

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OCTOBER 30, 2008
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12TH FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Lemmo at 9:05 am

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Absent
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

*****Betsy McCullough, Assistant to the Director for City Planning & Community Investment introduced our new Deputy Director of Urban Form, Bennur Koskuz*****

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for September 25, 2008

Boardmembers Silvas was not present at the September 25 meeting and cannot vote on the minutes

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE SEPTEMBER
MINUTES WITH CORRECTIONS**

Seconded by Boardmember Schaefer

Vote: 5-0-1

Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Emme is absent due to training; expected to be in attendance at the November meeting.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

None

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmember Garbini will recuse herself from Item #9 3528/3538 Indiana Street due to a conflict of interest

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- The designation of the Contemporary Bungalow Court on Olivetas in La Jolla (Casa del Horizonte) was overturned by the City Council earlier this month on the basis of factual errors. There were no members of the public present to support the designation and no input was provided by the La Jolla Historical Society, SOHO or members of the HRB.
- The November HRB meeting will be held on Friday, November 21st at 1:00 PM, rather than the usual 4th Thursday due to the Thanksgiving holiday.
- The deadline for requesting a Mills Act agreement this calendar year has passed. Requests will again be taken starting in January 2009.
- The Mayor's office is working hard to find suitable replacements for the current Board vacancies. It is anticipated that at least two seats will be filled prior to the meeting in January 2009.
- The next Policy Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for Monday, November 10, 2008 and the next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for Monday, November 10, 2008. The DAS and Incentives Subcommittee meetings will resume when the membership has been addressed by the Policy Subcommittee and the full Board.

- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes five referrals from Development Services, one referral from CCDC, and the Certified Local Government Annual Report. There are 62 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007 and 44 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

E. INFORMATION ITEMS

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – STEPHEN B. AND FANNIE MARKS HOUSE *at 1037 15th Street*

ITEM 8 – ALBERTA SECURITY COMPANY/MARTIN V. MELHORN SPEC HOUSE #2
at 4144 Lark Street

ITEM 10 – CORNELIUS AND EVA LEE KELLY SPEC HOUSE #1 *at 4330 Witherby Street*

Board Discussion:

Items 7 and 8 were pulled from the Consent Agenda because speaker slips in opposition of Staff's recommendations were submitted

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION ON CONSENT AGENDA ITEM 10 – CORNELIUS AND EVA LEE KELLY SPEC HOUSE

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – ELIZABETH SULLIVAN FREY HOUSE/SPINDRIFT ARCHAEOLOGICAL SITE #5

Continued from September

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia on behalf of the property owner, Lee Carson

Location: 7961 St Louis Terrace, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7961 St. Louis Terrace as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Elizabeth Sullivan Frey House/Spindrift Archaeological Site #5 located at 7961 St Louis Terrace as a historical resource under HRB Criteria A and C.

Report Number: HRB-08-059

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge still has some questions with the placement of the chimney, French doors and the patio/terrace. This is not what we would have seen when house was originally constructed.

Boardmember Curry supports designation. As an architect, we don't have the time to go into deep historical analysis for preservation because you lose the resources. Historic preservation is a tool. It retains its integrity and character from the date of construction, the building is the evidence.

Boardmember Silvas supports Staff's recommendation, but feels that archaeological sites should also receive the Mills Act. He would like the actual village name, *Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya*, to be reflected as part of the designation.

Boardmember Schafer also supports designation under A and C. He wanted to note that this site is eligible under Criterion A because it is within the boundaries of a traditional cultural property recognized by the Native American Community as significant. This is a big what if game when there isn't more definitive data. There is sufficient character defining features present. For the most part it is all there and has all of the attributes needed for being a good representation of this style.

Boardmember Garbini also agrees that it is a good example of a Spanish Eclectic home in the area. The courtyard and the gate are in consistent with era of construction. She is also in favor of designation under A and C.

Boardmember Berge would like Staff and the consultant to look at the interior molding to determine whether or not there were French doors on one side of the fire place or whether there were windows as part of the Mills Act recommendations. She is troubled by this unknown quality when designating individually significant homes.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – ELIZABETH SULLIVAN FREY HOUSE/SPINDRIFT ARCHAEOLOGICAL SITE #5 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE RECOMMENDING THAT STAFF INSPECT THE INSIDE, ESPECIALLY THE LIVING ROOM TO DETERMINE WHETHER OR NOT THERE WERE FRENCH DOORS ON ONE SIDE OF THE FIRE PLACE OR

WHETHER THERE WERE WINDOWS AND IN PARTICULAR LOOKING AT THE MOLDING, IT IS THE INSPECTION INSIDE AND OUTSIDE THAT STAFF IS A RECOMMENDATION FOR CONDITIONS OF THE MILLS ACT, AND IN ADDITION THAT THE KUMEYAAY WORDS MUT KULA XUY/MUT LAH HOY YA BE INCLUDED IN THE NAME

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 6 – JOHN AND BEATRICE MCGREGOR HOUSE*

Continued from September

Applicant: Archaeos on behalf of the property owner, Carol Navagato

Location: 3020 Dumas Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1268 7-D)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3020 Dumas Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John and Beatrice McGregor House* located at 3020 Dumas Street as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-08-064 and HRB Staff Memo dated October 20, 2008

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ruth Alter, Angeles Leira, Carol Navagoto

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

None

** Boardmember Berge informed Staff, after the motion was made, that the wife's name was Beatrice not Louise, the name will be changed to reflect correction: John and Beatrice McGregor House*

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – JOHN AND LOUISE MCGREGOR HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – STEPHEN B. AND FANNIE MARKS HOUSE

Applicant: Archaeos, on behalf of the potential property owner, the San Diego Community College District

Location: 1037 15th Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (1289 3-C)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1037 15th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Stephen B. and Fannie Marks Home at 1037 15th Street with a period of significance of 1888-1893 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-08-065

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ruth Alter

In Opposition: Raul Valderrama

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Schaefer commented that the Board is given the task to evaluate properties for designation regardless of proposed projects. Designating property serves the purpose of preservation and it has all of the character defining characteristics of the style. He supports designation.

Boardmember Curry is also in support of designation. She feels that it qualifies under Criterion A for its social history in addition to Criterion C. It has historic integrity and complies with the standards for preservation.

Boardmember Berge supports designation under Criterion C. She would like to change the architectural style to Queen Anne Cottage Style. She would like input from other Boardmembers with regards to Criterion A.

Boardmember Silvas likes the idea of Criterion A; it shows the continuity and connection to Barrio Logan. He supports designation under both Criterion A and C.

Boardmember Schaefer doesn't think they can defend designation under Criterion A; all houses that are designated have a historic and community context. Criterion A requires a special element that transcends the normal historic context. He is in favor of designation under C, but not A.

Raul Valderrama, the property owner declined to request a continuance.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – STEPHEN B. AND FANNIE MARKS HOUSE UNDER HRB CRITERION A AND C

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 4-2-0

Motion Fails

(Schaefer, Garbini)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – STEPHEN B. AND FANNIE MARKS HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION AND TO CHANGE THE ARCHITECTURAL STYLE TO VICTORIAN QUEEN ANNE COTTAGE STYLE

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – ALBERTA SECURITY COMPANY/MARTIN V. MELHORN SPEC HOUSE #2

Applicant: Happy Hazard LLC, on behalf of property owners, Rodney Love and Larry Wood

Location: 4144 Lark Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4144 Lark Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alberta Security Company/Martin V. Melhorn Spec House #2 at 4144 Lark Street with a period of significance of 1923 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C and D.

Report Number: HRB-08-066

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Janet O'Dea, Rodney Love

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge is not troubled by the tile steps. She would like the period of significance be changed to reflect 1918-1923. She supports designation under Criterion C and D, but is not sure about B.

Boardmember Curry also supports designation under Criterion C and D, but does not support B. It is a very good example and has a lot of integrity, removal of the tile is not necessary. The setting and surrounding landscape is very important.

Boardmember Garbini mentioned that the Queen Palms probably date back to the 1930's and are a contributing factor. She also supports designation under Criterion C and D.

Boardmember Schaefer supports designation under Criterion C and D; with the period of significance changed to 1918-1923. He is not sure if there is enough information to convince him that it should be designated under Criterion B.

Boardmember Silvas supports designation under Criterion C and D. He would like more information for Criterion B.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – ALBERTA SECURITY COMPANY/MARTIN V. MELHORN SPEC HOUSE #2 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION AND TO CHANGE THE DATE OF CONSTRUCTION TO CA. 1918-1923

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO ASK STAFF TO RECONSIDER
REQUIRING FOR THE MILLS ACT REMOVAL OF THE TILE ON THE PORCH
AND THE STEPS**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 9 – ADENA MEAD HOUSE

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of property owners, MDTC LLC

Location: 3528/3538 Indiana Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3528/3538 Indiana Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Adena Mead House be designated under HRB Criterion C as an example of Craftsman Bungalow style architecture retaining a high level of integrity, and excluding 3528 Indiana Street from the designation due to a loss of integrity of materials, design and feeling.

Report Number: HRB-08-067

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

ITEM HAS BEEN TRAILED TO NOVEMBER DUE TO THE LACK OF A QUORUM

ITEM 10 – CORNELIUS AND EVA LEE KELLY SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Legacy 106, on behalf of property owners, Claudio and Rita Romero-Dutschmann

Location: 4330 Witherby Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4330 Witherby Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Cornelius and Eva Lee Kelly Spec House #1 located at 4330 Witherby Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-08-068

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 11 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT

Applicant: City of San Diego, City Planning & Community Investment Department

Location: Citywide

Description: The Historical Resources Board Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation, Mayor and City Council consistent with the City's Certified Local Government (CLG) responsibilities and Municipal Code Section 111.0206 (d)(7) requirements.

Today's Action: Review, comment and approve the Annual Report.

Staff Recommendation: Direct staff to forward the Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation and the San Diego City Council, or revise the Annual Report and forward as appropriate
Report Number: HRB-08-069

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge is very pleased with the report.

Boardmember Schaefer thought the report was excellent, concise and well written. Maybe Staff could include a few words regarding the recent Board resignations and proposed criteria for appeals. He would like the Board to review, as an action item, and make a proposed recommendation to the City Council regarding the proposed criteria for appeals.

Boardmember Curry congratulated everyone on all of their hard work. As part of the goals, she would like to see preservation spread equally Citywide (#1); owners educated on preservation (#7); and incentives for low income families (#12).

Boardmember Lemmo would like Staff to be involved in Community Plan updates.

Boardmember Silvas supports all of the goals, especially the survey work on the Community Plan updates. He would like to see every inch of San Diego's history designated or researched.

Boardmember Garbini would like more training for Boardmembers.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE STAFF'S
RECOMMENDATION FOR ITEM 11 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL
GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT**

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: November 21, 2008

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 11:40 AM