

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF APRIL 24, 2008  
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING  
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR  
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Lemmo at 9:05 AM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present ( <i>arrived at 9:25</i> )
Boardmember	John Eisenhart	Absent
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Paul Johnson	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary  
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner  
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner  
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner  
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner  
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES for November 8, 2007, November 29, 2007,  
January 24, 2008, February 28, 2008, and March 27, 2008.**

Minutes were not available at this time.

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

**ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

**A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Eisenhart absent due to illness

• **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

None

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Emme wanted to let everyone know that there is an antique (paper antiquities) show this weekend from 10-4:00pm at the Shrine Auditorium in Kearney Mesa.

## **B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Board Chair Lemmo declared a conflict of interest with Item 7, Items 9 through 16 and Item 17.

Boardmember Berge declared a conflict of interest with Item 8

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Boardmember Curry did not visit Item 6, and Boardmembers Emme, Schaefer, Silvas, and Johnson only viewed the site from the street.

### **BOARD ACTION:**

#### **MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EMME TO INVOKE WAIVER FOR THE BOARDMEMBERS WHO WERE UNABLE TO VIEW THE SITE**

Seconded by Boardmember Schaefer

VOTE: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

## **C. STAFF REPORT**

- HRB workshop on historic preservation incentives, including the Mills Act held April 18<sup>th</sup>. Large turn out, numerous comments. Power point presentations by City, Los Angeles and Tax Assessor on line. Workshop continued to take additional public comment. Looking at first week of June. Notices and announcements out as soon as date is secured.
- Annual Excellence in Historic Preservation Awards will be presented at the May 22, 2008 HRB meeting. Awards in most categories. Please join us to celebrate excellence in historic preservation. Awards ceremony followed by cake.
- Next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, May 7, 2008. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, May 12, 2008. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, May 12, 2008.

Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes 10 referrals from Development Services, one referral from CCDC, and one individual homeowner nomination continued from November 2007. There are 17 individual homeowner nominations that were submitted in 2006, 68 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007, and 19 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

**D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

Leo Wilson, Chair of the Bankers Hill/ Park West Community Association, has submitted a written request for an indefinite continuance of Items #9 – 16. The property owner submitted a letter in support of the continuance.

HRB staff is requesting an indefinite continuance of Item 17 – Western Salt Company Salt Works to allow time for necessary legal research and opinion.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EMME TO APPROVE AN INDEFINITE CONTINUANCE AT THE OWNERS REQUEST FOR AGENDA ITEMS 9-16.**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge                      Vote: 6-0-2                      Motion Passes  
*(Lemmo, Curry)*

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE AN INDEFINITE CONTINUANCE AT STAFFS REQUEST FOR AGENDA ITEMS 17**

Seconded by Boardmember Emme                      Vote: 7-0-1                      Motion Passes  
*(Lemmo)*

**E. INFORMATION ITEMS**

None

**ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

None

**ACTION ITEMS**

**ITEM 5 – 6206 WAVERLY AVENUE**

Applicant: Vonn Marie May, on behalf of the owners, Stephen and Claudia Metcalf

Location: 6206 Waverly Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 6206 Waverly Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 6206 Waverly Avenue under any HRB Criteria due to modifications which have resulted in a loss of architectural integrity.

Report Number: HRB-08-024

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM HAS BEEN TRAILED TO MAY; DUE TO LACK OF A QUORUM

## **ITEM 6 – EDITH L. BABCOCK HOUSE**

Applicant: Scott Moomjian, on behalf of the owner Saeid Baha of 1330-1348 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue, LLC

Location: 1330, 1330½, 1338-1342 Eighth Avenue, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Edith L. Babcock House and other properties located at 1330, 1330 ½, and 1338-1342 Eighth Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Edith L. Babcock House located at 1330 Eighth Avenue as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a rare extant example of hollow clay tile method of construction expressed in a Vernacular architecture style residential building with Eclectic elements. The designation would include the historic garage built into the bank at the Eighth Avenue street level and would exclude the second story structure over the garage located at 1330 ½ Eighth Avenue. The designation would also exclude the building located at 1338-1342 Eighth Avenue.

Report Number: HRB-08-025

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

### **Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Bruce Coons, Mary Wendorf, Rita Cellien

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (*Matt Peterson, Saeid Baha, Puneh Baha, Cameron Duncan, Joeseeph Cristilli, Timothy Kyes*)

### **Board Discussion:**

Chair Lemmo did not find anything that is architecturally significant with the property, it is an example of hollow clay tile material, but not a good example, and he will not be supporting designation.

Boardmember Schaefer wanted to clarify, with Mr. Peterson, that the project would still do HABS level documentation, even if property is not designated. Mr. Peterson concurred that they would guarantee that that level of documentation would be done as an accommodation. Boardmember Schaefer wanted to know if that could be a condition if a demo permit was approved. Lucy Contreras, CCDC, responded that they can include this as a condition of the CCDC permit. Boardmember Schaefer feels that this is a tough one, but does not feel there is not enough hollow clay tile construction or style to support designation and he will not be supporting Staff recommendation.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Staff's date of construction, feels that this site does exhibit a particular method and type of construction, but unfortunately this sense comes from walking up the steps and standing in the courtyard, and not seen from the public right away. She is considering designation and would like to hear from other Boardmembers.

Boardmember Curry feels that the photos and documentation supports the rarity of building materials and designation. This property is a modest example, can address research questions, and shows the history of San Diego. She is in support of Staff recommendation.

Boardmember Silvas addressed Staff on the lack of time the Board had to review this months report. He was not able to visit inside, but could not see any significance from the public

right away with all of the vegetation around it. Even though the building is unsafe; he also feels that this part of our heritage and a part of the City of San Diego and the whole Cortez Hill, he is undecided.

Boardmember Garbini has been aware of this site for a long time and was excited to get to visit this site. There is much more to this site than the structures, there is the terrace gardens. When visiting the site, nothing had really been improved, and the site remains the same or close to the same as it did when it was built. It is a very exciting space, and she supports designation.

Boardmember Emme agrees with comments from other Boardmembers comments. Questioned whose opinion it was that the building was condemned, the owner or the City. Mr. Peterson clarified that it has not condemned, but there was a notice of violation posted concerning unreferenced masonry. Boardmember Emme wanted to point out that this building (City Administration) could easily be condemned because it does not have sprinklers. He was more convinced that the visibility, the setting, the character, and context are lacking in this neighborhood and for this building, there are better choices of hollowed clay tile in the City.

Boardmember Johnson commented that The City of San Diego has a lot of hollowed clay construction; this is a beautiful example of exposed hollow clay tile, and most likely wasn't meant to be exposed, but it is one of a handful of residential exposed hollow clay tile architecture left in the City.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM # 6 – EDITH L. BABCOCK HOUSE ACCORDING TO STAFF RECOMMENDATION, UNDER CRITERION C**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 5-3-0

Motion Fails

*(Emme, Lemmo, Schaefer)*

**ITEM 7 – 3745 TENTH AVE**

Applicant: Scott Moomjian on behalf of the owner Eduardo Posada

Location: 3745 Tenth Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3745 Tenth Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate 3745 Tenth Avenue under any adopted designation criteria.

Report Number: HRB-08-026

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: Ernestine Bonn, Mary Wendorf

**Board Discussion:**

Chair Lemmo recused himself

Boardmember Berge commented that it should be required to refer to surveys whether they are adopted or not. There are serious alterations; texture coating, front door, side window, and garage. No one is debating that this is a Craftsman; the question is, does it maintain enough of its historical integrity.

Boardmember Curry thinks that it does have integrity, and the windows and the texture coating are reversible. All of features are there, and alterations are reversible, integrity is there.

Boardmember Johnson commented that this particular house is located in very high profile area, a gateway to a sub-neighborhood, there is still a high context setting remains for this bungalow era.

Boardmember Emme agrees with Staff's recommendation. In these multi-family areas he did not get a sense of it being a district or a contributor, it is a very prominent location, but there other examples in the neighborhood in better condition. Unfortunately this site (and neighborhood) has been compromised.

Boardmember Silvas was glad to see the other homes in the neighborhood; unfortunately they are not well kept as this one is. The windows and all of the things that are not historic are reversible but they have to be historically correct here, he is still undecided.

Boardmember Schaefer is also on the edge, it is not an exceptional (or particularly good) example of a Craftsman, there is no real potential for a district and with all of the modifications; he is going to go with Staff's recommendation.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EMME APPROVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION AND NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – 3745 TENTH AVE.**

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 4-3-1

Motion Passes

*(Berge, Curry, Johnson) (Lemmo)*

**ITEM 8 – KENSINGTON NEON SIGN**

Applicant: Cecelia Conover (not the owner)

Location: Airspace adjacent to 4121 Adams Avenue, Mid-City: Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the property located in public airspace adjacent to 4121 Adams Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Kensington Neon Sign as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A as a special element of the historical, social, and business development of the Kensington community.

Report Number: HRB-08-027

Staff Report by Trisha Olsen

**Testimony Received:**

Neutral: Rebecca Kelley, Supervisor Ron Roberts Office

In Favor: Cecilia Conover (*Nancy Panton, Sandra Little*), Maggie McCann, John Garrison  
Earnestine Bonn, Mary Wendorf, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: Harold Koenig (*Louise Guarnotta, Mike Koone, Deena Koenig, Bette Doemeny,  
Jean Litchfield, Paul Doemeny, Joan Fitzsimons, Roger Utt, Jonathan Tibbits*)

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge recused herself

Boardmember Schaefer feels that there is no question that this sign is historic, and is disappointed that the community organization did not take historic preservation into account when they went through this process. This situation could have been resolved with a replication of this sign even within the context of this new project. Community members were not well informed or given the option of restoring and maintaining the historicity of the sign. Agrees with Staff's recommendation, and that the project should still go forward by following historic preservation principles.

Boardmember Silvas agrees with Boardmember Schaefer. Both of the new options have the lights included in the lamp posts, which will be more expensive in the long run, money should be spent on the existing sign instead. Likes the current sign because it stands by itself and looks like it is floating in the air, agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry also supports Staff's recommendation. Economic and health issues can be resolved, and the historicity preserved per the standards.

Boardmember Garbini in favor of designation would like the current support system included in the designation.

Boardmember Emme realized today, that old things require a lot of maintenance and can be hazardous; both situations can be corrected. There should have been a third option on the ballot to include preserving the existing sign. Agrees with Boardmember Silvas that this is a "floating sign", it is unique, and one of a kind, and it should be preserved.

Boardmember Johnson feels this is a textbook example of a historic resource, there are avenues for restoration and if need be there are avenues for reconstruction.

Chair Lemmo is troubled by this item. It is a shame they are at a point where folks have invested their time, money and efforts in the community in good faith to maintain this icon in Kensington. He was surprised this item was not already a historical resource in the City. The board is faced with a very narrow decision based on the information given and their own opinion presented to them by the Staff recommendation, does not see any way to not agree with Staff's recommendation.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – KENSINGTON  
NEON SIGN UNDER CRITERION A, PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 7-0-1  
(Berge)

Motion Passes

### **ITEM 9 – 2950 AND 2950A SIXTH AVENUE**

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of the owner Palm Properties LP

Location: 2950 and 2950A Sixth Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2950 and 2950A Sixth Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property at 2950 and 2950A Sixth Avenue under any HRB Criteria due to modifications which have resulted in a loss of architectural integrity.

Report Number: HRB-08-030

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS

### **ITEM 10 – DR. FRANCIS AND FLORENCE MEAD HOUSE**

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of the owner Sixth Avenue Properties LP

Location: 3330 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3330 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion B for its association with historically significant individuals Dr. Francis and Florence Mead.

Report Number: HRB-07-040 and Memo dated April 10, 2008

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS

### **ITEM 11 – FREDERICK F. THOMAS HOUSE**

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of the owner Sixth Avenue Properties LP

Location: 540 Thorn Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 540 Thorn Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Frederick F. Thomas House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a unique and good example of Tudor Revival-influenced Craftsman architecture incorporating Ashlar stone, rarely used to such a degree in extant residential architecture within the City.

Report Number: HRB-07-041 and Memo dated April 10, 2008



Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS

**ITEM 12 – GUARDIAN LIFE INSURANCE/SKIDMORE, OWINGS AND MERRILL OFFICE BUILDING**

Applicant: CHEL Holdings, Ltd., owner

Location: 2901 Fifth Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2901 Fifth Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the Guardian Life Insurance/Skidmore, Owings and Merrill Office Building at 2901 Fifth Avenue as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-08-028

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS

**ITEM 13 – JOHN SINKS HOUSE**

Applicant: CHEL Holdings, Ltd., owner

Location: 3340 Sixth Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3340 Sixth Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John Sinks House located at 3340 Sixth Avenue under HRB Criterion C as a good example of a Craftsman style, exclusive of the separate two-story residential structure at the rear of the lot.

Report Number: HRB-07-043 and Memo dated April 10, 2008

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS

**ITEM 14 – SOLAR APARTMENTS**

Applicant: CHEL Holdings, Ltd., owner

Location: 504 Thorn Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 504 Thorn Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the Solar Apartments at 504 Thorn Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-08-029

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS

**ITEM 15 – GEORGE AND ALICE HAZZARD HOUSE**

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia on behalf of property owner Palm Properties LP

Location: 2900 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2900 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George and Alice Hazzard House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Italian Renaissance Revival Style architecture.

Report Number: HRB-07-045 and Memo dated April 10, 2008

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS

**ITEM 16 – CLARA SHRIER AND BLANCHE L. EHRENBERG BUILDING**

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia on behalf of property owner Sixth Ave Properties LP

Location: 516-522 Thorn Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 516-522 Thorn Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Clara Shrier and Blanche L. Ehrenberg Building under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Spanish Eclectic architecture.

Report Number: HRB-07-046 and Memo dated April 10, 2008

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS

**ITEM 17 — WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS**

**(Continued from January 24, 2008 and February 28, 2008)**

Applicant: Save Our Heritage Organisation (SOHO), owned by the San Diego Airport Authority

Location: 1470 Bay Boulevard, Otay Mesa-Nestor Community, Council District 8

Description: Consider the designation of the Salt Works located at 1470 Bay Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Salt Works located at 1470 Bay Boulevard under HRB Criterion E. The resource shall be listed as an individually significant resource, with the eleven elements identified as “contributing” included in the designation as character defining elements of the resource; and the four elements identified as “non-contributing” excluded from the designation as non-character defining elements.

Report Number: Memo dated April 10, 2008

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE STAFF

**REMINDER:**

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:** May 22, 2008

**LOCATION:** City Administration Building  
12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 12:25 PM**