

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OCTOBER 22, 2009  
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING  
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12<sup>th</sup> FLOOR  
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:10 PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Salvador Aréchiga	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present <i>arrived at 1:50PM</i>
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary  
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner  
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner  
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner  
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES** for August 27, 2009 and September 25, 2009

Minutes from August 27, 2009 and September 25, 2009 were not available for approval

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

**ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

**A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

- **ABSENCES**

None

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

**B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

**FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Chair Lemmo, Vice-Chair Aréchiga, Boardmember Silvas, and Boardmember Bethke were unable to see the interiors of Items 6 and 8; Boardmember Garbini was unable to see the interiors of Item 6

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO INVOKE THE WAIVER FOR THE BOARDMEMBERS WHO WERE UNABLE TO VIEW THE INTERIORS FOR ITEMS 6 AND 8; PHOTOS INCLUDED IN THE REPORTS ARE SUFFICIENT.**

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**C. STAFF REPORT**

- We have a few binders from the Best Practices Seminar held last month that can be purchased for \$25. The binders include handouts of the PowerPoint presentations, the Treatment Standards and Guidelines, several preservation bulletins, and an information bulletin on CEQA and Historical Resources. If you are interested, see Shannon today or give her a call.
- Staff is busy working on preparing the CLG Annual Report. We will present the draft at the November Board meeting for review and approval. It will then be submitted to the State Office of Historic Preservation and posted on our website.
- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, November 4. The next Incentives Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, November 9. Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings have been cancelled until further notice due to a current lack of subcommittee members.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes 7 individual homeowner nominations including 1 continued item. There are 52 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, and 16 homeowner nominations in 2009 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.
- We anticipate completing all of the 2007 submittals this calendar year so that those owners will be able to apply for a Mills Act agreement beginning in January 2010. Those applications are due no later than March 31, 2010 to be considered in the calendar year.

#### **D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

**Item 5 – Western Salt Company Salt Works;** Applicant is requesting a continuance to the next open agenda, January 28, 2010, Staff is in support of the continuance

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CONTINUE ITEM 5 – WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS TO THE JANUARY 28, 2010 HEARING**

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 6-0-1

Motion Passes

*(Lemmo)*

#### **ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

ITEM 6 – IRVING AND MAY WATSON HOUSE

ITEM 7 – JOHN AND CAROLINE BOSTICK HOUSE

ITEM 8 – FRANCIS AND DOROTHY HARVEY HOUSE

ITEM 9 – HELEN SCHNEPP HOUSE

ITEM 10 –OLMSTEAD BUILDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #1

#### **Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge pulled Item 6, Item 9 and Item 10 from the consent agenda

Boardmember Berge would like the following modifications to Item 7 – include the front porch wall and front porch light fixture in the resolution

Boardmember Berge would like clarity on Item 8 as to which walls actually have the original beeswax finish. The resolution needs be made clearer.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE ITEM 7 – JOHN AND CAROLINE BOSTICK HOUSE AND ITEM 8 – FRANCIS AND DOROTHY HARVEY HOUSE ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION AS REVISED AND REFLECTED IN THE RECORD.**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

---

#### **INFORMATION ITEMS**

---

#### **ITEM A – GREATER GOLDEN HILL AND NORTH PARK HISTORIC SURVEY UPDATE**

Staff will present a brief status report on these survey efforts. No action on the part of the Board is required

#### **ITEM B – GENERAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN FOR THE TORREY PINES CITY PARK (GLIDERPORT)**

Staff and Consultant will present background information and three potential General Development Plan scenarios for the local and National Register listed Torrey Pines Gliderport site (HRB# 315). Although

no action on the part of the Board is required, comments and recommendations from the Board are being solicited.

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Garbini thinks that a possible interpretive center/museum might be appropriate to give the public information on the history and use of the site; the biggest concern is the sensitivity and restoration of the site.

Boardmember Silvas agrees that this is a very important site, and commends them for including the Kumeyaay.

Boardmember Bethke commends the educational aspect; development should complement the natural and cultural resources and use of site.

Chair Lemmo wanted to know what the Coastal Commission said about the beach access gondola.

Boardmember Berge supports the Basic approach due to the economic concerns with development and conservation conflicts.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga supports the “Light Touch” alternative; suggests sustainable pavement

Chair Lemmo supports restoration but not to the extent that would change the look and feel

Boardmember Curry was looking into the possibility combining portions of options 1 and 3; supports restrooms or drinking fountains as part of option 1 if that is a possibility.

---

**ACTION ITEMS**

---

**ITEM 5 – WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS**

**Continued from September 2009**

Applicant: Save Our Heritage Organisation (SOHO)

Property is owned by the San Diego Airport Authority

Location: 1470 Bay Boulevard, 91911, Otay Mesa-Nestor Community, Council District 8 (1269 3-H)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1470 Bay Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Salt Works located at 1470 Bay Boulevard under HRB Criterion E. The resource shall be listed as an individually significant resource, with the eleven elements identified as “contributing” included in the designation as character defining elements of the resource; and the four elements identified as “non-contributing” excluded from the designation as non-character defining elements.

Report Number: Staff memo dated September 18, 2009 and HRB-08-005

ITEM CONTINUED UNTIL THE JANUARY 28, 2010 HEARING AT THE APPLICANTS REQUEST

**ITEM 6 – IRVING AND MAY WATSON HOUSE**

Applicant: John Aganon represented by Christianne Knoop

Location: 3136 Grim Avenue, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 7-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3136 Grim Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Irving and May Watson House located at 3136 Grim Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-068

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: John Aganon (*Christianne Knoop, Sandy Keaton, Peter Manjuck*)

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge has concerns with the front porch, which appears to her to have been extended.

Boardmember Curry thinks that unless we have a photograph that shows how it was before it changed, if it did in fact change, with this photo we cannot really say it is not original.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga likes the effort the owners have put into preserving this house, but had an issue with the porch with regards to the stucco on the brick. There is a better solution to brick deterioration than stucco.

Boardmember Bethke is also concerned with the stucco on the brick and loss of integrity; major character defining feature of the home.

Boardmember Curry mentioned that in the past we have asked owners to make changes prior to designation; i.e. if stucco is the only issue (property meets Criterion C for designation). Would the situation be resolved if the owner removed the stucco from the porch; we would still need a historic photo to prove that it is not the original porch.

Boardmember Bethke wanted to know if they can produce a photo that this is the original porch; from an architectural standpoint, it is a funky extension.

Chair Lemmo agrees that the porch doesn't seem right.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga asked if porch can be reversed.

Boardmember Marrone asked Staff for more clarification on their reasoning for supporting designation.

Boardmember Curry is a little concerned; stucco may not be ideal, but the materials are still there and the history is documented. "Funky" could still be original unless we have the proof that it is not. Do we need to have 100% integrity, if so then we will be left with very few examples.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – IRVING AND MAY WATSON HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 5-3-0

Motion Fails

(*Bethke, Berge, Garbini*)

**ITEM 7 – JOHN AND CAROLINE BOSTICK HOUSE**

Applicant: Zlotnick Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2436 Presidio Drive, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1268 5-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2436 Presidio Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John and Caroline Bostick House located at 2436 Presidio Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-069

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

**ITEM 8 – FRANCIS AND DOROTHY HARVEY HOUSE**

Applicant: Richard Haas III represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 5801 Adelaide Avenue, 92115, Eastern Area Community, Council District 7 (1270 4-B)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5801 Adelaide Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Francis and Dorothy Harvey House located at 5801 Adelaide Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1932 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-070

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

**ITEM 9 – HELEN SCHNEPP HOUSE**

Applicant: Sonya Celeste-Harris

Location: 3636 Herbert Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-C)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3636 Herbert Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Helen Schnepf House located at 3636 Herbert Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-071

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Sonya Harris, Richard Harris

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge wanted to clarify whether or not Helen Schnepf actually lived in this property. She had questions for Staff with regards to the shingles and clapboards on the addition and found the Queen Palms troublesome.

Boardmember Garbini is concerned with the addition and its massing.

Boardmember Curry feels that the addition is acceptable and meets the Secretary of Interior Standards.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – HELEN SCHNEPP HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 6-2-0

Motion Passes

*(Bethke, Garbini)*

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO ADD SPEC HOUSE #1 TO THE NAME, MAKING IT THE HELEN SCHNEPP SPEC HOUSE #1**

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 6-0-2

Motion Passes

*(Bethke, Garbini)*

**ITEM 10 –OLMSTEAD BUILDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #1**

**Continued from September 2008**

Applicant: Gomez and Amuedo-Dorantes Trust represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 4276 Trias Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268-5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4276 Trias Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Olmstead Building Company Spec House #1 located at 4276 Trias Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1933 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-09-073

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: John Eisenhart, Scott Moomjian (*Francisco Gomez, Catalina Amuedo-Dorantes*)

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Curry agrees with applicant that Bellon is an important person. Besides the characteristics of the home i.e. porte-cochere, it is important and pleasing the way the home is treated by the owners (as an artifact). The home has the original footprint and retains its integrity; she can support it under B and C.

Boardmember Bethke has a lot of issues with all of the Criteria presented. He does not feel there is enough evidence to designate; particularly under Criterion B; which he considers “hokey”. Under Criterion C, there is nothing particularly interesting about the home. Criterion D was the most interesting aspect of nomination; but not sufficient to be a notable example.

Boardmember Berge also had issues with designation in all of the categories; gable is interesting but out of character.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga noticed that the Sanborn map does not show the porte-cochere and, there is a noticeable difference between the new stucco and the stucco on the porte-cochere.

Boardmember Curry thinks the integrity is good and that it is a good example embodying distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Colonial Revival style architecture. The porte-cochere is part of its history; alterations have followed the Secretary of Interior Standards.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 – OLMSTEAD BUILDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #1 PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 6-2-0

Motion Passes

*(Berge, Aréchiga)*

**ITEM 11 – 2749 28<sup>th</sup> STREET**

Applicant: Jennifer & Robert Romano represented by Christianne Knoop

Location: 2749 28<sup>th</sup> Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 7-D)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2749 28<sup>th</sup> Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2749 28<sup>th</sup> Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-09-072

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen, presented by Jennifer Hirsch

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Jennifer Romano, Robert Romano (*Christianne Knoop*)

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge was pleased to hear that the French doors were original; was painting the addition recommended by Staff.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga mentioned that DAS is an option, not sure if it was when the addition was added

Boardmember Silvas thought it was a very beautiful house

Boardmember Bethke is concerned with the addition, feels that the property has been compromised. Landscaping and paint won't help.

Boardmember Garbini agrees that it is a beautiful house, but feels that the massing on the addition is a problem and other alterations affect the integrity as well.

Boardmember Curry agrees that the alterations need to be looked at before asking the owners to make changes.

Boardmember Berge does not see it as individually significant due to the massing and the changes. Home could be a contributor to a district; encouraged owners to pursue with their neighbors a possible district.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – 2749 28<sup>th</sup> STREET UNDER CRITERION C AS REQUESTED BY THE PROPERTY OWNER**

Seconded by Vice Chair Aréchiga

Vote: 0-8-0

Motion Fails

*(Lemmo, Aréchiga, Curry, Marrone, Berge, Garbini, Silvas, Bethke)*

**ITEM 12 – BOARD APPOINTMENT OF VICE-CHAIR**

**\*\*Please Note this Item will be taken First on the Agenda\*\***

Applicant: City Planning & Community Investment Department

Location: Citywide

Description: Consider appointing a Vice-Chair from among the existing Boardmembers to perform the duties of the Chair in the Chair's absence.

Today's Action: Appoint a Vice-Chair

Staff Recommendation: Appoint a Vice-Chair

Report Number: N/A

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO NOMINATE SAL ARÉCHIGA AS VICE-CHAIR**

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**REMINDER:**

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:** Friday, November 20, 2009

**LOCATION:** City Administration Building  
12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:35 PM**