

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OCTOBER 27, 2011
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:08PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Absent
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present <i>left at 3:00PM</i>
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner
Liz Shearer-Nguyen, Acting Senior Planner
Jeff Szymanski, Acting Senior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Keith Bauerle, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR SEPTEMBER 22, 2011

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BETHKE TO APPROVE THE SEPTEMBER 22, 2011
MINUTES WITH MODIFICATIONS**

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 6-0-2
(*Curry, Silvas*)

Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Dan Soderberg – Board procedures and public due process regarding Windemere Cottage

Don Schmidt – letter from the La Jolla Historical Society and SOHO to the City Attorney regarding Windemere Cottage

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Baksh notified staff he would not be in attendance; Boardmember Curry has to leave at 3:00PM.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Draft Minutes for September 22, 2011
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmember Marrone declared a conflict of interest for Item 8

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Boardmember Curry was unable to visit Items 7 and 8

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO INVOKE THE WAIVER PURSUANT TO CRITERIA 1 FOR BOARDMEMBER CURRY FOR ITEMS 7 AND 8

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-1
(Curry)

Motion Passes

C. STAFF REPORT

- Welcome Liz Shearer-Nguyen, Antoinette Gibbs and Jeff Szymanski, all Associate Planners in Development Services. They will be serving as Senior Planners in the Historical Resources section during Jodie's absence; you will be seeing them at the next couple of Board meetings.
- The appeal of the historical designation of the Eric Lund and Anna M. Dahlander Lund House located at 1036 Madison Avenue was heard by the City Council on October 25, 2011 and the designation was upheld. On the same day, the City Council also approved the proposed expenditures from the Historic Preservation Fund.
- Preservation Fund Expenditures was approved by City Council as proposed
- Staff will be conducting historic preservation training for community planning group members this evening at the MOC II Building located on Topaz Street in Kearny Mesa.
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, November 2, 2011. The next Policy Subcommittee meetings will be on Monday, November 14, 2011. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meetings will be on Monday, November 14, 2011.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 2 referrals from Development Services; 5 individual homeowner nominations; a request for an extension of a site development permit for a designated resource; proposed amendments to the HRB District Policy; and election of a new

Vice-Chair. There are 24 homeowner nominations in 2011 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 – ALFRED AND JESSICA PHINNEY/THOMAS L. SHEPHERD HOUSE

ITEM 9 – THE LIFE HOUSE

ITEM 10 – J.A. AND MARY SMITH/WILLIAM WAHRENBERGER HOUSE

ITEM 11 – RICHARD AND VIOLA REQUA HOUSE

ITEM 12 – ISAAC AND FLORA WALKER HOUSE

ITEM 13 – BAHIA VIEW CONDOMINIUMS EXTENSION OF SITE DEVELOPMENT PERMIT
NO. 2007-27

Boardmember Bethke pulled Item 9 from the Consent Agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 8, 10, 11, 12 AND 13 ON THE
CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATIONS TO ITEM 10**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

Vote* 7-0-1

Motion Passes

**(Marrone abstained from voting on Item 8)*

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A – ETHICS TRAINING FOR BOARDMEMBERS

No action on the part of the Board is required.

Item was trailed to 2:30PM

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – BOARD ELECTION OF A VICE-CHAIR

Applicant: City Planning & Community Investment Department

Location: Citywide

Description: Consider electing a Vice-Chair from among the existing Boardmembers to perform the duties of the Chair in the Chair's absence.

Today's Action: Elect a Vice-Chair

Staff Recommendation: Elect a Vice-Chair

Report Number: N/A

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO ELECT BOARDMEMBER GARBINI AS VICE-CHAIR

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-1
(*Garbini*)

Motion Passes

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO ELECT BOARDMEMBER MARRONE AS SECOND VICE-CHAIR

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 7-0-1
(*Marrone*)

Motion Passes

ITEM 6 – 1310 K STREET

Applicant: Career Lofts –SD LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1310 K Street, 92101, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (**1289 4-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1310 K Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1310 K Street under any designation criteria.

Report Number: HRB-11-065

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

In Favor: Marie Lia

In Opposition: John Eisenhart, Bruce Coons

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry sees this building as a utilitarian building, which are not designed to look beautiful or too ornamental. It shows what it was when it was built. It is a representative of 20th century commercial industrial style, nothing is missing. It is an element of a district which can be used to evaluate significance and there are other buildings in the area with similar characteristics. If architecture is a problem, then we can follow Criterion A. Surveys are used as a tool. This is an underrepresented area for historic preservation; there are similar buildings in Little Italy. It should be designated because it is historic and has integrity.

Boardmember Woods could be persuaded either way but tends to support Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone thinks that the original style is still there, however it is classified.

Boardmember Silvas also thinks this is a historical building. It is the closest warehouse to ballpark and it is the first building one would see if walking around the area. It is an important historical building.

Boardmember Bethke originally supported Staff's recommendation but is now on the fence, he thinks the speakers made good points. He is troubled that there is no statement of significance i.e. why would it be significant as a warehouse under Criterion A. It is not automatically significant

because it is a warehouse and it does not have the documentation to support a statement of significance.

Boardmember Garbini thinks that it retains the integrity of setting, its location enhances the warehouse district, its architectural detailing is intact, and signage is interesting. Its close association with the warehouse district makes it more cohesive.

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation based on the written materials. The Warehouse Thematic District Survey DPR form states it is a contributor to a thematic district; building type not style was identified. There is no analysis in research report related to building type; there is not enough information to analyze building type.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CONTINUE ITEM 6 – 1310 K STREET WITH THE AGREEMENT OF THE CONSULTANT TO RETURN IN THE JANUARY 2012 MEETING AND ASSESS THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESOURCE AS A TYPE AND ALSO THEN TO LOOK AT THIS ANALYSIS IN LINE WITH THE FURTHER INFORMATION WITHIN THE ADOPTED WAREHOUSE THEMATIC DISTRICT SURVEY, WHICH IS ONLINE, AND TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT TESTIMONY TODAY TO BE SUBSTANTIATED. THE CURRENT REPORT DOES NOT CONTEXTUALIZE THE PROPERTY'S HISTORY OR ARCHITECTURAL STYLE OR TYPE TO THE EXTENT NEEDED OR AT ALL.

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – 7712 HILLSIDE DRIVE

Applicant: Thomas and Antoinette Keck Trust represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 7712 Hillside Drive, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7712 Hillside Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 7712 Hillside Drive under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-11-066

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Nettie Keck, Richard Bokal

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation. The massive scale of additions and the reuse of historic materials is inappropriate.

Boardmember Garbini thinks that a lot of it appears historic and is not persuaded that it has changed dramatically.

Boardmember Bethke doesn't think the additions are a problem; mostly in the rear and may be consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards. He is leaning towards designation.

Vice-Chair Silvas supports Staff's recommendation.

Chair Lemmo also supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone thinks the rear addition is consistent with the standards; someone took a lot of care to stay with the character of the house. Roofing materials are not an issue; the 1945 addition could be historic. She is against Staff's recommendation, house is worthy of being saved.

Boardmember Woods agrees that this is worthy of designation and the additions are imperceptible to public.

Boardmember Curry thinks it still looks like a Tudor revival house and the style is still there. Additions are setback; could be designated.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – 7712 HILLSIDE DRIVE UNDER CRITERION C BECAUSE THE HOME EMBODIES DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE ENGLISH TUDOR REVIVAL FROM THE PERIOD OF 1931. DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS INCLUDE: THE ROOFLINE AND STEEP GABLES, HERRING BONE BRICK PATTERN TIMBERING AT THE FRONT OF THE HOUSE, STONEMWORK WHICH COULD BE INDICATIVE OF ENGLISH TUDOR, AND THE ORIGINAL CHIMNEY. STAFF WILL DETERMINE THE NAME BASED ON THE NAMING POLICY.

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 6-2-0
(*Silvas, Berge*)

Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – ALFRED AND JESSICA PHINNEY/THOMAS L. SHEPHERD HOUSE

Applicant: Gary L. Greenberg Trust represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 7124 Olivetas Avenue, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 1-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7124 Olivetas Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alfred and Jessica Phinney/Thomas L. Shepherd House located at 7124 Olivetas Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1962 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 248 square feet rear addition dating to 1988, and the 68 square feet ground floor addition and 232 square feet second floor addition dating to 2011.

Report Number: HRB-11-067

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 9 –THE LIFE HOUSE

Applicant: Witt Family Trust represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 6025 Waverly Avenue, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1247 3-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 6025 Waverly Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the LIFE house located at 6025 Waverly Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1939 under HRB Criteria A and C.

Report Number: HRB-11-068

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Vonn Marie May, Todd and Betsy Witt, Don Schmidt

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Chair Lemmo wanted to note that the draft resolution does not specify the exclusion and if the property is designated, it should be corrected.

Boardmember Bethke does not think it qualifies under Criterion C and that the discussion for Criterion A may be misleading. Questioned whether this home was adopted by architect from the Life magazine article; or actually was a case study home.

Boardmember Berge thinks that it is individually significant and supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Garbini supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke supports designation under Criterion A, but would prefer it not be designated under Criterion C.

Vice-Chair Silvas supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation.

Chair Lemmo supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BETHKE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – THE LIFE HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 10 – J.A. AND MARY SMITH/ WILLIAM WAHRENBERGER HOUSE

Applicant: Jennifer M. Tuteur Trust represented by IS Architecture

Location: 4188 Arden Way, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4188 Arden Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the J.A. and Mary Smith/ William Wahrenberger House located at 4188 Arden Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-11-070

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 11 – RICHARD AND VIOLA REQUA HOUSE

Applicant: Ima Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 4346 Valle Vista Way, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4346 Valle Vista Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Richard and Viola Requa House located at 4346 Valle Vista Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1911 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-11-071

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 12 – ISAAC AND FLORA WALKER HOUSE

Applicant: Richard Reed and Diana Ram Joint Living Trust represented by Jaye MacAskill

Location: 2722 29th Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2722 29th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Isaac and Flora Walker House located at 2722 29th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-11-072

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 13 – BAHIA VIEW CONDOMINIUMS EXTENSION OF SITE DEVELOPMENT PERMIT NO. 2007-27

Applicant: Bahia View Condominiums, LLC

Location: 1425 Market Street, 92101, Center City Community, Council District 2 (**1289 3-B**)

Description: Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.

Today's Action: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to designated historical resources.

Staff Recommendation: That the HRB recommends that the Commission grants approval of a three-year EOT for the Permit for the Project, including the removal, restoration, and incorporation into the Project of the 1888 portion of HRB Site No. 819, the Tourist Hotel building.

Report Number: CCDC Report

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 14 – HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD DISTRICT POLICY

Applicant: City of San Diego, Development Services Department

Location: City-wide

Description: Consider an amendment to the Historical Resources Board District Policy 4.1.

Today's Action: Approve the proposed amendment to the Historical Resources Board District Policy 4.1 or do not approve the amendment.

Staff Recommendation: Approve one of the following two options: Option A: Approve the amendments to the Historical Resources Board District Policy 4.1. as currently proposed, with the most recent revision regarding historic contexts; or Option B: Approve the amendments to the Historical Resources Board District Policy 4.1. as currently proposed, with the most recent revision regarding historic contexts and removal of the research considerations in their entirety.

Report Number: Staff memo dated October 14, 2011 and HRB-11-057

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge wants to change the name back to the 1977 original subtitle “Procedure on Establishing Historic Districts”.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO ADOPT OPTION A, CHANGING THE WORD POLICY IN THE TITLE TO THE WORD PROCEDURE

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Friday, November 18, 2011

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:40PM