

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF AUGUST 27, 2009
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:07 PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Salvador Aréchiga	Present <i>arrived at 1:10PM</i>
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present <i>arrived at 2:00PM</i>
<i>Boardmember</i>	<i>Gail Garbini</i>	<i>Absent</i>
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Present <i>left at 4:00PM</i>
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Andrew Goodrich, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for May 21, 2009, June 25, 2009, and July 23, 2009

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE THE MAY 21, 2009 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE THE JUNE 25, 2009 MINUTES AS AMENDED

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 4-0-0 Motion Passes
(Schaefer, Bethke)

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE THE JULY 23, 2009 MINUTES AS AMENDED

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes
(Silvas)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Garbini was out of town and unable to attend today's meeting.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Chair Lemmo, Vice-Chair Schaefer and Boardmembers Aréchiga were unable to visit the interiors of Items 5, 6 and 9; Boardmember Silvas was unable to visit Items 6 and 9.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO INVOKE THE WAIVER FOR THE BOARDMEMBERS WHO WERE UNABLE TO VIEW THE INTERIORS FOR ITEMS 5, 6 AND 9; PHOTOS INCLUDED IN THE REPORTS ARE SUFFICIENT.

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

C. STAFF REPORT

- The Best Practices in Historic Preservation seminar will take place on Monday, September 14, 2009 in Balboa Park. We have confirmation that Councilmember Todd Gloria from District 3 will provide the opening comments. Historic preservation is an important community issue for the Councilmember and we are looking forward to hearing from him. The seminar will consist of a morning session focused on historic contexts and surveys which is very timely given the number of survey efforts that are currently underway or soon will be starting. The afternoon will start with a session on historical resources and CEQA and will conclude with an in-depth session on project review and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. Registration forms and flyer are online and on back table. Tomorrow is the last day to register at the lower rate of \$40.00 which includes continental breakfast, lunch and seminar materials.

- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, September 2. The next regularly scheduled Incentives Subcommittee meeting will be adjourned to Monday, October 12. The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be adjourned to a special joint meeting with the Archaeology Subcommittee on Thursday, September 24, 2009 at 4:00 PM Time Certain. This special joint meeting will be held in the Council Committee Room, on the 12th Floor of the City Administration Building.
- The September HRB meeting will be adjourned at 4pm to accommodate the joint subcommittee meeting where comprehensive changes to the Historical Resources Guidelines will be discussed. The draft revisions will be made available to subcommittee members and the public approximately 2 weeks prior to the meeting. This HRB and Subcommittee meeting also marks the last meeting for Dr. Schaefer, after six long and I'm sure very rewarding years as a Boardmember. We will miss him and are busy looking for another archaeologist to fill his seat.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes 9 individual homeowner nominations including 4 continued items and the Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria. There are 13 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007, 52 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, and 14 homeowner nominations in 2009 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.
- We anticipate completing all of the 2007 submittals this calendar year so that those owners will be able to apply for a Mills Act agreement beginning in January 2010. Those applications are due no later than March 31, 2010 to be considered in the calendar year.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

NONE

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 10 – WILLIAM AND ANNA BRADLEY/LILIAN RICE HOUSE

ITEM 11 – RAYMOND AND MARGARET TAYLOR HOUSE

ITEM 12 – RALPH HURLBURT/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC HOUSE # 1

ITEM 13 – RAYMOND AND DORIS WORRELL HOUSE

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke pulled Item 11 – Raymond and Margaret Taylor House and Item 12 – Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec House # 1 from the Consent Agenda

Boardmember Berge would like the following modifications to item 10 – remove “grey composition” referring to the shingles in the resolution

Vice-Chair Schaefer would like a Mills Act recommendation to have the single dormer replaced with the original two dormers for Item 10

Boardmember Berge would also like the following modifications to Item 13 – change the notice of completion date to 1928 and include the tower and cast concrete grilles in the resolution

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE ITEM 10 – WILLIAM AND ANNA BRADLEY/ LILIAN RICE HOUSE AND ITEM 13 – RAYMOND AND DORIS

**WORRELL HOUSE ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S
RECOMMENDATION AS REVISED AND REFLECTED IN THE RECORD.**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 4186 JACKDAW STREET

Continued from June 2009

Applicant: Astrid & William Shannon Revocable Trust represented by Christianne Knoop

Location: 4186 Jackdaw Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4186 Jackdaw Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 4186 Jackdaw Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criterion.

Report Number: Staff memo dated August 13, 2009 and HRB-09-040

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Christianne Knoop (*Astrid Shannon*), Bill Shannon

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge questioned the whether there may be other Melhorn houses that survived with vertical slats or whether this photo may just show the under boards before shingles were applied

Vice-Chair Schaefer agrees that changes in cladding has significantly impacted the integrity; he likes the interior but how is preservation served by designation. Paint can be removed from the bricks; there are many features still intact.

Boardmember Aréchiga also agrees that the paint can be removed from the brick; he also has some issues with the shingles.

Vice-Chair Schaefer wanted to know if there could be recommendations put in a file for potential Mills Act restoration

Boardmember Bethke is impressed by the features of the home, but integrity has been compromised too much for individual designation. Owner could restore home and resubmit with new information, but currently it does not meet the standards.

Vice-Chair Schaefer wanted to give the owner some credit for taking the asbestos off and putting on something comparable to the original wood shingles; he is wavering toward supporting designation

Boardmember Marrone thinks the bricks and shingles are reversible; other features make it significant.

Boardmember Aréchiga feels that the missing garage also compromises the integrity.

Boardmember Berge feels that it is significant under Criterion D for Melhorn with the Asian influence of the roofline and the interiors being called out.

Boardmember Silvas wanted to know if the year would need to be determined

Boardmember Bethke still feels that the integrity is too compromised under Criterion D and that the context isn't there to support it.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR SCHAEFER TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – 4186 JACKDAW STREET UNDER CRITERION C EMBODYING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF CRAFTSMAN STYLE WITH JAPANESE INFLUENCES DATING TO CA. 1914 IS A VALUABLE EXAMPLE OF CRAFTSMANSHIP AND UNDER CRITERION D AS A NOTABLE WORK OF MASTER ARCHITECT MARTIN V. MELHORN AND INCLUDES THE NOTABLE PRESERVED ASPECTS INDICATED IN THE STAFF REPORT ON THE INTERIOR.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 5-2-0

Motion Fails

(Bethke, Aréchiga)

ITEM 6 – JAMES P. AND FLORENCE E. GIBSON/CHARLES SALYERS HOUSE

Continued from April 2009

Applicant: Angela Rock & Megan Humpal represented by IS Architecture

Location: 4771 Vista Lane, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (**1269 3-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4771 Vista Lane as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the James P. and Florence E. Gibson/Charles Salyers House located at 4771 Vista Lane as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria A, C, and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-059

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen, presented by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ione Stiegler, Megan Humpal

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Vice-Chair Schaefer agrees with Staff's recommendation under Criterion A in addition to Criteria C and D.

Chair Lemmo agrees with Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Berge also agrees with Criterion A and is in support of Staff's recommendation

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – JAMES P. AND FLORENCE E. GIBSON / CHARLES SALYERS HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 7-0-1
(Curry)

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – 2909 CHATSWORTH BLVD.

Continued from July 2009

Applicant: Raquel & Kevin Greene represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 2909 Chatsworth Blvd., 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1268 6-D)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2909 Chatsworth Blvd. as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 2909 Chatsworth Blvd. as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: Staff memo dated August 13, 2009 and HRB-09-017

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (*Kevin Greene*)

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Staff on the architectural style and significance regardless of style; it is not individually eligible regardless of what you call it.

Boardmember Curry agrees there is a disagreement with the style but the historical integrity is there

Vice-Chair Schaefer sees more Ranch than Minimal Traditional; Staff reviewed adopted "Ranch procedures". He agrees with Staff, property is not individually significant.

Boardmember Berge also agrees that it is not individually significant, maybe significant as a district contributor. She does not support designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – 2909 CHATSWORTH BLVD. PURSUANT TO THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 2-6-0
(Lemmo, Schaefer, Marrone, Aréchiga, Bethke, & Berge)

Motion Fails

ITEM 8 – 155 19th STREET, SHERMAN HEIGHTS DISTRICT CONTRIBUTOR

Continued from July 2009

Applicant: Leticia Garcia represented by Philip Shapiro

Location: 155 19th Street, 92102, Southeastern San Diego Community, Council District 8 (1289 4-C)

Description: Consider the rescission of the designation of the Sherman Heights District Contributor located at 155 19th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Rescind the designation of 155 19th Street; or do not rescind.

Staff Recommendation: Rescind the designation of the property at 155 19th Street, designated as HRB Site #208-003, due to a loss of integrity.

Report Number: Staff memo dated August 13, 2009 and HRB-09-037

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Louise Torio (*Steve Veach*)

In Opposition: Philip Shapiro, R. Robledo

Board Discussion:

Chair Lemmo found the plans to be helpful; the plans say this property is a designated historical resource and the plans say that the “double gable roofline shall be reconstructed with the same pitch eave overhang and rafter tails” and this did not occur. This property is built to the plans, but the plans are not historically accurate and have changed the resource in such a way that it no longer qualifies for its designation and that is why it is before us today as a rescission action. This house was not done correctly, it was not your fault, but it is not the City’s fault either, the City wasn’t your architect or your engineer.

Boardmember Curry believes that there is a cultural issue related to restoration and architecture in the US; the owner didn’t get enough help during reconstruction from neighbors or the City. We may not be blaming the owner but we are punishing him; issues only came out with Mills Act request. She is really bothered by this case.

Boardmember Berge believes that there are extraordinary circumstances in this situation; she read excerpt from Sherman Heights Historic District and Grant Hill Park Historic District Design Criteria and Guidelines; “*Rehabilitation of Historic structures and alterations shall be made in consistency with the U.S. Secretary of Interior Standards for rehabilitation. Minor deviations of the above standards may be permitted on a case by case basis upon review by the Planning Director and Historical Site Board.*”

Boardmember Silvas mention that this reminded him of a case the Board reviewed on Lark and Washington Place; and this is the third time he has seen “rescind” on the agenda, must be a new trend, and that this is also the first home that he has reviewed East of the I-5.

Vice-Chair Schaefer thinks it was a really good idea to have the plans distributed to the Board, allowed them to see what happened and where the slip up occurred. It is very clear that it happened with the Builder, because the plans are very explicit as to what needs to be done for a designated historical resource in a reconstruction. It is not ambiguous, it is plainly worded; there are deviations in what was built then what was noted and approved on the plans. He supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Aréchiga doesn’t see the plans to be straight forward; he sees discrepancies within plans between sheets. There are several mistakes by all including City Staff review of the plans.

Boardmember Bethke agrees more outreach is needed, but by letting this go sets a dangerous precedent there should not be exceptions to the standards. This building does not contribute to the district; it gives a false sense of history.

Boardmember Aréchiga mentioned that the owners were offered Mills Act and 10 years to restore the structure.

Boardmember Curry said that Mills Act would not resolve issue for 10 years; need to look for other solutions

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BETHKE TO RESCIND THE DESIGNATION OF ITEM 8 – 155 19TH STREET, SHERMAN HEIGHTS DISTRICT CONTRIBUTOR PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Schaefer

Vote: 4-3-1

Motion Fails

(Curry, Berge, Silvas)(Aréchiga)

ITEM 9 – EDWARD AND GERTRUDE DENNSTEDT HOUSE

Applicant: Joanna & Howard Smith Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4615 Norma Drive, 92115, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (**1269 3-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4615 Norma Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Edward and Gertrude Dennstedt House located at 4615 Norma Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1936 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-053

Staff Report by Andrew Goodrich

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ron May (*Joanna Smith, Dale May*)

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge would like to have the original red clay tile roof, front gate and garage doors added to the resolution; she would also like to have the name include the middle initials for clarity i.e. Edward W. and Gertrude A. Dennstedt; and lastly she wondered why not include entire rooms in the designation?

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – EDWARD AND GERTRUDE DENNSTEDT HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS; CHANGE THE NAME TO THE EDWARD W. AND

GERTRUDE A. DENNSTEDT HOUSE AND INCLUDE THE ENTIRE LIST OF CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES AND INTERIORS AS PROPOSED IN THE NOMINATION REPORT (PPS 18 & 24) IN THE RESOLUTION.

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 10 – WILLIAM AND ANNA BRADLEY/LILIAN RICE HOUSE

Applicant: Judith & Richard Freeman Trust represented by Christianne Knoop

Location: 7325 Remley Place, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 7-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7325 Remley Place as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William and Anna Bradley/Lilian Rice House located at 7325 Remley Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1930 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-054

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 11 – RAYMOND AND MARGARET TAYLOR HOUSE

Applicant: JDC Family Trust represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 2732 Azalea Drive, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2732 Azalea Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Raymond and Margaret Taylor House located at 2732 Azalea Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C.

Report Number: HRB-09-055

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen, presented by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Item was taken Out of Order; Boardmember Marrone was not present for this item.

Boardmember Bethke although not crazy about the rear addition; it does adhere with the Secretary of Interior Standards. He has a bigger issue with the report, it does not sufficiently establish significance, local context is lacking.

Boardmember Berge agrees that the report needs more local historic context; she is supporting Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry feels that this meets Criterion C; consultant report provides sufficient information for local designation we may even want to limit number of pages for reports.

Vice-Chair Schaefer agrees that this is a very good example of Colonial Revival and an important addition to our corpus of historical resources in San Diego. Context could be expanded for future designations; supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Aréchiga would also like more from consultants to establish significance

Boardmember Curry argued that the architectural style is the criterion for local designation.

Chair Lemmo is also in support of Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – RAYMOND AND MARGARET TAYLOR HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 6-1-0

Motion Passes

(Bethke)

ITEM 12 – RALPH HURLBURT/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC HOUSE # 1

Applicant: Chris & Julia Pallia represented by Happy Hazard LLC.

Location: 3917 Hawk Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3917 Hawk Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec House # 1 located at 3917 Hawk Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-056

Staff Report by Andrew Goodrich

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Janet O'Dea (Dale May), Julie Pallia

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke has issues with the style

Boardmember Berge also agrees that the style should be changed to Colonial Revival Cottage Style with Craftsman Bungalow influences; Ralph Hurlbert should be noted as a Master Designer not Master Architect

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 12 – RALPH HURLBURT/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC HOUSE # 1 PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE INCLUSION AND CHANGE TO THE COLONIAL REVIVAL COTTAGE STYLE ARCHITECTURE WITH CRAFTSMAN BUNGALOW INFLUENCES AND THE DEFINITIVE ADJECTIVE ADDED FOR MASTER DESIGNER RALPH HURLBURT

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 13 – RAYMOND AND DORIS WORRELL HOUSE

Applicant: Marcella & Frank Plant Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4351 Ampudia Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4351 Ampudia Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Raymond and Doris Worrell House located at 4351 Ampudia Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-057

ITEM PASSENT ON CONSENT

ITEM 14 – GUIDELINES FOR THE APPLICATION OF HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD DESIGNATION CRITERIA

Applicant: City of San Diego, City Planning & Community Investment Department

Location: Citywide

Description: Consider the adoption of the Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria and inclusion of the criteria guidelines in the Land Development Manual, Historical Resources Guidelines Appendix E.

Today's Action: Adopt the Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria, or do not adopt the Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria

Staff Recommendation: Adopt the Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria as presented and direct staff to include them in Appendix E of the Historical Resources Guidelines in the Land Development Manual.

Report Number: HRB-09-058

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge feels that page 3 is the most important page in the document; evaluating a resource within its historic context. She has a handful of questions, possible revisions; she would like to go over with the Board. On Page 3, she would like the words “stand-alone” removed.

Chair Lemmo does not see the need for this revision.

Vice Chair Schaefer agrees with Chair Lemmo.

Boardmember Bethke doesn't think that it would hurt to add a clarifying statement.

Boardmember Curry is concerned about adding too much information would be more harmful than helpful.

Boardmember Berge moved on to questions she had on pages 20-28; evaluations need to be context based when applying Criterion C.

Boardmember Bethke needs more clarification; current approach does not help the public understand significance. He needs to know why a building is unique in order to evaluate its significance. Since joining the Board, he has not seen any analysis that adequately puts a building into its historic context.

Boardmember Curry responded that we are doing preservation; we only need enough information to designate, some historic research can be done a later time. Stated that if the Guidelines are adopted and there are problems, changes could be made then.

Boardmember Aréchiga asked why all issues were not resolved at the Policy Subcommittee and wanted to understand whether changes could be made after Guidelines are adopted.

Boardmember Bethke referenced the Grand Jury investigation and is just looking for answers as to who, what, where, why and when; if they cannot answer these questions then it probably isn't individually significant. We are piece mealing districts together one by one. His feeling is that a liberal application of the criteria is a disservice to preservation.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Boardmember Bethke, she opposes the guidelines as they stand.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO ADOPT THE GUIDELINES FOR THE APPLICATION OF HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD DESIGNATION CRITERIA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Schaefer

Vote: 4-3-0

Motion Passes

(Berge, Bethke, Aréchiga)

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, September 24, 2009

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:55 PM