

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 25, 2009  
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING  
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12<sup>th</sup> FLOOR  
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:00 PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Salvador Aréchiga	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary  
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner  
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner  
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner  
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner  
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES** for August 27, 2009

Minutes from August 27, 2009 were not available for approval

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

Myra Herrmann – California Archaeology Month

### **ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

#### **A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Curry and Silvas were unable to attend today's meeting.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Chair Lemmo announced that today is Dr. Schaefer's last meeting; he wanted to thank him for all of the good work that he has done on this Board and for the City of San Diego.

Boardmember Aréchiga wanted to congratulate Staff once again on the well put together seminar earlier this month; he really enjoyed it.

#### **B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Boardmember Marrone received an email from the La Jolla Historical Society regarding Item-10 1263 Silverado Street; she didn't open the email and notified them that she should receive these types of communications from them in the future. She did not read the email and it did not affect her opinion of Item 10.

Chair Lemmo mentioned that if this happens to any Boardmember in the future; they should forward that correspondence to the Staff Liaison to the Board.

#### **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Boardmember Arechiga was unable to visit Items 6 and 10, information included in the reports are sufficient

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

#### **MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO INVOKE WAIVER FOR THE BOARDMEMBERS WHO WERE UNABLE TO VIEW ITEMS 6 AND 10**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

#### **C. STAFF REPORT**

- Earlier this week, the City Council Committee on Land Use and Housing heard a number of items related to historic preservation. Staff presented an update on the Mills Act Program and the General Plan incentives, including the work being done by the Incentives Subcommittee, and a status report on the processing of three new historic districts. Our Deputy Director presented

background information on conservation areas and how they are used in other U.S. cities to protect community and neighborhood character. Staff reviewed the permit review process for properties over 45 years old with the most current statistics and addressed outstanding issues related to noticing, penalties, CEQA, and preliminary reviews. A detailed written response to community concerns will be prepared by the end of this year to address all the issues raised at the hearing. Staff also introduced four potential amendments to the Land Development Code related to historical resources. These amendments will be taken through the usual process with abundant public review and will come to the Board during the adoption process. The entire hearing with all the presentations, public comment, and Councilmember comment can be viewed on the City's TV24 website under archived videos.

- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, October 14. The next Incentives Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, October 12. Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings have been cancelled until further notice due to a current lack of subcommittee members.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes 5 individual homeowner nominations including 1 continued item and 1 California Register of Historical Resources listing recommendation. There are 7 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2007, 52 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, and 14 homeowner nominations in 2009 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.
- We anticipate completing all of the 2007 submittals this calendar year so that those owners will be able to apply for a Mills Act agreement beginning in January 2010. Those applications are due no later than March 31, 2010 to be considered in the calendar year.

#### **D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

Staff is requesting a 30-day continuance **Item 6 – Western Salt Company Salt Works** due to noticing errors

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

#### **MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT A 30-DAY CONTINUANCE AT STAFF'S REQUEST**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

#### **ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

ITEM 5 – THE ROBERT O. PETERSON/RUSSELL FORESTER RESIDENCE (*note this item is a recommendation for listing on the California Register not a local designation*)

ITEM 7 – E.A AND EFFIE TINDULA HOUSE

ITEM 8 – LUCY KILLEA HOUSE

ITEM 9 – JOHN SNYDER/RALPH E. HURLBURT & CHARLES H. TIFAL SPEC HOUSE #2

All Items were pulled from the Consent Agenda.

---

**INFORMATION ITEMS**

---

**ITEM A – MILLS ACT MONITORING/INSPECTION SCHEDULE**

No action on the part of the Board is required.

---

**ACTION ITEMS**

---

**ITEM 5 – THE ROBERT O. PETERSON/RUSSELL FORESTER RESIDENCE**

Applicant: Jeffrey R Krinsk Property Trust Et Al represented by

Location: 567 Gage Lane, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1288 3-A**)

Description: California Register of Historical Resources listing recommendation

Today's Action: Review California Register of Historical Resources Nomination for the Robert O. Peterson/Russell Forester Residence

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the Office of Historic Preservation the listing of The Robert O. Peterson/Russell Forester Residence at 567 Gage Lane to the California Register of Historical Resources.

Report Number: HRB-09-060

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge wanted to know, for clarity, what is the role of the HRB today.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO RECOMMEND TO THE OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION THE LISTING OF THE ROBERT O. PETERSON/RUSSELL FORESTER RESIDENCE TO THE CALIFORNIA REGISTER OF HISTORICAL RESOURCES PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Vice Chair Schaefer

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 6 – WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS**

**Continued from April 2008**

Applicant: Save Our Heritage Organisation (SOHO)

Property is owned by the San Diego Airport Authority

Location: 1470 Bay Boulevard, Otay Mesa-Nestor Community, Council District 8 (**1269 3-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1470 Bay Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Salt Works located at 1470 Bay Boulevard under HRB Criterion E. The resource shall be listed as an individually significant resource, with the eleven elements identified as “contributing” included in the designation as character defining elements of the resource; and the four elements identified as “non-contributing” excluded from the designation as non-character defining elements.

Report Number: Staff memo dated September 18, 2009 and HRB-08-005

ITEM CONTINUED FOR 30-DAYS AT STAFFS REQUEST

**ITEM 7 – E.A AND EFFIE TINDULA HOUSE**

Applicant: Hall Family Trust

Location: 3593 29<sup>th</sup> Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3593 29<sup>th</sup> Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate of the E.A. and Effie Tindula House, located at 3593 29<sup>th</sup> Street under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-061

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge would like to make the following modifications to the resolution; change style to “Craftsman Bungalow Style with Colonial Revival stylistic influences; add single car detached garage and front porch with columns and clipped gable roof to character defining features. Vice Chair Schaefer encouraged the owners to come back and nominate the significant interior elements of the property. Boardmember Garbini would like to include the scored concrete walkway as a character defining feature of the site.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – E.A AND EFFIE TINDULA HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION WITH MODIFICATIONS TO THE RESOLUTION AS FOLLOWS; CHANGE THE STYLE TO CRAFTSMAN BUNGALOW, AND ADD TO THE CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES: THE SINGLE CAR DETACHED GARAGE, FRONT PORCH WITH COLUMNS AND CLIPPED GABLE ROOF AND SCORED CONCRETE WALKWAY.**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-0-1

Motion Passes

*(Bethke)*

**ITEM 8 – LUCY KILLEA HOUSE**

Applicant: John and Nicole Cardosa represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 3248 Brant Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1269 7-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3248 Brant Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Lucy Killea House located at 3248 Brant Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1969-1999 under HRB Criteria B.

Report Number: HRB-09-064

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Vice Chair Schaefer wanted to clarify the City does not have a “minimum” age requirement; normally more time has to pass, in this case data supports that sufficient time has passed to determine her historical significance. Boardmember Berge would like to make the following modifications to the resolution to call out more of her accomplishments i.e. woman’s issues, historic preservation. Chair Lemmo also agrees that the resolution should highlight her contributions with more specificity. Boardmember Bethke is uncomfortable with recentness of association; he feels that more time needs to pass to define what that legacy really is. Boardmember Schaefer is not sure that alterations to the structure have significantly impacted the house. Boardmember Garbini thinks that the changes to the front may have been done, because she was entertaining a lot more people than the average person as part of her career; which maybe why it was designed the way it was. Boardmember Marrone agrees; she did not feel there is a significant impact to integrity. She is in favor of nominating it for Criterion C.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY VICE CHAIR SCHAEFER TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – LUCY KILLEA HOUSE UNDER CRITERION B FOR ITS ASSOCIATION WITH LUCY KILLEA, WHO IS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL AND STATE HISTORY FOR HER SERVICE AS CITY COUNCIL MEMBER FOR DISTRICT 3, STATE SENATOR, AND ESPECIALLY FOR HER SIGNIFICANCE IN FOUNDING THE HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD, AND FOR HER MANY YEARS OF ADVOCATING WOMEN’S, HEALTHCARE, ENVIRONMENTAL AND OTHER PROGRESSIVE POLITICAL ISSUES THROUGHOUT HER CAREER**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-1-0

Motion Passes

(Bethke)

**MOTION BY VICE CHAIR SCHAEFER TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – LUCY KILLEA HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C AS AN EXAMPLE OF ITALIAN RENAISSANCE**

**STYLE ARCHITECTURE RETAINING INTEGRITY WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE FROM 1920-1999; WHICH INCLUDES MODIFICATIONS TO THE HARDSCAPE.**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 9 – JOHN SNYDER/RALPH E. HURLBURT & CHARLES H. TIFAL SPEC HOUSE #2**

Applicant: Lois Musoke Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4370 Trias Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 4-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4370 Trias Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt & Charles H. Tifal Spec House #2 located at 4370 Trias Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-09-062

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Ron May (*Dale May*)

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge would like to make the following modifications to the resolution; change Ralph E. Hurlburt to Master Designer

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – JOHN SNYDER/RALPH E. HURLBURT & CHARLES H. TIFAL SPEC HOUSE #2 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH MODIFICATIONS TO THE RESOLUTION AS FOLLOWS; CHANGE RALPH E. HURLBURT TO MASTER DESIGNER**

Seconded by Boardmember Aréchiga

Vote: 6-1-0

Motion Passes

(*Bethke*)

**ITEM 10 – 1263 SILVERADO STREET**

Applicant: Susan & James Padavano represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1263 Silverado Street, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1263 Silverado Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1263 Silverado Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-09-065

**Staff Report by Kelley Saunders**

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Marie Lia (*Susan Padavano, James Padavano*)

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Bethke asked why the letters refer to “beach” cottage, which is more Criterion A than it is Criterion C. He thinks there is a case under Criterion A; but the case is not made for this criterion in the report. He does not support designation under Criterion C. Chair Lemmo agrees, if there was some supporting documentation for “A” he would support it; but he finds it more difficult to support under “C.” Boardmember Berge also agrees and thinks the consultant should go back and do more research for “A” and then bring it back before the Board. Vice Chair Schaefer agrees with other Boardmembers on “A” and agrees with Staff on “C”. This cottage does convey an important time and space in the history of La Jolla that has been lost in all of the development; there are few left from the early history of beach cottages in La Jolla. Boardmember Marrone agrees with everything that Vice-Chair Schaefer said; there is still so much of it intact and it stands out as an example of what La Jolla used to look like. It is also important that it still sits on its original lot. Boardmember Garbini asked if the Board can determine that the changes have gained significance of their own over time. Chair Lemmo thinks it is pretty clear from the consensus of Boardmembers sitting here today that the property is likely significant under “A. The problem is the consultant report doesn’t support A, so an addendum would be needed from the consultant. Boardmember Bethke would like to see a context addressing Criterion A

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE TO A POINT IN THE NEAR FUTURE AFTER STAFF HAS RECEIVED AND EVALUATED ADDENDUM MATERIALS PRESENTED BY THE OWNER OR THE OWNERS CONSULTANT CONCERNING THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THIS RESOURCE UNDER CRITERION A AS WE HAVE DISCUSSED TODAY**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**REMINDER:**

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:**

Thursday, October 22, 2009

**LOCATION:**

City Administration Building  
12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:55 PM**