

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF NOVEMBER 29, 2007
202 C Street, City Administration Building
Council Committee Room, 12th Floor
San Diego, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Otto Emme at 1:05 PM

Chairperson	Otto Emme	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Laura Burnett	Absent
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present (Arrived Late)
Boardmember	John Eisenhart	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Jacqueline Dominguez, Interim Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Tricia Olsen, Intern
Garry Papers, Deputy Director, Urban Form

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 27, 2007

The Minutes of September 27, 2007 were not available for approval.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Burnett and Silvas notified staff that they would not be available for this meeting due to work conflicts. Boardmember Curry is running late.

• **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

None

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Marshall wanted to remind everyone that the Annual Orchids and Onions Awards are tomorrow evening and tickets are still available to purchase.

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmember Eisenhart worked with the client on the rehab of Item #10 in September

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Boardmembers Berge and McNeely spoke with the owners at both houses where the interiors were also being considered for designation (Items 15& 16), neither said it would affect their vote. Boardmember Eisenhart briefly spoke with the tenant at the Gem Café (Item #8).

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Boardmember Schaeffer and Chair Emme were not able to view the interiors of Items 15 & 16, and Boardmembers Marshall and Eisenhart were unable to view the interior of Item 16. Boardmember Schaeffer stated there were enough photos of the interiors in information given to the Board, that they could still make an informative decision.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO INVOKE WAIVER FOR THE INTERIOR VISITATIONS

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely

VOTE: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

C. STAFF REPORT

- The Planning Commission unanimously recommended to the City Council adoption of the Historic Preservation Element of the General Plan Update. The next public hearing will be December 5, 2007 at the LU&H Committee.
- The San Diego Armed Services YMCA, which the Board recommended for listing, was in fact listed on the National Register of Historic Places earlier this month.
- The State Historical Resources Commission voted 6-0 to list the Wm. Black House/SDM-W-12 Locus A on the National Register the day after the Board recommended its listing.
- The 2007 Governor's Historic Preservation Awards were presented at a ceremony at the Leland Stanford Mansion in Sacramento on November 16. Over half of the recipients were either Certified Local Governments or were organizations located within a CLG. Two of the winners were the City of San Diego Parks and Recreation Department for the Spreckels Organ Pavilion Lighting Restoration and the San Diego Padres for the Western Metal Supply Company Rehabilitation. Kudos goes to the City and David Marshall's firm for these great award-winning projects!
- SOHO has filed a lawsuit against the City for approval of the Bayshore Bikeway project. Issues will either be settled through an agreement or through the courts.

Implementation of the HRB Recommendations Regarding Historic Interiors

No action of the Board is required on this item.

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd: Unfortunately due to staff vacancies and continuing increases in work load, with apologies I was not able to pull together these materials. It is anticipated that revisions will be made to various DSD Information Bulletins, The Board adopted Report Guidelines, Staff 1st Contact Procedures, the draft Designation Criteria, and the Board Administrative Procedures. These revisions will be presented to the Board at the January meeting for action.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

The following items are non-controversial, with all parties agreeable to the staff recommendation, and the Board may wish to approve them on consent:

- **ITEM 12 —JACOB AND ANNA JANOWSKY HOUSE at 1419 30th Street**
- **ITEM 13 —EMILY HILL WADSWORTH HOUSE at 3130 2nd Avenue**
- **ITEM 14 —ALVA H. HJORTH/BEN H. JOHNSON HOUSE at 4361 Argos Drive**
- **ITEM 15 —SARAH BROCK/WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON HOUSE at 1603 Torrance Street**
- **ITEM 16 -- LOUIS AND JENNIE BAKER HOUSE at 1360 31st Street**

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Schaefer would to add a condition that the owners of Item #15 donate the original or an archival quality copy of the building plans to the San Diego Historical Society. Ms. Winterrowd stated that the Board cannot condition a designation. Boardmember Schaefer would like to make it a condition of the Mills Act if the owners choose to pursue one. The owners of agreed to donate either the original or an archival copy of the building plans to the San Diego Historical Society. Boardmember Marshall mentioned that the original or archival copy of the plans should also stay with the house.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION OF ITEMS 12, 13, 14, 15 AND 16, WITH ITEM #15 DIRECTING STAFF WHEN AND IF THE APPLICANT APPLIES FOR A MILLS ACT, THAT THE ORIGINAL OR AN ARCHIVAL COPY OF THE BUILDING PLANS BE SUBMITTED TO THE SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL SOCIETY AS DISCUSSED

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

Would the owners of the sites that were just now designated like to address the Board?

Bruce Abrams, Item #13, thanked the Board for taking the time to designate his home and hopes that his neighbors would also take the time to designate their homes, and save 2nd Avenue.

Richard Bentley, Item # 16, also wanted to thank the Board for designating his home.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – DONALD AND MARY RODIBAUGH/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE **(Continued from November 8, 2007)**

Applicant: Vonn Marie May on behalf of the owners, Stephen and Claudia Metcalfe

Location: 6206 Waverly Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the Donald and Mary Rodibaugh/Thomas Shepherd House as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the 1947 Donald and Mary Rodibaugh/Thomas Shepherd House, located at 6202 Waverly Avenue in La Jolla, under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of early Ranch style architecture and under Criterion D, associated with Master Architect Thomas Shepherd.

Report Number: HRB-07-084

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Bill Boehm, Claudia Metcalfe

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Board expressed concern over the 1995 addition.

Boardmember Schaeffer asked if there was any portion of the Thomas Shepherd house demolished in the process of adding the addition. Mr. Boehm replied that only the retaining wall on the North side was moved.

Boardmember Emme stated that addition could be removed and only the roof would really need to be repaired, asked if there were any photos of the house prior to the additions. Ms. Metcalfe responded that she might have a few with a view of the house from the north side, but may not have a view of the garage, but did not have them with her.

Boardmember Berge feels that the garage is too jarring, and that maybe they should go to DAS and see if there is anything that can be done

Boardmember Marshall stated that the first thing he noticed about the house was the garage; it is an attractive and intact house worthy of designation. Unfortunately the most visible and closest to the street is the garage, which is correctable, but in the current condition is the house worthy of designation?

Staff wanted to mention that the owner can go to DAS to work things out, and even if the owner complies with DAS, there is no guarantee that the house will be designated.

Boardmember McNeely wanted to know from the Chair Emme and Boardmember Eisenhart, architect, if they think that DAS can help.

Boardmember Eisenhart is on the fence, he likes the courtyard and the use of negative space, but the garage massing is a little bit too much. He agrees with staff that the character of the house is still there.

Ms. Winterrowd asked if it was an option to designate the house excluding the garage.

Chair Emme would like them to go to DAS, and get more information on the house

Boardmember Marshall would be willing to support designation if a Mills Act condition was to go to DAS to soft on the garage façade. He is more concerned with the upper part of the garage. Ms. Winterrowd stated that designation cannot be conditioned; the Board can ask Staff to add the condition to the Mills Acts, should one be pursued.

Chair Emme thought there was too much work to ask the owners to fix, they should go to DAS

Boardmember Berge agreed, they should go to DAS in January and see what the applicant was willing to do.

Ms. Winterrowd could not guarantee they could get on the agenda for DAS in January, since it is not time sensitive, the Board could make a motion for the applicant to go to DAS prior to returning to the Board

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EISENHART TO HAVE APPLICANT FOR
ITEM #5 SEEK ASSISTANCE WITH DAS IN JANUARY, IF POSSIBLE**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 6 – CASSUIS AND KATE PECK/THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE

(Continued from November 8, 2007)

Applicant: Vonn Marie May on behalf of the owner, Delores Coyner

Location: 620 Via del Norte, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the Cassuis and Kate Peck/Thomas Shepherd House as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Cassuis and Kate Peck/Thomas Shepherd House, located at 620 Via del Norte in La Jolla, under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Ranch style architecture and under Criterion D, associated with Master Architect Thomas Shepherd.

Report Number: HRB-07-086

Staff Report by Mike Tudury

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Claudia Metcalfe

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge is leaning towards agreeing with the applicant. She would like to change the architectural style from Ranch to Ranch Style with Minimal Tradition influences under Criterion C. Staff agreed to make the change.

Boardmember Schaefer thought this was a good example of a Ranch house in the context of the post war style, but a little concerned that there are so many Shepherds, he build the same style home over and over again. Is there a way to judge a good Shepherd to a not so good Shepherd, or are they all going to be designated because they are linked to him.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Boardmember Schaefer, is this a notable Shepherd, how to we determine where this house fit into his career, and how do we tell if this is notable.

Boardmember Marshall is supporting designation, believes this to be faithfully represented of a Thomas Shepherd home. He doesn't agree that there can be too many Shepherd homes, the number of objects is less important than the way there were created or the quality they were created in which is really what matters. It would be a mistake to limit or put a moratorium on a literal of figurative style or architect, it should be on a case by case basis.

Boardmember McNeely agrees with Boardmember Marshall

Chair Emme agrees that it should be quality and not quantity

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM # 6 UNDER CRITERION C AND CRITERION D, PER STAFF RECOMMENDTATION, WITH A NOTATION REGARDING THE MINIMAL TRADITIONAL INFLUENCES.

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 — BURLINGAME HISTORIC DISTRICT AMENDMENT (2nd HEARING)

(Continued from November 8, 2007)

Applicant: City of San Diego City Planning & Community Investment, Historical Resources Section

Location: Various addresses within the intensive survey area (existing Burlingame Historic District boundaries), defined by the properties extending along San Marcos Street to the north, Kalmia Street to the south, 32nd Street to the east, and 30th Street to the west.

Description: Second hearing to consider the proposed district amendment to change the Burlingame Historical District type from a Voluntary/Traditional Historical District to a Geographic/Traditional Historical District.

Today's Action: Review the proposed amendment to the existing Burlingame Historical District to change the district type from a Voluntary/Traditional Historical District to a Geographic/Traditional Historical District; take public testimony; classify of all remaining contributing and non-contributing resources; and amend the district as a Geographic/Traditional Historical District consistent with adopted HRB Policy 4.1 and Land Development Code (LDC) Section 123.0205.

Staff Recommendation:

1. Approve the proposed district amendment to change the district type from a Voluntary/Traditional Historical District to a Geographic/Traditional Historical District, based on adopted HRB District Policy 4.1 and consistent with LDC Section 123.0205.
2. Classify the following 15 properties as Contributing Resources:

APN #	Street No.	Street Name	Status Code	Board Action
539-032-09	2408	Capitan Avenue	5D1	n/a
539-041-11	2406	Dulzura Avenue	5D1	n/a
539-044-08	3171	Kalmia Street	5B	n/a
453-711-06	3010	Laurel Street	5D1	n/a
453-711-07	3016	Laurel Street	5B	n/a
453-711-08	3024	Laurel Street	5B	n/a
453-713-22	3030	Laurel Street	5D1	n/a
539-032-01	3031	Laurel Street	5D1	n/a
453-713-14	3134	Maple Street	5D1	n/a
453-722-13	3178	Maple Street	5D1	8/23/2007
539-031-05	2404	San Marcos Ave	5B	n/a
539-031-07	2424	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a
539-032-03	2455	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a
453-722-03	2625	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a
453-722-06	2653	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a

3. Classify the following 26 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

APN #	Street No.	Street Name	Status Code	Board Action
539-043-08	2404	32nd Street	6L	n/a
539-042-07	2405	Dulzura Avenue	6L	7/26/2007
539-033-04	3025	Kalmia Street	6L	n/a
539-033-05	3031	Kalmia Street	6Z	n/a
539-033-09	3061	Kalmia Street	6L	7/26/2007
539-044-09	3183	Kalmia Street	6Z	n/a
453-724-12	3106	Laurel Street	6Z	n/a
453-724-09	3124	Laurel Street	6L	1/25/2007
453-723-05	3176	Laurel Street	6Z	n/a
453-713-15	3124	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-724-01	3127	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-713-13	3144	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-722-18	3150	Maple Street	6Z	DEMO
453-724-04	3161	Maple Street	6Z	n/a
453-723-01	3175	Maple Street	6L	1/26/2006
453-723-03	3185	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-722-11	3190	Maple Street	6Z	n/a
539-032-05	2433	San Marcos Ave	6L	1/25/2007
453-711-24	2532	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a

APN #	Street No.	Street Name	Status Code	Board Action
453-721-01	2602	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-04	2624	San Marcos Ave	6L	n/a
453-721-05	2632	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-07	2654	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-08	2660	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-09	2672	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-10	2680	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a

Report Number: HRB-07-076

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Nancy Tarbell, Connie di Girolamo, Betty Ball, Rick Hardy, Linda Canada, Vickie Granowitz, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: Nan Hoback, Arline Fallen, Linda Beech

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry supports restoration of non-contributors and wants 6Z for homes built out of the period of significance or those that cannot be restored.

Boardmember Marshall congratulated Staff and the homeowners in this neighborhood for all of their work, there has been overwhelming support, more so than required to amend district/type from Voluntary/Traditional to Geographic/Traditional. Agrees with Mr. Coons and Boardmember Curry on the issue of 6L versus 6Z, it is difficult to say that something is not correctable, no matter how bad it may look in its present condition, there are exceptions even if it is the original house, for example 2672 San Marcos, with the second floor edition and some serious edition, unfortunately is too far gone. To be truly reversible there needs to be good documentation of what it looked like, not just a checkbook and a desire to restore. In favor of 6L if it is the original house as opposed to 6Z, because in most cases they are reversible. Ms. Canada stated that 2672 San Marcos was originally built as a two-story home and has not had any modifications to the front, the windows were changed out from wood to aluminum changing the front façade, and she is working with Staff on behalf of the owner. Boardmember Marshall responded that if more information is provided, then they can change the status code. Strongly supports Staff's recommendation to make this district a Geographic/Traditional.

Boardmember Schaefer congratulated everyone on their hard work in establishing this district. Agrees with Boardmember Marshall regarding the need for more documentation i.e. photos, hidden architectural fabric, original plans etc, enough information to do an appropriated and accurate restoration. These designations can be altered with new information, no real effect on the property owners in terms of their options in the future.

Chair Emme agrees that more information is needed. With minimal information, there is no way to know what the house actually looked like when it was originally built. Some houses can come back; it is just a major investment.

Boardmember Eisenhart stated that Burlingame exemplifies a great neighborhood. It is important to look at a figurative ground study, maintain positive and negative spaces, and the original footprint. This neighborhood is a great asset to the City, and for those who don't want to be apart of the historic district, hopefully there will be a difference of opinion in twenty years.

Boardmember Berge, 6Z and 6L are only status codes, different from Criteria, not the final step in designation.

Boardmember Marshall wanted to take another look at 2404 San Marcos, with regards to the tile roof, not comfortable with including this property as a contributor. Also questioned whether the owner at 2455 San Marcos would be willing to remove the bars to conform to the rest of the neighborhood. A friend/neighbor of the owner stated that the owner is elderly and the bars are there for her safety, Staff said they would be uncomfortable asking her to remove the bars.

Boardmember Berge would like to extend the period of significance to 1953; Staff responded that a commitment cannot be made at this time or in the near future. Boardmember Berge acknowledged this and just wanted to put it on the record.

BOARD ACTION:

ACTION 1: MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO APPROVE, PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION, TO CHANGE THE DISTRICT TYPE FROM A VOLUNTARY/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT TO A GEOGRAPHIC/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 7-0-0 Motion Passes

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO CHANGE THE STATUS OF 2404 SAN MARCOS FROM 5B (CONTRIBUTOR) TO 6L (NON-CONTRIBUTOR)

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 5-2-0 Motion Passes
(Schaefer, Eisenhart)

ACTION 2: MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE, PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION, CLASSIFICATION OF ALL PROPERTIES LISTED ON THE AGENDA AS CONTRIBUTING RESOURCES, WITH THE EXCEPTION OF 2404 SAN MARCOS.

Seconded by Boardmember McNeely Vote: 7-0-0 Motion Passes

ACTION 3: MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE, PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION, CLASSIFICATION OF ALL PROPERTIES LISTED ON THE AGENDA AS NON-CONTRIBUTING RESOURCES, INCLUDING 2404 SAN MARCOS, AND TO MAINTAIN THE 6L AND 6Z STATUS CODES.

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 8 — 1433 MARKET STREET (GEM CAFÉ)

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia on behalf of Bahia View Condominiums, LLC, owner

Location: 1433 Market Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Gem Café located at 1433 Market Street as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the Gem Café located at 1433 Market Street under any adopted HRB criteria.

Report Number: HRB-07-089

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

ITEM HAS BEEN CONTINUED UNTIL THE JANUARY 24, 2008 MEETING.

ITEM 9 — JOHN AND CELESTA IGELSTROEM APARTMENT COURTYARD

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of the owners Pearl & Herschel LLC (Referred from the City of San Diego Development Services Department)

Location: 7522-7534 Herschel Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the John and Celesta Igelstroem Apartment Courtyard located at 7522-7534 Herschel Avenue, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John and Celesta Igelstroem Apartment Courtyard located at 7522-7534 Herschel Avenue under HRB Criterion C as a very good example of a Minimal Traditional apartment courtyard.

Report Number: HRB-07-090

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Bruce Coons

In Opposition: Marie Lia, organized presentation

Speaker slips: Scott Moomjian, Jerry Ruddick, Jerry McClees, Jay Wexler

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Eisenhart stated that the previous reports are not under discussion today. This property interior setting is unchanged; spacing is generous, and it retains a high level of

integrity from 1939. Style is a good example of Minimal Traditional; will support designation under Criterion C.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Boardmember Eisenhart that this property is a good example of Minimal Traditional. The argument that this property was not historic in 1999 does not hold for today. Also supports designation.

Boardmember Marshall is also supporting Staff's recommendation, wanted to point out that in 1999 the applicant stated that this property held all 7 aspects of integrity, but today it doesn't retain its setting integrity. Even with that being the case, which he doesn't agree with, the property still retains 6 of the 7 aspects of integrity, and there is no question that the building(s) is still consistent with the way it was built in 1938, it is a good example of a courtyard complex.

Boardmember Schaefer agrees with the comments of the other Boardmembers and with Staff's recommendation. This site has all of the bells and whistles for both an apartment courtyard and for Minimal Traditional with excellent integrity. Difference between today and 1999, is the Modernism Historic Context Study, which we now have, and the appreciation of styles does change over time with greater education and knowledge of what resources we have in San Diego. Travesty that this did not come before the Board in 1999, and was handled through Staff only. A copy of the inventory of properties, which was done for the Journal of San Diego History, on apartment courtyards, should be available to the Board. Site has all of the feelings that typify an apartment courtyard complex.

Boardmember McNeely does not agree with Staff's recommendation or support designation, it is a lovely courtyard, but does not feel it has integrity.

Boardmember Emme asked the current owner what they have changed in regards to the landscaping and hardscape since 1999? It looks like it has all been changed. Mr. Ruddick, owner, responded that all of the landscaping and hardscape is new; it is not the same as it was in 1999.

Boardmember Curry supports Staff's recommendation. 1938 is historic and being simple and modest doesn't make it invaluable, it is an important example within La Jolla to preserve. The housing type is important and reason to give value to the resource.

Boardmember McNeely wanted to point out that she isn't sure if the new landscaping is the reason that it looks better than it did in 1999, and there are lots of properties like this one in Southeast San Diego, around Federal Blvd.

Boardmember Marshall just wanted to comment prior to making a motion, this property is significant, it's clearly simple style represents the time period. The concept of communal living is still intact, even with the changes to landscaping and hardscaping.

Boardmember Schaefer wanted to clarify, that his support of Staff recommendation isn't based on a whim, wants the opponents to understand that through experience on the Board, with understanding, the importance and significance of this style, Minimal Traditional.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO DESIGNATE ITEM # 9
UNDER CRITERION C, PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 5-2-0

Motion Fails

(Emme, McNeely)

ITEM 10 -- THE A. W. PRAY RENTAL HOUSE/THE Q PROJECT

Applicant: Jonathan Segal, owner

Location: 1907 Kettner, Little Italy District of the Downtown Community Planning Area,
Council District 2

Description: Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority
on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.

Today's Action: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures
and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend
inclusion of additional permit conditions or denial of the permit related to designated
historical resources.

Staff Recommendation: That the Historical Resources Board recommends that the Planning
Commission approve Centre City Site Development Permit 2007-60 for the relocation of
the A. W. Pray Rental House subject to conditions, but deny the proposed demolition of
the historical resource.

Report Number: CCDC Report dated November 9, 2007

Staff Report by Sachin Kalbag of CCDC

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Eisenhart recused himself

Boardmember Marshall supports site #1 only

Boardmember Berge also agrees

Boardmember Curry thinks that the Little Italy is a better location, and relocation is OK if
demolition is eminent.

Boardmember Schaefer wanted to commend everyone's efforts to preserve this home, also
agrees that #1 (Little Italy) is the best and really only option.

Boardmember Emme wanted to know if this has ever done before or recently. Staff responded
that Rosario Hall and Ginty house have both been successfully relocated.

Boardmember McNeely also agrees with the Little Italy site

Boardmember Marshall stated that mitigation needs more teeth to assure rehab, maybe it should state that relocation and rehabilitation per Secretary of Interior Standards should be completed prior to occupancy of new project.

Mr. Segal, applicant, stated that they would take the burden of the funds for moving it, providing a foundation for it, responsible for getting the building up and running. Little Italy would be responsible for rehabilitation of the building, they have the money and it is a free building for them.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO APPROVE ALTERNATIVE #1: RECOMMEND TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF THE SDP BASED ON THE CONDITIONS LISTED ABOVE, SUBJECT TO A RELOCATION SITE IN LITTLE ITALY ON COLUMBIA ADJACENT TO THE FIRE HOUSE MUSEUM. THE APPLICANT WOULD BE REQUIRED TO OBTAIN THIS APPROVAL AND PERMITS FOR THE RELOCATION PRIOR TO ANY CONSTRUCTION PERMITS BEING ISSUED FOR THE Q PROJECT. THE RELOCATION AND EXTERIOR REHABILITATION PER THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR STANDARDS BE COMPLETED, AND OCCUPANCY GRANTED FOR THE RELOCATED STRUCTURE, PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF THE OCCUPANCY FOR THE Q PROJECT.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-0-1

Motion Passes

(Eisenhart)

ITEM 11– 4167 & 4169 JACKDAW ST

Applicant: IS Architecture on behalf of Michael Terry and Garth Howe, owners

Location: 4167 & 4169 Jackdaw Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of 4167 & 4169 Jackdaw Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-07-092

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

ITEM HAS BEEN CONTINUED AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNERS.

ITEM 12 – JACOB AND ANNA JANOWSKY HOUSE

Applicant: Christianne Knoop on behalf of Raad Jeris, owner

Location: 1419 30th Street, North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Jacob and Anna Janowsky House located at 1419 30th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Jacob and Anna Janowsky House located at 1419 30th Street under HRB Criterion C as a very good example of Craftsman bungalow architecture.

Report Number: HRB-07-093

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 13 – EMILY HILL WADSWORTH HOUSE

Applicant: Scott Moomjian on behalf of Bruce M. Abrams, owner

Location: 3130 2nd Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Emily Hill Wadsworth House located at 3130 2nd Avenue as a historical resource

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Emily Hill Wadsworth House located at 3130 2nd Avenue under HRB Criterion C as a very good example of Colonial Revival style architecture.

Report Number: HRB-07-094

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 14 – ALVA H. HJORTH/BEN H. JOHNSON HOUSE

Applicant: Ronald V. May, Legacy 106, on behalf of Olga Nazimova, owner

Location: 4361 Argos Drive, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Alva H. Hjorth/Ben H. Johnson House located at 4361 Argos Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alva H. Hjorth/Ben H. Johnson House located at 4361 Argos Drive as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Tudor style architecture and retaining a high level of integrity from its 1926 period of significance.

Report Number: HRB-07-095

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

Testimony Received:

In Favor:

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 15 – SARAH BROCK/WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON HOUSE

Applicant: Walter and Elizabeth Smoyer, owners

Location: 1603 Torrance Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Sarah Brock/William Templeton Johnson House located at 1603 Torrance Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Sarah Brock/William Templeton Johnson House located at 1603 Torrance Street under HRB Criterion C as an outstanding example of Pueblo Revival architecture, and under HRB Criterion D as the work of Master Architect William Templeton Johnson.

Report Number: HRB-07-096

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 16 – LOUIS AND JENNIE BAKER HOUSE

Applicant: Deidre Lee, on behalf of owners Richard and Jane Bentley

Location: 1360 31st Street, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of Louis and Jennie Baker House located at 1360 31st Street, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Louis and Jennie Baker House located at 1360 31st Street, under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Craftsman bungalow architecture.

Report Number: HRB-07-097

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

BOARD ACTION:

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: January 24, 2008

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:55 PM