

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JULY 28, 2011
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:10PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Absent
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Absent
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner
Jennifer Feeley, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Keith Bauerle, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR April 28, 2011, May 26, 2011 and June 23, 2011

The May 26, 2011 and June 23, 2011 minutes are not available at this time.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BETHKE TO APPROVE THE APRIL 28, 2011 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Marrone and Berge advised staff they would not be available for this meeting.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Letter for Item 10 – Tillie Genter House
- ✓ April 28, 2011 Draft Minutes
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- The Dryden North Park Historic District was not appealed so it is now final.
- Staff will be conducting historic preservation training for community planning group members in October.
- The next DAS meeting will be rescheduled to the later part of August. Once the date is certain, the agenda will be posted. The next Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings will be on Monday, August 8, 2011.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 2 referrals from Development Services, including 1 continued item from last month's agenda; 6 individual homeowner nominations; and an information item. With this hearing, we have completed the 2009 nominations. There are 14 homeowner nominations in 2010 and 18 homeowner nominations in 2011 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – ALBERT AND ANNA KENYON/ARCHIBALD MCCORKLE HOUSE

ITEM 8 – GUILFORD H. AND GRACE WHITNEY HOUSE

ITEM 9 – MIGUEL AND ELLA GONZALEZ HOUSE

ITEM 10 – TILLIE GENTER HOUSE

ITEM 11 – BERTHA B. MITCHELL HOUSE

ITEM 12 – RALPH AND AGNES VIRDEN HOUSE

Boardmember Bethke pulled Item 9 from the Consent Agenda

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 7, 8, 10, 11 AND 12 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A – CALIFORNIA HISTORICAL RESOURCES INVENTORY DATABASE (CHRID)

Staff will present an update on the work the City has undertaken to acquire and modify CHRID for the management of historical resources. *No action on the part of the Board is required.*

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 2137 PACIFIC HIGHWAY

Continued from June 2011 – At the June 23, 2011 HRB hearing a motion to designate the property was made. At that point in the hearing, the owner’s representative exercised their rights to a one-month continuance.

Applicant: Frank Fat Properties LP represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 2137 Pacific Highway, 92101, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (1288 1-J)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2137 Pacific Highway as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2137 Pacific Highway under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-11-034

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

PRIOR TO OPENING PUBLIC TESTIMONY, CHAIR LEMMO READ THE FOLLOWING MOTION, MADE AT THE JUNE 23, 2011 HEARING, INTO THE RECORD:

Motion by Boardmember Berge to designate item 6 –Tops Fat City China Camp Building at 2137 Pacific Highway as historically significant under Historical Resources Board Criterion C as the resource embodies the distinctive characteristics of the streamline modern sub style of architecture with modified art deco stylistic influences through the retention of character defining features and retains integrity from its ca. 1941 (date of construction) through its ca. 1978-79 (date of redevelopment or rehabilitation) period of significance. The resource exhibits the following character defining features of the streamline modern sub style of the City of San Diego’s Modernism Historic Context Statement with the modified art deco elements: 1) flat roofs with coping along the parapets, 2) asymmetrical façade, 3) horizontal massing and emphasis as evidence by the basic form of the building especially as viewed from

the primary façade along Pacific Highway and emphasized by the neon lighting, 4) a smooth stucco exterior finish, 5) primary horizontal accents including the coping and neon lights with restrained detailing that has been influenced and modified by the secondary art deco stepped accents along the parapet and the art deco magnified vertical elements at the entrance tower. In addition, the resource exhibits secondary streamline modern features such as glass block in the retention of the original metal frame curved corner glass window flanked by vertical fluted panels over the main entrance door and at the southwest corner.

THERE WAS NO SECOND TO THIS MOTION; THEREFORE THE MOTION DIES. CHAIR LEMMO THEN OPENED PUBLIC TESTIMONY.

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Jonathan Segal, Luke Daniels, Colin Fat, Dan Soderberg (*Ron May*), Don Schmidt, Alana Coons, James Bregante, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: Neil Hyytinen

Board Discussion:

Chair Lemmo reiterated that the City was not a party to any deal SOHO might have with the developer. If the Board chooses to not designate this resource then it is no longer within the jurisdiction of the Board. The only thing before the Board today is this property as it sits today in the condition that it sits today. The Board is not supposed to be evaluating the merits or the wisdom of the project or not; the only issue is whether to designate or not.

Boardmember Curry is concerned about the agreement because anything can happen; she supports designation. Change designation from Criterion C to Criterion A; Criterion A allows more flexibility for site. If historic restoration is possible, more flexibility and reversibility is possible, historic photos allow restoration. She believes the style is “googie” with art deco elements, which is very rare.

Boardmember Woods wanted to know if the HRB could continue the item; she does not support designation under Criterion C.

Boardmember Baksh does not support designation.

Chair Lemmo is in support of Staff’s recommendation.

Vice-Chair Silvas is on the fence.

Boardmember Garbini would support designation under Criterion A, it is an important building.

Chair Lemmo mentioned that the research report currently does not support Criterion A; they would need additional research to address it, may be necessary to continue the item to allow the applicant to amend the report.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff’s recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – 2137 PACIFIC HIGHWAY UNDER CRITERION A, AS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO’S HISTORICAL, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, LANDSCAPING, AND ARCHITECTURAL DEVELOPMENT

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 2-5-0

Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Silvas, Woods, Baksh, Bethke)

ITEM 6 – ROBERT AND RUBY MAGNESS HOUSE

Applicant: Roger A. Benham and Laurie L. Benham

Location: 412 San Fernando Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 **(1288 4-A)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 412 San Fernando Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Robert and Ruby Magness House located at 412 San Fernando Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1951-1953 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-11-043

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Roger Benham, Laurie Benham

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke is in favor of designation and excluding the garage because it is not original.

Boardmember Garbini agrees

Boardmember Silvas agree

Chair Lemmo agrees

Boardmember Baksh agrees

Boardmember Woods agrees

Boardmember Curry agrees

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – ROBERT AND RUBY MAGNESS HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE EXCLUSION OF THE GARAGE

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – ALBERT AND ANNA KENYON/ARCHIBALD MCCORKLE HOUSE

Applicant: Mathias Kill and Daniel Mosher represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 2832 Granada Avenue, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 **(1269 7-E)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2832 Granada Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Albert and Anna Kenyon/Archibald McCorkle House located at 2832 Granada Avenue with a period of significance of 1912-1913 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation includes portions of the interior and excludes the first floor room addition at the rear of the structure constructed at an unspecified date and the 1984 detached garage, workshop and laundry room located in the rear of the property.

Report Number: HRB-11-044

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 – GUILFORD H. AND GRACE WHITNEY HOUSE

Applicant: Canedo Family Trust represented by Charles Hughes

Location: 4146 Miller Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4146 Miller Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Guilford H. and Grace Whitney House located at 4146 Miller Street with a period of significance of 1927-1963 under HRB Criteria B and C.

Report Number: HRB-11-045

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 9 – MIGUEL AND ELLA GONZALEZ HOUSE

Applicant: Charles G. LaBella and Mary T. Rossi

Location: 2829 28th Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2829 28th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Miguel and Ella Gonzalez House located at 2829 28th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1916-1961 under HRB Criterion A. The designation excludes the 1965 additions and the detached garage.

Report Number: HRB-11-046

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Charles LaBella

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke is not sure that case has been made that this exception to deed is significant, cannot support Criterion A.

Chair Lemmo thinks this is a special circumstance.

Boardmember Garbini finds this very interesting, Criterion A is really viable.

Vice-Chair Silvas commented on the social effect of deed restrictions.

Boardmember Baksh is in full support of Criterion A and also supports designation under Criterion B.

Boardmember Woods supports Criterion A; asked if this is just one house with the exception, would every house that has this exception then be a candidate for designation.

Boardmember Curry thought that the Baja California or Tijuana Historical Societies may have unique information about border history. She supports designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR SILVAS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – MIGUEL AND ELLA GONZALEZ HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 10 – TILLIE GENTER HOUSE

Applicant: Drowns-Pennell 2006 Trust represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 7356 Eads Avenue, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 7-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7356 Eads Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Tillie Genter House located at 7356 Eads Avenue with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-11-047

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 11 – BERTHA B. MITCHELL HOUSE

Applicant: Ancira Family Trust represented by Archaeos

Location: 2121 Sunset Boulevard, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2121 Sunset Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Bertha B. Mitchell House located at 2121 Sunset Blvd. with a period of significance of c.1923 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the three-car garage constructed in 2009.

Report Number: HRB-11-048

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 12 – RALPH AND AGNES VIRDEN HOUSE

Applicant: Christopher Davies and John Davies Trust & Patricia. Davies Trust represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 3646 Albert Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3646 Albert Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Ralph and Agnes Virden House located at 3646 Albert Street with a period of significance of 1950 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the separately accessed lower level added between 1950 and 1963.

Report Number: HRB-11-049

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 13 – HISTORIC PRESERVATION FUND EXPENDITURES

Applicant: City of San Diego, Development Services Department

Location: City-wide

Description: Consider the expenditure of funds from the Historic Preservation Fund.

Today's Action: Recommend to the City Council the expenditure of funds from the Historic Preservation Fund as proposed, do not recommend the expenditure of any funds at this time or return to staff with recommendations to modify the proposal for the expenditure of funds.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the City Council the expenditure of \$30,000 from the Historic Preservation Fund over the next two fiscal years (2012 – 2013) as proposed for architectural assistance, archaeological site protection, Board and staff training, improved technology for public access to historical records, and historic district signage.

Report Number: HRB-11-050

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

After the motion was made:

Boardmember Silvas spoke in support of both Presidio projects.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL THE EXPENDITURE IN THE AMOUNT AND IN THE MANNER PROPOSED BY STAFF

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Thursday, August 25, 2011

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:05PM