC Report dated February 13, 2008

CCDC Staff Report by Sachin Kalbag

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia

In Opposition: Bruce Coons

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Eisenhart recused himself

Boardmember Garbini wanted to know how much space is between the little house and the wall of the new structure. She is also concerned about the placement of the street tree as well as the need for there to be more space around the old structure.

Mr. Segal said that the proposed site is better for the resource, more breathing room

Boardmember Marshall feels that this is a compromise and that hopefully the pluses outweigh the minuses. The pluses are: the house stays in Little Italy; it is virtually on the same site, although facing a different direction; the house will undergo a full restoration. Feels that there will be enough house left, but it is a trade-off, and better than the previous proposals. Would like to make it a requirement that the interior 2nd story is maintained

and the street tree is eliminated or relocated so that it is not directly in front of the resource. With these changes, he will support Staff recommendation.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Boardmember Marshall

Boardmember Emme also agrees that this is the best compromise

Boardmember Schaefer supports the findings and permit; with additional conditions that if the back work (that is going to be removed) is original that it would be documented for the record and that there will be a plaque to indicate original location of the building. He will support Staff recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO SUPPORT STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR ITEM 10 - THE A. W. PRAY RENTAL HOUSE/THE Q PROJECT FOR APPROVAL WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS: CONDITION 6; MAKE IT A REQUIREMENT THAT THE 2ND STORY BE MAINTAINED, AND ADD A CONDITION 7; THAT NO STREET TREE BE INSTALLED IN FRONT OF THE HOUSE.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-1

Motion Passes

(Eisenhart)

ITEM 11 — GILES W. BROWN HOUSE

Applicant: IS Architecture on behalf of Peter Dennehey and Timothy Jackson, owners.

Location: 4617 East Talmadge, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4617 East Talmadge as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Giles W. Brown House under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Spanish Eclectic style architecture.

Report Number: HRB-08-013

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ione Stiegler, Peter Dennehey, Timothy Jackson

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge concerns with this home are the stucco or re-stucco, lowering of the garden wall, the garage doors, and the brick walkway. She would like the garage doors replaced with more appropriate doors as a condition of the Mills Act.

Boardmember Emme wanted to know if there was any documentation of the 1990's remodel

Boardmember Marshall agrees with Staff's recommendation to the owner to lower the front wall, would not have supported designation of the home in its previous condition, will support Staff recommendation

Boardmember Schaefer agrees with Boardmember Marshall, supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Eisenhart feels that the integrity has been retained, and also supports Staff's recommendation

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – GILES W. BROWN HOUSE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER CRITERION C

Seconded by Boardmember Eisenhart

Vote: 7-2-0

Motion Passes

(Garbini, Emme)

ITEM 12 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT

Applicant: City of San Diego, City Planning & Community Investment Department

Location: Citywide

Description: The Historical Resources Board Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation, Mayor and City Council consistent with the City's Certified Local Government (CLG) responsibilities and Municipal Code Section 111.0206 (d)(7) requirements.

Today's Action: Review, comment and approve the Annual Report.

Staff Recommendation: Direct staff to forward the Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation and the San Diego City Council, or revise the Annual Report and forward as appropriate

Report Number: HRB-08-008

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 13 – COMPOSITION OF THE HRB STANDING SUBCOMMITTEES

Applicant: HRB Policy Subcommittee

Location: N/A

Description: Appointments to the HRB Standing Subcommittees

Today's Action: Ratify the HRB Policy Subcommittee's appointments to the HRB Policy, Design Assistance and Archaeology Subcommittees, revise the appointments, or do not ratify the appointments and return the item to the Policy Subcommittee with comments.

Staff Recommendation: Ratify the HRB Policy Subcommittee's appointments to the HRB Subcommittees

Report Number: HRB-08-014

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

