CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Vice-Chairperson Schaefer at 1:12 PM

Chairperson: John Lemmo  Absent
Vice Chairperson: Jerry Schaefer  Present
Boardmember: Priscilla Berge  Present
Boardmember: Maria Curry  Present (arrived at 1:10)
Boardmember: Otto Emme  Absent
Boardmember: Gail Garbini  Present
Boardmember: Linda Marrone  Present
Boardmember: Abel Silvas  Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

***Welcome New Boardmember Linda Marrone***

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for October 30, 2008
Boardmember Marrone was not present at the October 30 meeting and cannot vote on the minutes

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE OCTOBER MINUTES WITH CORRECTIONS

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini  Vote: 5-0-1  Motion Passes (Marrone)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None
ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- ABSENCES
  Chair Lemmo is out of town attending Court in Los Angeles. Boardmember Silvas must leave at 2:30 to attend Native American activities. Boardmember Emme is out of town training with the National Guard.

- OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION
  - Draft Minutes from October 30, 2008
  - ITEM 7 – Brian Smith Letter (Applicant)
  - ITEM 9 – Historical Resource Designation Appeals Process (Staff Report)
  - Memo: 2009 Hearings Dates

- GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS
  None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- CONFLICTS OF INTEREST
  Boardmember Garbini recused herself from Item #5 3528/3538 Indiana Street due to a conflict of interest.

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS
  Boardmember Berge wanted to put in the record that she spoke before the Land Use & Housing Committee in reference to Item 9 – Historical Resource Designation Appeals Process; this meeting is referenced in the Staff report. This was prior to her being appointed to the HRB and will not impinge on her ability to function as a HRB member.

None

- FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER
  None

C. STAFF REPORT

- The proposed Mills Act reforms and fees are being heard by the City Council at a special meeting on Monday, November 24th at 6:00pm. The meeting is being held at the Balboa Park Club in Balboa Park.

- The schedule for the 2009 meetings is available on the back table. All meetings are again scheduled for the 4th Thursday of the month, except November is on the 3rd Friday and no meeting in December.
• The Mayor’s office is working hard to find suitable replacements for the current Board vacancies. It is anticipated that at least one more seat will be filled prior to the meeting in January 2009.

• The next Policy Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for Monday, January 12, 2009 and the next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for Monday, January 12, 2009. The DAS and Incentives Subcommittee meetings will resume when the membership has been addressed by the Policy Subcommittee and the full Board.

• Boardmembers will note today’s agenda includes three referrals from Development Services, one individual homeowner nomination and the Historical Resource Designation Appeals Process. There are 59 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007 and 46 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Staff is requesting a continuance of Item 9 – Historical Resource Designation Appeals Process to the January 22, 2009 meeting.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CONTINUE ITEM 9 – HISTORICAL RESOURCE DESIGNATION APPEALS PROCESS TO THE JANUARY 22, 2009 MEETING

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

E. INFORMATION ITEMS

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

None recommended by Staff

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – ADENA MEAD HOUSE

Trailed from October 2008

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of the property owners, MDTC LLC
Location: 3528/3538 Indiana Street, 92103, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-C)
Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3528/3538 Indiana Street as a historical resource.
Today’s Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.
Staff Recommendation: Designate the Adena Mead House be designated under HRB Criterion C as an example of Craftsman Bungalow style architecture retaining a high level of
integrity, and excluding 3528 Indiana Street from the designation due to a loss of integrity of materials, design and feeling.

Report Number: HRB-08-067

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

ITEM HAS BEEN TRAILED TO JANUARY DUE TO THE LACK OF A QUORUM

ITEM 6 – S.S. AND ROSA KENDALL SPEC HOUSE #1
Applicant: Archaeos, on behalf of the property owners Brandon Cohen and Bruce & Vivian Cohen
Location: 3794 29th Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 5-E)
Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3794 29th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the S.S. and Rosa Kendall Spec House #1 located at 3794 29th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1921 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-08-070

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:
In Favor: None
In Opposition: Ruth Alter

Board Discussion:
Boardmember Curry supports Staff’s recommendation. The house retains its integrity and stands out for being on a corner. The house is designed the way it should be for its location.

Boardmember Berge also supports Staff’s recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – S.S. AND ROSA KENDALL SPEC HOUSE #1 PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION; WITH THE THOUGHT THAT THE NAME COULD BE REVISITED

Seconded by Boardmember Curry  Vote: 6-0-0  Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – MUT KULA XUY/MUT LAH HOY YA SITE #6
Applicant: Scott Moomjian, on behalf of the property owners, Patrick Daniels & Virginia De Robertis
Location: 7907 Princess Street, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-G)
Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7907 Princess Street as a historical resource.
Historical Resources Board  
Minutes of November 21, 2008  
Page 5 of 7

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya Site #6 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A and do not designate the building located at 7907 Princess Street under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-08-071

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Matt Peterson, Scott Moomjian (Brian Smith, Mike Vetters)

Board Discussion:

...Criterion A

Boardmember Silvas wanted to know if the entire site has been graded.

Boardmember Schaefer wanted to clarify that the entire site area is being treated as a Traditional Cultural property in deference to Native American concerns about this area and the recent history of development projects within the Spindrift site. Mitigation monitoring is going to happen regardless; by designating individual properties the process is expedited to ensure that there is proper due diligence and treatment of any discoveries. He supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Curry supports Staff’s recommendation. If there were any artifacts or evidence discovered in the area it confirms it is part of the larger cultural area and should be designated.

Boardmember Berge also supports Staff’s recommendation and agrees with other Boardmembers comments.

...Criterion C

Boardmember Marrone commented that the property was originally designed as a residence and a studio. It appears that the front part of the structure is what remains of the original studio. Although changes have been made, the proportions and the patterns remain the same.

Boardmember Curry thinks that it is an interesting house, but feels there are too many changes to the front façade to justify designation.

Boardmember Berge also supports Staff’s recommendation not to designate under Criterion C.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – MUT KULA XUY/MUT LAH HOY YA SITE #6 UNDER CRITERION A PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION
Seconded by Boardmember Berge   Vote: 6-0-0   Motion Passes

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – MUT KULA XUY/MUT LAH HOY YA SITE #6 UNDER CRITERION B, C, AND D
Seconded by Boardmember Silvas   Vote: 0-6-0   Motion Fails
(Schaeffer, Curry, Marrone, Silvas, Garbini, Berge)

ITEM 8 – 7015 VISTA DEL MAR AVENUE
Applicant: Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of the property owners, John & Barbara Northrop
Location: 7015 Vista Del Mar Avenue, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 1-E)
Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7015 Vista del Mar Avenue as a historical resource.
Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.
Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property at 7015 Vista Del Mar Avenue under any HRB Criterion due to loss of integrity.
Report Number: HRB-08-072
Staff Report by Jodie Brown
Testimony Received:
In Favor: None
In Opposition: Marie Lia, Geoff Northrop, John Northrop
Board Discussion:
Boardmember Curry supports designation. She feels that the porch enclosure meets the standards and has gained significance on its own. The changes are identifiable, and should not be changed. It should also be designated because it is built by a Master Builder.

Boardmember Marrone agrees with Boardmember Curry. She thinks that since the porch was enclosed over 45 years ago, it shouldn’t be excluded from the designation or be required to be changed back. It is in accordance with the Spanish Eclectic style.

Boardmember Berge supports designation under Criterion C and D, house has the same footprint as the original Sanborn map, excluding the porch enclosure.

Boardmember Garbini agrees with Boardmember Berge, the original site is intact. She was not bothered by the porch enclosure.

Boardmember Schaeffer commented that some porch enclosures are OK; and that all of the character defining features are still present in this house. Possible option for the Board is to recommend the porch be restored to its original condition should the present or future owners request a Mills Act.
MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – 7015 VISTA DEL MAR AVENUE AS THE JEAN P. HAMPTON/A.L. & A.E. DENNSTEDT BUILDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #1 UNDER CRITERION C FOR ITS SPANISH COLONIAL REVIVAL STYLE ARCHITECTURE AND UNDER CRITERION D AS A NOTABLE EXAMPLE OF MASTER BUILDER A.L. & A.E. DENNSTEDT BUILDING COMPANY.

Seconded by Boardmember    Vote: 6-0-0   Motion Passes

ITEM 9 – HISTORICAL RESOURCE DESIGNATION APPEALS PROCESS

Applicant: City of San Diego, City Planning & Community Investment Department
Location: Citywide
Description: Review and consider the alternatives for modifying the current historical resource designation appeals process.
Today's Action: Make a recommendation to the San Diego City Council regarding the issue of whether or not to modify the current historical resource designation appeals process.
Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the City Council either maintaining the current historical resource designation appeal process or adoption of the proposed alternative that would expand the Council’s discretion in overturning a historical designation, or remain neutral on the issue and not present a recommendation to the City Council.
Report Number: HRB-08-073

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

ITEM HAS BEEN CONTINUED AT THE REQUEST OF STAFF

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: January 22, 2009
LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:30PM