

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Aréchiga and Curry were unable to attend due to pressing family and personal business in Mexico.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Copies of Draft Minutes for January and February 2009
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- We are very happy to announce the Mayor's reappointment of Boardmembers Berge, Garbini, Marrone, Schaefer and Silvas to the Historical Resources Board. We anticipate City Council action to confirm these reappointments in April. In addition, the Mayor has designated Boardmember Lemmo to continue as Chair for 2009.
- The Mills Act application deadline for properties designated prior to 2009 is next week. Since March 31st falls on a City Holiday, the deadline is extended to April 1, 2009. The application period for properties designated in 2009 is January 1st through March 31st 2010. Applications and an informational handout can be found on the website at www.sandiego.gov/historic
- Next week is also the deadline for submittal of nominations for the Annual Excellence in Historic Preservation Awards. We have received several nominations but there is room for more and a number of categories have not received any nominations. Nomination forms can be found on the website and copies are located on the back table. They are due by April 3, 2009.
- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, May 6. The next Incentives Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, April 13 assuming the Board takes action

today to re-establish that subcommittee. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, April 13 and the next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, May 11.

- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes 8 individual homeowner nominations including 2 continued from February's hearing and Composition of the HRB Standing and Ad Hoc Subcommittees. There are 41 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007, 52 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, and 3 homeowner nominations in 2009 that have not been reviewed by Staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Marie Lia has communicated to staff that she will be unable to attend today's hearing due to illness. Staff is requesting a 30 day continuance of Item 6 – The Thompson/Hurlburt and Tifal house on Myrtle Way at the applicant's request.

Staff is requesting a 60 day continuance of Item 7 – La Jolla Adult Recreation Center Club to allow additional time to meet and consult with the Real Estate Assets and Park and Recreation Departments.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT A 30 DAY CONTINUECE FOR ITEM 6 – THE THOMPSON/HURLBURT AND TIFAL HOUSE AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST AND A 60 DAY CONTINUENCE FOR ITEM 7 – LA JOLLA ADULT RECREATION CENTER CLUB AT STAFFS REQUEST

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 10 – WALT MASON HOUSE *located at 1411 Virginia Way*

ITEM 11 – LAURA A. TYLER HOUSE *located at 1832 Dale Street*

ITEM 13 – COMPOSITION OF THE HRB STANDING & AD HOC SUBCOMMITTEES

Board Discussion:

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION ON CONSENT AGENDA ITEM 10 – WALT MASON HOUSE, ITEM 11 – LAURA A. TYLER HOUSE, AND ITEM 13 – COMPOSITION OF THE HRB STANDING & AD HOC SUBCOMMITTEES

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. STATUS OF MARSTON HOUSE LEASE

The current lease with the San Diego Historical Society to operate the Marston House will be terminated effective June 30, 2009. The City is interested in leasing the property to an appropriate entity and will pursue a new lease agreement over the next few months. At the request of a member of the public, the HRB Chair docketed this item to allow public input to the Board regarding the treatment of the Marston House.

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

Speakers: Vonn Marie May, Louise Torio, Janet O’Dea, Allen Hazard, Sarai Johnson, Paul Johnson, Ron May, Alana Coons, Bruce Coons

Board Discussion:

Chair Lemmo asked Deputy City Attorney Fain what the process would be for the City moving forward with a new lease

Deputy City Attorney Fain responded that City contracts are normally put out for competitive bidding; sometimes there are exceptions to that process where a sole source is chosen. At this point, today’s Agenda refers to the treatment of the Marston House and pursuing a new lease agreement; not potential operator/s. It is premature for the Board to discuss or provide recommendations on an operator/s; recommendations referring to treatment are OK.

Vice-Chair Schaefer would like to comment on the type of operator and treatment standards. The steward/s should be preservationist specialists. San Diego Historical Society has made some very bad decisions, and he would like to recommend that they not be the stewards again. He would like to know what responsibilities the City will assume or maintain with the new steward/s.

Boardmember Berge would also like to weigh in with the Board on a future lease agreement; the City has the obligation to maintain this property.

Boardmember Silvas agrees that the San Diego Historical Society has done things which could have been done better

Boardmember Bethke disagrees that a preservationist organization should manage the Marston House; he thinks it is important that an organization that specializes in operating House Museums manage the property. Historical Societies don’t always understand the investment needed to own and operate a house as large as the Marston House.

Boardmember Garbini mentioned that whoever takes over the lease would probably like the gardens restored; by retaining the gardens or bringing them back to a certain period would be important for the interpretation of the site.

Chair Lemmo summed up the discussion that Board would be interested in seeing a comprehensive way of approaching this property with preservationist expertise, as well as

interpretive expertise, and looking at the whole site rather than piece-mealing it, i.e. someone operating the gardens, someone for the house. We would like to see an overall operator of the facility to make sure that it is maintained that way it needs to be and operate in a way that will be efficient and enjoyable by all.

NO ACTION OF THE BOARD IS REQUIRED FOR THIS ITEM

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – GEORGE AND AMALIA GANS HOUSE

Continued from February 2009

Applicant: Rose Hogan represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 2890 East Redwood Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3
(1269 7-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2890 East Redwood Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George and Amalia Gans House, located at 2890 East Redwood Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-010

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian (*Rose Hogan, Chuck Patterson*)

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke does not see a precedent for Criterion B; for Criterion C there aren't any distinctive features to make this property individually eligible. Criterion D is an interesting case; he thinks there might be more of a case if there were more Spanish Eclectic homes built by Gans post 1928. Why did he build this type of home for his family? More analysis is needed as to why this is a notable example; more context. He does not feel that it is eligible under any of the criteria.

Boardmember Berge strongly recommends there be separate motions for each criterion. She agrees with Boardmember Bethke on Criterion B, there is no precedent. Under Criterion C, she has questions regarding integrity, i.e. is the tile original, has the stucco been redone, etc. For Criterion D, photo shows a corollary between the curved wall of the Craftsman porch and the curved wall of this home; both homes were built by Gans. Curved wall is signature mark of Master Builder.

Vice-Chair Schaefer thinks this is a simple, generic, mediterranean house and the register should represent a socio-economic cross section of San Diego. The fact that this was built by a Master Builder who built it for himself makes him comfortable with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Garbini thought it was exciting that the home still had the original walkway, driveway, and rear patio. It maybe small and may have been built by a builder within his means, but you have all of the components. She is leaning towards Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone thinks it is reflective of a good example of an architectural style that was built for affordable housing by a Master Builder as his own home. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke liked what Vice-Chair Schaefer regarding the historical significance for Criteria C and D, but he is not sure that those arguments are being made and the proper context is being included in the nomination; are we reading into the nomination what we see?

Chair Lemmo responded that the Board makes their determination based on all of the materials, personal observations, etc.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMER BERGE TO DESTINGATE ITEM 5- GEORGE AND AMALIA GANS HOUSE LOCATED AT 2890 EAST REDWOOD STREET HRB CRITERION D

Seconded by Vice-Chair Schaefer

Vote: 6-1-0

Motion Passes

(Bethke)

ITEM 6 – FREDERICK & HELEN THOMPSON/RALPH E. HURLBURT & CHARLES H. TIFAL HOUSE

Continued from February 2009

Applicant: Eric Bianchini represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1232 Myrtle Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 **(1269 6-B)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1232 Myrtle Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Frederick and Helen Thompson/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal House, located at 1232 Myrtle Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-013

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM CONTINUED FOR 30 DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNER

ITEM 7 – LA JOLLA ADULT RECREATION CENTER CLUB

Applicant: City of San Diego; nominated by La Jolla Bridge Club represented by IS Architecture

Location: 1160 Coast Blvd., 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 **(1227 6-F)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1160 Coast Blvd. as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the La Jolla Adult Recreation Center Club located at 1160 Coast Blvd as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1939 under HRB Criterion A.

Report Number: HRB-09-016

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM CONTINUED FOR 60 DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF STAFF

ITEM 8 – 3131 ELLIOTT STREET

Applicant: Sean and Judith Parker represented by Kathleen Crawford

Location: 3131 Elliott Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 7-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3131 Elliott Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 3131 Elliott Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criterion.

Report Number: HRB-09-018

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Judy Parker, Sean Parker

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge found the architectural changes “disturbing” and the issue of historic person difficult.

Chair Lemmo wanted to clarify to the Board that the owner’s presentation was focused on Criterion B and that it should also be the main focus of the Board.

Boardmember Bethke thinks that regardless of whether or not he is significant as a person, ideally the building needs to relate to that significance; he does not feel the home qualifies

Applicant asked the Board for a continuance

Boardmember Berge wanted to reiterate that integrity is still an important issue for Criterion B

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CONTINUE ITEM 8 – 3131 ELLIOTT STREET FOR 30 DAYS OR UNTIL NEXT AVAILABLE AGENDA AT THE APPLICANTS REQUEST

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 6-1-0

Motion Passes

(Bethke)

Boardmember Bethke wanted to state for the record that the continuances are getting out of hand

ITEM 9 – 2670 2nd AVENUE

Applicant: Edgar Degiovanni & Ann Otto

Location: 2670 2nd Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1269 7-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2670 2nd Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 2670 2nd Avenue as a historical resource under any HRB Criterion.

Report Number: HRB-09-019

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Ann Degiovanni, Edgar Degiovanni, David Marshall, Janet O’Dea, Sarai Johnson, Paul Johnson, Bruce Coons

Board Discussion:

Chair Lemmo asked if there was anything about Hebbard in the report.

Boardmember Berge was reminded of the Marston House when she first saw this house. Uptown Survey identified home as an individual contributor. She is undecided on Criterion C; but feels that Savage is clearly significant. Level of integrity is not as significant for Criterion B.

Boardmember Garbini added that engineers were often transient by nature of the work; which doesn’t diminish the significance of the home.

Vice-Chair Schaefer wishes there was a longer association of Savage and the home during his productive years as a whole. He would like to see the home designated and a Mills Act processed to bring the house back; he feels that it retains enough integrity for designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 - HIRAM NEWTON SAVAGE HOUSE LOCATED AT 2670 2nd AVENUE UNDER HRB CRITERION B FOR ITS ASSOCIATION WITH HIRAM NEWTON SAVAGE WHO IS SIGNIFICANT IN REGIONAL WATER HISTORY.

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini Vote: 7-0-0 Motion Passes

FOLLOW-UP ADVISORY MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR SCHAEFER TO CONDITION MILLS ACT APPROPRIATELY FOR RESTORING INTEGRITY IN INCREMENTALLY BASED ON HISTORICAL DOCUMENTATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 7-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 10 – WALT MASON HOUSE

Applicant: R R 85 Trust represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 1411 Virginia Way, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1269 6-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1411 Virginia Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Walt Mason House located at 1411 Virginia Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1921-1939 under HRB Criterion B.

Report Number: HRB-09-021

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 11 – LAURA A. TYLER HOUSE

Applicant: Frank and Lauren Downey Revocable Trust represented by Happy Hazard LLC

Location: 1832 Dale Street, 92102, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 1-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1832 Dale Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Laura A. Tyler House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an example of Craftsman style architecture.

Report Number: HRB-09-022

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 12 – 1977 TITUS STREET

Applicant: Jeffrey Lind represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 1977 Titus Street, 92110, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1977 Titus Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 1977 Titus Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criterion.

Report Number: HRB-09-023

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Ron May (*Dale May, Jeff Lind, Bruce Coons, Linda Canada, Christianne Knoop*)

Board Discussion:

Vice-Chair Schaefer asked the Board how they felt about the bathroom window modification.

Boardmember Berge found it interesting that this home was part of a National Movement “Quality Building” at the local level. We have Criterion B for famous people and famous events.

Boardmember Bethke commented that the nomination does not address the significance under a National Movement; the case is not made. For Criterion A, he didn’t see where the Spanish Village setting is locally significant nor did he see any integrity of the setting. He also didn’t find any special elements of architectural development to be significant for Criterion A.

Chair Lemmo agrees with Boardmember Bethke

Vice-Chair Schaefer also agrees with Boardmember Bethke; this is just one of many development projects and this one doesn’t have any bearing of a special element.

Chair Lemmo finds the three arched windows distracting; they are clearly not part of the original design.

Boardmember Berge strongly recommends Applicant go back and work with Staff

Boardmember Bethke asked if it was relevant to be talking about possible changes; he feels that at some point they have to get to what is being presented regardless to what changes are being promised.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 12 – 1977 TITUS STREET UNDER CRITERIA A AND C

Seconded by Vice-Chair Schaefer

Vote: 0-7-0

Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Schaefer, Bethke, Garbini, Marrone, Silvas, Berge)

ITEM 13 – COMPOSITION OF THE HRB STANDING & AD HOC SUBCOMMITTEES

Applicant: HRB Policy Subcommittee and CPCI Department

Location: N/A

Description: Consider ratifying the HRB Policy Subcommittee’s Appointments to the HRB Standing Subcommittees and Re-Establishment of the Ad Hoc Incentives Subcommittee

Today's Action: Ratify the HRB Policy Subcommittee’s appointments to the HRB Policy, Design Assistance and Archaeology Subcommittees, revise the appointments, or do not ratify the appointments and return the item to the Policy Subcommittee with comments. Re-establish the Incentives Subcommittee and appoint members as recommended by the Policy Subcommittee, revise the appointments, or do not re-establish the Incentives Subcommittee.

Staff Recommendation: Ratify the HRB Policy Subcommittee’s appointments to the standing HRB Subcommittees and re-establish the ad hoc Incentives Subcommittee and appoint members

Report Number: HRB-09-024

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd; presented by Kelley Saunders

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: April 23, 2009

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:25 PM