

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF FEBRUARY 26, 2009  
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING  
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR  
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Lemmo at 1:21 PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present <i>left at 2:55</i>
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Salvador Aréchiga	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
<i>Boardmember</i>	<i>Gail Garbini</i>	<i>Absent</i>
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Present
<i>Boardmember</i>	<i>Abel Silvas</i>	<i>Absent</i>

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary  
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner  
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner  
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner  
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner  
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

**\*\*\*Welcome New Boardmembers Salvador Aréchiga and Alex Bethke\*\*\***

**ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for January 22, 2009**

Minutes from January 22, 2009 were not available for approval.

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

Vonn Marie May: Is concerned with the recent news and status of the Marston House; and wondered if the Board wouldn't like to weigh in on this matter.

Chair Lemmo responded that since this item is not on today's agenda the Board cannot discuss it today; but he would like Staff to put it on the agenda for discussion at the March hearing.

### **ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

#### **A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Garbini had a conflict with work and was unable to attend this month's hearing.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Designation Criteria for City of San Diego Historical Sties
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation
- ✓ Updated material for Boardmember Binders
- ✓ Award Nomination Form

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

#### **B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmember Marrone recused herself from Item #9 7118 Olivetas Avenue due to a conflict of interest

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

#### **C. STAFF REPORT**

- Staff is accepting nominations for Annual Excellence in Historic Preservation Awards through April 3, 2009. Jodie Brown is coordinating the awards process this year. Forms are on line [www.sandiego.gov/historic](http://www.sandiego.gov/historic) and printed copies available on back table. Awards ceremony will be held at 12:30 pm on Thursday, May 28, 2009, just prior to the HRB meeting.
- With the appointment of new Boardmembers, it is time to address membership of the HRB Subcommittees, in particular Incentives and Design Assistance. These two subcommittees have not been meeting and are in need of new members and new chairs. Boardmembers should let me know their interests and availability to serve on at least one subcommittee. The Policy Subcommittee will review the Boardmember interests at the next meeting and will forward a recommendation to the full Board. It is anticipated that Subcommittee membership will be on the March 26<sup>th</sup> HRB meeting with subcommittee meetings resuming in April.

- Staff will be applying for a CLG Grant to help with the San Ysidro Community Plan update survey work. The grant is due to OHP the end of April and funding would be for the state fiscal year October 2009 through September 2010.
- The historic survey work for Uptown, North Park and Golden Hill community plans is beginning. Volunteer forms for these surveys are available on the back table and are due to Jennifer Hirsch by tomorrow.
- The Appeal of 1220 J Street (garage in East Village) is being docketed for Council hearing likely in April. The backup material in support of the appeal is citing the lack of written findings, as required by the Municipal Code, as a basis. The Chair and other Boardmembers may wish to attend the appeal hearing. I will advise of the date as soon as it is known.
- Motion and findings form in blue folders should be filled out for the record prior to a vote to designate unless findings are provided in staff report. In addition staff will write the motion and findings at the hearing and display them on the screen for Boardmembers and the public to view prior to a vote.
- The next Policy Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for Monday, March 9, 2009 and the next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting is scheduled for Monday, March 9, 2009. The DAS and Incentives Subcommittee meetings will resume when the membership has been addressed by the Policy Subcommittee and the full Board.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes two referrals from Development Services and five individual homeowner nominations. There are 49 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007, 52 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, and 2 homeowner nominations in 2009 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

#### **D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

Scott Moomjian, on behalf of the property owner, has submitted a written request for an indefinite continuance of Item 8 – 3594 28<sup>th</sup> Street

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

#### **MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT AN INDEFINITE CONTINUANCE AT THE OWNERS REQUEST FOR AGENDA ITEM 8 – 3594 28<sup>th</sup> STREET**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

#### **ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

ITEM 7 – GEORGE AND AMALIA GANS HOUSE *located at 2890 East Redwood Street*

ITEM 9 – MINNIE GERHARD/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE *located at 7118 Olivetas Avenue*

- ITEM 10 – FREDERICK AND HELEN THOMPSON/RALPH E. HURLBURT AND CHARLES H. TIFAL HOUSE *located at 1232 Myrtle Avenue*  
ITEM 11 – BARON X. KOUCH AND NORMA MEYER SCHUH SPEC HOUSE #2 *located at 4643 El Cerrito Drive*

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Bethke pulled Items 7, 9 and 10 from Consent Agenda

Boardmember Berge would also like to pull Items 7, 9, and 10

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION ON CONSENT AGENDA ITEM 11 – BARON X. KOUCH AND NORMA MEYER SCHUH SPEC HOUSE #2**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

---

**ACTION ITEMS**

---

**ITEM 5 – INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPERS/LOCH CRANE OFFICE BUILDING**

Applicant: Cal-Sorrento LTD represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 3344 Industrial Court, 92121, Torrey Pines Community, Council District 1 (1208 3-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3344 Industrial Court as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Industrial Developers/Loch Crane Office Building, located at 3344 Industrial Court as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1965 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-008

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: John Eisenhart, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: Marie Lia, Steve Higgins

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Curry thinks this building should be designated under Criteria C. The Contemporary Modernism style for this building is very important because it reflects local expression of the Modern school. The elevator issue could be brought before DAS.

Boardmember Berge made reference to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards in regards to the goals of preservation planning; registering historic properties. The Board is here today to address the issue of registering/designating the property.

Boardmember Bethke agrees that this building is exceptionally significant and that the architecture alone meets the criteria. He feels that it meets the criteria to be designated under Criteria D as well.

Vice-Chair Schaefer also agrees with the other Boardmembers; this building has all of the “bells and whistles” for an excellent Modernist building. It meets all of the criteria for an exceptional Modernist building by an architect who is likely to be identified as a master architect.

Chair Lemmo agrees with Vice-Chair Schaefer; their role here is to apply criteria for designation. In regards to Criteria C it isn't even a close call, and for Criteria D they could debate further.

Boardmember Aréchiga really likes the building. This building could dictate the design of the remaining site and use to their advantage.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ALL STRUCTURES UNDER CRITERION C**

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke                      Vote: 4-3-0                      Motion Fails  
*(Lemmo, Schaefer, Aréchiga)*

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPERS/LOCH CRANE OFFICE BUILDING PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge                      Vote: 7-0-0                      Motion Passes

**ITEM 6 – P.M. AND CHARLOTTE A. PELTIER HOUSE**

Applicant: Lynn Family Trust represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 2242 Pine Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 4-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2242 Pine Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the P.M. and Charlotte A. Peltier House, located at 2242 Pine Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1935 under HRB Criteria C.

Report Number: HRB-09-009

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor:            None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian

**Board Discussion:**

Vice-Chair Schaefer commented that this about as minimal/basic Mediterranean Spanish Eclectic you can find; with more symmetry than normal. There are several substantial changes to the structure. Absent a district this may not rise to the level of designation.

Boardmember Berge feels that the stucco texture may be questionable; but is more troubled by the two large windows on the front of the house.

Boardmember Curry also questions the stucco and concerns with the alterations; it does have many characteristics of the style.

Boardmember Bethke does not think it is a distinctive example.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – P.M. AND CHARLOTTE A. PELTIER HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke                      Vote: 0-7-0                      Motion Fails  
*(Lemmo, Schaefer, Aréchiga, Bethke, Berge, Curry, Marrone)*

**ITEM 7 – GEORGE AND AMALIA GANS HOUSE**

Applicant: Rose Hogan represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 2890 East Redwood Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3  
**(1269 7-E)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2890 East Redwood Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George and Amalia Gans House, located at 2890 East Redwood Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-010

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor:        Scott Moomjian, Rose Hogan

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Chair Lemmo left at 2:55pm

Vice-Chairperson Schaefer took over for Chair Lemmo

Scott Moomjian, representing the owner, requested that since there were only six Boardmembers present and all six needed to vote in favor of designation; he would like to request a 30 day continuance for more Boardmembers to be present.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR SCHAEFER TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – GEORGE AND AMALIA GANS HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

*After the motion was made by Vice-Chair Schaefer and seconded by Boardmember Berge; Scott Moomjian, representing the owner, asked for a continuance based on Municipal Code 123.0202d*

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CONTINUE ITEM 7 – GEORGE AND AMALIA GANS HOUSE UNTIL THE NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNER PER MUNICIPAL CODE 123.0202D**

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 8 – 3594 28<sup>th</sup> STREET**

Applicant: Josephine Ranches Trust represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 3594 28<sup>th</sup> Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-D)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3594 28<sup>th</sup> Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 3594 28<sup>th</sup> Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criterion due to a lack of architectural and material integrity.

Report Number: HRB-09-011

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS

**ITEM 9 – MINNIE GERHARD/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE**

Applicant: Black Coast Properties LLC represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 7118 Olivetas Avenue, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 1-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7118 Olivetas Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Minnie Gerhard/Thomas Shepherd House, located at 7118 Olivetas Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1934 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-012

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Vonn Marie May, Beth Steusloff

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

*Item was taken out of order to maintain quorum*

*Boardmember Marrone recused herself from this item.*

Boardmember Bethke is not sure that the house is individually significant and would like to hear what other Boardmembers have to say.

Boardmember Berge questioned Criteria D, notable work of Thomas Shepherd's very early turning representation of the Modern architecture in 1934: "Monterey type" custom Minimal Traditional with French Eclectic influences.

Boardmember Curry supports Staff's recommendation; complies with Criteria C. Shepherd's homes reflected each owner; then each home needs to be evaluated on its own value.

Vice-Chair Schaefer feels that the context and the setting compliment the style of the home; lots of integrity. He wanted to clarify that the City Criterion has a lower threshold than the National Register. He supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Vice-Chair Schaefer; but is still on the fence as to whether it is individually significant.

Boardmember Berge would like to add modifications to Staff's recommendation

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – MINNIE GERHARD/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH ADDITIONAL FINDINGS TO INCLUDE THOMAS SHEPHERD'S TRANSITION FROM FANTASY REVIVAL STYLE TO THE MODERN MINIMAL TRADITIONAL STYLE EARLY IN HIS CAREER**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 6-0-1

Motion Passes

*(Marrone)*

**ITEM 10 – FREDERICK AND HELEN THOMPSON/RALPH E. HURLBURT AND CHARLES H. TIFAL HOUSE**

Applicant: Eric Bianchini represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1232 Myrtle Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-B)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1232 Myrtle Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Frederick and Helen Thompson/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal House, located at 1232 Myrtle Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-013

**Testimony Received:**



In Favor: Marie Lia

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Marie Lia, representing the owner, would also like to request a 30 day continuance for more Boardmembers to be present.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR SCHAEFER TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 –  
FREDERICK AND HELEN THOMPSON/RALPH E. HURLBURT AND  
CHARLES H. TIFAL HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

*After the motion was made by Vice-Chair Schaefer and seconded by Boardmember Berge; Marie Lia, representing the owner, asked for a continuance based on Municipal Code 123.0202d*

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CONTINUE ITEM 10 –  
FREDERICK AND HELEN THOMPSON/RALPH E. HURLBURT AND  
CHARLES H. TIFAL HOUSE UNTIL THE NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING AT  
THE REQUEST OF THE OWNER PER MUNICIPAL CODE 123.0202D**

Seconded by Boardmember Aréchiga

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 11 – BARON X. KOUCH AND NORMA MEYER SCHUH SPEC HOUSE #2**

Applicant: Gerard & Jennifer Widmer represented by Legacy 106

Location: 4643 El Cerrito Drive, 92115, College Area Community, Council District 7 (**1270 3-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4643 El Cerrito Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Baron X. Kouch and Norma Meyer Schuh Spec House #2 located at 4643 El Cerrito Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of c. 1931 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-014

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

**REMINDER:**

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:** March 26, 2009

**LOCATION:** City Administration Building  
12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:21 PM**