

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF AUGUST 28, 2008
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12TH FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Lemmo at 1:05pm

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Absent
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	John Eisenhart	Present
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Paul Johnson	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney (*arrived at 1:10*)

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for February 28, 2008 and April 24, 2008

Boardmember Curry was not present at the February 28, 2008 meeting and could not vote on the minutes

Boardmember Eisenhart was not present at the April 24, 2008 meeting and could not vote on the minutes

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE FEBRUARY 28, 2008 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Eisenhart Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE APRIL 24, 2008 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Emme Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Schaefer and Silvas were absent do due to prior commitments with work

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

None

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Berge received a "Thank You" letter from a property owner, who recently had their home designated

Boardmember Eisenhart wanted to mention the upcoming hearing (Federal) regarding the toll road in San Onofre scheduled for September.

Boardmember Curry mentioned the last stretch of the Border Fence is going to affect Border Field State Park and Playas de Tijuana.

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Starting in September, printed copies of the agendas and staff reports will no longer be provided at the hearing, instead a copy of the agenda will be posted on the back wall, and copies of the staff reports will be kept in a binder in the back of the room for reference. Agendas and staff reports will now be posted on the web prior to the hearing.
- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, September 3, 2008. The next Incentives, Policy and Archaeology Subcommittees meetings will be on Monday, September 8, 2008.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes one referral from CCDC, one referral from Development Services, and four individual homeowner nominations. There are 68

individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007 and 46 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

E. INFORMATION ITEMS

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 6 – GEORGE J. SINGER HOUSE at 3419 Vermont Street

ITEM 8 – JOSEPH E. McFADDEN HOUSE at 3560 29th Street

ITEM 9 – RALPH LOREN & ALICE MAE FRANK HOUSE at 6003 Waverly Avenue

ITEM 10 – JAMES J. PODESTA HOUSE at 6123 Avenida Cresta

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Emme pulled Item 8

Boardmember Berge pulled Item 6

Boardmember Berge wanted clarification from Staff on Item 9 regarding their recommendations for the Mills Act, did the recommendations exclude the 1972 and the 1989 additions. Staff responded that the 1972 and 1989 additions would be excluded from a Mills Act contract.

Boardmember Berge also had a question on Item 10 for Staff, regarding the DPR-523B form not being included in the report, and if possible can Staff help the homeowner complete it. Staff agreed to help the homeowner fill out the form.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION ON CONSENT AGENDA ITEM 9 – RALPH LOREN & ALICE MAE FRANK HOUSE AND ITEM 10 – JAMES J. PODESTA HOUSE WITH THE CLARIFICATION OF STAFFS RECOMMENDATIONS

Seconded by Boardmember Eisenhart

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – M.J. CUSHING AND M.A. ROSS HOUSE

Continued from July 2008

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of the owner R. Quigley and K. Hallahan

Location: 416 13th Avenue, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (1289-B4)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 416 13th Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the M.J. Cushing and M.A. Ross House located at 416 13th Street as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C, as an example of Folk Victorian architecture.

Report Number: HRB-08-046

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia (*Scott Moomjian, Kathleen Crawford, Kathleen Hallahan, Eric Johnson*), Rob Quigley

In Opposition: Bruce Coons

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry agrees with the Staff report, and feels it should be designated. The alterations should be referred to as layers of history, and this home is a survivor of history. It may be a modest example but that does not make it a bad example.

Boardmember Berge focused on integrity and not condition when looking at this building. Does it maintain the same level of integrity when compared to other Folk Victorians in the same area, with the same period of significance?

Boardmember Eisenhart feels that the home still maintains the distinct feeling of the era. This home goes back to the origin of the East Village and San Diego; there are only a limited number of homes remaining from the East Village during this period of significance and helps define the area.

Boardmember Emme feels this home has lost a lot of its integrity and its setting. Changes are drastic, and it is just an OK example.

Boardmember Johnson one of the basic preservation standards is that a structure can gain history over time; this building is a prime example of this. Period of significance could, and rightfully so, be a fairly wide period. Reuse of building materials common in early San Diego, context is not lost; is deserving of historic designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EISENHART TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – M.J. CUSHING AND M.A. ROSS HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 5-2-0

Motion Fails

(*Emme, Lemmo*)

ITEM 6 – GEORGE J. SINGER HOUSE

Applicant: IS Architecture on behalf of the property owners, Lisa Marie Shaul and Robert Fleisher

Location: 3419 Vermont Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-B)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3419 Vermont Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George J. Singer House located at 3419 Vermont Street as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C, as a good example of Spanish Colonial Revival architecture.

Report Number: HRB-08-053

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ione Stiegler, Lisa Shaul, Rob Fleisher

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge pulled from Consent Agenda

Boardmember Berge has questions regarding the windows, brick window sills, replacement of roof tiles and the cornice. Lack of historic photos caused these items to leap out and questions to arise. Most troubled by lack of historic photo.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER JOHNSON TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – GEORGE J. SINGER HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – 1504 FORT STOCKTON

Applicant: Scott Moomjian, on behalf of the owners Joseph and Lorena Avietea

Location: 1504 Fort Stockton Drive, Uptown .Community, Council District 2 (1265 5-H)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1504 Fort Stockton Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the residence at 1504 Fort Stockton Drive as an individual historic resource under any HRB Criteria due to a loss of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-08-054

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian (*Joseph Avietea, Lorena Avietea*)

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Discussion with Deputy City Attorney Green regarding the process of the Board making motions in the positive, and not in the negative, i.e. motion to not designate per Staff recommendation. This issue needs to be discussed in the Policy Subcommittee.

Boardmember Curry agrees that this property has lost a lot of integrity and should not be designated; but the parapet is historical and questions if the alterations can be reversed.

Boardmember Eisenhart agrees that the parapet is interesting, but the house as lost its integrity.

Boardmember Berge also supports Staff, but thinks the house is a treasure.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EMME TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – 1504 FORT STOCKTON UNDER CRITERION C

Seconded by Boardmember Lemmo Vote: 0-7-0 Motion Fails
(Lemmo, Emme, Garbini, Berge, Curry, Eisenhart, Johnson)

ITEM 8 – JOSEPH E. MCFADDEN HOUSE

Applicant: Scott Moomjian, on behalf of the owner Edward Cronan

Location: 3560 29th Street, Greater North Park .Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3560 29th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Joseph E. McFadden House at 3560 29th Street as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A as a special element of the development of the West End Subdivision in the North Park community and under HRB Criterion C as an example of Craftsman architecture.

Report Number: HRB-08-055

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian (*Ed Cronan*)

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Emme pulled from Consent Agenda

Boardmember Emme had a question regarding the change in the walkway since 2003 based on photos in the historical report.

Boardmember Berge has trouble with this house, cumulatively there have been dramatic changes to the architecture and does not agree that it qualifies under C. She does support designation under Criterion A.

Boardmember Eisenhart thinks this is an outstanding house; craftsmanship is really distinct and trumps any minor little things.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EISENHART TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – JOSEPH E. MCFADDEN HOUSE UNDER CRITERION A AS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE WEST END SUBURB IN THE NORTH PARK COMMUNITY

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-1-0 Motion Passes
(Emme)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EISENHART TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – JOSEPH E. MCFADDEN HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C AS AN OUTSTANDING EXAMPLE OF CRAFTSMAN ARCHITECTURE

Seconded by Boardmember Curry Vote: 5-2-0 Motion Fails
(Emme, Berge)

ITEM 9 – RALPH LOREN AND ALICE MAE FRANK HOUSE

Applicant: Vonn Marie May, on behalf of the owners James and Kris McMillan

Location: 6003 Waverly Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 3-F)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 6003 Waverly Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Ralph Loren and Alice Mae Frank House as a historical resource under Criterion C, as an example embodying distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture and under Criterion D, as an example of a notable work by master architect Ralph L. Frank.

Report Number: HRB-08-056

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 10 – JAMES J. PODESTA HOUSE

Applicant: Jeffrey and Deanna Hill, owners

Location: 6123 Avenida Cresta, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 3-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 6123 Avenida Cresta as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the historic portion of the James J. Podesta Residence as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C, as an example of Italian Renaissance style architecture, excluding the 1990's additions, the pool, and the garage.

Report Number: HRB-08-057

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: September 25, 2008

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:00PM