

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF APRIL 22, 2010  
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING  
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12<sup>th</sup> FLOOR  
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:10PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Salvador Aréchiga	Absent
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Absent
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present arrived at 1:55PM
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Ann Jarmusch	Present arrived at 1:20PM
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary  
Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner  
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner  
Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Planner  
Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR March 25, 2010**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE MARCH 25, 2010 MINUTES  
WITH CHANGES**

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 5-0-1  
(Marrone)

Motion Passes

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

### **ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

#### **A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Aréchiga and Bethke notified Staff that they were unable to attend this month's meeting.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Request for continuance for ITEM 5 – WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

#### **B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Chair Lemmo declared a conflict of interest for Items 5 and 6.

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Boardmember Woods- ITEM 9 – EDWARD AND ELEANOR MASTIN HOUSE

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

#### **C. STAFF REPORT**

- We are very happy to say that we received 43 applications for new Mills Act agreements during this year's application period. Staff will be preparing the draft agreements for owners to review this summer and will process the agreements for recordation before the end of this calendar year.
- The Policy Subcommittee has selected the Excellence in Preservation Award winners for this year based on nominations received through April 2<sup>nd</sup>. The recipients will be notified by staff on Monday. Please join us at the May Board meeting to celebrate history month and the awards.
- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, May 5, 2010. The next Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings will be on Monday, May 10, 2010
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 2 referrals from Development Services; 3 individual homeowner nominations; and an Amendment to the Historical Resources Board Procedures. This agenda includes 2 continued items and 1 item trailed from last month's agenda. There are 38 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, 21 homeowner nominations in 2009, and 4 homeowner nominations in 2010 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

**D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

The Airport Authority has requested a continuance of ITEM 5 – WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS.

**Board Discussion:**

*Item taken out of order; Chair Lemmo recused himself from this item*

Boardmember Berge is not in favor of a 90-day continuance

Boardmember Garbini is not in favor

Boardmember Jarmusch is not in favor

Chair Pro Tem Silvas is not in favor

Boardmember Marrone is not in favor

Boardmember Woods is not in favor

Boardmember Curry will abstain from the vote; as she just arrived

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO NOT GRANT THE SAN DIEGO AIRPORT AUTHORITY A CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 5 – WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS**

Seconded by Boardmember Jarmusch

Vote: 6-0-1  
(Curry)

Motion Passes

**ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

ITEM 8 – WILLS AND JANE FLETCHER/RALPH L. FRANK AND MILTON SESSIONS HOUSE  
*located at 575 San Gorgonio Street*

ITEM 9 – EDWARD AND ELEANOR MASTIN HOUSE *located at 1891 Viking Way*

ITEM 10 – AMENDMENT TO THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD PROCEDURES

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Garbini suggested that for ITEM 8 – WILLS AND JANE FLETCHER/RALPH L. FRANK AND MILTON SESSIONS HOUSE the terms Master Designer and Master Landscape Designer are used instead of Master Architect and Master Landscape Architect; until it is known for sure that they were licensed.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 8 AND 9; AND APPROVE ITEM 10 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

---

## **ACTION ITEMS**

---

*Chair Lemmo declared a conflict of interest for Items 5 and 6; since the Vice-Chair is absent today a Chair Pro Tem was appointed to run the remainder of the meeting. Chair Lemmo appoints Boardmember Silvas as Chair Pro Tem, Vote is 7-0-0; Motion Passes.*

### **ITEM 5 – WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS**

#### **Continued from January 2010**

Applicant: Save Our Heritage Organisation (SOHO)

Property is owned by the San Diego Airport Authority

Location: 1470 Bay Boulevard, 91911, Otay Mesa-Nestor Community, Council District 8 (**1269 3-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1470 Bay Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Salt Works located at 1470 Bay Boulevard under HRB Criterion E. The resource shall be listed as an individually significant resource, with the eleven elements identified as “contributing” included in the designation as character defining elements of the resource; and the four elements identified as “non-contributing” excluded from the designation as non-character defining elements.

Report Number: Staff memo dated September 18, 2009 and HRB-08-005

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

#### **Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Bruce Coons, John Eisenhart, Dan Soderberg, Ron May

In Opposition: Zane O. Gresham

#### **Board Discussion:**

*Item taken out of order; Chair Lemmo recused himself from this item*

Boardmember Berge wanted to know more about the ownership issue; this played an important role in history

Boardmember Garbini said the period of significance is extensive for the whole of area. As it relates to the site that the Airport Authority owns, it is significant for the processing of the salt within the longer period of significance.

Boardmember Jarmusch does not favor piece mealing; she asked about specific elements for designation. She does favor designation of those elements under the Airport Authority ownership.

Boardmember Marrone also favors designation of elements

Boardmember Woods agrees that this is a really important monument and wonderful resource; she supports designation under Criterion E would support under A and C as well.

Boardmember Curry supports designation; it is a unique resource.

Boardmember Berge needs more clarity on what is eligible for designation today

Chair Pro Tem Silvas agrees with significance; it has been there for many years.

Boardmember Jarmusch feels we need to recognize and preserve the working waterfront.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS UNDER THE CRITERIA SET FORTH BY THE STAFF REPORT AND INCLUDES THE MAIN PROCESSING PLANT, ELECTRICAL BUILDING, RAIL ROAD TRACKS, AND SALT PILES USED FOR STORAGE OF SALT AFTER HARVESTING.**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

*After the motion was made by Boardmember Marrone and seconded by Boardmember Berge; Zane O. Gresham, representing the San Diego Airport Authority, asked for a 30-day continuance based on Municipal Code Section 123.0202d. The Board granted the continuance.*

ITEM CONTINUED FOR 30-DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE PROPERTY OWNER

**ITEM 6 – 2901 5<sup>th</sup> AVENUE**

**Trailed from March 2010**

Applicant: Palm Properties LP represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 2901 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1269 7-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2901 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate 2901 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated March 12, 2010, Staff Memo dated November 6, 2009, HRB-08-028 and HRB 07-042

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Marie Burke Lia, Scott Moomjian, Richard Lidford

In Opposition: John Eisenhart, Bruce Coons, Dan Soderberg, Eva Thorn

**Board Discussion:**

*Chair Lemmo recused himself from this item*

Boardmember Curry supports designating this property; we have not had enough time to appreciate this building. It has the character defining features according to the Modernism Context Statement; reversibility is important. SOM is an important firm; and this is their only building in San Diego.

Boardmember Woods has problems with the building; reviewed the plans but does not see it in the building. There are too many alterations; no wall of glass.

Boardmember Marrone also has a problem, she sees the importance of SOM, but the changes to the building have significantly altered it. She would like to hear other Boardmembers thoughts.

Boardmember Jarmusch favors designation; the bones are still there and changes are reversible. This is a remarkable statement of Modernism.

Boardmember Garbini agrees that this is a good example of medium scale office building and represents an early and good example of Post and Beam construction. It is a SOM building and the design methodology is still intact. She supports designation under Criteria C and D.

Boardmember Berge also favors designation under Criterion C.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER JARMUSCH TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – 2901 5<sup>th</sup> AVENUE UNDER CRITERION C AS EMBODYING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF MODERNISM AND UNDER CRITERION D AS NOTABLE WORK OF THE FIRM SOM WHICH IS INTERNATIONALLY RENOWNED**

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 5-2-0

Motion Fails

*(Silvas, Woods)*

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – 2901 5<sup>th</sup> AVENUE UNDER CRITERION C FOR ITS CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES UNDER MODERNISM POST AND BEAM STYLE**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 5-2-0

Motion Fails

*(Silvas, Woods)*

**ITEM 7 – JOHNSON’S WILSHIRE GAS STATION**

**Continued from March 2010**

Applicant: Sabah Y. Toma, Janan T. Toma, Latif C. Marogy and Faiza M. Marogy represented by Archaeos

Location: 4689 Market Street, 92102, Encanto Neighborhoods Community, Council District 4 **(1289 3-J)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4689 Market Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate Johnson’s Wilshire Gas Station located at 4689 Market Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1962 under HRB Criterion C. The recent convenience store building is excluded from the designation.

Report Number: HRB-10-012

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: John Eisenhart, Dan Soderberg

In Opposition: Joe Harris

**Board Discussion:**

*Item 7 will be heard first to allow Chair Lemmo to recuse himself from the remainder of the meeting.*

Boardmember Berge would like the resolution to read canopy structure instead of building; questioned if there was enough remaining historic fabric to be a valuable example of Googie without the pervasive signage/neon present.

Boardmember Garbini supports designation; this is a good structure and good example of style.

Boardmember Jarmusch is mindful of community opinion but we have lost much of this style and there isn’t much left.

Boardmember Marrone also supports designation; the use is still there and it portrays a rare form of architecture.

Boardmember Silvas agrees that the signage is important; if not possible he would like to see postage of the designation be visible. He supports designation of structure.

Boardmember Woods agrees that this is a good example and could become a focus for the community.

Chair Lemmo agrees with Staff

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – JOHNSON’S WILSHIRE GAS STATION PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 8 – WILLS AND JANE FLETCHER/RALPH L. FRANK AND MILTON SESSIONS HOUSE**

Applicant: Brown Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 575 San Gorgonio Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288-3-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 575 San Gorgonio Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Wills and Jane Fletcher/Ralph L. Frank and Milton Sessions House located at 575 San Gorgonio Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1941 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-10-016

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

**ITEM 9 – EDWARD AND ELEANOR MASTIN HOUSE**

Applicant: Anne Plachta Trust represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 1891 Viking Way, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1891 Viking Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Edward and Eleanor Mastin House located at 1891 Viking Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1930 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-10-017

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

**ITEM 10 – AMENDMENT TO THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD PROCEDURES**

Applicant: City Planning and Community Investment Department

Location: Citywide

Description: Consider an amendment to the Historical Resources Board Procedures.

Today's Action: Approve the proposed amendment to the Historical Resources Board Procedures or do not approve the amendment.

Staff Recommendation: Approve the proposed amendment to the Historical Resources Board Procedures.

Report Number: Staff memo dated April 16, 2010

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

**REMINDER:**

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:**

Thursday, May 27, 2010

**LOCATION:**

City Administration Building  
12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:25PM**