

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JULY 26, 2007  
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING  
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR  
202 C STREET  
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Vice Chairperson Emme at 1:05 p.m.

Chairperson	Robert Vacchi	Absent
Vice Chairperson	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Laura Burnett	Absent
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	John Eisenhart	Present
Boardmember	Donald Harrison	Absent
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Delores Johnson, Board Secretary  
Jacqueline Dominguez, Clerical Assistant  
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner  
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner  
Mike Tudury, Senior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1A - MINUTES OF MAY 24, 2007**

The Minutes of May 24, 2007 were not available for approval.

**ITEM 1B - MINUTES OF JUNE 28, 2007**

The Minutes of June 28, 2007 were not available for approval.

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

Nicole Purvis announced that two classes are being offered through San Diego State University, The Introduction to Historic Preservation and American Architectural History.

**ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

**A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

- **Absences:**  
Boardmembers Vacchi, Burnett, Curry and Harrison notified Staff that they would not be able to attend the meeting. Boardmember Silvas advised Staff he may be out of town for work.
- **Other General Information:**  
Boardmembers "Blue Folders" contained information from the University of California along with several letters and emails related to Item 6 on today's agenda.
- **General Board Member Comments:**  
Boardmember Marshall reported that he wrote a postcard history book related to Balboa Park. The book will be for sale in most stores in Balboa Park.

## **B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

- **Conflict of Interest:**  
Boardmember Schaefer declared a conflict of interest on Item 6. Boardmember Marshall declared a conflict of interest on Items 8 through 15. The Board no longer had a quorum on Item 6 and Items 8 through 15 and therefore could not conduct business on those items.

Ms. Winterrowd noted that the Board will not be able to provide comments on Item 6, the National Register Nomination, because the next regularly scheduled HRB meeting will be held on August 23, 2007, which follows the State's meeting on that item.

Boardmember Berge inquired if the HRB could have a special meeting prior to the State's deadline to provide comments on Item 6. Vice Chairperson Emme solicited a motion to have a special meeting on Item 6. No motion was made.

Items 8 through 15 will be trailed to the next regularly scheduled meeting on August 23, 2007.

### **Ex Parte Communications:**

None.

- **Failure to visit designation sites (including interiors proposed for designation)/invocation of waiver:**  
Vice Chairperson Emme said he did not visit the interior site on the agenda (Item #21), as time got away from him, but he believes the photographs provided are adequate for him to make a determination to address the interior. Boardmember Berge moved that the HRB invoke the waiver on Item 5 for Chairperson Pro Tem Emme. The motion was seconded and unanimously approved.

## **C. STAFF REPORT**

### **Announcements:**

- a. Staffing Announcements: Introduce Tricia Olsen new Intern; Delores Johnson is retiring from the City in August; Jackie Dominguez will be filling in until the position can be filled.
- b. HRB Workshop on San Diego Modernism – Monday, August 6, 3:00 to 4:30, CAB12 Committee Room; will count toward CLG training; invite Modernism Committees of the AIA and SOHO; Consultant under contract for the Modernism Context Statement will present an overview of their work to date; Staff is soliciting additional information from knowledgeable individuals about the Modernism Architecture of San Diego, in particular the history of the movement and its historical context in the overall development of San Diego from 1935 to 1970.
- c. HRB Annual Retreat scheduled for Saturday, September 15, 2007 at the Santa Fe Room of the Balboa Park Club, 9:15am to 2:30pm.
- d. Next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, August 1, 2007
- e. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, September 10. The Modernism workshop will take the place of a Policy Subcommittee meeting for August
- f. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will also be held on September 10 Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes nine referrals from Development Services, seven voluntary designations of contributing resources in the Burlingame District, eight individual homeowner nominations, the Historic Building Interiors Ad Hoc Subcommittee Report to the full Board, and review and comment of a National Register nomination. There remain 49 requests for designation from the public submitted in 2006 waiting to be reviewed by Staff and brought forward for designation.

**Marianne Greene delivered three City Attorney opinions on the following items:**

**1) Can the HRB designate a historic property with the condition that it not be granted any Mills Act tax relief or limit the tax relief?**

The answer is no. The HRB is advisory to Council. The Charter of San Diego vests in the City Council the authority to enter into contracts; it does not vest that authority in the Board. Also, Council Policy 700-46, adopting the Mills Act program, does not delegate such contractual authority to the HRB.

**2) What is the HRB's role relative to historic surveys?**

The Land Development Code, Section 111.02069, enables the Board to recommend to City Council and Planning Commission procedures to use the historical resources inventory results in the planning process. The HRB's duties do not include the power to adopt historical resources survey. The HRB is established by the City Council to identify, designate and preserve the historical resources of the City, to review and make a Recommendation to the appropriate decision making authority on applications for permits and other matters, such as demolitions, destruction etc., and to recommend to the City Council and Planning Commission procedures to facilitate to the use of the historical resources inventory results in the planning process, in accordance with Section 111.02069 of the Land Development Code. The language clearly states that a part of the Board's powers and duties is to recommend to the Council the use of the surveys for planning purposes, however no where in the code does it mention the HRB's power to adopt a survey without Council's approval.

**3) Can a non-commercial property, owned by an association or corporation that is religiously affiliated (i.e. a church), exempt itself from historical preservation laws by a vote of the congregation, that such laws will result in a substantial hardship in the association or corporation?**

The answer is yes. In the government code Section 25373D, there is no indication that the courts have interpreted this particular government code section to require a particular procedure by which a religious organization must proceed in order to obtain the exemption.

**D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

ITEM 6 – SDM-W-12 LOCUS A (SDI-4669) NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION  
There was discussion on whether or not to hear public testimony on Item 6 as a courtesy to those present for this particular item, in light of the conflicting HRB and State meeting dates that will result in the inability of the Board to provide comments on the item

Boardmember Marshall moved to hear public testimony on Item 6, in the order the item is listed on the agenda, as an information-only item, without Board discussion, debate or deliberation. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Eisenhart. The motion was approved 5-0-1. Boardmember Schafer abstained.

CHEL Holdings has requested their eight items be continued:

- ITEM 8 – WILLIAM AND NELL CRONAN HOUSE at 2950 and 2950A Sixth Avenue
- ITEM 9 – DR. FRANCIS AND FLORENCE MEAD HOUSE at 3330 Sixth Avenue
- ITEM 10 – FREDERICK F. THOMAS HOUSE at 540 Thorn Street
- ITEM 11 – GUARDIAN LIFE/SKIDMORE, OWINGS AND MERRILL OFFICE BUILDING at 2901 Fifth Avenue
- ITEM 12 – JOHN SINKS HOUSE at 3340 Sixth Avenue
- ITEM 13 – SOLAR APARTMENT BUILDING at 504 Thorn Street
- ITEM 14 – JACOB PRICE SPEC HOUSE at 2900 Sixth Avenue
- ITEM 15 – CLARA SHRIER AND BLANCHE L. EHRENBERG BUILDING at 516-522 Thorn Street

**ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA:**

The following items are non-controversial with all parties agreeable to the Staff Recommendations, and the Board may wish to approve them on consent:

- ITEM 7A – G – BURLINGAME VOLUNTARY/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT, UPDATE 8 properties at 2454 Capitan Avenue, 2464 Capitan Avenue, 2405 Dulzura Avenue, 3061 Kalmia Street, 3178 Maple Street, 2524 San Marcos Avenue \*\* note: the property owner at 2404 San Marcos withdrew his request for designation; the Agenda correctly does not include this property as part of Item #7 but the Staff report included it
- ITEM 16 – FRANKLIN AND HELEN BOULTER/MARTIN V. MELHORN HOUSE at 4119 Palmetto Way

- ITEM 17 – J. B. DRAPER SPEC HOUSE #1 at 3563 28<sup>th</sup> Street
- ITEM 18 – HAROLD AND CHARLOTTE MUIR HOUSE at 1205 Muirlands Drive
- ITEM 19 – THE PACIFIC BUILDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #2 at 1517 Granada Avenue
- ITEM 20 – SAM AND MARY MCPHERSON/RALPH E. HURLBURT AND CHARLES H. TIFAL HOUSE at 3133 28<sup>th</sup> Street
- ITEM 21 – LAURA M. AND JAMES R. LUTTRELL HOUSE at 938 20<sup>th</sup> Street
- ITEM 22 – HEILMAN BROTHERS SPEC HOUSE # 1 at 3215 Granada Avenue

**Requests for Withdrawals from the Consent Agenda:**

ITEM 7A-G - Boardmember Berge requested the item pulled for discussion.

ITEM 17 - Boardmember Berge requested the item pulled for discussion.

ITEM 18 - Boardmember Berge requested the item pulled for discussion.

ITEM 19 - Boardmember Marshall disagreed with Staff Recommendation and requested the item pulled for discussion.

**BOARD ACTION:** Boardmember McNeely moved that Items 16, 20, 21 & 22 be approved on consent. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Marshall. The motion was approved 6-0-0.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** Wayne Peterson, spoke on Item 16 and thanked the Board for the favorable vote on his home.

Lisa Barnes spoke on Item 22 and thanked the Board for recognizing her Craftsman home.

**ACTION ITEMS**

**ITEM 5 – HISTORIC BUILDING INTERIORS AD HOC SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT TO THE HRB**

Applicant: CP&CI, Urban Form Division

Location: Citywide

Description: Review the Recommendations of the Historic Building Interiors Ad Hoc Subcommittee.

Today's Action: Accept the subcommittee's Recommendations or return specific issues to the subcommittee for additional work with specific direction.

Staff Recommendation: Accept the subcommittee's Recommendations.

Report Number: HRB-07-037

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd.

Cathy Winterrowd reported that the Historic Building Interiors Ad Hoc Subcommittee developed Recommendations addressing eight topics related to historic interior spaces. The Recommendations are provided in detail in the Staff report. Ms. Winterrowd summarized the Recommendations as follows: Recommendation to use existing and draft documents and

procedures to incorporate the analysis, access to designation and treatment of interiors; Interiors should be addressed under HRB Criterion C; Homeowners should have the ability to voluntarily request designation of interior spaces; There is the need for the interior to be of exceptional significance in order to designate it without owner agreement; There is the need for interiors of public buildings and publicly accessible interior spaces to be addressed in the research report and Staff Recommendation; The desire, but not requirement for Board members to visit the interior spaces in order to designate them, unless it is only the interior that is being considered for designation, then viewing of the interior would be required. Staff concurs with all of the Recommendations and the implementation proposed by the subcommittee and recommends that the full Board accept these Recommendations as proposed. Staff and the Board can immediately implement those Recommendations that do not require formal revisions to adopted or draft documents. It is anticipated that Staff can return to the HRB with implementation of the remaining Recommendations at the November hearing.

Mr. Marshall thanked the Interior Ad Hoc Subcommittee members, Pricilla Berge, Robert Vacchi, Marsha Sewell and Bruce Coons. Mr. Marshall said that this process was not to institute new requirements, regulations or codes, it was to create a process that enables the HRB to consider interiors and to recognize their importance in those cases where it is warranted, to protect the interiors of historic buildings.

### **Open public testimony**

#### **In Favor:**

Bruce Coons echoed what was already said. Even though it was always available to designated interiors, it is good to have set of criteria and guidelines to follow and to encourage more interior preservation. Mr. Coons encouraged the adoption of these regulations and added that hopefully more people will be volunteering their interiors to be designated.

#### **In Opposition:**

None.

**BOARD DISCUSSION:** Mr. Schaefer said the policies are well thought out and balanced and he is in full support.

**BOARD ACTION:** Boardmember Marshall moved that the HRB adopt the Staff Recommendation to accept the subcommittee recommendations for Item 5, Historic Building Interiors Ad Hoc Subcommittee Report, and that Staff Report HRB-07-037 be added to the existing documents as an attachment. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Berge. The motion was approved 6-0-0.

### **ITEM 6 – SDM-W-12 LOCUS A (SDI-4669) NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION**

**Applicant:** Patricia Dalhberg and Don Schmidt on behalf of the La Jolla Historical Society, not the property owner

**Location:** *Address Restricted*, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Review the nomination of SDM-W-12 Locus A (SDI-4669) for listing on the National Register and provide comments to the Office of Historic Preservation.

Today's Action: Review and comment on the nomination of SDM-W-12 Locus A (SDI-4669) for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.

Staff Recommendation: Provide comments in support of listing SDM-W-12 Locus A (SDI-4669) on the National Register of Historic Places.

Report Number: HRB-07-036

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd.

Item 6 was withdrawn from the agenda due to lack of a quorum, however, the Board resolved to hear public testimony on the item, as an information-only item, without Board discussion, debate or deliberation. Mr. Schaefer dismissed himself from the meeting.

### **Open public testimony**

#### **In Favor:**

Don Schmidt, representing the La Jolla Historical Society, said although this particular nomination is prepared for National Register Criteria A and D, they also believe the house on this site is worthy of designation. In October 2004, the La Jolla Historical Society Board voted to oppose the demolition of this residence that sits on the site and any disturbance of the site. After trying to work with UCSD to convince them not to destroy the house and dig up the property, the Society came to the conclusion that the only way to preserve this site was to have it put on the National Register of Historic Places.

Richard Karako discussed the designation under Criterion A and the importance of acknowledging Native American traditional values in general.

Milt Fegley, Director of Community Planning at UCSD, commented that the action before the HRB today was to be to review and comment on this proposal. Mr. Fegley said UCSD recognizes the importance of this site and the University has prepared a comprehensive report that speaks to that point and that conclusion. Mr. Fegley expressed concerns that the presentation of this item to this Board has resulted in the public disclosure of the location of the site, and this is inconsistent with both law and practice, and he trusts that it will not occur again in the future.

Ron May, of Legacy of 106, said there is sufficient evidence to support a National Register Nomination under Criterion D, regardless of arguments about where the boundary of the site is, because the portion that they do have information on is more than sufficient.

Patricia Dahlberg of the La Jolla Historical Society, said that although we are discussing the National Register Criterion A and D today, the Society will be back to talk about the National Register's criterion for the historic designation of the house itself, called in today's report a non-contributing member.

Bruce Coons of SOHO, said the site is an extremely important archeological site, but it is also the only known adobe William Lunkin house in San Diego County.

**In Opposition:**

None.

**ITEM 7A – G – BURLINGAME VOLUNTARY/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT, UPDATE 8, DESIGNATION OF CONTRIBUTING RESOURCES NOT PREVIOUSLY VOLUNTEERED**

Applicant: Robert R. Young, Michael M. Del Campo, Aida Casares, David & Erin Armstrong, Stephen Olds & Penelope Wolfe Olds, Chris & Rebekah Lugo

Location: 2454 Capitan Avenue, 2464 Capitan Avenue, 2405 Dulzura Avenue, 3061 Kalmia Street, 3178 Maple Street, 2524 San Marcos Avenue, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the listed properties as contributing resources to the Burlingame Voluntary/Traditional Historical District.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: (1) Designate the properties located at 2454 Capitan Avenue; 2464 Capitan Avenue; 2405 Dulzura Avenue; 3061 Kalmia Street; 3178 Maple Street; 2524 San Marcos Avenue as contributing properties to the Burlingame Voluntary/Traditional Historical District under HRB Criterion F. (2) If the threshold of 85% of potentially contributing properties designated as contributing properties as part of the Burlingame Voluntary/Traditional Historical District is achieved, direct Staff to begin the process of establishing a Burlingame Geographic/Traditional Historical District and return the item to the full HRB for a noticed public hearing.

Report Number: HRB-07-038

Ms. Saunders noted that 2404 San Marcos Street does not appear on the agenda, due to the applicant withdrawing their request for designation at this time.

**Open public testimony**

**In Favor:**

Connie DiGirolamo spoke on the issue of voluntary traditional historic districts. Ms. DiGirolamo expressed concerns that a potentially contributing resource located at 3150 Maple Street, was lost due to a demolition permit issued by the City. The property was located on a significant corner in the neighborhood, and it appeared that no consideration was given to the voluntary historic district during the permit phase. Ms. DiGirolamo said it is very important that the City review its policies and procedures to make certain that historical properties and districts are protected in the future. Ms. DiGirolamo expressed support of the Staff Recommendation to begin the process of establishing a Burlingame Traditional Historic District.

Hank Sullivan, of Dulzura Avenue, said it was a shock to the entire neighborhood to see the 3150 Maple Street house destroyed. Mr. Sullivan supported moving forward with designation

for those homes that were not previously volunteered and also with designating Burlingame for a Geographic Historic District.

Mr. Chris Lugo, of 2524 San Marcos Avenue, informed the Board of his intentions to redo the vinyl windows of his property to original wood.

Bruce Koons, Executive Director of SOHO, said this is a very important district that should never have been a voluntary district and expressed support in moving this to a traditional district.

**In Opposition:**

None.

**BOARD DISCUSSION:**

Boardmember Marshall said he strongly supported Staff going forward with establishing it as a Traditional Geographic District, but was not in support of including 2405 Dulzura and 3178 Maple in the district at this time.

Boardmember Berge said it appears that the front façade of 3061 Kalmia Street has been dramatically altered. Boardmember McNeely agreed with Boardmember Berge, that the roof line has been added to and also the windows do not appear to be the original ones.

**BOARD ACTION:**

Boardmember Marshall moved to support Staff Recommendation to include in the district 2454 Capitan, 2464 Capitan and 2524 San Marcos and also directed Staff to begin the process of establishing Burlingame as a Traditional Geographic Historic District. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Berge. The motion was approved 6-0-0.

Boardmember Marshall moved to not designate 2405 Dulzura Avenue, based on alterations and loss of integrity. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Berge. The motion was approved 6-0-0.

Boardmember Berge moved to not designate 3061 Kalmia Street. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Marshall. The motion was approved 6-0-0.

Boardmember Marshall moved to not designate 3178 Maple Street. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Berge and approved 6-0-0.

**ADDITIONAL BOARD ACTION:**

At the end of the meeting and after review of the DAS Meeting Notes, Mr. Marshall informed the Board that the Design Assistance Subcommittee came to a consensus to support designation of 3178 Maple Street as is, with a Mills Act requirement with a one year deadline, to remove the tile canopy and replace it with something more temporary, like a canvas awning. Mr. Marshall suggested the Board could support designation as is, and follow up with a Mills Act requirement.

Boardmember Marshall moved that 3178 Maple Street be docketed for the next meeting, to reconsider designation and Mills Act conditions. The motion was seconded by Boardmember McNeely. The motion was approved 4-2 (Eisenhart, Emme)-0.

**ITEM 8 - WILLIAM AND NELL CRONAN HOUSE**

Applicant: CHEL Holdings, Ltd, owner (referral from Development Services)

Location: 2950 and 2950A Sixth Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the William and Nell Cronan House located at 2950A Sixth Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William and Nell Cronan House, located at 2950A Sixth Avenue as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Spanish Revival architecture. Staff is also recommending that the rear 1936 duplex unit which was expanded and converted to medical offices in 1954 (currently addressed at 2950 Sixth Avenue) be excluded from the designation.

Report Number: HRB-07-039

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

**ITEM 8 - WITHDRAWN FROM THE AGENDA DUE TO LACK OF A QUORUM.**

**ITEM 9 – DR. FRANCIS AND FLORENCE MEAD HOUSE**

Applicant: CHEL Holdings, Ltd, owner (referral from Development Services)

Location: 3330 Sixth Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House located at 3330 Sixth Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Dr. Francis and Florence Mead House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion B for its association with historically significant individuals Dr. Francis and Florence Mead.

Report Number: HRB-07-040

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

**ITEM 9 - WITHDRAWN FROM THE AGENDA DUE TO LACK OF A QUORUM.**

**ITEM 10 – FREDERICK F. THOMAS HOUSE**

Applicant: CHEL Holdings, Ltd, owner (referral from Development Services)

Location: 540 Thorn Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Frederick F. Thomas House located at 540 Thorn Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Frederick F. Thomas House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent and unique example of Tudor Revival-influenced Craftsman architecture incorporating ashlar stone, rarely used to such a degree in extant residential architecture within the City.

Report Number: HRB-07-041

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

**ITEM 10 - WITHDRAWN FROM THE AGENDA DUE TO LACK OF A QUORUM.**

**ITEM 11 – GUARDIAN LIFE/SKIDMORE, OWINGS AND MERRILL OFFICE BUILDING**

Applicant: CHEL Holdings, Ltd, owner (referral from Development Services)

Location: 2901 Fifth Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Guardian Life/Skidmore, Owings and Merrill Office Building located at 2901 Fifth Avenue, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Guardian Life/ Skidmore, Owings and Merrill Office Building located at 2901 Fifth Avenue as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as the structure embodies distinctive characteristics of the Modern style of architecture including simplicity of form, function, detailing and materials and under HRB Criterion D for its association with the Master Architectural firm of Skidmore, Owings and Merrill.

Report Number: HRB-07-042

Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

**ITEM 11 - WITHDRAWN FROM THE AGENDA DUE TO LACK OF A QUORUM.**

**ITEM 12 – JOHN SINKS HOUSE**

Applicant: CHEL Holdings, Ltd, owner (referral from Development Services)

Location: 3340 Sixth Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the John Sinks House located at 3340 Sixth Avenue as a historic resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John Sinks House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C due to the house's primarily intact original historic form and fabric evidencing characteristics of the Craftsman style, exclusive of the separate two-story residential structure at the rear of the lot.

Report Number: HRB-07-043

Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

**ITEM 12 - WITHDRAWN FROM THE AGENDA DUE TO LACK OF A QUORUM**

**ITEM 13 – SOLAR APARTMENT BUILDING**

Applicant: CHEL Holdings, Ltd, owner (referral from Development Services)

Location: 504 Thorn Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Solar Apartment Building, located at 504 Thorn Street, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Solar Apartment Building as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C due to its intact original historic form and fabric evidencing characteristics of the Arts and Crafts architectural style, with Prairie style influences, exclusive of the non-historic garage conversion.

Report Number: HRB-07-044  
Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

**ITEM 13 - WITHDRAWN FROM THE AGENDA DUE TO LACK OF A QUORU**

**ITEM 14 – JACOB PRICE SPEC HOUSE**

Applicant: CHEL Holdings, Ltd, owner (referral from Development Services)

Location: 2900 Sixth Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Jacob Price Spec House, located at 2900 Sixth Avenue, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Jacob Price Spec House as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Italian Renaissance Revival Style architecture.

Report Number: HRB-07-045

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd.

**ITEM 14 - WITHDRAWN FROM THE AGENDA DUE TO LACK OF A QUORUM**

**ITEM 15 – CLARA SHRIER AND BLANCHE L. EHRENBERG BUILDING**

Applicant: CHEL Holdings, Ltd, owner (referral from Development Services)

Location: 516-522 Thorn Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Clara Shrier and Blanche L. Ehrenberg Building located at 515-522 Thorn Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Clara Shrier and Blanche L. Ehrenberg Building as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent and unique example of Mission Revival style architecture with Italian Renaissance Revival influences and as an example of early 20<sup>th</sup> century apartment building design in the Banker's Hill area.

Report Number: HRB-07-046

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd.

**ITEM 15 - WITHDRAWN FROM THE AGENDA DUE TO LACK OF A QUORUM**

**ITEM 16 – FRANKLIN AND HELEN BOULTER/MARTIN V. MELHORN HOUSE**

Applicant: Ronald V. May, on behalf of Judy and Wayne Peterson, owners

Location: 4119 Palmetto Way, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Franklin and Helen Boulter/Martin V. Melhorn House, located at 4119 Palmetto Way, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Franklin and Helen Boulter/Martin V. Melhorn House located at 4119 Palmetto Way as a historical resource, exclusive of the non-historic addition at the rear elevation, under HRB Criterion C, as an excellent example of the Craftsman Bungalow style with unusual Neoclassical architectural elements, and Criterion D, as an example of the experimental design style used by recognized Master Builder Martin V. Melhorn late in his career.

Report Number: HRB-07-047

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd.

**Open public testimony**

**In Favor:**

None.

**In Opposition:**

None.

**BOARD ACTION:**

Item 16 approved on consent by a vote of 6-0-0.

**ITEM 17 – J. B. DRAPER SPEC HOUSE #1**

Applicant: Dr. Ray Brandes and Scott Moomjian, on behalf of Elsa D. Benedict, owner

Location: 3563 28<sup>th</sup> Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the J. B. Draper Spec House #1, located at 3563 28<sup>th</sup> Street, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the J. B. Draper Spec House #1, located at 3563 28<sup>th</sup> Street, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of the Prairie style of architecture.

Report Number: HRB-07-048

Staff Report by Ginger Weatherford.

**Open public testimony**

**In Favor:**

None.

**In Opposition:**

None.

**BOARD DISCUSSION:**

Boardmember Berge requested more historical evidence for the façade and expressed particular concerns about the pergola and the half wall and pillar that is adjacent to the driveway.

Boardmember Eisenhart stated the upper windows appear more like a combination of Mission and Prairie styling and believes there is only a slight modification to the porch. He further stated the resource is still significant. Boardmember Marshall stated the resource retains sufficient integrity for designation.

**BOARD ACTION:**

Boardmember Berge moved to continue Item 18 to the September Meeting, with the understanding that additional documentation will be provided to verify that the property is historically accurate. The motion was seconded by Chair Emme and approved 6-0-0.

**ITEM 18 – HAROLD AND CHARLOTTE MUIR HOUSE**

Applicant: Beth Montes, on behalf of the owner, Chicago Trust Company of California

Location: 1205 Muirlands Drive, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the Harold and Charlotte Muir House located at 1205 Muirlands Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the original, historic elements of the Harold and Charlotte Muir House (located at 1205 Muirlands Drive) dating to the 1928 period of significance under HRB Criterion A as a special element of The Muirlands subdivision, a significant and well designed development within the community of La Jolla.

Report Number: HRB-07-049

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

**Open public testimony**

**In Favor:**

None.

**In Opposition:**

None.

**BOARD DISCUSSION:**

Boardmember Berge requested the consultant provide a current photo of the resource on the DPR form. Boardmember Marshall wanted to know if the tree was evaluated as part of the designation. Beth Montes said the tree was not considered in the designation.

**BOARD ACTION:**

Boardmember Schaefer moved to designate Item 18, in accordance with Staff Recommendations. The motion was seconded by Boardmember McNeely. The motion was approved 6-0-0.

**ITEM 19 – THE PACIFIC BUILDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #2**

Applicant: IS Architecture, on behalf of owners Frank and Robin D'Esti

Location: 1517 Granada Avenue, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Pacific Building Company Spec House #2 located at 1517 Granada Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Pacific Building Company Spec House #2 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Prairie architecture, and HRB Criterion D as the work of the Pacific Building Company, an established Master Builder.

Report Number: HRB-07-050

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

**Open public testimony**

**In Favor:**

Frank D'Esti, the owner.

**In Opposition:**

None.

**BOARD DISCUSSION:**

Boardmember Marshall referenced the historic photograph on page 16 of the historical report, which shows the significance of the trellis that is not longer there. Boardmember Marshall encouraged the property owners to bring this back for future designation. Boardmembers Berge and Eisenhart agreed that a pergola would help the home. Boardmember Eisenhart also identified the upper cornice as a significant alteration to the historic roof profile that should be reversed.

**BOARD ACTION:**

Boardmember Marshall moved to designate the Item 19, under Criterion C for architecture, and that the applicants meet with the Design Assistance Subcommittee to establish a method to reintroduce the roof line and trellis design. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Berge. The applicant requested a continuance after the motion to designate was made. The Board resolved to continue the item to the August meeting at the applicant's request.

**ITEM 20 – SAM AND MARY MCPHERSON/RALPH E. HURLBURT AND CHARLES H. TIFAL HOUSE**

Applicant: Ron May, on behalf of Ronald N. Rooney, owner

Location: 3133 28<sup>th</sup> Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Sam and Mary McPherson/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal House, located at 3133 28<sup>th</sup> Street, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Sam and Mary McPherson/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal House, located at 3133 28<sup>th</sup> Street, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of the Spanish Eclectic style of architecture and under HRB Criterion D as the work of Master Architect/Designer Ralph E. Hurlburt and Master Builder Charles H. Tifal.

Report Number: HRB-07-051

Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

**Open public testimony**

**In Favor:**

None.

**In Opposition:**

None.

**BOARD ACTION:**

Item 20 approved on consent by a vote of 6-0-0.

**ITEM 21 – LAURA M. AND JAMES R. LUTTRELL HOUSE**

Applicant: Ron May, on behalf of Sterling and Regina Peters, owners

Location: 938 20<sup>th</sup> Street, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Laura M. and James R. Luttrell House, located at 938 20<sup>th</sup> Street, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Laura M. and James R. Luttrell House, located at 938 20<sup>th</sup> Street, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of the California Craftsman Bungalow style of architecture. The designation shall also consist of the interior of the living and dining rooms.

Report Number: HRB-07-052  
Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

**Open public testimony**

**In Favor:**

None.

**In Opposition:**

None.

**BOARD ACTION:**

Item 21 approved on consent by a vote of 6-0-0.

**ITEM 22 – HEILMAN BROTHERS SPEC HOUSE # 1**

Applicant: Ruth Alter on behalf of Lisa Barnes and Daniel Manlongat, owners

Location: 3215 Granada Avenue, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Heilman Brothers Spec House #1 located at 3215 Granada Avenue as a historic resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Heilman Brothers Spec House #1 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C due to the building's intact original historic fabric evidencing many characteristics of the Craftsman style, exclusive of the garage.

Report Number: HRB-07-053  
Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

**Open public testimony**

**In Favor:**

None.

**In Opposition:**

None.

**BOARD ACTION:**

Item 22 approved on consent by a vote of 6-0-0.

**Reminder:** The next Historical Resources Board Meeting will be held on August 23, 2007 at the City Administration Building, 202 C Street, Council Committee Room, 12th Floor.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:25 p.m.

jd