

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 27, 2012
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:10PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present <i>left at 3:00PM</i>
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present <i>arrived at 2:20PM</i>
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present <i>left at 3:15PM</i>
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Assistant Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner
Camille Pekarek, Planning Intern
Sarah Vonesh, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance:

Keith Bauerle, Deputy City Attorney
Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR July 26, 2012

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE JULY 26, 2012 MINUTES WITH CHANGES

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 7-0-2 Motion Passes
(Lemmo, Bethke)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Silvas notified staff he will not be in attendance. Boardmember Curry has to leave at 3:00PM and Boardmember Rivera has to leave at 3:15PM. Boardmember Larimer was called away for work and will arrive as soon as he can.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Correspondence for Item 7
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 13
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- I would like to introduce Planning Intern Sarah Vonesh. She moved here from Washington DC, she has a bachelor's degree in historic preservation from the College of Charleston in South Carolina. She worked for the City of Charleston in the planning, preservation and sustainability department; she is out here to pursue her master's degree in historic preservation.
- OHP workshop on November 8 and meeting on November 9 at 9:00am in the Balboa Park Club
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, October 3, 2012. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, October 8, 2012. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, November 19, 2012.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 1 referral from Development Services and 8 individual homeowner nominations, of which one has been continued from a previous agenda. There are 19 homeowner nominations in 2012 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- ITEM 7 – CASA DE LAS JOYAS
- ITEM 8 – WALTER AND EMILIE ALBRECHT HOUSE
- ITEM 9 – FRANK AND BARBARA HOPE, JR. HOUSE
- ITEM 10 – PAUL AND CHARLOTTE HUTCHINSON HOUSE
- ITEM 11 – THE RIDGEWAY HOUSE
- ITEM 12 – FRANTA STEWART SPEC HOUSE #1

Item 7 pulled by Boardmember Bethke and Item 10 pulled by Boardmember Berge

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 8, 9, 11 AND 12 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFFS RECOMMENDATON

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A – OLD TOWN SURVEY

The historic consultant for the Old Town historic survey will update the Board on the status and preliminary results of the survey. No action on the part of the Board is being requested. For more information on the Old Town Context Statement and Survey, please visit our website at the link below:

<http://www.sandiego.gov/planning/programs/historical/oldtown.shtml>

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge would like the consultant to confirm the date the city accepted ownership of Presidio Park, and wanted to confirm the name of a potential district.

Boardmember Curry thinks the preservation and tourism phase 1 and 2 are interesting; because historic preservation is part of the history and development of an area and there are these trends that we don't see any more. She is wondering if the survey will compare other preservation movements in the country.

ITEM B – MIDWAY SURVEY

The historic consultant for the Midway historic survey will update the Board on the status and preliminary results of the survey. No action on the part of the Board is being requested. For more information on the Midway Context Statement and Survey, please visit our website at the link below:

<http://www.sandiego.gov/planning/programs/historical/midway.shtml>

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 3902 9th AVENUE

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: 3902 9th Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 5-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3902 9th Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 3902 Ninth Avenue under any adopted HRB Designation Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 12-054

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge agrees with Staff analysis and recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Garbini agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Lemmo agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Rivera agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry agrees with Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – 3902 9th AVENUE UNDER CRITERION A, AS REFLECTING POST WAR REDEVELOPMENT ACTIVITY IN UPTOWN WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1951

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini

Vote: 0-9-0

Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Garbini, Curry, Woods, Baksh, Rivera, Marrone, Bethke, Berge)

ITEM 6 – 2335 JUAN STREET

Continued from September 2011

Applicant: Mikhail Family Trust represented by Paul and Sarai Johnson

Location: 2335 Juan Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2335 Juan Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2335 Juan Street under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 12-046 and HRB 11-003

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Bruce Coons, Paul Johnson (*Iman Mikhail*)

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry thinks it retains features and supports designation.

Boardmember Woods thinks it is a beautiful house and appreciates the changes the owner has put into it; however, the massing has been altered by the additions.

Boardmember Baksh thinks the addition distracts from the house.

Boardmember Rivera thinks designating the interiors makes a difference and wants to see it designated. It is in a significant property in this community.

Chair Lemmo thinks the owner's efforts are remarkable; addition is differentiated.

Vice-Chair Garbini would support a package of designation with interiors included.

Boardmember Bethke also appreciates the cost and effort to address modifications; however, character defining features have been significantly altered.

Boardmember Marrone favors designation with interiors included.

Boardmember Berge is not in favor of designation.

Boardmember Larimer thinks there are a lot of bones to this home that are worthy of designation, asked about the DAS review.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 - 2335 JUAN STREET UNDER C AS EMBODYING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF SPANISH ECLECTIC STYLE INCLUDING THE INTERIORS THAT ARE IDENTIFIED IN THE CONSULTANT'S REPORT AND THAT WERE PRESENTED IN THE POWERPOINT AND VIDEO TODAY WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1930

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 6-4-0

Motion Passes

(*Woods, Baksh, Bethke, Berge*)

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO MODIFY DESIGNATION TO REMOVE THE SECOND STORY ADDITION AND THE REAR ADDITION FROM DESIGNATION

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 7-1-2

Motion Passes

(*Berge*)(*Woods, Bethke*)

ITEM 7 – CASA DE LAS JOYAS

Applicant: Mahmoud and Bibi Ladjevardi represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 7902 Roseland Drive, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7902 Roseland Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Casa De Las Joyas located at 7902 Roseland Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927-1932 under HRB Criterion A. The designation excludes the family room, den, kitchen and utility room additions at the east side of the property, constructed in 1988 and 2006 and totaling approximately 852 square feet.

Report Number: HRB-12-047

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Mahmoud Ladjevardi

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke supports designation under Criteria C and D, thinks the discussion of Criterion A should be applied to Criteria C and D.

Boardmember Curry supports designation under Criterion A and agrees with programmatic architecture.

Boardmember Woods supports designation under Criterion A or C.

Boardmember Baksh supports designation under Criterion A.

Boardmember Rivera thinks there is minimal street frontage and visibility; she is leaning against designation.

Chair Lemmo supports designation under Criterion A, but could consider Criteria C and D.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation and designation under Criterion C.

Boardmember Marrone supports designation under Criteria A, C and D, but is not sure about programmatic architecture.

Boardmember Berge supports designation under Criterion A based upon the resolution and would exclude additions. It is a La Jolla landmark.

Boardmember Larimer asked the consultant to discuss modifications to the home, he is on the fence.

Boardmember Bethke thinks the elements of the home that are clearly significant remain; he supports designation under Criteria C and D even with modifications.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 - CASA DE LAS JOYAS UNDER CRITERION A AS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF THE CITY'S AND LA JOLLA'S HISTORICAL, CULTURAL, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL DEVELOPMENT AND RETAINS INTEGRITY TO THE 1927-1932 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE'S HIGH VISIBILITY AND

PARTICULARLY UNIQUE INDIAN VERNACULAR ARCHITECTURE WITH SPANISH ECLECTIC INFLUENCES, CHARACTERIZED BY THE HIGHLY VISIBLE MOGUL DOMES, HAS MADE IT AN IMPORTANT, CLEARLY RECOGNIZABLE LANDMARK IN THE LA JOLLA COMMUNITY, WHERE IT IS COMMONLY KNOWN AS “THE TAJ MAHAL OF LA JOLLA”.

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – WALTER AND EMILIE ALBRECHT HOUSE

Applicant: Jean James Living Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 535 San Gorgonio Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 4-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 535 San Gorgonio Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Walter and Emilie Albrecht House located at 535 San Gorgonio Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1941 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 455 square foot detached music room, constructed in 2008.

Report Number: HRB-12-048

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 9 – FRANK AND BARBARA HOPE, JR. HOUSE

Applicant: Donald and Barbara Foster represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 3430 Bangor Place, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 2-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3430 Bangor Place as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Frank and Barbara Hope, Jr. House located at 3430 Bangor Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1967 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-12-049

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 10 – PAUL AND CHARLOTTE HUTCHINSON HOUSE

Applicant: Philip and Erin McConkey represented by Trip Bennett

Location: 1856 Viking Way, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1856 Viking Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Paul and Charlotte Hutchinson House located at 1856 Viking Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1931 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes two story addition between the garage and the main house constructed in the 1980s and the second story garage addition.

Report Number: HRB-12-050

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Trip Bennett (*Alice Bennett, Betsy McKeesh, Erin McConkey, Adrian Mckibbin, Mary Vuseth, Peter Charlton, Jr. and Nathanael Roberol*)

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge is concerned about the size and massing of the rear additions.

Boardmember Bethke does not think the massing is a significant issue.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 – PAUL AND CHARLOTTE HUTCHINSON HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 11 – THE RIDGEWAY HOUSE

Applicant: Sedlock 1984 Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 4256 Ridgeway Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (**1268 2-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4256 Ridgeway Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate The Ridgeway House located at 4256 Ridgeway Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criteria A, C and D. The interiors proposed in the designation include the exposed wood ceiling in the living room; second level interior living room balcony with lathe turned spindle wood balustrade; copper fireplace hood in the library; the decorative ceramic tile at the staircase risers; and the wrought iron staircase railing. The designation excludes the detached rear pool house which is approximately 300 square feet and was constructed in 1984.

Report Number: HRB-12-051

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 12 –FRANTA STEWART SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Craig and Merilee Wilsie represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 5317 Wilshire Drive, 92116, Normal Heights Community, Council District 3 (**1269 2-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5317 Wilshire Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Franta Stewart Spec House #1 located at 5317 Wilshire Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. Interior elements included in the designation include the staircase tile and ironwork; the living room stenciled beams; and the fireplace surround, mantle and hearth.

Report Number: HRB-12-052

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 13 – 1004 DEVONSHIRE DRIVE

Applicant: Paul and Britton Buss represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1004 Devonshire Drive, 92107, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1287 2-H)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1004 Devonshire Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1004 Devonshire Drive under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-12-053

Staff Report by Jeff Oakley

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Joe Holasek, Bruce Coons, Michael Ryan, Ken Harvey, Byron Wear

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Larimer asked staff to address modifications that caused staff to not support designation.

Boardmember Berge had questions about the modifications, she supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports designation under Criterion A, it is one of a small group of houses from 1926-1930 that still exist.

Boardmember Bethke could support designation under Criterion A under the existing context, integrity is not an issue.

Vice-Chair Garbini mentioned the Sunset Cliffs development parallels the San Clemente development; movement in Southern California in the 1920's to develop communities along the Pacific Ocean, typically white Spanish-Mediterranean style.

Chair Lemmo can support designation under Criterion A.

Boardmember Baksh cannot support designation under Criterion C due to the lack of integrity, is on the fence for Criterion A.

Boardmember Woods agrees with Boardmember Baksh.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 13- JOHN STEVEN MCGROARTY SPEC HOUSE #1, WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1927-1928 UNDER HRB CRITERION A AS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF SUNSET CLIFFS' EARLY ARCHITECTURAL AND CULTURAL DEVELOPMENT FROM 1925-1928. SPECIFICALLY, IT EXEMPLIFIES AND REFLECTS THROUGH THE RETENTION OF ORIGINAL, HISTORIC PHYSICAL ELEMENTS, SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF SAN DIEGO'S, POINT LOMA'S, SUNSET CLIFF'S, AND DEVONSHIRE DRIVE'S HISTORICAL, CULTURAL, AND ARCHITECTURAL DEVELOPMENT BY VIRTUE OF ITS PROMINENT CORNER LOCATION, SIZE (TWO-STORY FORM ON TWO LOTS), LIGHT COLOR SPANISH-STYLE STUCCO EXTERIOR, RED TILE ROOF, AND WIDE-SPREAD COMMUNITY RECOGNITION AS A SUNSET CLIFFS "ICON."

THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES ADDITIONS CONSTRUCTED AFTER THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE.

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 7-1-0
(*Baksh*)

Motion Passes

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, November 29, 2012

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:30PM