



### **ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

#### **A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Curry notified staff that due to her teaching commitment, she is not able to attend today's meeting.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ MEMO - HRB MEETING DATES FOR 2010
- ✓ Letters for Item 6 – George and Alice Hazzard House *at 2900 Sixth Avenue*
- ✓ Letters for Item 8 – Henry Jones House *at 4040 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue*
- ✓ Letters for Item 9 – 1041-1047 University Avenue
- ✓ Letter for Item 10 – 1263 Silverado Street
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

#### **B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Chair Lemmo has a conflict of interest for Items 5-8; Items 9-13 will be heard first to allow Chair Lemmo to recuse himself from the remainder of the meeting.

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

#### **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

#### **C. STAFF REPORT**

- The next Incentives Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, December 14. The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, January 6, 2009. This meeting may be postponed one week to January 13 due to the holidays and need for adequate noticing. Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings have been cancelled until further notice due to a current lack of subcommittee members.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes 5 referrals from Development Services and 2 individual homeowner nominations including 1 continued item, a correction of parcel numbers for previously designated resources; and the Annual Certified Local Government Report. There are 52 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, and 18 homeowner nominations in 2009 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.
- With this meeting we have completed all of the 2007 submittals. Those owners whose property was designated this calendar year or earlier are eligible to apply for a Mills Act agreement beginning in January 2010. Those applications are due no later than March 31, 2010 to be considered next year.

#### **D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

None

#### **ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

##### **ITEM 6 – GEORGE AND ALICE HAZZARD HOUSE**

Item 6 was pulled off of Consent Agenda for Public Comment

---

#### **INFORMATION ITEMS**

---

##### **ITEM A – UPTOWN HISTORIC SURVEY UPDATE**

Staff will present a brief status report on these survey efforts. No action on the part of the Board is required

##### **ITEM B – CHICANO PARK MURALS**

Chicano Park in Barrio Logan is home to more than 40 magnificent murals painted by Hispanic artisans from throughout the Southwest. Mr. Marty Rosen from CALTRANS has secured \$1.6 million in grants to restore at least 20 of the murals. Mr. Rosen will present information on this important project. No action on the part of the Board is required

---

#### **ACTION ITEMS**

---

##### **ITEM 5 – 2901 5<sup>th</sup> AVENUE**

###### **Continued from April 2008**

Applicant: Palm Properties LP represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 2901 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1269 7-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2901 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate 2901 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated November 6, 2009, HRB-08-028 and HRB 07-042

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

###### **Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Marie Lia, Leo Wilson

In Opposition: John Eisenhart, Todd Pittman, Michael D'Ambrosia

###### **Board Discussion:**

Vice-Chair Arechiga wanted to know what the reason was for the pop outs.

Boardmember Bethke appreciates Mr. Eisenharts comments; he thinks this needs more discussion and would like to hear other Boardmembers thoughts.

Boardmember Berge agrees that this needs more discussion; she also has concerns with the email and would like to know more.

Vice-Chair Arechiga would like to know more about its significance.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CONTINUE ITEM 5 – 2901 5<sup>th</sup> AVENUE SO THE BOARD CAN HAVE MORE COMPLETE INFORMATION REGARDING THE ASSOCIATION OF THE ARCHITECT AND ALSO THE METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION, SO THE BOARD CAN REVIEW IT LATER WITH A MORE THOROUGH BACKGROUND.**

Seconded by Boardmember Jarmusch

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 6 – GEORGE AND ALICE HAZZARD HOUSE  
Continued from April 2008**

Applicant: Palm Properties LP represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 2900 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1269 7-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2900 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George and Alice Hazzard House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Italian Renaissance Revival Style architecture.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated November 6, 2009, Staff Memo dated April 10, 2008 and HRB-07-045

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Marie Lia, Don Schmidt, Leo Wilson, Janet O’Dea, Bruce Coons (*Ron May, Ernestine Bonn, Nancy Moors, Ann Garwood, Dale May, Dan Soderberg*)

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Jarmusch wanted to know if they could amend the motion to add Criterion B.

Boardmember Berge has concerns about Criterion B; if designated under Criterion B the wife’s name would be removed from the name. She doesn’t want to modify the motion.

Boardmember Bethke sees more of a case for Criterion A than B; for the community.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – GEORGE AND ALICE HAZZARD HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 7 – 2950 AND 2950A 6<sup>th</sup> AVENUE  
Continued from April 2008**

Applicant: Palm Properties LP represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 2950 and 2950A 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1269 7-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2950 and 2950A 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property at 2950 and 2950A 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated November 6, 2009, HRB-08-030 and HRB 07-039

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Marie Lia

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Jarmusch is in favor of designating 2950A, even though there isn't any confirmation it was designed by Louis Gill; she believes a strong argument can be made for it. Its Modernist approach to the Spanish Revival is keeping with Gill and his famous uncle Irving Gill; alterations could be restored.

Boardmember Berge would like to know how many Louis Gills buildings have been designated

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER JARMUSCH TO DESIGNATE 2950A 6<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE AS HISTORIC UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D**

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 3-5-0

Motion Fails

*(Aréchiga, Silvas, Woods, Bethke, Marrone)*

**ITEM 8 – HENRY B. JONES HOUSE**

Applicant: Scripps Health represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 4040 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 5-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4040 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Henry B. Jones House under HRB Criterion C as an example of Craftsman style architecture retaining integrity, excluding the detached garage.

Report Number: HRB-09-066

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Ron May (*Dale May, Ernestine Bonn, Dan Soderberg*) Nancy Moors, George Wodemeyer, Barry Hagar, Don Schmidt, Ann Garwood, Bruce Coons, Christine Mann, Janet O'Dea, Lisa Hannula, John Taylor, Leo Wilson

In Opposition: Marie Lia and Scott Moomjian (*Rick Gorton, Lynne Heidel, Bruce Rainey*), Todd Hoff, Davis Cracroft MD., Sister Mary Gallagher, Carolyn Kutzko

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation for designation on this house

Boardmember Bethke agrees that the significance of this building is self evident; it is important we deal with the designation before the relocation. Knowing that the house will be demolished for a parking lot; it is a crime if we don't designate it with the knowledge that is the intent. It is also unfair to place the emphasis that we are inhibiting health and safety.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – HENRY B. JONES HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 9 – 1041-1047 UNIVERSITY AVENUE**

Applicant: Joshlin Group LLC represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 1041-1047 University Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 5-B)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1041-1047 University Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property at 1041-1047 University Avenue under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-09-074

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Scott Moomjian (*Jim Collins, John Wilson, Patrick Conpt, Tony Garcia*)

In Opposition: Christine Mann, Leo Wilson, Dan Soderberg, Don Schmidt, Ann Garwood, David Moty, Bruce Coons (*Ron May, Dale May, Ernestine Bonn, Nancy Moors*), Diane Kane, Janet O’Dea, John Taylor

**Board Discussion:**

None

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – 1041-1047 UNIVERSITY AVENUE THE CHARLES JURMAN BUILDING UNDER HRB CRITERION C BASED UPON THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS: THE RESOURCE EMBODIES THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF A TWO-PART COMMERCIAL BLOCK TYPE OF BUILDING INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO THE FAÇADES HORIZONTAL DIVISION INTO THE MORE PUBLIC GROUND LEVEL OF TWO STORE FRONTS VIEWED ESSENTIALLY AS A WALL OF GLASS WITH RECESSED PUBLIC ENTRIES, THE HORIZONTAL ROW OF WINDOWS DELINEATING THE SEPARATION OF THE TWO ZONES AND THE MORE PRIVATE UPPER LEVEL CLAD IN ITS HORIZONTAL CLAPBOARD. THROUGH THE RETENTION OF THESE PRIMARY CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES AND WITH THE EDWARDIAN CORNICE IDENTIFIED AS A SECONDARY STYLISTIC FEATURE; THE BUILDING RETAINS ENOUGH HISTORIC INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1910 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE AND CONTINUES TO CONVEY ITS HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE AS A TWO-PART COMMERCIAL BLOCK TYPE OF BUILDING IN THE NEIGHBORHOODS COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT.**

Seconded by Boardmember Jarmusch

Vote: 8-1-0

Motion Passes

(Lemmo)

**ITEM 10 – 1263 SILVERADO STREET**

**Continued from September 2008**

Applicant: Susan & James Padavano represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1263 Silverado Street, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1263 Silverado Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1263 Silverado Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated November 6, 2009 and HRB-09-065

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Marie Lia (*Susan Padavano, James Padavano*) Kathleen Crawford, Don Schmidt (*Dan Soderberg*), Diane Kane

**Board Discussion:**

Chair Lemmo supports designation under Criterion A

Boardmember Bethke thanked Ms. Lia for the context and supports Criterion A for this nomination. He is willing to lower the threshold based on the number of cottages left in their setting; it is an important resource.

Boardmember Berge also supports designation under Criterion A; but is also concerned about the porch.

Boardmember Garbini isn't bothered by the porch addition

Boardmember Silvas asked what the stories that make this a special element are.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BETHKE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 – 1263 SILVERADO STREET UNDER HRB CRITERION A; AS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF LA JOLLA'S BEACH COTTAGE HISTORY WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1909**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-1  
(*Woods*)

Motion Passes

**ITEM 11 – IRVING AND MAY WATSON HOUSE**

Applicant: John Aganon represented by Christianne Knoop

Location: 3136 Grim Avenue, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3136 Grim Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Irving and May Watson House located at 3136 Grim Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated November 6, 2009 and HRB-09-068

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Christianne Knoop

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge still does not think that the 1946 photo definitely documents that the porch has been there since the house was built in 1912; she is not supporting designation.

Boardmember Marrone agrees that there could have been changes to the porch, but the photo shows that the porch existed in 1946 and is over 45 years if age. It still conveys its architectural style, a craftsman with an intact porch. She supported the designation last month and still thinks this home is worthy of designation.

Boardmember Bethke now agrees that the porch could be original, but still would like to know why this design. He still has an issue with the stucco on the bricks.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – IRVING AND MAY WATSON HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Aréchiga

Vote: 4-5-0

Motion Fails

*(Lemmo, Berge, Bethke, Garbini, Jarmusch)*

**ITEM 12 – CORRECTION OF APN FOR PREVIOUSLY DESIGNATED RESOURCES, HRB# 493 AND HRB# 740**

Applicant: City of San Diego, City Planning & Community Investment Department

Location: 3503 Ray Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-E**) and 1745 Kearsarge Road, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-G**)

Description: Consider Corrections to the Designations/APN for Ray Street (HRB # 493) and 1745 Kearsarge Road (HRB# 740).

Today's Action: Review and approve the APN corrections or return to staff for additional information.

Staff Recommendation: Correct the record to reflect new APN's for two historically designated sites located at 3503 Ray Street (HRB # 493) and 1745 Kearsarge Road (HRB# 740).

Report Number: HRB-09-075

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

None

**BOARD ACTION:**



**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CORRECT OUR RECORD TO ASSOCIATE THE CORRECT PARCEL NUMBER WITH THE ACTUAL DESIGNATED RESOURCES**

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 13 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT**

Applicant: City of San Diego, City Planning & Community Investment Department

Location: Citywide

Description: The Historical Resources Board Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation, Mayor and City Council consistent with the City's Certified Local Government (CLG) responsibilities and Municipal Code Section 111.0206 (d)(7) requirements.

Today's Action: Review, comment and approve the Annual Report.

Staff Recommendation: Direct staff to forward the Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation and the San Diego City Council, or revise the Annual Report and forward as appropriate

Report Number: HRB-09-076

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Jarmusch suggested we add info about geographical spread of participants/attendees for the Best Practices Seminar.

Boardmember Bethke wondered if it would be possible or beneficial to see the geographic spread of where designations/nominations are coming from in relation to the City.

Chair Lemmo thought maybe the best way would be through a GIS map.

Boardmember Berge identified the name of the Kensington Manor District needs to be corrected.

Boardmember Silvas was interested to learn the status of various historic surveys.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE ITEM 13 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE MODIFICATIONS SUGGESTED BY TODAY'S BOARDMEMBERS**

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

**REMINDER:**

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:**

Thursday, January 28, 2010

**LOCATION:**

City Administration Building  
12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:07PM**