

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD**  
**MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF**  
**May 24, 2007**

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM – 12<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR  
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Vacchi at 1:07 p.m.

Chairperson	Robert Vacchi	Present
Vice Chairperson	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Laura Burnett	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present - Left at 3:50 p.m.
Boardmember	John Eisenhart	Present
Boardmember	Donald Harrison	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Absent
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present – Left at 5:52 p.m. and Returned at 6:15 p.m.
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Absent
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present – Left at 5:46 p.m.

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Delores Johnson, Board Secretary  
Garry Papers, Deputy Director, Planning  
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner  
Diane Kane, Senior Planner  
Mike Tudury, Senior Planner  
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner  
Ginger Weatherford, Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Nina Fain, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1 - MINUTES OF MARCH 22, 2007 were not available for approval.**

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

Matt Peterson spoke on the importance of extending the Mills Act tax incentives to properties where significant archaeological resources are designated.

**\*\*\*SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS  
ANNUAL AWARDS FOR EXCELLENCE IN HISTORIC PRESERVATION  
AWARDED BY THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD\*\*\***

Twelve awards were presented to the following recipients:

Category: Archaeology, for the establishment of the San Diego State University Occasional Archaeology Papers, a free academic journal focusing on archaeology of, by and for San Diego.  
Recipients: Dr. Seth Mallios and Dominique Rissolo

Category: Architectural Reconstruction, for the careful reconstruction of the front porch of the George Gans Spec House #2, restoring a critical character defining feature of the home.  
Recipients: Peter Dixon and Gary Dick

Category: Architectural Restoration, for the excellent and conscientious restoration of the Naval Training Center Chapel, including the original stained glass windows, wood pews and organ pipes.  
Recipients: Heritage Architecture & Planning, The Corky McMillin Co, C.W. Clark, Inc, Nadel Architects, Legacy Building Services, and City of San Diego Redevelopment Agency

Category: Architectural Rehabilitation, for the rehabilitation of the Colonel Irving Salomon/Henry Hester apartments, a significant example of modernist architecture in San Diego.  
Recipients: McGeough LaFrance Architects, Ted Mintz, and Del Mar Heritage

Category: Architectural Rehabilitation, for the rehabilitation and good stewardship of the historic Whaley House.  
Recipient: Save Our Heritage Organisation

Category: Community History, for their efforts to preserve and protect the character, charm and historical significance of the Mission Hills community through community outreach.  
Recipients: Mission Hills Heritage

Category: Community History, for the establishment of the Islenair Historic District, a coordinated effort between the community and the City to preserve a unique element of San Diego history.  
Recipients: Patty Vaccariello, Mary Vaccariello, Jessie Sergent, Christ Hansen, Kit & Mike Lynch, Judy Smongesky, Barbara & Mark Tarvin, Helene & Bill Isbell, Teem Osborne, Raquel Llorens, Pat McTague, Donna Gillen, Lisa Ganem, Bea Avina, and Kelley Saunders

Category: Cultural Diversity, for the incorporation of Native American arts and artifacts in a permanent exhibit at the U.S. Grant Hotel, providing a multi-cultural experience to visitors.  
Recipients: Sycuan Band of the Kumeyaay Nation, Louis Guassac, and Tina Muse

Category: History, for the publication of the “Cable Cars & Ostrich Feathers” self-guided tour revealing the historic gems of the University Heights community.  
Recipient: University Heights Historical Society

Category: Individual Accomplishment, for her efforts to raise awareness of the benefits and importance of historic preservation in the Burlingame community, prompting an additional 18 properties to volunteer for designation.

Recipient: Wendy Hardy

Category: Preservation Advancement, for her unwavering leadership to SOHO as president, taking the organization to a new level of public awareness through the publication of their new magazine; and to the preservation community at large, providing years of dedicated service to the protection of San Diego's heritage.

Recipient: Beth Montes

Category: Education, for her extraordinary efforts to bring the history of Old Town San Diego alive to San Diego's school children.

Recipient: Karla Shiminski

### **ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

#### **A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information**

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Marshall and Schaefer advised staff that they would be out of town and unable to attend today's meeting. Ms. Curry identified that she would have to leave at 4:00p.m. due to an important family matter.

#### **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

##### **Contents of "Blue Folders":**

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Harrison announced that he has advised the Mayor's office that he is resigning from the Board. He has agreed to stay until a replacement for him is appointed by the Mayor's office.

#### **C. Conflict of Interest Declarations**

##### **Conflicts of Interest**

Chair Vacchi identified a conflict of interest with Item #10.

##### **Ex Parte Communications**

Boardmembers Berge and Curry greeted owners in Mission Hills but did not discuss issues related to designation.

Failure to visit designation sites (including interiors proposed for designation)/invocation of waiver

None.

#### **D. Staff Report**

Cathy Winterrowd reported that: A new book titled: North Park, A San Diego Urban Village, 1896 to 1946 by Donald Covington, has just been released telling the fascinating story of North Park's first 50 years, illustrated with more than 90 historical photographs. It is available at the

Museum of San Diego History Store in Balboa Park, North Park Main Street and on line through Sunbelt Publications. Check with northparkhistory.org for more info.

- a. HRB Staff Member Diane Kane has announced her retirement from public service. June 30, 2007 will be her last day with the City.
- b. The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, June 6.
- c. The regularly scheduled June Policy Subcommittee meeting has been cancelled by the Chair due to a lack of agenda items; the next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, July 9.
- d. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will also be held on July 9.

Today's agenda includes one referral from CCDC and one referral from Development Services, the first hearing on two historic districts, an update on the Uptown Survey, and a determination of consistency with the Standards for proposed development at the historic El Cortez. There remain 59 requests for designation from the public waiting to be reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

#### E. Requests for Continuances

CCDC has requested that Item # 6 – the Issac Lyon Building at 1479 J Street and the Issac Lyon Rental Property at 360 15<sup>th</sup> Street, which was continued From March 2007, be removed from the agenda. The property owner recently passed away and nothing will be coming forward on the property until the estate is settled. Staff supports an indefinite continuance of this item.

**Motion by Boardmember McNeely    Second by Boardmember Berge**  
**Vote:     9 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.**

#### **ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA** **None.**

#### **INFORMATION ITEM:**

#### **ITEM 5 — UPTOWN HISTORIC SURVEY**

Applicant: City of San Diego,

Location: Uptown Community, Council Districts 2 and 3

Description: Reconnaissance survey of the Uptown Community Plan Area, identifying significant architectural and cultural landscape resources.

Today's Action: Staff will provide an overview of revisions to the Uptown Historic Survey in response to comments received from the State Office of Historic Preservation and from members of the public. No action on the part of the Board is requested at this meeting.

Report Numbers: Staff Memo dated May 18, 2007.

Staff Report given by Diane Kane who described the public comments received in March 2007 on the survey and the staff response to these comments; a discussion of previous surveys and identification of potential districts; description of the evaluation tools used in the Uptown Survey; review of new language added to the survey report; and new HRB recommendations proposed by staff.

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Burnett stated she is impressed with the survey and the work that went into it. She also questioned when it would be ready for adoption since the work has been on going for several years. Boardmember Emme asked about the concept of conservation areas. Boardmember Berge was impressed with the staff responses to previous public comment. Boardmember Curry would like to have more information on conservation areas, as well.

**ACTION ITEMS****ITEM 6 – ISSAC LYON BUILDING, 1479 J STREET & ISSAC LYON RENTAL PROPERTY, 360 15<sup>th</sup> STREET (Continued from March 2007 – It is anticipated that this item will be continued indefinitely.)**

Applicant: Kathleen Crawford on behalf of Kenneth Cummings, owner, referred from the City Centre Development Corporation.

Location: 479 J Street & 360 15<sup>th</sup> Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider subject properties for historic designation.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Issac Lyon Building and the Issac Lyon Rental Property under HRB Criterion C as rare examples of Victorian commercial and residential vernacular in downtown San Diego.

Report Number: HRB-07-025 and Supplemental Staff Memo dated May 8, 2007.

This item was continued indefinitely.

**ITEM 7 – MISSION HILLS HISTORIC DISTRICT (1<sup>st</sup> HEARING)**

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: Various addresses within the intensive survey area boundaries, defined by the properties fronting on Sunset Boulevard (inclusive of 1814 Sunset Blvd through 1898 Sunset Blvd) to the north; the homes fronting Sheridan Avenue to Lyndon Road (inclusive of 1801 Sheridan Ave through 1896 Lyndon Rd and 4107 Saint James Place) to the east and south; and the properties on the east side of Saint James Place to the west, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: First hearing to consider the designation of the Mission Hills Historic District as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Review the Mission Hills Geographic/Traditional Historic District nomination; take public testimony; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; provide direction to staff regarding the content of the nomination, including the district boundary, historical context, statement of significance, period of significance, and classification of all contributing and non-contributing resources; determine whether the district nomination is complete based upon this direction; and forward to a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.

Staff Recommendation:

At this time, staff recommends that the Board:

1. Accept the proposed District Boundary, with or without further direction;

2. Accept the proposed Historical Context, with or without further direction;
3. Accept the proposed Statement of Significance, with or without further direction;
4. Accept the proposed Period of Significance, with or without further direction;
5. Review the information provided to support the establishment of Morris Irvin as a Master Builder and forward the issue to the second hearing for consideration.

6. Classify the following 56 properties as Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1808	Lyndon	443-612-08-00	5B	1870	Sheridan	443-611-20-00	5D3
1812	Lyndon	443-612-09-00	5D3	1875	Sheridan	443-612-04-00	5B
1819	Lyndon	443-650-24-00	5D3	1876	Sheridan	443-611-21-00	5D3
1820	Lyndon	443-612-10-00	5D3	1882	Sheridan	443-611-22-00	5D3
1831	Lyndon	443-650-25-00	5D3	1885	Sheridan	443-612-03-00	5D3
1833	Lyndon	443-620-10-00	5D3	1899	Sheridan	443-612-01-00	5B
1840	Lyndon	443-612-11-00	5B	1815	Sunset	443-611-12-00	5D3
1841	Lyndon	443-620-02-00	5B	1818	Sunset	443-432-20-00	5D3
1849	Lyndon	443-620-04-00	5B	1824	Sunset	443-432-18-00	5B
1850	Lyndon	443-612-13-00	5D3	1826	Sunset	443-432-17-00	5B
1853	Lyndon	443-620-05-00	5B	1829	Sunset	443-611-10-00	5B
1876	Lyndon	443-612-15-00	5D3	1830	Sunset	443-432-15-00	5D3
1877	Lyndon	443-620-17-00	5B	1835	Sunset	443-611-09-00	5B
1884	Lyndon	443-612-16-00	5D3	1836	Sunset	443-432-14-00	5B
1896	Lyndon	443-612-17-00	5D3	1845	Sunset	443-611-08-00	5B
4107	Saint James	443-611-24-00	5D3	1848	Sunset	443-432-13-00	5D3
1801	Sheridan	443-650-13-00	5B	1850	Sunset	443-432-12-00	5B
1807	Sheridan	443-650-15-00	5D3	1851	Sunset	443-611-07-00	5B
1815	Sheridan	443-650-17-00	5B	1863	Sunset	443-611-06-00	5B
1816	Sheridan	443-611-13-00	5B	1864	Sunset	443-432-11-00	5B
1824	Sheridan	443-611-14-00	5B	1870	Sunset	443-432-10-00	5B
1825	Sheridan	443-650-20-00	5D3	1871	Sunset	443-611-05-00	5B
1834	Sheridan	443-611-15-00	5D3	1875	Sunset	443-611-04-00	5B
1840	Sheridan	443-611-16-00	5B	1883	Sunset	443-611-03-00	5B
1845	Sheridan	443-612-07-00	5B	1889	Sunset	443-611-02-00	5B
1852	Sheridan	443-611-18-00	5B	1890	Sunset	443-432-07-00	5D3
1859	Sheridan	443-612-06-00	5D3	1895	Sunset	443-611-01-00	5B
1860	Sheridan	443-611-19-00	5B	1898	Sunset	443-432-05-00	5B

7. Classify the following 19 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1801	Lyndon	443-650-21-00	6Z	1823	Sheridan	443-650-19-00	6Z
1805	Lyndon	443-650-22-00	6Z	1844	Sheridan	443-611-17-00	6L
1811	Lyndon	443-650-23-00	6Z	1867	Sheridan	443-612-05-00	6L
1845	Lyndon	443-620-03-00	6Z	1889	Sheridan	443-612-02-00	6Z
1848	Lyndon	443-612-12-00	6Z	1890	Sheridan	443-611-23-00	6L
1855	Lyndon	443-620-06-00	6Z	1814	Sunset	443-432-23-00	6Z
1868	Lyndon	443-612-14-00	6Z	1821	Sunset	443-611-11-00	6L

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1875	Lyndon	443-620-18-00	6Z	1874	Sunset	443-432-09-00	6Z
1811	Sheridan	443-650-16-00	6Z	1884	Sunset	443-432-08-00	6Z
1819	Sheridan	443-650-18-00	6Z				

8. Find that the nomination is complete based upon this direction, and direct staff to docket the Mission Hills district nomination for a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.

Report Number: HRB-07-027

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders with clarification that staff provided a corrected recommendation for this item, in a memo dated May 24, 2007, to reflect the period of significance of 1908-1942, as proposed by the applicant. Staff mistakenly identified the period of significance as 1908-1941, which resulted in one property located at 1867 Sheridan Avenue classified by staff as non-contributing because it was built in 1942. That property is now recommended as a contributing resource, resulting in a recommendation of 57 contributing resources and 18 non-contributing resources.

Speakers in Favor: Janet O’Dea and Allen Hazard in support of district with some disagreements with staff recommendations regarding contributing and non-contributing resources and need for district design guidelines.

Speakers in Opposition: James Fowler (opposed to the classification of his property at 1811 Lyndon, not opposed to the historical district.)

**Boardmember Discussion:**

Boardmember Silvas was disappointed with the prehistory portion of the historical context and felt the history component was also lacking. He recommended additional work on the context to address the history of the people in the area including the Presidio, Old Town and the Native American village of Cosoy, as it relates to the development of Mission Hills. Boardmember Emme questioned how staff verified the level of property owner support and what makes Irvin a Master Builder. He stated support for staff’s use of 6Z and 6L in classifying the non-contributing properties.

Boardmember Curry supports the district and favors looking at non-contributing properties becoming contributing through restoration and rehabilitation. She suggested there be more emphasis on the history of the people in this area over time. Boardmember Harrison questioned the basis for the district boundary and expressed concern for the fiscal impact to the City if all contributing properties in the district were to be granted Mills Act agreements. He would like to support the district but is not in favor of Mills Act agreements due to the cumulative loss of revenue at a time when the City is facing a fiscal emergency. He would like to see a fiscal impact report addressing this issue. He asked the City Attorney’s office to provide a response to whether the HRB can direct the granting or not granting of a Mills Act agreement. Boardmember Berge would like to have a draft district DPR form and draft resolution of designation to review at the hearing.

**Motion by Boardmember Berge to accept the district boundary as proposed by staff.  
Second by Boardmember Eisenhart.**

**Board Discussion of Motion:**

Boardmember Curry left the meeting prior to any vote on this item.

Boardmember Eisenhart also has concerns with the number of Mills Act agreements and potential fiscal impact to the City. He agrees that the report needs more discussion of the area history, particularly related to development around the canyons. Boardmember McNeely is in favor of the district and is concerned about the boundary, specifically around St. James Place. Boardmember Harrison also expressed concerns about the boundary.

**Vote on Motion: 7 in favor, 1 opposed (Silvas) and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Berge to accept the period of significance as proposed by staff. Second by Boardmember Burnett.**

**Vote on Motion: 7 in favor, 1 opposed (Silvas) and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Harrison to revise the context statement to include Native American and early historic settlement of the area including the Spanish and Mexican Periods of history. Second by Boardmember Eisenhart.**

**Vote on Motion: 8 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Berge to accept the statement of significance as proposed by staff. Second by Boardmember Eisenhart.**

**Vote on Motion: 8 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Berge to forward consideration of Morris Irvin as a Master Builder to a second hearing with more information provided by staff. Second by Boardmember Harrison.**

**Vote on Motion: 8 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

Additional Board Discussion of proposed contributing and non-contributing properties: Chair Vacchi requested discussion of status code for 1811 Lyndon due to owner comments during public testimony. Boardmember McNeely felt that the alterations to this property are not substantial based on her review of the building record and they may not have significantly altered the resource. She further stated that the historic bricks are significant. Boardmember Berge stated that the draft Uptown Survey classified the property as 5D3, heavily altered, which she supports although she agrees that the porch infill creates a problem with integrity. Boardmember Emme observed that it would be difficult to restore without a historic photo and that it should not be designated as a contributor if there has been a major modification to the historic character. Boardmember Eisenhart supports a status code of 6L, making it a non-contributor for now, with the possibility of restoration.



**Motion by Boardmember Eisenhart to classify 1811 Lyndon as a 6L non-contributor. Second by Boardmember Burnett.**

**Vote on Motion: 7 in favor, 1 opposed (Emme) and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

Additional Board Discussion:

Boardmember Eisenhart suggested classifying 1848 Lyndon as a contributing resource as the second story addition was well done and did not affect the footprint. Boardmember Berge pointed out that the draft Uptown Survey identified this property as 6Z heavily altered. Ms. Saunders stated that the massing and scale of the house changed with an addition in 1991. Boardmember Eisenhart withdrew his suggestion. He requested staff look for more information about 1884 Sunset prior to next meeting to help determine its appropriate classification.

**Motion by Boardmember Eisenhart to classify 1805 Lyndon as a 6L non-contributor. Second by Boardmember Berge.**

**Vote on Motion: 7 in favor, 1 opposed (Emme) and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Emme to accept the classification of 57 properties as contributing resources as proposed by staff. Second by Boardmember Berge.**

**Vote on Motion: 8 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Burnett to accept the classification of 18 properties as non-contributing resources as proposed by staff and revised by the HRB in earlier motions and to forward the district nomination to a second hearing. Second by Boardmember Berge.**

**Vote on Motion: 8 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

## **ITEM 8 – FORT STOCKTON LINE HISTORIC DISTRICT (1<sup>st</sup> HEARING)**

Applicant: Barry Hager and Scott Sandel

Location: Various addresses within the intensive survey area boundaries, defined by the properties fronting on West Lewis Street transitioning to Fort Stockton Drive between Stephens Street and Trias Street (including 4244 and 4247 Saint James Place, 4250 and 4251 Sierra Vista, 4249 Arden Way, 4390 and 4430 Witherby Street, and 4391, 4405 and 4435 Trias Street), as well as the properties on the southwest side of Pine Street between Witherby and Trias Streets, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: First hearing to consider the designation of the Fort Stockton Line Historic District as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Review the Fort Stockton Line Geographic/Traditional Historic District nomination; take public testimony; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; provide direction to staff regarding the content of the nomination, including the district boundary, historical context, statement of significance, period of significance, and classification of all contributing and non-contributing resources; determine whether the district nomination is complete based upon this direction; and forward to a second HRB hearing for designation as a

historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.

**Staff Recommendation:**

At this time, staff recommends that the Board:

1. Accept the proposed District Boundary, with or without further direction;
2. Accept the proposed Historical Context, with or without further direction;
3. Accept the proposed Statement of Significance, with or without further direction;
4. Accept the proposed Period of Significance, with or without further direction;
5. Classify the following 79 properties as Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
4249	Arden Way	44342201	5D3	2212	Fort Stockton Drive	44325012	5D3
1787	Fort Stockton Drive	44343224	5B	2220	Fort Stockton Drive	44325011	5D3
1797	Fort Stockton Drive	44343222	5B	2227	Fort Stockton Drive	44325103	5D3
1799	Fort Stockton Drive	44343221	5B	2235	Fort Stockton Drive	44325102	5D3
1800	Fort Stockton Drive	44343117	5B	2236	Fort Stockton Drive	44325009	5B
1802	Fort Stockton Drive	44343118	5B	2245	Fort Stockton Drive	44325101	5B
1804	Fort Stockton Drive	44343119	5D3	2252	Fort Stockton Drive	44325007	5B
1811	Fort Stockton Drive	44343216	5B	2255	Fort Stockton Drive	44306163	5B
1816	Fort Stockton Drive	44343120	5D3	2258	Fort Stockton Drive	44325006	5B
1830	Fort Stockton Drive	44343121	5D3	2260	Fort Stockton Drive	44325005	5B
1834	Fort Stockton Drive	44343109	5B	2265	Fort Stockton Drive	44306164	5B
1835	Fort Stockton Drive	44343226	5B	2271	Fort Stockton Drive	44306165	5B
1845	Fort Stockton Drive	44343227	5B	2276	Fort Stockton Drive	44325002	5D3
1854	Fort Stockton Drive	44343105	5B	2277	Fort Stockton Drive	44306166	5D3
1855	Fort Stockton Drive	44343228	5B	2285	Fort Stockton Drive	44306167	5B
1859	Fort Stockton Drive	44343229	5D3	2215	Pine Street	44325024	5B
1860	Fort Stockton Drive	44343103	5D3	2225	Pine Street	44325023	5D3
1866	Fort Stockton Drive	44343102	5B	2231	Pine Street	44325022	5D3
1867	Fort Stockton Drive	44343230	5D3	2271	Pine Street	44325017	5B
1883	Fort Stockton Drive	44343231	5D3	2281	Pine Street	44325016	5D3
1918	Fort Stockton Drive	44327023	5D3	4244	Saint James Place	44342223	5B
1920	Fort Stockton Drive	44327024	5D3	4247	Saint James Place	44343201	5B
2008	Fort Stockton Drive	44325042	5D3	4391	Trias Street	44306168	5D3
2019	Fort Stockton Drive	44325117	5D3	4405	Trias Street	44325001	5B
2020	Fort Stockton Drive	44325041	5D3	4435	Trias Street	44325014	5B
2025	Fort Stockton Drive	44325116	5D3	1705	West Lewis Street	44346211	5B
2031	Fort Stockton Drive	44325115	5B	1706	West Lewis Street	44346115	5D3
2035	Fort Stockton Drive	44325114	5D3	1714	West Lewis Street	44346116	5D3
2038	Fort Stockton Drive	44325040	5D3	1715	West Lewis Street	44346212	5D3
2107	Fort Stockton Drive	44325113	5D3	1720	West Lewis Street	44346117	5D3
2110	Fort Stockton Drive	44325050	5D3	1731	West Lewis Street	44346214	5D3
2115	Fort Stockton Drive	44325112	5D3	1732	West Lewis Street	44346119	5B
2121	Fort Stockton Drive	44325111	5D3	1744	West Lewis Street	44346120	5D3
2127	Fort Stockton Drive	44325110	5B	1752	West Lewis Street	44346121	5B
2138	Fort Stockton Drive	44325053	5D3	1753	West Lewis Street	44346201	5B

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
2139	Fort Stockton Drive	44325109	5D3	1760	West Lewis Street	44346122	5D3
2147	Fort Stockton Drive	44325108	5D3	1770	West Lewis Street	44346123	5D3
2151	Fort Stockton Drive	44325107	5D3	1778	West Lewis Street	44346124	5B
2154	Fort Stockton Drive	44325055	5B	4390	Witherby Street	44325106	5B
2206	Fort Stockton Drive	44325013	5B				5D3

6. Classify the following 30 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1775	Fort Stockton Drive	44343225	6L	2244	Fort Stockton Drive	44325008	6Z
1801	Fort Stockton Drive	44343219	6L	2268	Fort Stockton Drive	44325004	6L
1846	Fort Stockton Drive	44343106	6Z	2274	Fort Stockton Drive	44325003	6Z
1887	Fort Stockton Drive	44343202	6L	2205	Pine Street	44325025	6Z
1913	Fort Stockton Drive	44342222	6L	2241	Pine Street	44325021	6Z
1914	Fort Stockton Drive	44327002	6L	2251	Pine Street	44325020	6Z
2005	Fort Stockton Drive	44325119	6Z	2255	Pine Street	44325019	6Z
2015	Fort Stockton Drive	44325118	6Z	2265	Pine Street	44325018	6Z
2042	Fort Stockton Drive	44325039	6Z	2285	Pine Street	44325015	6L
2114	Fort Stockton Drive	44325051	6L	4250	Sierra Vista	44327001	6L
2124	Fort Stockton Drive	44325052	6Z	4251	Sierra Vista	44343101	6L
2146	Fort Stockton Drive	44325054	6Z	1717	West Lewis Street	44346213	6L
2211	Fort Stockton Drive	44325105	6L	1728	West Lewis Street	44346118	6Z
2221	Fort Stockton Drive	44325104	6Z	1739	West Lewis Street	44346203	6Z
2228	Fort Stockton Drive	44325010	6Z	4430	Witherby Street	44325026	6L

7. Find that the district nomination is complete based upon this direction, and direct staff to docket the Fort Stockton Line district nomination for a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district.

If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.  
Report Number: HRB-07-028

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

Speakers in Favor: Barry Hager and Scott Sandel in support of district with some disagreements with staff recommendations regarding contributing and non-contributing resources and need for district design guidelines.

Speakers in Opposition: None.

Board discussion:

Boardmembers Curry, Silvas and McNeely were not present during this item.

Boardmember Berge stated she believes 4150 Sierra Vista is a very early English cottage revival and should be classified as a contributing resource.

**Motion by Boardmember Harrison to accept the district boundary; accept the context statement with the exception of the early history and settlement discussion, which**

**should be revised to better reflect the prehistory and settlement of the area; accept the statement of significance; and accept the period of significance, as proposed by staff. Second by Boardmember Burnett.**

**Vote on Motion: 6 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Emme stated an issue with 1715 West Lewis and 4390 Witherby regarding integrity and suggests that a status code of 6L would be more appropriate. Boardmember Eisenhart agrees that 1715 West Lewis is a non-contributor but does not agree that 4930 Witherby is a non-contributor.

**Motion by Boardmember Eisenhart to classify the property at 1715 West Lewis as a 6L non-contributor. Second by Boardmember Berge.**

**Vote on Motion: 6 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Harrison reiterated his concern about loss of revenue to the City through granting of Mills Act agreements to all contributing resources in the district.

**Motion by Boardmember Harrison to accept all contributing resources, as proposed by staff, with the exception of 1715 West Lewis Street and 4390 Witherby. Second by Boardmember Burnett.**

**Vote on Motion: 6 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Berge to classify the property at 4250 Sierra Vista as a 5D3 contributor. Second by Boardmember Burnett.**

**Vote on Motion: 5 in favor, 1 opposed (Emme) and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Eisenhart to classify the property at 2221 Fort Stockton as a 6L non-contributor. Second by Boardmember Burnett.**

**Vote on Motion: 5 in favor, 1 opposed (Emme) and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Eisenhart to classify the property at 2015 Fort Stockton as a 6L non-contributor. Second by Boardmember Berge.**

**Vote on Motion: 5 in favor, 1 opposed (Emme) and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Berge to accept all non-contributing resources as proposed by staff, with the exception of 4150 Sierra Vista, and with the modification of the status codes for 2221 Fort Stockton and 2015 Fort Stockton and the inclusion of 1715 West Lewis Street as non-contributing, as modified by previous motions. Second by Boardmember Emme.**

**Vote on Motion: 6 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Emme to classify the property at 4390 Witherby as a non-contributing resource. Second by Boardmember Burnett.**

**Vote on Motion: 2 in favor, 4 opposed (Berge, Eisenhart, Harrison, Vacchi) and 0 abstentions. Motion fails.**

**Motion by Boardmember Eisenhart to classify the property at 4390 Witherby as a contributing resource, as proposed by staff. Second by Boardmember Berge.**

**Vote on Motion: 5 in favor, 1 opposed (Emme) and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**Motion by Boardmember Eisenhart to accept the nomination and forward it to a second hearing. Second by Boardmember Emme.**

**Vote on Motion: 6 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

### **ITEM 9 –SPINDRIFT ARCHAEOLOGICAL SITE #3**

Applicant: Brian Malk and Nancy Heitel owners, referred from Development Services

Location: 1905 Spindrift, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1905 Spindrift Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the property located at 1905 Spindrift Drive as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A, exemplifying and reflecting special elements of the City's historical, archaeological and cultural development.

Report Number: HRB-07-029

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd.

Speakers in Favor: Scott Moomjian representing the owner. Mr. Moomjian stated that the owner does not oppose designation of the site for its archaeological and cultural significance and requested the City's help in allowing the Mills Act tax reduction benefits to apply to the property.

Speakers in Opposition: None.

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Emme questioned the importance of the site given the amount of disturbance from existing development. Boardmember Harrison stated that it is important to determine how best to treat the resource in terms of cultural sensitivity. Boardmember Silvas indicated a desire for an acknowledgement of Native American occupation of the area as part of a Mills Act agreement through a plaque or signage. Chair Vacchi would like the Mills Act question explored. Boardmember Emme suggested looking at how other cities address archaeology sites and Mills Act agreements.

**Motion by Boardmember Burnett to designate the site based on the staff recommendation. Second by Boardmember Berge.**

**Vote on Motion: 8 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

**ITEM 10 — PROPOSED PROJECT AT 777 BEECH STREET, ADJACENT TO THE EL CORTEZ HOTEL, HRB SITE #269 (Trailed from April 2007)**

Applicant: Centre City Development Corporation

Location: 777 Beech Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Review proposed project for compliance with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The specific Standards for Rehabilitation that apply to the proposed new structure are Standards 2, 9 and 10.

Today's Action: Determine whether or not the proposed construction at 777 Beech Street meets the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with respect to the adjacent historically-designated El Cortez.

Staff Recommendation: Find that the proposed 777 Beach Street project is not consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with respect to the adjacent, historically designated El Cortez building, located at 702 Ash Street.

Report Number: HRB-07-026, dated April 12, 2007 and Supplemental Staff Memo dated May 10, 2007

Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

**Speakers in Favor:** Janet O'Dea, Anne Porter, Rita Collier, Barry Bruins, Amy Roth, Robert C. Wood, Max Coates, Pat Cook, Ross Porter, and Kathy Casey. Additional individuals gave their time to the speakers who presented individual testimony and organized presentations in favor of the staff recommendation and opposed to the proposed project.

**Speakers in Opposition:** Michael Zucchet, representing the owner, provided a PowerPoint presentation addressing the overall project and in opposition to the staff recommendation.

**Boardmember Discussion:**

Boardmembers Curry and Silvas were not present for this item.

Boardmember Harrison stated that the HRB cannot permanently prevent some construction at this site. The issue to him is to review the proposed building in light of some other building going forward. Boardmember Eisenhart stated that the tower on the proposed building overpowers the El Cortez. Boardmember Burnett expressed that the historic massing of adjacent properties is appropriate for this site. Boardmember Berge agreed with Mr. Eisenhart and the staff

recommendation and felt the proposal was overwhelming and dominating in its scale and massing. Boardmember McNeely feels the new building does protect the El Cortez and that development downtown is inevitable. Boardmember Emme stated he felt the proposed project was not consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards #2 and particularly #9. Boardmember Burnett agreed that the project is not consistent with the Standards and would prefer public open space at the site instead of a new building. Boardmember Harrison believes the new building can become part of the fabric of the City over time.

**Motion by Boardmember Eisenhart that the proposed 777 Beach Street project is not consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with respect to the adjacent, historically designated El Cortez building, located at 702 Ash Street. Second by Boardmember Berge.**

**Vote on Motion: 4 in favor, 2 opposed (Harrison, McNeely) and 0 abstentions. Motion passes.**

The meeting was adjourned at 7:38 p.m.