

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF MARCH 24, 2011  
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING  
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12<sup>th</sup> FLOOR  
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:05PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Abel Silvas	Present <i>left at 2:30PM</i>
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present <i>left at 3:30PM</i>
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Ann Jarmusch	Present
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary  
Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner  
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner  
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner  
Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner  
Jennifer Feeley, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR February 24, 2011**

Not available at this time

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

Ione Stiegler – would like to have the wood roof issue for historical resources be heard at LU&H

### **ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

#### **A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

- **ABSENCES**

Vice-Chair Silvas and Boardmember Curry notified Staff that they had to leave early.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Letter for Item 5- Eric Lund and Anna M. Dahlander Lund House
- ✓ Handout for Item 6- Robert and Frances Johnston Rental House
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

#### **B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Chair Lemmo declared a conflict of interest for Items 5.

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

#### **C. STAFF REPORT**

- The issue of establishing a Master outside of the designation process was discussed at the March 14, 2011 Policy Subcommittee meeting. By way of consensus, the Subcommittee decided not to pursue written guidelines or procedures but rather allow information related to a Master to be presented to the Board as part of a regularly scheduled HRB meeting. Anyone wishing to present such information should contact staff to be placed on a future agenda as an information item. The information presented to the Board should reflect the requirements to establish a Master as described in the adopted Designation Criteria Guidelines. Written materials supporting the presentation should then be submitted to staff and may be used in future designation actions where the Board may establish the Master consistent with current guidelines and procedures.
- It is that time of year again to nominate your favorite historic preservation project, program or person for an award. Nominations are being accepted until Friday, April 1, 2011. Printed copies of the nomination form are available on the back table and can be completed electronically and submitted via the website at [www.sandiego.gov/historic](http://www.sandiego.gov/historic).
- The next DAS meeting will be on Wednesday, April 6, 2011. The next Policy Subcommittee will be on Monday, April 11, 2011. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, April 11, 2010.

- Those owners whose property was designated in 2010 or earlier are eligible to apply for a Mills Act agreement beginning in January 2011. Those applications are due no later than March 31, 2011 to be considered this year.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 1 referral from Development Services; 6 individual homeowner nominations; including 1 continued item from previous agendas. There are 19 homeowner nominations in 2009, 21 homeowner nominations in 2010, and 7 homeowner nominations in 2011 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

#### **D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

None

#### **ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

ITEM 8 – WILLIAM AND IDA COOK HOUSE

ITEM 10 – GILBERT AND ALBERTA MCCLURE RENTAL HOUSE AND APARTMENTS

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

#### **MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 8 AND 10 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 9-1-0

Motion Passes

*(Jarmusch)*

---

#### **ACTION ITEMS**

---

#### **ITEM 5 – ERIC LUND AND ANNA M. DAHLANDER LUND HOUSE**

Applicant: Kyle Kutzke and Carolyn Kutzke represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1036 Madison Avenue, 92116, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 4-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1036 Madison Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Eric Lund and Anna M. Dahlander Lund House located at 1036 Madison Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1923 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-11-013

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

#### **Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Marie Lia

#### **Board Discussion:**

*Chair Lemmo recused himself from this item*

Boardmember Berge wanted clarification on which timeframe to use for evaluation. She also commented that the Airplane bungalow is important and that Robert Anderson should be noted as the builder.

Boardmember Curry supports designation; resource has distinctive characteristics and airplane style of Craftsman fits the requirements.

Boardmember Jarmusch questioned if there were photos any photos in the report before 2011; she feels this is a difficult situation.

Vice-Chair Silvas recalls the lost airplane bungalow in Pacific Beach.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Garbini supports Staff's recommendation.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – ERIC LUND AND ANNA M. DAHLANDER LUND HOUSE PER STAFFS RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 9-0-1

Motion Passes

*(Lemmo)*

**ITEM 6 – ROBERT AND FRANCES JOHNSTON RENTAL HOUSE**

**Continued from September 2010**

Applicant: Dylan Calsyn & Beth Timpe represented by IS Architecture

Location: 1545 29th Street, 92102, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 2-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1545 29th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Robert and Frances Johnston Rental House located at 1545 29<sup>th</sup> Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1943-1948 under HRB Criterion A.

Report Number: Staff memo dated March 11, 2011 and HRB-10-048

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Ione Stiegler (*Hal Tyrol, Nancy Labovitz, Beth Timpe, Ron May, Kim Grant*), Dylan Calsyn

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Garbini supports Staff's recommendation; thinks that it is important.

Boardmember Woods didn't see the connection when it first came before the Board, but feels that the consultant's report really filled in all of the gaps.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Chair Lemmo supports Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Silvas supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Jarmusch thought the supplemental information was great; she supports designation.

Boardmember Bethke mentioned that while the association with the Hollywood Theater is interesting; this home is not significant and does not represent the theater in a significant way. Burlesque was significant in its own right but not in association with this house; he does not support designation.

Boardmember Curry feels that there are few connections with people and places under Criterion A; she supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Boardmember Bethke; significance falls to the theater and the Johnson's, who lived across the street. The period of significance, 1943-1948, needs to be added to the resolution if designated.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR SILVAS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – ROBERT AND FRANCES JOHNSTON RENTAL HOUSE UNDER CRITERION A PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 8-2-0

Motion Passes

*(Bethke, Berge)*

**ITEM 7 – WALTER J. AND GRACE OGDEN/RALPH L. FRANK HOUSE**

Applicant: B & E Trust represented by IS Architecture

Location: 1007 Cypress Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1007 Cypress Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Walter J. and Grace Ogden/Ralph L. Frank House located at 1007 Cypress Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1931 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 2002 rear addition equaling approximately 2,200 sq. ft.

Report Number: HRB-11-014

Staff Report by Terra King

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Ione Stiegler

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Jarmusch is persuaded that the prior occupants, Dr. Lyell Cary Kinney and Mr. Arthur DeFever, establish an important cultural context for the house. She supports the consultant's nomination under Criterion B.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Staff's recommendation; offices are often more relevant and better associations than houses.

Boardmember Curry feels there is local significance and that an association can be made; she supports designation under Criterion B.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Berge; it is important to tie people and places together but it needs to be significant. This property does not represent why these citizens are or may be significant.

Chair Lemmo agrees with Boardmember Bethke materials are insufficient at this point.

Boardmember Marrone agrees with the other Boardmembers comments; not significant under Criterion B.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Garbini thought that the report needed more information to designate under Criterion B, but was glad that the discussion was brought up for discussion.

Boardmember Jarmusch wanted to reiterate that her information came from the report; she also questioned the Board on how many historic office tours they went on this year in comparison to historic home tours.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – WALTER J. AND GRACE OGDEN/RALPH L. FRANK HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS TO THE RESOLUTION: REPLACE MASTER ARCHITECT WITH MASTER DESIGNER**

Seconded by Boardmember Jarmusch

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER JARMUSCH TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – WALTER J. AND GRACE OGDEN/RALPH L. FRANK HOUSE UNDER CRITERION B DUE TO THE LONG-TERM RESIDENCE OF DR. KINNEY AND MR. DEFEVER**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 2-7-0

Motion Fails

*(Lemmo, Woods, Baksh, Garbini, Marrone, Bethke, Berge)*

**ITEM 8 – WILLIAM AND IDA COOK HOUSE**

Applicant: Elizabeth Scalice represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 3819 Pringle Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3819 Pringle Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William and Ida Cook House located at 3819 Pringle Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-11-016

**ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

**ITEM 9 – 1856 VIKING WAY**

Applicant: Philip and Erin McConkey represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1856 Viking Way, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1856 Viking Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1856 Viking Way under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-11-017

Staff Report by Terra King

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Marie Lia, Tripp Bennett, Phil McConkey

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge was troubled by all of the modifications, but focus was on the replacement windows on the front public façade. She added that it may qualify as a district contributor, if a district is created in the future.

Boardmember Curry feels we need another Criterion for houses like this; even by looking at all of the modifications it still has characteristics of the style and is an important example.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Staff; too many changes that do not meet the standards. The front addition interrupts the original design of the resource.

Boardmember Jarmusch is not sure on this one.

Boardmember Marrone understands the importance of preserving homes and doesn't have a problem with the garage modification; windows problem could be remedied through the Mills Act. Other modifications are OK and you can still see the architectural style.

Boardmember Baksh thinks that it is a very nice place and admits that he is not an expert in architecture; but his thoughts on integrity have been shaped by drawing on past Board decisions. He feels the property has lost integrity and does not support designation.

Boardmember Woods noted that the windows could be reversed and the front addition is not too much of an issue for her.

Boardmember Garbini asked if it does embody distinctive characteristics; agrees that it is a nice place to live but the lines are not good.

Chair Lemmo agrees this is a difficult decision; cumulative aspect of alterations has had a negative effect.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – 1856 VIKING WAY UNDER CRITERION C BECAUSE IT EMBODIES THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH ECLECTIC STYLE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1931.**

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 2-7-0  
(Lemmo, Woods, Baksh, Garbini, Jarmusch, Bethke, Berge)

Motion Fails

**ITEM 10 – GILBERT AND ALBERTA MCCLURE RENTAL HOUSE AND APARTMENTS**

Applicant: John Stone represented by Christianne Knoop

Location: 4050-4056 Hamilton Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 5-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4050-4056 Hamilton Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the property located at 4050 and 4052-4054 Hamilton Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the one story apartment at 4050½ Hamilton Street and the Neo-Classical cottage at 4056 Hamilton Street.

Report Number: HRB-11-018

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

**ITEM 11 – WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON/HARRY BRAWNER RENTAL HOUSE**

Applicant: Garry Kaffel and Richard Bottcher represented by Christianne Knoop

Location: 4460 Trias Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 4-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4460 Trias Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William Templeton Johnson/Harry Brawner Rental House located at 4460 Trias Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1924 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-11-019

Staff Report by Jeff Oakley

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Gary Kaffel, Christianne Knoop

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge supports designation under Criterion D, but not under C because of the non-historic garden wall and garage conversion.

Boardmember Jarmusch agrees with Boardmember Berge on Criterion D.

Boardmember Baksh supports designation under Criteria C and D.

Boardmember Woods agrees that the wall really changes the appearance from the street; also questioned the garage door and paint color.

Boardmember Garbini also agrees with Boardmember Berge on Criterion D; because of the change in the wall.



**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON/HARRY BRAUNER RENTAL HOUSE UNDER CRITERION D PER STAFFS RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

*(Lemmo, Woods, Baksh, Garbini, Jarmusch, Bethke, Berge)*

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON/HARRY BRAUNER RENTAL HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C PER STAFFS RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Baksh

Vote: 3-5-0

Motion Fails

*(Woods, Garbini, Jarmusch, Bethke, Berge)*

**REMINDER:**

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:**

Thursday, April 28, 2011

**LOCATION:**

City Administration Building  
12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:45PM**