

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OCTOBER 28, 2010  
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING  
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12<sup>th</sup> FLOOR  
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Vice-Chair Silvas at 1:13PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Absent
Vice Chairperson	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Absent
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Ann Jarmusch	Present <i>arrived at 1:17PM</i>
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Absent
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance:

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary  
Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner  
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner  
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner  
Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner  
Jeff Dalglish, Planning Intern  
Jennifer, Feeley, Planning Intern  
Terra King, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance:

Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR July 22, 2010 and August 26, 2010**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE JULY 22, 2010 MINUTES AS WRITTEN**

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 5-0-1

Motion Passes

*(Bethke)*

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 26, 2010, MINUTES WITH CHANGES**

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 6-0-1

Motion Passes

*(Jarmusch)*

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

### **ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

#### **A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

- **ABSENCES**

Chair Lemmo and Boardmembers Baksh and Marrone notified staff that they are unable to attend this month's hearing.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

#### **B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Boardmember Berge had spoke with the homeowners of Item 6 regarding paint colors

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

#### **C. STAFF REPORT**

- Welcome back to Jodie Brown; new Intern Jennifer Feeley and good bye to Jeff Dalglish.
- Staff will be conducting an introductory training later today for community planning group members to learn how the City identifies and protects our historical resources. The historical resource nomination and designation process, the review process for determining when a historical resource is present and the regulatory framework for designated historical resources will be discussed. Preservation incentives, particularly the Mills Act tax reduction, will be presented, as well. We anticipate offering a more advanced training session on specific historic resource issues next fall.
- An appeal of the designation of the Harwood Tichenor Building located at 1151-1159 Tenth Avenue is being docketed for hearing by the City Council in mid to late November.
- The community plan update surveys are progressing. The historic context, field work and preliminary draft survey report are complete for San Ysidro. This work was done with the financial assistance of a CLG grant. The public participation process will begin in December and the survey will be brought to the Board in 2011. The Uptown and North Park survey work has been presented to the community at their plan update workshops along with a discussion of conservation areas; the same will occur for the Greater Golden Hill community on Saturday, November 6<sup>th</sup>. The Midway and Old San Diego survey work has begun; staff is reviewing the initial draft historic context statement and the consultant is conducting field work at this time.
- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for November 3, 2010. The next Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings are scheduled for Monday, November 8, 2010.

- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes one referral from CCDC and four individual homeowner nominations, including 1 continued item from previous agendas and an information item on the Update of the Mills Act Audit and New Applications. There are 14 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, 21 homeowner nominations in 2009, and 20 homeowner nominations in 2010 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

#### **D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

Staff is requesting a continuance of Item 10 – Board Review of City Building Code for Wood Roofs until the November 19 hearing so that Chair Lemmo can participate in the discussion.

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO GRANT A CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 10 – BOARD REVIEW OF CITY BUILDING CODE FOR WOOD ROOFS UNTIL THE NOVEMBER 19 AT THE REQUEST OF STAFF**

Seconded by Boardmember Jarmusch

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

#### **ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

ITEM 6– HENRIETTA BUCKLAND HOUSE at 1522 Granada Avenue

ITEM 7 – WILLIAM AND MILDRED SCHULENBURG SPEC. HOUSE #1 at 4633 Edgeware Road

ITEM 8– F. LIST AND C. BELL MCMECHEN at 3055 Palm Street

ITEM 9 – JULIA FRENCH AND GEORGE R. METCALF HOUSE at 3443 Elliott Street

Boardmember Berge pulled Items 6 and 9 from the Consent Agenda

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 7 AND 8 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

---

#### **INFORMATION ITEMS**

---

#### **ITEM A –UPDATE ON MILLS ACT AUDIT AND NEW APPLICATIONS**

Staff will present the results of the 2010 Mills Act audit of existing agreements and information related to the 2010 applications for new Mills Act agreements. No action on the part of the Board is required.

---

#### **ACTION ITEMS**

---

#### **ITEM 5 – 1451-1453 F STREET Continued from September 2010**

Applicant: Ponce Living Trust represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1451-1453 F Street, 92101, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (**1289 3-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1451-1453 F Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1451-1453 F Street under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-10-046

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Marie Lia

In Opposition: Bruce Coons, Ashley Christensen

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge stated this building falls under the Edwardian timeframe as the period of architecture, which reflects a simplification of the Victorian era architecture with simple classical features, found in the United States between 1900 and 1914 and supports designation with the exclusion of the rear addition; this structure fits within the historic context of single-family residences changing to multifamily use within East Village

Boardmember Garbini thinks this an underappreciated form of architecture and there are very few of them left

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Boardmember Berge on the context; he is more concerned with the change in setting than the addition; in favor of designation

Vice-Chair Silvas is also concerned with significant change in its setting

Boardmember Jarmusch agrees that it is a unique structure and feels it should be designated

Boardmember Woods supports designated; she sees the two properties as a set, this one and its neighbor which was designated last month

Boardmember Curry is also in support of designation; the building shows an evolution of architectural style

Boardmember Berge's motion is based on the findings that she read into the record, the staff report, consultant report and everything that was added at today's designation hearing; the full version will be included in the resolution.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – H.R. EMERLING RESIDENTIAL BUILDING LOCATED AT 1451-1453 F STREET AS A RESOURCE FROM THE EDWARDIAN PERIOD OF ARCHITECTURE, RETAINING A GOOD LEVEL OF INTEGRITY FROM ITS CA. 1909 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE, BASED ON THE FINDINGS READ INTO THE RECORD, AND EXCLUDING THE POST 1950'S REAR ADDITION**

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 6 – HENRIETTA BUCKLAND HOUSE**

Applicant: Kevin, Kimberly & Frances Mathis represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1522 Granada Avenue, 92102, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 2 (**1289 2-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1522 Granada Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Henrietta Buckland House located at 1522 Granada Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1911 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-10-049

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Ione Stiegler

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge had questions regarding the paint color and would like to add American Foursquare as a sub style of Prairie Architecture.

Boardmember Bethke wanted to know why Staff recommended removing the shingles prior to bringing the property to the Board; he feels it should be identified as American Foursquare and not Prairie

Boardmember Curry mentioned that the Prairie style is more widely accepted

Boardmember Woods agrees with Boardmember Curry

Boardmember Jarmusch is in favor of adding American Foursquare sub-style

Boardmember Garbini added that the Queen Palms are in the historic photo and date to the original date of construction.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – HENRIETTA BUCKLAND HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE ADDITION OF AMERICAN FOURSQUARE SUB-STYLE**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 6-1-0

Motion Passes

*(Bethke)*

**ITEM 7 – WILLIAM AND MILDRED SCHULENBURG SPEC. HOUSE #1**

Applicant: Thomas Lepley represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4633 Edgeware Road, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (1269 3-H)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4633 Edgeware Road as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William and Mildred Schulenburg Spec. House #1 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Craftsman style with Neoclassical influences retaining integrity from its 1925 period of significance. The second unit and garage located in the southeast corner of the property were constructed in 1930 and are excluded from this designation due to substantial modifications.

Report Number: HRB-10-050

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

**ITEM 8 – F. LIST AND C. BELL MCMECHEN HOUSE**

Applicant: Jonathan & Amanda Ohman represented by Archaeos

Location: 3055 Palm Street, 92104, Greater North Park, Council District 3 (1269 7-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3055 Palm Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the F. List and C. Bell McMechen House located at 3055 Palm Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of circa 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The 1992 rear addition and remodeled garage with an added workshop are excluded from this designation due to substantial modifications.

Report Number: HRB-10-051

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

**ITEM 9 – JULIA FRENCH AND GEORGE R. METCALF HOUSE**

Applicant: Eli & Jaclyn Owre represented by IS Architecture

Location: 3443 Elliott Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1268 6-C)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3443 Elliott Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Julia French and George R. Metcalf House located at 3443 Elliott Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-10-052

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Ione Stiegler, Eli Owre, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Curry feels that the alterations comply with the standards and do not affect the significance of the property; she supports designation

Vice-Chair Silvas is also in support of designation

Boardmember Bethke questioned why the 1921 Sanborn does not include this house

Boardmember Garbini likes the detailing on the house; she is in support of designation

Boardmember Berge had questions regarding the 1940 Sanborn map which showed an enclosed sun porch; she was troubled by the roof and felt that photos of the interior would have helped clear up some of these issues.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9-JULIA FRENCH AND GEORGE R. METCALF HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 10 – BOARD REVIEW OF CITY BUILDING CODE FOR WOOD ROOFS**

Applicant: City Planning & Community Investment and Development Services Departments

Location: Citywide

Description: Review existing Building Code Regulations related to Wood Roofs and Consider making Recommendations to the Building Official to address compatibility with historical resources.

Today's Action: Review and make Recommendations to the Building Official

Staff Recommendation: Review and make Recommendations to the Building Official

Report Number: N/A

ITEM CONTINUED UNTIL THE NOVEMBER 19, 2010 HEARING AT THE REQUEST OF THE STAFF

**REMINDER:**

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:**

Friday, November 19, 2010

**LOCATION:**

City Administration Building  
12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:35PM**