

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF APRIL 23, 2009
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Lemmo at 1:05 PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Salvador Aréchiga	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for March 26, 2009

Minutes from March 26, 2009 were not available for approval

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

None

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Boardmember Bethke was unable to visit Item 7-Mut Kula Xuy/Mut Lah Hoy Ya Site #7

C. STAFF REPORT

- I would like to take a minute to acknowledge and thank Shannon Anthony, the Board Secretary for all her hard work and support she provides to Boardmembers and staff. She is a very important part of the historical resources section and works tirelessly behind-the-scenes to keep things running smoothly in preparation for our monthly meetings. In addition, Shannon often makes the all-important first impression on City customers via phone and in person and helps consultants with document retrieval, general questions, minutes, resolutions, and all sorts of other requests. She handles numerous other important tasks needed for the City to provide services to our citizens. We really appreciate all you do Shannon, thanks!
- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, May 6. The Subcommittee will be reviewing the draft QHP Treatment Guidelines as part of a new Programmatic Agreement, window replacements on two designated buildings, repairs at the California Tower in Balboa Park, and two rehabilitation proposals. The next Incentives Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, May 11 when the subcommittee members will continue discussions on transfer of development rights and other potential incentives identified in the General Plan. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, May 11. The agenda will include the subcommittee's first look at the proposed Kensington Manor Unit #2 historic district and a review of the designation process. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, May 11 if there are items for the agenda.

- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes one referral from Development Services and 5 individual homeowner nominations including 2 continued from March's hearing. There are 37 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007, 52 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, and 3 homeowner nominations in 2009 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Staff is requesting a continuance for Item 7 – Mut Kula Xuy/Mut Lah Hoy Ya Site #7. There is additional fieldwork that is required before the item can go forward for a designation decision.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT A CONTINUENCE FOR ITEM 7 – MUT KULA XUY/MUT LAH HOY YA SITE #7 AT STAFFS REQUEST

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 – DELAWIE RESIDENCE II *located at 1833 Neale Street*

ITEM 9 – JOHN SNYDER/RALPH E. HURLBURT AND CHARLES H. TIFAL SPEC HOUSE #1 *located at 2315 Fort Stockton Drive*

ITEM 10 – FLORENCE W. GIBSON SPEC HOUSE *located at 4771 Vista Lane*

Board Discussion:

Vice-Chair Schaefer pulled Item 10 – FLORENCE W. GIBSON SPEC HOUSE from the consent agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION ON CONSENT AGENDA ITEM 8 – DELAWIE RESIDENCE II AND ITEM 9 – JOHN SNYDER/RALPH E. HURLBURT AND CHARLES H. TIFAL SPEC HOUSE #1

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – FREDERICK AND HELEN THOMPSON/RALPH E. HURLBURT AND CHARLES H. TIFAL HOUSE

Continued from February 2009 and March 2009

Applicant: Eric Bianchini represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1232 Myrtle Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1232 Myrtle Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Frederick and Helen Thompson/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal House, located at 1232 Myrtle Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-013

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Item taken out of order

Boardmember Bethke asked for clarification on the City's policy that references visibility from the public right-of-way. The main façade does not qualify for designation, it is a garage and a room; the character defining features are on the rear of the house.

Deputy City Attorney Fain responded that there is not a requirement in our designation process that the resource be visible from any public views but if you enter into a Mills Act agreement there would be requirements for that sort of thing.

Boardmember Curry doesn't see the relevance of this house, it can't be seen. It is not designatable, it is just a garage.

Boardmember Garbini asked if a house is any less historic because you can't see it.

Boardmember Bethke responded that it depends on what its historical significance is.

Boardmember Garbini mentioned that there was a period of time when the architecture part of the success of the architecture was the fact that it was low profile. This house is part of that movement where it became part of its environment as opposed to standing out on its own. This doesn't make it any less significant, it is significant because of that fact.

Boardmember Marrone thinks the way this house is sited to the lot is a significant part of the architecture

Chair Lemmo agrees

Boardmember Curry really has a problem with what is visible from the street; she didn't see the other part of the resource (from the canyon view)

Vice-Chair Schaefer agrees that it is an underwhelming façade from the street; but was very impressed with the design down the slope. The rhythm of the walls, window, doors and others openings coming down the slope was very dramatic and original; careful design relative to the contours of the land. He is in support of designation.

Boardmember Berge commented that there isn't any primary documentation stating that Ralph E. Hurlburt was the designer. The water permit shows the 1926 date of construction, not the 1927

date; this is very early for a Spanish Colonial Revival home to have an attached garage. She will not support Hurlburt and Tifal together; but will support Tifal individually as the builder.

Boardmember Garbini thinks this is a fabulous house but the roof tile is wrong. She has an issue with the Board taking the issue of the roof (i.e. clay tile) on a case-by-case basis, the Board needs to be consistent.

Boardmember Berge is also troubled by the roof and does not support designation under Criterion C.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – FREDERICK AND HELEN THOMPSON/CHARLES H. TIFAL HOUSE UNDER HRB CRITERION D AS A NOTABLE WORK OF MASTER BUILDER CHARLES H. TIFAL; FOR ITS TIERED HILLSIDE CONSTRUCTION AND RETAINS A GOOD LEVEL OF INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1926 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR SCHAEFER TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – FREDERICK AND HELEN THOMPSON/CHARLES H. TIFAL UNDER HRB CRITERION C FOR ITS DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS THROUGH THE RETENTION OF CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF THE SPANISH COLONIAL ARCHITECTURE AND RETAINS A GOOD LEVEL OF ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1926 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 7-2-0

Motion Passes

(Berge, Silvas)

ITEM 6 – 3131 ELLIOTT STREET

Continued from March 2009

Applicant: Sean and Judith Parker represented by Kathleen Crawford

Location: 3131 Elliott Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 7-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3131 Elliott Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 3131 Elliott Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criterion.

Report Number: HRB-09-018

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Judy Elliott (*Bob Adelizzi*), Tommi Adelizzi

Board Discussion:

Item taken out of order

Boardmember Curry feels that David continued the work of his father and is not significant under Criterion B; but qualifies under Criterion C. In theory the door could be replaced and meet the standards if there is a needed function for the home; a new door in place of a historic window is OK for rehabilitation. She feels the alterations are minor.

Boardmember Silvas wanted to know where David Fleet lived after this house.

Vice-Chair Schaefer feels there is some messiness about this one; integrity is an issue. He agrees that David Fleet had enough historical significance; but his association with this house is not strong enough.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Vice-Chair Schaefer, integrity is an issue for individual significance. She does not support designation under Criterion C; and needs more information for Criterion B.

Boardmember Bethke thinks the case for significance during this time frame needs to be stronger. There seems to be more of a company significance than an individual significance.

Chair Lemmo agrees with Boardmember Bethke

Boardmember Curry wanted to know when the window became a door; is it possible the door may have its own significance.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with the other Boardmembers that this is not individually significant because the integrity has been compromised and it does not meet the Secretary of Interior Standards.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – 3131 ELLIOTT STREET UNDER HRB CRITERIA B AND C

Seconded by Vice-Chair Schaefer

Vote: 1-7-1

Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Schaefer, Garbini, Marrone, Aréchiga, Bethke, Berge)(Curry)

ITEM 7 – MUT KULA XUY/MUT LAH HOY YA SITE #7

Applicant: Mehrdad & Fereshten Soumekh, represented by Brian F. Smith & Associates

Location: Not Permitted to List, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the property above as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya Site #7 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A and exclude from the designation the building located on the same premises.

Report Number: HRB-09-029

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

ITEM CONTINUED AT THE REQUEST OF STAFF

ITEM 8 – DELAWIE RESIDENCE II

Applicant: Kurt G Schuette 2001 Trust represented by Happy Hazard LLC

Location: 1833 Neale Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1833 Neale Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Delawie Residence II as a historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-028

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – JOHN SNYDER/RALPH E. HURLBURT & CHARLES H. TIFAL SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Penelope & William D'Allaird Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 2315 Fort Stockton Drive, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 4-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2315 Fort Stockton Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #1 located at 2315 Fort Stockton Drive as a historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-026

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 10 – FLORENCE W. GIBSON SPEC HOUSE

Applicant: Angela Rock & Megan Humpal represented by IS Architecture

Location: 4771 Vista Lane, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (**1269 3-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4771 Vista Lane as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Florence E. Gibson Spec House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-027

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ione Stiegler, Megan Humpal

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Vice-Chair Schaefer is concerned with the use of the modern “s” shaped roof tiles as opposed to the historic “u” shaped tiles. In the past, properties have been denied designation because of the use of the modern roof tiles.

Chair Lemmo commented that there are a lot of Superior Court judges here in the county; he is not any more significant than any of our other distinguished jurists that we have had over the years in San Diego.

Boardmember Berge agrees that the judge does not stand out as individually significant, but the house is known within the community as the “Judge’s House”. She has questions about Criterion C; and will be making a motion to send the report back for further documentation.

Boardmember Aréchiga believes this house is similar to a house the Board decided not to designate two months ago, the questions were focused on the front windows. He would like to know why this house is different.

Boardmember Berge thinks that without historic photos it is hard to speculate when and if any changes occurred.

Boardmember Curry feels that it complies with Criterion C, even though there may not be any historic photos of the home. There are modifications that are considered to be early; but how do we know when they were made; i.e. roof tile may be an early modification. It is known as the “Judges House” and is an important part of the community’s history; this makes an issue for Criterion B. She thinks a decision can be made today.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CONTINUE ITEM 10 – FLORENCE W. GIBSON SPEC HOUSE TO ALLOW FOR THE PROPERTY OWNER AND CONSULTANT TO RETURN WITH ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTATION REGARDING THE BUILDER, THE HOUSE, AND THE INTERIORS

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: May 28, 2009

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:45 PM