

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 25, 2008
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12TH FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

SPECIAL ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM THE CHAIR

- Reappointments of Boardmembers Maria Curry and Otto Emme
- Resignations of Boardmembers John Eisenhart and Paul Johnson

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Lemmo at 1:04 pm

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for May 22, June 26, July 24, and August 28, 2008

Boardmember Berge was not present at the May 22 meeting and cannot vote on the minutes

Boardmember Emme was not present at the June 23 meeting and cannot vote on the minutes

Boardmembers Silvas and Schaefer were not present at the August 28 meeting and cannot vote on the minutes

No Quorum present to approve the minutes, Chair can ask for corrections and approve minutes

BOARD ACTION:

CHAIR LEMMO APPROVED THE MINUTES AS WRITTEN

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

- Ron May: Mission Hills Heritage Walking Tour at Presidio Park this Saturday
- Bruce Coons: Ethics ruling; encourages the Board adopt a simple majority vote for designation of historic structures until additional Boardmembers are appointed.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Silvas is unable to attend the meeting today due to his attendance at the weeklong California Indian Cultural Awareness Conference held each year at Cal State San Bernardino

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Emme announced that this could be his second to last meeting, he is in the National Guard and received notice earlier this week that he will be deployed to Kosovo in December for a year.

Boardmember Curry wanted to mention an article that appeared in the San Diego Reader regarding Barrio Logan in September.

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

• **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- The Olivetas (HRB #858) appeal will be heard before Council on Monday, October 6th
- Deadline to request the Mills Act, for the 2009 tax year, is October 1st, written request is required.
- The next DAS and Incentives Subcommittee meetings have been cancelled due to Boardmember resignations. These subcommittees will begin meeting again when the membership has been addressed by the Policy Subcommittee and the full Board.
- The next Policy Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for Monday, October 13 and the next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for Monday, November 10, 2008.

- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes four referrals from Development Services and three individual homeowner nominations. There are 59 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007 and 42 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The property owner of Item #7 – 4276 Trias Street is requesting an indefinite continuance

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE AN INDEFINITE CONTINUANCE AT THE OWNERS REQUEST FOR AGENDA ITEM 7 – 4276 TRIAS STREET

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

The property owner of Item #10 – 7365 Remley Place is requesting an indefinite continuance

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE AN INDEFINITE CONTINUANCE AT THE OWNERS REQUEST FOR AGENDA ITEM 10 – 7365 REMLEY PLACE

Seconded by Boardmember Emme Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

E. INFORMATION ITEMS

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 – ELIZABETH SULLIVAN FREY/SPINDRIFT ARCHAEOLOGICAL SITE #5
at 7961 St Louis Terrace

ITEM 11 – BARON X. KOUCH AND NORMA MEYER SCHUH SPEC HOUSE #1 at
3519 Dove Court

ITEM 12 – KATE M. DILLON AND FLORENCE A. MADDOCK/HENRY J. LANG
HOUSE at 3696 Albatross

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge pulled Items 8 and 12

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION ON CONSENT AGENDA ITEM 11 – BARON X. KOUCH AND NORMA MEYER SCHUH SPEC HOUSE #1

Seconded by Boardmember Emme

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – AMENDMENT TO THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD PROCEDURES

Applicant: City Planning and Community Investment Department

Location: Citywide

Description: Consider an amendment to the Historical Resources Board Procedures related to designation procedures.

Today's Action: Approve the proposed amendment to the Historical Resources Board Procedures or do not approve the amendment.

Staff Recommendation: Approve the proposed amendment to the Historical Resources Board Procedures related to designation procedures.

Report Number: HRB Staff Memo dated September 19, 2008

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ron May (*Dale Ballou May*)

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge likes the clarity and consistency

Chair Lemmo clarified that the Chair will call for a vote to designate as requested by the owner, if no motion is made

Boardmember Schafer added that the members of the Board can ask the Chair for separate votes on each HRB Criteria if needed

Boardmember Curry thinks the question should be; does the Board want to designate under any HRB Criteria?

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE ITEM 5 – AMENDMENT TO THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD PROCEDURES PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Emme

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 6 – 2415-2421 UNION STREET

Applicant: City Planning and Community Investment on behalf of the property owners, Norm and Marian Dewitt

Location: 2415 Union Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1288 1-J)

Description: Review potential eligibility as part of the Quieter Home Program

Today's Action: To determine eligibility for the National Register

Staff Recommendation: The property is eligible for the National Register at the local level

Report Number: HRB Staff Memo dated September 19, 2008

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

ITEM WAS PULLED BY STAFF DUE TO RESOLUTION OF THE ISSUE

ITEM 7 – 4276 TRIAS STREET

Applicant: Scott Moomjian, on behalf of property owners, Gomez and Amuedo-Dorantes Trust

Location: 4276 Trias Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1268-5-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4276 Trias Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate 4276 Trias Street under any HRB criteria.

Report Number: HRB-08-049 and HRB Staff Memo dated September 19, 2008

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

ITEM HAS BEEN CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS

ITEM 8 – ELIZABETH SULLIVAN FREY HOUSE/SPINDRIFT ARCHAEOLOGICAL SITE #5

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia on behalf of the property owner, Lee Carson

Location: 7961 St Louis Terrace, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7961 St. Louis Terrace as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Elizabeth Sullivan Frey House/Spindrifft Archaeological Site #5 located at 7961 St Louis Terrace as a historical resource under HRB Criteria A and C.

Report Number: HRB-08-059

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge supports designation under Criterion A, but does not support Criteria C. She has serious concerns and questions with regards to the historical integrity and the architecture of the property; the French doors appear to be new, steps are new, not sure why the chimney looks the way it does, why is there a view window on the side, has the stucco been redone, lack of a historic photo. She does not feel there is enough documentation to justify designation under Criterion C.

Boardmember Schaefer supports designation under both Criteria A and C. He wanted to clarify that this site is eligible under Criterion A because it is within the boundaries of a

traditional cultural property recognized by the Native American Community as significant.

Boardmember Curry also supports designation under both criteria; the house is an excellent example of its style and has a lot of integrity.

Boardmember Berge wanted to reiterate that she does support designation under Criterion A, and would support a separate motion; but there is not enough documentation to warrant designation under Criterion C.

Marie Burke Lia requested a continuance until the next meeting to address Boardmember Berge's concerns.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EMME TO CONTINUE ITEM 8 – ELIZABETH SULLIVAN FREY HOUSE/SPINDRIFT ARCHAEOLOGICAL SITE #5 UNTIL THE NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNER

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 9 – ELIZABETH LEE STICKNEY/RALPH L. FRANK HOUSE

Applicant: Scott Moomjian on behalf of the property owner, Gerald Heidt.

Location: 610 Rosecrans Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 3-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 610 Rosecrans Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Elizabeth Lee Stickney/Ralph Frank L. House located at 610 Rosecrans Street under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-08-060

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Christine McGregor

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (*Janice Heidt, Marie Lia, Kathleen Crawford, Tim Martin*), Matt Heidt

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry supports Staff's recommendation; this is an excellent example of Custom Ranch style, it has retained character defining features for both criteria inside and outside. It is important to look at the evolution of the architects work.

Boardmember Garbini thinks the intent of the design was to blend in with the site, which makes it an interesting piece of architecture. The roofing material is not historic and that would add a lot to the character to the house.

Boardmember Emme clarified that by having a property designated; it does not limit you from adding on to it. His problem with this property is that it would be the first time the Board designated a property where the primary view from the street is of the rear side of the home. Integrity is there, but the view from the public right-of-way is of the rear of the property. Sadler's letter also carries weight in his decision.

Boardmember Berge wanted to first comment on how good both the Staff and consultant reports were. She does not feel there is sufficient documentation to designate under Criterion D for work of a master architect, when the notice of completion includes both the father and the son. As for Criterion C, she would like to do a comparative analysis of the photos that are included in the consultants PowerPoint, and have the consultant narrate what the photos are of for the Board.

Boardmember Schaefer also wanted to commend Staff's report; it was very well written and concise. He disagrees with the consultant; the building has the character defining features of a Modern Ranch, but the question is, should it be designated and preserved. This property could be argued either way, but he is not supporting Staff's recommendation.

Chair Lemmo also concurs that Staff's report is excellent, but the property is not distinguishable and he does not support Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – ELIZABETH LEE STICKNEY/RALPH L. FRANK HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 1-5-0
(Curry)

Motion Fails

ITEM 10 – 7365 REMLEY PLACE

Applicant: Vonn Marie May on behalf of the property owner, the Culliver Family Trust

Location: 7365 Remley Place, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 7-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7365 Remley Place as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate 7365 Remley Place under any HRB criteria.

Report Number: HRB-08-063

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

ITEM HAS BEEN CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS

ITEM 11 – BARON X. KOUCH AND NORMA MEYER SCHUH SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Legacy 106, Inc on behalf of the owners, Lisa Starr Goodin & David Goodin

Location: 3519 Dove Court, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1268 6-J)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3519 Dove Court as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Baron X. Kouch and Norma Meyer Schuh Spec House #1 located at 3519 Dove Court under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-08-061

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 12 – KATE M. DILLON AND FLORENCE A. MADDOCK/HENRY J. LANG HOUSE

Applicant: Vonn Marie May on behalf of the property owners, Christopher and Jill Metcalf

Location: 3696 Albatross Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3696 Albatross Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Kate M. Dillon and Florence A. Maddock/Henry J. Lang House located at 3696 Albatross Street under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-08-062

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Vonn Marie May, Jill Metcalf

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge is troubled by some of the changes, known and unknown; the lack of a historic photo or interviews of other residents in the neighborhood. More information is needed on the time, theme and context of the property. It would be helpful if the consultant could tell her of some of the comparisons between this home, in this small little neighborhood, with those nearby that were built in the Mission Revival Style.

Boardmember Emme agrees with Boardmember Berge's concerns regarding lack of photos, he would also like to see photos of before and after when a new owner upgrades or modifies a property.

Boardmember Curry does not think that the research is 100% complete and the home is not 100% as it was when it was originally built; but it has enough material, characteristics, and integrity to be designated. Lack of photos is not a sufficient reason to not designate. Strong case for designation being built by a Master Builder, she supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Schaefer thinks this one is a slam dunk for designation and commends the owner for being preservation minded and using the appropriate materials. He also supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 12 – KATE M. DILLON AND FLORENCE A. MADDOCK/HENRY J. LANG HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION, WITH THE CORRECTION OF MASTER BUILDER

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 13 – 3020 DUMAS STREET

Applicant: Archaeos on behalf of the property owner, Carol Navagato

Location: 3020 Dumas Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1268 7-D)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3020 Dumas Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate 3020 Dumas Street under any HRB criteria.

Report Number: HRB-08-064

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Angeles Leira (*Carol Navagato, Dale Ballou May*), Bruce Coons

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge agrees this is a difficult house, the question of the stucco is critical on a Spanish Eclectic home. Some Quieter Home Program properties were individually designated under Criterion A and Criterion B and sometimes Criterion D, when not under Criterion C. In regards to historical context this one stands out, emphasis should be shifted to focus on Criterion A.

Boardmember Schaefer thinks the house is unique in design and has a lot of important features; with the information provide today, much of interior should be designated as well. Stucco is normally the kiss of death, not the worst texture they have seen, unfortunately the Board has to evaluate the property as it is today; he would personally like to stretch the rules on this one because of the interiors.

Boardmember Curry thinks they should designate the property, she is sure the stucco issue will be fixed; it is a matter of trust. This house is really a landmark, and the stucco is reversible.

Boardmember Emme does not see how the Mills Act will pay for the stucco to be corrected in the next year or even two years, the stucco needs to be reversed prior to designation, not

after. He agrees that the interiors should be designated, if properly noticed, and it is an excellent example of a Spanish Eclectic style; unfortunately it does not meet the standards as it is.

Boardmember Schaefer thinks that a continuance is the best approach, since unanimous support is not apparent

Angeles Leira said the owner is willing to have the stucco corrected within the next 30 days, come back to the next meeting, and if designated the owner would be allowed to request a Mills Act contract after the October 1 deadline.

Staff would not oppose accepting the Mills Act request after the deadline, if the property is designated at the next meeting.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEM 13 – 3020 DUMAS STREET UNTIL THE NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING, DIRECT STAFF TO WORK WITH THE OWNER ON THE STUCCO JOB, AND IF THE PROPERTY IS DESIGNATED, STAFF WILL PROCESS A LATE MILLS ACT AGREEMENT.

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: October 30, 2008

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:05 PM