

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Silvas and Curry notified staff they would need to leave the meeting at 3:00.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Applicant's request for continuance for Item 11 – Annie Porter House
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Boardmember Woods was approached by the tenant/potential future owner of Item 12, they were concerned about the impending designation and how it would limit their ability to add on to the house.

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- It is that time of year again to nominate your favorite historic preservation project, program or person for an award. Nominations are being accepted until Monday, April 2, 2012. Printed copies of the nomination form are available on the back table and can be completed electronically and submitted via the website at www.sandiego.gov/historic
- Those owners whose property was designated in 2011 or earlier are eligible to apply for a Mills Act agreement at this time. Those applications are due no later than April 2, 2012 to be considered this year and also can be found on the website at www.sandiego.gov/historic
- An appeal of the designation of the property at 741 F Street has been filed with the City Clerk and we are anticipating taking it to City Council in late April.
- The historic surveys and archaeological studies for the Old Town and Midway communities have been presented to those plan update advisory committees. The draft historic surveys are posted to our website. We would welcome any public comment or input on the survey results and recommendations.
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, April 4, 2012. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, April 9, 2012. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, May 14, 2012.

- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: two information items; 3 referrals from Development Services including one continued from a previous agenda; 11 individual homeowner nominations; and the Historic Preservation Fund Expenditures. There are 14 homeowner nominations in 2011 and 6 homeowner nominations in 2012 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Applicant has submitted a written request for a 30-day continuance for Item 11 – Annie Porter House

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT A 30-DAY CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 11 – ANNIE PORTER HOUSE

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – OAKLEY J. HALL HOUSE

ITEM 8 – M.B. AND IDA IRVIN/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC. HOUSE #2

ITEM 9 – GEORGE AND BERTHA COOLEY/ LOIS AND BENJAMIN TORGERSON SPEC. HOUSE #1

ITEM 10 – MISSION BREWERY BOTTLING PLANT

ITEM 12 – CHARLES AND MARIE BRENNER HOUSE

ITEM 13 – ELSIE HERMAN/RUSSELL FORESTER HOUSE

ITEM 14 – WOOLWORTH BUILDING

ITEM 15 – MORRIS B. IRVING SPEC. HOUSE NO. 2

ITEM 16 – GEORGE GANS SPEC HOUSE #4

ITEM 17 – DAVID LOUIS AND SUSAN E. KRETSINGER HOUSE

ITEM 18 – HISTORIC PRESERVATION FUND EXPENDITURES

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke pulled Items 13 and 18 from the consent agenda

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 7, 8, 9, 10, 12, 14, 15, 16 AND 17 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATIONS TO ITEMS 12 AND 15

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A – SIKES ADOBE HISTORIC FARMSTEAD MASTER

Introduction of the San Dieguito River Park's Master Plan for the Sikes Adobe Historic Farmstead outlining future activities and development of the site, such as a farmers market and weddings, and once funding is obtained, construction of a barn on the field northwest of the farmhouse

ITEM B – FEE STUDY FOR HISTORICAL RESOURCES NOMINATIONS AND MILLS ACT PROGRAM

Staff will present information related to proposed reduction in fees related to Historical Resources Nominations and the Mills Act Program.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – ANTONIO AND JOSEPHINE GIACALONE HOUSE AND 1668 COLUMBIA STREET Trailed from February 2012

Applicant: Owner represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1668 Columbia Street and 519 East Date Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 2 (**1289 2-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1668 Columbia Street and 519 West Date Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1668 Columbia Street under any adopted HRB Criteria; designate the Antonio and Josephine Giacalone House located at 519 West Date Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of c. 1885 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-12-009

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco, presented by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia (*Steve Marsa, Alex Leonard, Weston Harmer, Scott Moomjian*), Bruce Coons

In Opposition: Dan Soderberg

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge is concerned that the property has been moved and we don't know when or where it was built; she also has questions about the date of construction.

Boardmember Silvas supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Bethke also supports Staff's recommendation, but thinks that Criterion A would need addition information as well. He would like to see more development of the context, why was the building moved.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation. This was a fishing community and most of those residences were rentals and probably a low income residence; 1668 Columbia is probably more in keeping with what that community was really like during the fishing industry period.

Chair Lemmo agrees with Staff, would have liked more history on 519 Date Street.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry agrees with Vice-Chair Garbini's comments and is in support of Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5--ANTONIO AND JOSEPHINE GIACALONE HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 6 --THE LUSCOMB BUILDING

Trailed from February 2012

Applicant: Owner represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1769 San Diego Avenue, 92110, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1268 6-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1769 San Diego Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate The Luscomb Building located at 1769 San Diego Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion A. The designation shall exclude the two-story building at the south end of the lot constructed in 1932.

Report Number: HRB-12-010

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco, presented by Cathy Winterrowd

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Bruce Coons, Dan Soderberg

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (*Marie Lia*)

Board Discussion:

Item taken out of order, Boardmembers Curry and Silvas were not present.

Boardmember Woods is on the fence, agrees that it is an example of Programmatic Architecture and it is unique in San Diego. She has some concerns with the integrity but is inclined to support the Staff recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh agrees with Boardmember Woods.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation; what exists still conveys what it was originally set out to be. It is significant to the history of San Diego and to the City.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke is also in support of Staff's recommendation. The Programmatic aspect really belongs under Criterion C and the Tourist Camps under Criterion A. Not sure that the entire Tourist Camp would need to remain given the special circumstances, loss of integrity under Criterion A not a big deal. Would view the programmatic aspect under Criterion C with a minor loss of integrity, changed openings not significant, building still conveys the aspect of Programmatic Architecture. He supports designation under A and C.

Boardmember Berge mentioned that there is no documented Tourist Camp before 1932. She doesn't think that you can separate the actual use of building and the form of the building. She is not prepared to designate under Programmatic Architecture today and more research needs to be on the first use of the building.

Chair Lemmo thinks that there is enough evidence to support Staff's recommendation for designation under Criterion A.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – THE LUSCOMB BUILDING PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

After the motion was made by Boardmember Marrone and seconded by Boardmember Woods; Scott Moomjian, representing the owner, asked for a 30-day continuance per the Municipal Code Section 123.0202d. The Board granted the continuance.

ITEM 7 – OAKLEY J. HALL HOUSE

Trailed from February 2012

Applicant: Owner represented by IS Architecture

Location: 3510 Dove Court, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3510 Dove Court as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Oakley J. Hall House located at 3510 Dove Court with a period of significance of 1926 and 1927-1938 under HRB Criteria A, B and C.

Report Number: HRB-12-011

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 – M.B. AND IDA IRVIN/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC. HOUSE #2

Trailed from February 2012

Applicant: Owner represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 4181 Stephens Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4181 Stephens Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the M.B. and Ida Irvin/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #2 located at 4181 Stephens Street with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criteria C and D. The 308 square foot addition at the northeast corner of the structure as well as the 32 square foot utility room at the northern side of the structure were constructed in the 1950's and are excluded from this designation.

Report Number: HRB-12-012

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 9 – GEORGE AND BERTHA COOLEY/ LOIS AND BENJAMIN TORGERSON SPEC. HOUSE #1

Trailed from February 2012

Applicant: Owner represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 5158 Marlborough Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (**1269 2-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5158 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George and Bertha Cooley/Lois and Benjamin Torgerson Spec. House #1 located at 5158 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1931 under HRB Criteria C and D. The 184 square foot and 35 square foot additions at the rear of the structure were constructed c.1947 and are excluded from this designation.

Report Number: HRB-12-013

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 10– THE MISSION BREWERY BOTTLING PLANT

Trailed from February 2012

Applicant: Owner represented by Jaye MacAskill.

Location: 1747 Hancock Street, 92101, Midway-Pacific Highway Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1747 Hancock Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Mission Brewery Bottling Plant located at 1747 Hancock Street with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion A.

Report Number: HRB-12-014

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 11 – ANNIE PORTER HOUSE

Applicant: Bankers Hill Property LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2126-30 Front Street, 92101, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1289 1-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2126-30 Front Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Annie Porter House located at 2126-30 Front Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1895 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear additions consisting of an approx 144 square feet one story addition constructed c. 1921 with an approx 144 square feet second story addition above constructed at an unknown date.

Report Number: HRB-12-008

ITEM CONTINUED FOR 30-DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

ITEM 12 – CHARLES AND MARIE BRENNER HOUSE

Applicant: Owner represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 4075 Cousts Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4075 Cousts Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Charles and Marie Brenner House located at 4075 Coutts Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criteria C as an example of Spanish Eclectic architecture. The 70 square foot rear addition at the southeast elevation of the structure was constructed in 1973 and is excluded from this designation.

Report Number: HRB-12-022

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATIONS

ITEM 13 – ELSIE HERMAN/RUSSELL FORESTER HOUSE

Applicant: Owner represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 1262 Fleetridge Drive, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 1-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1262 Fleetridge Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Elsie Herman/Russell Forester House located at 1262 Fleetridge Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1961-1980 under HRB Criteria B, C and D.

Report Number: HRB-12-017

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco, presentation by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Vonn Marie May, Dan Soderberg

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke cannot support Criterion B.

Chair Lemmo was also concerned about Criterion B, the majority of the report was about the history of the development of social work and not about Ms. Herman.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 13 – EDMUND AND ELSIE HERMAN/ RUSSELL FORESTER HOUSE UNDER CRITERIA C AND D PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 14 – WOOLWORTH BUILDING

Applicant: Applicant represented by Jaye MacAskill

Owned by the City of San Diego

Location: 3067-3075 University Avenue, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 5-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3067-3075 University Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Woolworth Building located at 3067-75 University Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1949 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-12-018

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 15 – MORRIS B. IRVIN SPEC. HOUSE NO. 2

Applicant: Owner represented by Allen Hazard and Janet O'Dea

Location: 4239 Saint James Place, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4239 Saint James Place as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Morris B. Irving Spec. House No. 2 located at 4239 Saint James Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criteria C and D excluding the detached rear yard garage.

Report Number: HRB-12-021

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATIONS

ITEM 16 – GEORGE GANS SPEC HOUSE #4

Applicant: Owner represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 3005 33rd Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3005 33rd Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George Gans Spec House #4 located at 3005 33rd Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criteria C and D as an example of Craftsman architecture and a notable work of George Gans, a Master Builder. The 331 square foot rear addition at the northeast elevation of the structure and the 302 square foot second story addition over a new 322 square foot garage at the northwest corner of the property were constructed in 2010 and are all excluded from this designation.

Report Number: HRB-12-019

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 17 – THE DAVID LOUIS AND SUSAN E. KRETSINGER HOUSE

Applicant: Owner represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 2539 Palm Avenue, 92156, Otay Mesa-Nestor Community, Council District 8 (**1330 7-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2539 Palm Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the David Louis and Susan E. Kretsinger House located at 2539 Palm Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1896 under HRB Criteria A and C excluding the detached rear yard garage and the 1928 kitchen addition.

Report Number: HRB-12-020

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 18 – HISTORIC PRESERVATION FUND EXPENDITURES

Applicant: City of San Diego, Development Services Department

Location: City-wide

Description: Consider the expenditure of funds from the Historic Preservation Fund.

Today's Action: Recommend to the City Council the expenditure of funds from the Historic Preservation Fund as proposed, do not recommend the expenditure of any funds at this time or return to staff with recommendations to modify the proposal for the expenditure of funds.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the City Council the expenditure of up to \$5,000 from the Historic Preservation Fund (HPF) for the replacement of historic signs stolen from the public right of way or City owned land within Mission Hills. This expenditure includes using \$1,700 transferred into the HPF from Council District 2.

Report Number: HRB-12-023

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ron May

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry mentioned that Tijuana is going after the places that take in stolen items and this may be a trans-border crime.

Boardmember Berge thinks that rear mounted signs would be inappropriate for pillars.

Boardmember Bethke asked what other cities are doing, are they opting to non-metal materials, and how to assure they are not stolen again.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL THE EXPENDITURE OF FUNDS FROM THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION FUND AS PROPOSED PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Thursday, April 26, 2012

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:30PM