

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OCTOBER 25, 2012
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:07PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present <i>left at 3:00pm</i>
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Absent
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Assistant Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner
Camille Pekarek, Planning Intern
Sarah Vonesh, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Keith Bauerle, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR September 27, 2012

Minutes were not available

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Don Schmidt, La Jolla Historical Society – read letter in regards to the over 45 review process

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Rivera notified staff that she would not be in attendance and Boardmember Curry notified staff she has to leave at 3:00PM.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Correspondence for Items 5, 7 and 9
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmember Marrone has identified a conflict of interest with Item 5.

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Boardmember Woods – Item 5

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Reminder that the State Historical Resources Commission will hold their quarterly workshop in San Diego on Friday, November 9 at 9:00am in Ballroom of the Balboa Park Club with a workshop the preceding Thursday, November 8th.
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, November 7, 2012. The next Policy Subcommittee and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings will be on Monday, November 19, 2012.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 1 referral from Development Services; a national register nomination; and 11 individual homeowner nominations. There are 13 homeowner nominations in 2012 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 6 – CHICANO PARK

ITEM 8 – 2306 PINE STREET

ITEM 10 – 4756 KENSINGTON DRIVE

ITEM 11 – 1915 SUNSET BLVD

ITEM 12 – 4129 FALCON STREET

ITEM 13 – 4494 HORTENSIA STREET

ITEM 14 – 4302 ADAMS AVENUE

ITEM 15 – 2808 29TH STREET

Boardmember Bethke pulled Item 10 and Boardmember Larimer pulled Item 8

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 6, 11, 12, 13, AND 14 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFFS RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 10-0-0 Motion Passes

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 15 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFFS RECOMMENDATION WITH MODIFICATION TO THE NAME TO INCLUDE ANNA'S HUSBAND JOHN

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 10-0-0 Motion Passes

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A – CELEBRATE ARCHAEOLOGY MONTH

Presentations on:

- Archaeology Studies in support of Community Plan Updates
- Native American presence in Old Town during Pre-contact, Spanish, Mexican and Early American Periods
- Results of Phase I of the Presidio Collections Management Plan
- Presidio Bird Bone Study

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – DR. ROGER REVELLE HOUSE

Applicant: William Revelle II, Anne Shumway, and Mary Paci represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 7348 Vista Del Mar, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 1-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7348 Vista Del Mar as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Dr. Roger Revelle House located at 7348 Vista Del Mar as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1940-1991 under HRB Criterion B.

Report Number: HRB 12-055

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Don Schmidt

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (*Ryan Jartz, David Moran, Monty Moran*), Carolyn Revelle (*Tim Martin, Vonn Marie May*)

Board Discussion:

Item heard out of order, heard after Item 7

Boardmember Woods-would like to hear other Boardmember comments. She is concerned that the only real activity associated with the house was dinner parties to attract faculty, feels the office at SIO (Scripps Institute of Oceanography) is the property more associated with his accomplishments.

Boardmember Baksh feels the argument can be made for both sides, does not support designation based on the lack of integrity.

Boardmember Silvas thinks Mrs. Revelle was a great woman, thinks Dr. Revelle is well documented in the community.

Chair Lemmo is on the fence; thinks the 2012 report is more complete than the 2004 report. He is not sure they are making the connection between Revelle and this house.

Vice-Chair Garbini feels that a person's home broadens the personality and understanding of the individual, is in support of designation for the future generations.

Boardmember Bethke is also on the fence, not sure if this is an appropriate property to designate. This home does say something about Revelle, but his office at SIO is the paramount property to reflect his career.

Boardmember Larimer wanted more clarity on the assessment that was done in 2004, which suggests the house is significant. He doesn't think the house warrants designation.

Boardmember Berge does not think the house is associated with his significant accomplishments, not sure it should be designated because it is the only thing that we can designate.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – DR. ROGER REVELLE HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini

Vote: 1-7-1

Motion Fails

(Woods, Baksh, Silvas, Lemmo, Bethke, Larimer, Berge) (Marrone)

ITEM 6 – CHICANO PARK

Applicant: Josie Talamantez

Owner: City of San Diego

Location: National Ave. at Dewey Street, 92113, Barrio Logan Community, Council District 3 (**1269 4-D**)

Description: Review the National Register Nomination of Chicano Park

Today's Action: Review and make a recommendation on the National Register Nomination of Chicano Park.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend the listing of Chicano Park to the California Office of Historic Preservation.

Report Number: HRB-12-057

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – EDEN AND ADA GEORGE HOUSE

Applicant: Mary R Barton Revocable Trust represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 524 Coast Blvd South, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 7-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 524 Coast Blvd South as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Eden and Ada George House located at 524 Coast Boulevard as an historical resource with a period of significance of 1923 under HRB Criterion A. This designation excludes the 1986 two story addition.

Report Number: HRB-12-058

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Vonn Marie May, Laura Williams, Don Schmidt

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Item heard out of order; heard first

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation; home was documented in the 1977 survey.

Boardmember Larimer struggles with this one, was hoping for something that spoke to why it is important to the community. He has a hard time supporting designation.

Boardmember Bethke is on the fence; his primary concern is with Criterion A and this being a beach cottage. The 2nd story addition adversely affects the "beach cottage" design.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation; addition is consistent with the standards.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation; agrees with Boardmember Marrone's comments.

Chair Lemmo agrees there could have been more in the analysis, supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Silvas loves this house, would like to see more on the history of La Jolla before 1919.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 - EDEN AND ADA GEORGE HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 8-1-0

Motion Passes

(Larimer)

ITEM 8 – BESSIE OLDS HOUSE

Applicant: Christine and Charles Miller IV represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 2306 Pine Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1268 4-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2306 Pine Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Bessie Olds House located at 2306 Pine Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1938 under HRB Criteria C and D. The detached single-car garage located at the western side of the property was constructed in the 1970's and is excluded from this designation.

Report Number: HRB-12-059

Staff Report by Jeff Oakley

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Vonn Marie May, Don Schmidt

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Larimer mentioned that the shutters were missing and thinks they should be replaced; he supports designation.

Boardmember Silvas feels that the report lacks history of the community, only addresses the house.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – BESSIE OLDS HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION WITH A MODIFICATION TO THE NAME TO INCLUDE WILLIAM WAHRENBERGER AS MASTER BUILDER.

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 8-1-0

Motion Passes

(Silvas)

ITEM 9 – 5006 HASTINGS ROAD

Applicant: Samuel Clark represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 5006 Hastings Road, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (1269 2-H)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5006 Hastings Road as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 5006 Hastings Road under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-12-060

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Ron May, Kiley Wallace, Sam Clark, Don Schmidt

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge supports designation based on additional information and explanation of restoration work, minimal change in mass and scale and new garage is differentiated.

Boardmember Larimer is not sure it exemplifies Spanish Eclectic architecture.

Boardmember Bethke is on the fence, not sure there is sufficient evidence that restoration was accurate.

Boardmember Marrone thinks it does embody the Spanish Eclectic style and with the additional information provided today she can support designation, garage roof is not a problem.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports designation under Criterion C; thinks that the 2nd story deck is unusual for San Diego, the front walkway and entry is original and the new garage is not a problem.

Chair Lemmo supports designation.

Boardmember Silvas likes the house.

Boardmember Baksh supports designation.

Boardmember Woods is on the fence, is nervous about authenticity of the restoration.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – HERMAN AND BEULAH ALLEN HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C BASED UPON THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS, THE PROPERTY IS HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT UNDER CRITERION C FOR ITS DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS THROUGH THE RETENTION OF CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF THE SPANISH ECLECTIC STYLE AND RETAINS A GOOD LEVEL OF ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1929 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. IN PARTICULAR THE RESOURCE RETAINS ITS ASYMMETRICAL FAÇADE, EXTERIOR STUCCO WALLS AND CHIMNEY, A MIXTURE OF FLAT AND MISSION TILE GABLED AND SHED ROOFS, MULTI-LIGHT WOODEN CASEMENT WINDOWS, AND ANGULAR FRONT ENTRANCE AND THE ORIGINAL RED CONCRETE WALKWAY AND STAIRS. THIS FINDING IS FURTHER SUPPORTED BY THE INFORMATION IN THE HISTORICAL RESOURCE REPORT, THE STAFF REPORT AND WRITTEN AND ORAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING. THE ADDITIONAL SQUARE FOOTAGE, IF THAT CAN BE DETERMINED, TO THE GARAGE WOULD BE EXCLUDED FROM THE DESIGNATION.

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini

Vote: 7-2-0

Motion Passes

(Woods, Larimer)

ITEM 10 – CHARLES AND IVA CROUCH HOUSE

Applicant: James McCarthy represented by Archaeos

Location: 4756 Kensington Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (1269 3-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4756 Kensington Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Charles and Iva Crouch House located at 4756 Kensington Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C. The 300 square foot den addition and covered porch on the rear elevation of the structure that were constructed between 1921 and 1950 are excluded from this designation.

Report Number: HRB-12-061

Staff Report by Jeff Oakley

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ruth Alter

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke is bothered by the partial enclosure of the front porch, which is one of the character defining features.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Silvas supports Staff's recommendation.

Chair Lemmo supports Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke mentioned that just because it is common, that does not make it historic, enclosing a porch or partially enclosing a porch is not significant in its own right.

Boardmember Larimer thinks the house has a lot of original features; porch has been enclosed for a long time.

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 – CHARLES AND IVA CROUCH HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH A MODIFICATION TO THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE FROM 1912 TO 1911

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 8-1-0
(Bethke)

Motion Passes

ITEM 11 – HENRY AND LAVINA NELSON SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Amerzquita Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 1915 Sunset Blvd., 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1915 Sunset Blvd as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Henry and Lavina Nelson Spec House #1 located at 1915 Sunset Boulevard as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. An interior element included in the designation is the custom built-in China cabinet with decorative leaded glass in the dining room. The designation includes the mature Fern Pine (*Podocarpus gracilior*) tree located at the northwest corner of the lot. The designation excludes the three car garage, and the 1974 and 1993 additions at the southeast corner totaling approximately 844 square feet.

Report Number: HRB-12-062

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 12 – JOHN DONOHUE SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Martin and Carol Spuehler represented by Allan Hazard & Janet O'Dea.

Location: 4129 Falcon Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4129 Falcon Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John Donohue Spec House #1 located at 4129 Falcon Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of circa 1911 under HRB Criterion C. This designation excludes the detached 240 square foot garage constructed in 1980.

Report Number: HRB-12-063

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 13 – SAMUEL AND LULU MAXWELL HOUSE

Applicant: Norton Rappaport and Richard Guzman Trust represented by IS Architecture

Location: 4494 Hortensia Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4494 Hortensia Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Samuel and Lulu Maxwell House located at 4494 Hortensia Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1989, 292 square foot first floor addition and deck on the northeast corner of the house as well as the 2007, 160 square foot first floor addition/remodel.

Report Number: HRB-12-064

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 14 – AUGUSTUS AND LAURA REHKOPF/PEAR PEARSON HOUSE

Applicant: Kate Miller represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4302 Adams Avenue, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (**1269 3-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4302 Adams Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Augustus and Laura Rehkopf/Pear Pearson House located at 4302 Adams Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1931 under HRB Criteria C and D. Interior elements included in the designation are the staircase ironwork; the living room exposed beams with decorative brackets; and the living room fireplace surround, mantle and hearth.

Report Number: HRB 12-066

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 15 – ANNA NORWOOD HOUSE

Applicant: Adam and Ashley Feist

Location: 2808 29th Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2808 29th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Anna Norwood House located at 2808 29th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1923 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the non-historic shed addition behind the garage totaling approximately 288 square feet.

Report Number: HRB 12-067

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA WITH CHANGES TO THE NAME TO INCLUDE ANNA'S HUSBAND JOHN

ITEM 16 – 3794 LOUISIANA STREET

Applicant: Paul Spears Revocable Trust represented by Paul & Sarai Johnson

Location: 3794 Louisiana Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 5-D)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3794 Louisiana Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 3794 Louisiana Street under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-12-068

Staff Report by Jeff Oakley

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Paul Johnson (*Sarai Johnson*)

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge is bothered by the extensive brickwork; she cannot support designation today.

Boardmember Larimer appreciates the details of the home and extensive restoration, but the porch is a problem. He is leaning towards designation.

Boardmember Bethke is on the fence.

Boardmember Marrone also appreciates all of the work but the brickwork is too extensive.

Vice-Chair Garbini thinks the house is beautiful; the brick columns are not a problem. Typically when redoing porches, you want to go back to the original materials, which would have been concrete or wood. She has an issue the front porch material, not the walkway or the columns.

Chari Lemmo also thinks it is a beautiful house; the columns don't bother him but the brick porch is bothersome.

Boardmember Silvas likes the house.

Boardmember Baksh thinks the modifications are a bit too much, supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods agrees with other Boardmembers about the porch floor, supports designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 16 – DANIEL AND ANNA BOONE HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C AS A GOOD EXAMPLE OF THE CRAFTSMAN STYLE ARCHITECTURE THAT WAS POPULAR FROM 1905 TO THE EARLY 1920'S, THIS 1920 HOUSE DISPLAYS THE DISTINCTIVE

CHARACTERISTICS OF THE CRAFTSMAN STYLE AND CONVEYS THE WAY IN WHICH THE PROPERTY WAS DESIGNED BY A 1920'S SOCIETY

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini

Vote: 6-3-0

Motion Passes

(Baksh, Garbini, Bethke)

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, November 29, 2012

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:06PM