# CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
# POLICY SUBCOMMITTEE

## Monday, July 11, 2011, 3:00 PM to 4:00 PM

**5th Floor Large Conference Room**
City Administration Building
202 C Street, San Diego, CA

***The Policy Subcommittee is a subcommittee of the City of San Diego's Historical Resources Board. It is primarily composed of Historical Resources Board members who are interested in policy matters. In general, the Subcommittee is not a voting entity, but rather a forum for discussing issues and policy matters related to historic resources and their preservation. Comments at the meeting do not predispose future positions on any matter by the Historical Resources Board.***

***Members of the public will be allowed an opportunity to speak, for up to one minute each, at the end of the Subcommittee's discussion on an agenda item. Each member of the public is required to state their name and the organization (if any) that they represent prior to their one minute presentation.***

# MEETING AGENDA

1. Introductions

2. Public Comment (on matters not on the agenda)

3. Issues:

3a. HRB Historical District Policy. The HRB policy on historical districts, first adopted on January 7, 1977 and amended in 2000 and 2002, identifies five district types and provides different processing requirements and levels of regulation for each. Staff began the process of comprehensively amending the policy in 2006 to address several issues that were identified at that time. The amendment process was slowed due to workload and reduced staffing levels and has been on hold since 2010. With the current high level of interest by some community members in establishing historic districts, staff has undertaken a much simplified approach to addressing the outstanding issues by reducing the district types from five (i.e., Geographic, Thematic, Emerging, Archaeological, and Voluntary/Traditional) to one, a standard geographic historic district. This district type will accommodate all existing districts, except the Ocean Beach Emerging District, which is proposed to remain as it currently exists, and all potential districts including ones made up of archaeological resources. Resources that are thematically related but not located within a geographically defined boundary are proposed to be addressed through a Multiple Property Submission, consistent with National Park Service Bulletin 16B, *How to Complete the National Register Multiple Property Documentation Form*. The proposed amendment is attached, along with the current District Nomination Guidelines.

4. Adjourn

Next Policy Subcommittee Meeting will be on Monday, August 8, 2011 at 3:00 PM.

For more information, please contact Cathy Winterrowd by phone at (619) 235-5217 or email at cwinterrowd@sandiego.gov

**POLICY 4.1** - ADOPTED BY HSB ON JANUARY 7, 1977
AMENDED BY HRB ON AUGUST 28, 2000
AMENDED BY HRB ON APRIL 25, 2002
AMENDED BY HRB ON XXXX xx, 2011

**HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD~~DISTRICT~~ POLICY**
**ON**
**ESTABLISHING HISTORICAL DISTRICTS**

## 1. PURPOSE AND INTENT

This policy is intended to guide the designation of historical districts within the City of San Diego. A *Historical District* is a significant concentration, linkage, or continuity of sites, buildings, structures, or objects that are united historically, geographically, or aesthetically by plan or physical development and that have a special character, historical interest, cultural or aesthetic value, or that represents one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City. Designated historic districts are those districts designated by the Historical Resources Board pursuant to Land Development Code Chapter 12, Article 3, Division 2, and included in the City of San Diego Historical Resources Board Register, or listed in or determined to be eligible for listing in the California Register of Historic Resources or the National Register of Historic Places. Individuals or groups interested in submitting a historic district nomination for designation should review the *Guidelines for Preparing a Historic District Nomination in Consultation with Staff* (District Nomination Guidelines) for direction on how to proceed.

## 2. BACKGOUND

The City of San Diego Historical Resources Board (previously the Historical Sites Board) adopted its first policy on historical districts on January 7, 1977. The original policy did not distinguish different district types and provided twelve guidelines that were to be used in assessing a district's historical significance. The policy was updated on August 28, 2000, and it was at this time that districts were first separated into distinct categories. These categories included Geographic, Thematic, and Emerging. On April 25, 2002 the district policy was revised again to include the Archaeological District and the Voluntary/Traditional Historical District types.

Since the policy revision in 2002 that resulted in five district types, several issues with the district policy have been identified. Among these issues are the confusion created by different district types; the difficulty in regulating the various district types with the existing Historical Resources Regulations; the difficulty in establishing some district types; the difficulty in preserving the integrity of other district types; and the fact that the existing policy accommodated too many varying levels of community support and degrees of research and survey work. In addition, while the City is permitted to adopt its own district policy based on local preservation needs, the existing policy was not consistent with State and National Register district policies and procedures.

As a result of these issues, the District Policy was amended in 2011 with the goal of simplifying the designation and regulation of historical districts. The district types were reduced from five to one, a standard geographic historical district. Resources that are thematically related but not located within a geographically limited and defined boundary shall be addressed through a Multiple Property Submission, consistent with National Park Service Bulletin 16B, *How to Complete the National Register Multiple Property Documentation Form*.

## 3. EXISTING DISTRICTS

All but one of the existing districts were established as standard geographic districts, meaning they were confined to a defined geographic area, and all identified contributing properties were designated at the time the district was established. This amended district policy will not impact the way these districts are regulated. However, the Ocean Beach Cottage Emerging Historical District was established with only a context statement and period of significance to establish the significance of the district, as well as a few properties which fell within that context and period of significance that were eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F. A complete intensive survey was never completed, and therefore all eligible contributing properties are not known. Owners of properties which fall within the context statement and period of significance may bring their properties forward for designation as contributors to the district. Only those properties identified and designated as contributors are currently regulated.

Because the Ocean Beach Cottage district does not have a full intensive survey, is based on a context statement and period of significance, and is limited to those properties that fall within the context and period that are volunteered by the property owner for designation, conversion of this district to a standard geographic district is not feasible. In addition, the district's long history as a historic district precludes conversion to a Multiple Property Submission. Therefore, the district will continue to be regulated under the prior policy. Property owners may continue to bring properties forward for designation under the established context and period of significance, and the district shall remain voluntary in nature.

## ~~1. DEFINITIONS~~

~~*" A historical district means a significant concentration, linkage, or continuity of sites, buildings, structures, or objects that are united historically, geographically, or aesthetically by plan or physical development and that have a special character, historical interest, cultural or aesthetic value, or that represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City*." (San Diego Land Development Code Section 113.0103)~~

~~The City of San Diego Historical Resources Board will consider designating the following five types of Historical Districts consistent with the definition above:~~

~~GEOGRAPHIC/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT: This type of District is the long standing traditional type that includes a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way and within a geographically definable area which have related character, architectural styles, interrelationships, and physical proximity and association. Contributing sites in the Geographic/Traditional District are designated at the discretion of the Historical Resources Board.~~

## ~~2.~~4. CRITERIA

Establishing the historical significance of a district under the adopted HRB Historical District Policy is a two-step process which requires that one or more of the following criteria "a" through "k" be utilized in determining the significance of an area proposed for district designation~~The following criteria will be utilized in determining the significance of an area proposed for district designation~~:

a. Common Heritage: An area associated with groups of existing or former residents who, because of their common employment or heritage have contributed significantly to the City's development. Such an area will usually contain structures of architectural interest identified with common heritage and traditional functions.

b. Traditional Activity: An area or district associated with traditional activity, such as a central market, an educational or transportation facility, wharves, or warehousing. Such an area may also be remarkable for the particular architectural styles or method of construction associated with its original or traditional activity. Often a traditional activity has significantly shaped the history of the community which it served adding to its historic significance. If the traditional function exists in the present, it serves to illustrate the similarities and differences between past and present.

c. Rare Past: A district which was once representative of common existence during a specific historic era but is now rare or unusual. Such as: an example of architecture, artistry, or design once common, now rare, or a function or use once common, now rare.

d. Development Progression: Neighborhoods or districts illustrating the progressive development of style and changes in architectural and cultural taste.

e. Consistent Plan: Districts illustrating the development of coherent or consistent planning and design, or innovations in planning philosophy.

f. Public Works: Districts which illustrate the development of public works and other significant engineering achievements. During all historical periods structural aspects have been important, but after 1850, systems or construction employing steel and masonry contributed greatly to the evolution of commercial, industrial, and public buildings and therefore take a large part in the study of architecture of late periods.

g. Features of Daily Living: Districts which illustrate the details of daily living during a previous period. Equipment or mechanical devices such as call bells, speaking tubes, dumbwaiters, fans, or similar systems are examples.

h. Industrial Evolution: Districts which illustrate the evolution of an industrial era and its effects on humanity. Examples include company towns, glassworks, factories, manufacturing processes, and marketing developments. Aspects of these which have been instrumental in changing modes of work, altering working conditions, improving living standards, and generally affecting the social order may also manifest significance.

i. Craftsmanship: Examples of workmanship, craftsmanship, artistry, or design which would today be economically infeasible or difficult to reproduce and/or are of benefit to the contemporary community as significant reminders of the past.

j. Building Groupings: Building groupings where the significance and importance of the individual structures is increased because of their relationship to a grouping or row of other significant structures, which may or may not be of a similar period or design style.

k. Landmark Supportive: District of quality buildings or sites, often made up of individual landmark structures supported by other structures of somewhat lesser importance. Such districts are normally easily definable and have a significance over and above the sum of the values of each historic site because of the total historic environment.

The district is then designated under the standard adopted Board Criteria A-E, as supported by the analysis under the District Policy criteria. Contributing resources are designated under Criterion F:

Criterion A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Criterion B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Criterion C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Criterion D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Criterion E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

Criterion F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

## ~~3.~~5. OBJECTIVE

The objective of a District is to maintain the scale and basic character of the subject district and other designated historic districts through:

a. Protection and preservation of the basic characteristics and salient architectural details of structures insofar as these characteristics and details are compatible with the historical district, as defined by the Board in the Statement of Significance adopted for each district.

b. Affording the widest possible scope for continuing vitality through private renewal and architectural creativity, within appropriate controls and standards. The Board intends to foster a climate in which each district may continue to exist as a living, changing neighborhood and not a static museum.

c Encouraging development of vacant property and redevelopment of incompatibly developed properties in accordance with the character of the area.

d Encouraging continuous research into San Diego's human past and culture for the benefit of future generations.

## ~~4.~~6. DOCUMENTATION

Information required for the ~~establishment~~ designation of historical districts:

~~**GEOGRAPHIC/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT**~~

**Geographic Boundaries**: Specific geographic boundaries are established to encompass the historically significant area, sites and features.

**A Context and Statement of Significance**: Historic contexts are those patterns or trends in history by which a specific occurrence, property, or site is understood and its meaning (and ultimately its significance) within history or prehistory is made clear. The nomination must place the district within its historic context and develop a statement of significance that describes how the district is significant within that context ~~A statement is provided to establish the historical significance of the district~~ based on the District Policy Criteria "a"-"k" and the adopted HR-B~~oard~~ Criteria A-E.

**Site Surveys**: All properties within the district boundaries are evaluated and identified as contributing to the historical significance of the district, or as non-contributing sites. State of California Department of Parks and Recreation Forms (DPR-523 Forms) are provided for all properties within the District boundaries.

**Contributing Sites**: Contributing sites are those that meet the significance characteristic of the District and are specifically designated historical resources. These sites shall be eligible for all the benefits and responsibilities of historic designation, including the application of the Historical Building Code, Tax Code Incentives, and US Secretary of Interior Standards for development. Generally a Geographic Historic District should have a minimum of 50% contributing sites, and ideally 65% or more (source: State Historic Preservation Office).

**Non-contributing Sites**: Non-contributing sites are those that have been substantially modified so that they no longer contribute to the historical integrity of the district, or sites that were developed subsequently and have no inherent historical significance or features. These sites are not eligible for benefits resulting from historical designation, except if the owner subsequently restores original historic fabric and features making it a contributing site to the district. In these cases, the Board shall hold a public hearing where the status of the site from non-contributing to contributing can be assessed and approved.

**Vacant Parcels**: Vacant parcels within the boundaries of a District will be deemed to have significance if they relate to the quality and character of the district, otherwise they will be classified as non-contributing sites. Alteration of vacant sites will be reviewed in a manner consistent with the applicable historical district's approved development guidelines.

**District Features**: The Board will determine upon designation of a Historic District those features and characteristics deemed essential to the maintenance of the district's architectural and/or historic integrity.

**Development Guidelines**: If deemed necessary to maintain the historical and/or architectural integrity of a historical district the Board will prepare and adopt a set of development guidelines to be used in development project review for contributing and non-contributing sites, and other district features such as streets, etc., to provide an appropriate context for the application of US Secretary of Interior Standards.

**Demolition and Alteration**: Alteration to a contributing site within a historical district must comply with the applicable provisions of the San Diego Land Development Code. For example, a Site Development Permit is required for substantial alteration within historical districts and a recommendation of the Historical Resources Board is required prior to Planning Commission decision on a Site Development Permit. Furthermore, if a deviation for demolition or removal of a contributing structure within a historical district is approved, the applicant must obtain approval for new development before the issuance of a Demolition/Removal Permit. (San Diego Land Development Code sections 126.0502, 126.0503, 143.0250, and 143.0260(c).

**Inter-Department and Agency Support**: Participation of appropriate City departments will be sought to assist with the preparation of a historical district. Upon designation of a historical district, actions of Departments which could affect said district, including proposed changes in land use, changes in traffic patterns and street closing, public improvements, encroachment permits, etc. should be forwarded to the Board for review and recommendation, consistent with the applicable historical district development guidelines and Section 111.0206d(4) of San Diego Land Development Code which empowers the Board "*To adopt standards and guidelines to be used by the Board in reviewing applications for development permits involving designated historical resources.*"

~~**THEMATIC HISTORICAL DISTRICT**~~

~~**Geographic Boundaries**: District significance is based on historical theme features not contained within identifiable geographic boundaries. Typically, a Thematic District boundary would be the whole, or a large portion of the City's jurisdiction.~~

~~**A Statement of Significance**: A statement is provided to establish the historical significance of the district based on Board Criteria.~~

~~**Site Survey**: Only properties associated with the District's theme are evaluated and identified as contributing sites. DPR-523 Forms are prepared for contributing sites only.~~

~~**Contributing Sites**: Contributing sites are deemed historical resources. These sites shall enjoy all the benefits and responsibilities of historic designation, including the application of the Historical Building Code, Tax Code Incentives, and US Secretary of Interior Standards for development. Generally this type of district should contain 100% contributing sites within the area identified (source: State Historic Preservation Office).~~

~~**Non-contributing Sites**: Criterion is not applicable since there typically is no geographic boundary within which non-contributing sites would be identified.~~

~~**Vacant Parcels**: Vacant parcels may be included in a Thematic District if they contribute to the significance of the district's theme. Included could be sites such as open yards, parks or open space areas that provide context and setting that contribute to the historical theme of the district. Vacant parcels with these features may be identified as contributing sites.~~

~~**District Features**: The Board will determine upon designation of a historic district those features and characteristics deemed essential to the maintenance of the district's thematic integrity.~~

~~**Development Guidelines**: If deemed necessary to maintain the historical and/or architectural integrity of a historic district the Board may prepare and adopt a set of development guidelines to be used in development project review.~~

~~**Demolition and Alteration**: Alteration to a contributing site in a Thematic District must comply with the applicable provisions of the San Diego Municipal code. For example, a Site Development Permit is required for substantial alteration within historical districts and a recommendation of the Historical Resources Board is required prior to Planning Commission Decision on a Site Development Permit. Furthermore, if a deviation for demolition or removal of a contributing structure within a historical district is approved, the applicant must obtain approval for new development before the issuance of a Demolition/Removal Permit. (San Diego Land Development Code Sections 126.0502, 126.0503, 143.0250, and 143.0260(c).~~

~~**Inter-Department and Agency Support:** Participation of appropriate City departments will be sought in assisting with the preparation of a thematic district program. Upon designation actions of Departments which could affect a thematic district, including proposed changes in land use, changes in traffic patterns, public improvements, and street closing, should be forwarded to the Board for review and recommendation consistent with the applicable thematic district guidelines per Section 111.0206d(4) of the San Diego Land Development Code.~~

## ~~VOLUNTARY/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT~~

~~**Geographic Boundaries**: Specific geographic boundaries are established to encompass the historically significant area, sites and features based on the historical survey completed.~~

~~**A Statement of Significance**: A statement is provided to establish the historical significance of the district based on Board Criteria.~~

~~**Site Surveys**: All properties within the district boundaries are evaluated and identified as contributing to the historical significance of the district, or as non-contributing sites. DPR-523 Forms are provided for all properties within the District boundaries.~~

~~**Potentially Contributing Sites**: Potentially Contributing Sites are those that meet the significance characteristic of the District. These sites shall be identified as eligible for designation as contributing sites in the district's survey.~~

~~**Contributing Sites**: Contributing Sites are Potentially Contributing Sites which are volunteered by their owners for designation and are specifically designated historical resources. These sites are eligible for all the benefits and responsibilities of historic designation, including the application of the Historical Building Code, Tax Code Incentives, and US Secretary of Interior Standards for development. In order to establish a Voluntary/Traditional District, a minimum of 51% of the known Potentially Contributing Sites shall be the minimum considered for the establishment of this type of District. When more than 85% of the Potentially Contributing Sites have been designated, the Board shall proceed to establish a Geographic/Traditional based Historical District (See Geographic/Traditional Historical District section for process and requirements).~~

~~**Non-contributing Sites**: Non-contributing sites are those that have been substantially modified so that they no longer contribute to the historical integrity of the district, or sites that were developed subsequently and have no inherent historical significance or features. These sites are not eligible for benefits resulting from historical designation, except if the owner subsequently restores original historic fabric and submits it for historical designation as a contributing site to the district. In these cases, the Board shall hold a public hearing where the status of the site from non-contributing to contributing can be assessed and approved.~~

~~**Vacant Parcels**: Vacant parcels within the boundaries of a District will be deemed to have significance if they relate to the quality and character of the district, in which case they may be volunteered for designation. Otherwise they will be classified as non-contributing sites.~~

~~**District Features**: The Board will determine upon designation of a District those features and characteristics deemed essential to the maintenance of the district's architectural and/or historic integrity.~~

~~**Development Guidelines**: Development activity for the District's Contributing Sites will be subject to the US Secretary of Interior Standards. Potentially Contributing Sites more than 45 years old will be regulated by the City of San Diego Land Development Code Section 143.0250.~~

~~**Demolition and Alteration**: Demolition or alteration to a contributing site shall conform with Section 143.0201 et sec. of the Land Development Code. Demolition or alteration of a potentially contributing site within a historical district must comply with the applicable provisions of Sections 143.0212, 143.0220, and 143.0250 of the San Diego Land Development Code.~~

~~**Inter-Department and Agency Support**: Participation of appropriate City departments will be sought to assist with the preparation of a historical district. Upon designation of a historical district, actions of Departments which could affect said district, including proposed changes in land use, changes in traffic~~

~~patterns and street closings, public improvements, encroachment permits, etc. should be forwarded to the Board for review and recommendation, consistent with the applicable historical district development guidelines and Section 111.0206d(4) of San Diego Land Development Code,~~
~~which empowers the Board "*To adopt standards and guidelines to be used by the Board in reviewing applications for development permits involving designated historical resources.*"~~

## ~~EMERGING HISTORICAL DISTRICT~~

~~**Geographic Boundaries**: District significance is based on a sampling of historical features or sites contained within an identifiable neighborhood or community of the City.~~

~~**A Statement of Significance:** A statement is provided establishing the historical significance of the district based on Board Criteria and representative samples of development that meet historic district criteria.~~

~~**Site Survey**: Only properties submitted for evaluation that are associated with the District's theme are evaluated and identified as contributing sites DPR-523 Forms are prepared for contributing sites only.~~

~~**Contributing Sites**: Contributing sites are deemed historical resources. These sites will enjoy all the benefits and responsibilities of historic designation, including the application of the Historical Building Code, Tax Code Incentives, and US Secretary of Interior Standards for development. Generally volunteered sites should make up no less than 10% and no more than 40% of the potentially contributing sites. If volunteered sites are more than 40% of the potential contributing sites within the geographic area, then a Geographically based district should be pursued (per State Historic Preservation Office recommendation).~~

~~**District Features**: The Board will determine upon designation of an Emerging District those features and characteristics deemed essential to the maintenance of the district's architectural and/or historic integrity, such as zoning, revitalization activity, etc.~~

~~**Demolition or Alteration**: Alteration to a contributing site in an Emerging District must comply with the applicable provisions of the San Diego Land Development Code. For example, a Site Development Permit is required for substantial alteration within historical districts and a recommendation of the Historical Resources Board is required prior to Planning Commission decision on a Site Development Permit. Furthermore, if a deviation for demolition or removal of a contributing structure within a historical district is approved, the applicant must obtain approval for new development, before the issuance of a Demolition/Removal Permit. (San Diego Land Development Code Sections 126.0502, 126.0503, 143.0250, and 143.0260(c).~~

~~**Inter-Department and Agency Support**: Participation of appropriate City departments will be sought in assisting with the preparation of an Emerging District program. Upon designation of an Emerging District, the Board will request that actions of Departments which could affect contributing site in an Emerging District, including proposed changes in land use, changes in traffic patterns and street closing, be forwarded to the Board for review and recommendation consistent with Section 111.0206d(2) of the San Diego Land Development Code.~~

## ~~ARCHAEOLOGICAL DISTRICT~~

~~**Boundaries:** Boundaries are established to encompass the known or potential archaeologically significant area, based on published scientific reports identifying sites and features. Defining the perimeter of an archaeological site is often difficult, because its definition depends on an exhaustive scientific research which may often take many years and even a lifetimes. Defensible boundaries are required in that the boundaries chosen have to be justified. Boundaries, however, may change over time as a result of ongoing research.~~

~~**A Statement of Significance**: A statement is provided to establish the significance of the district based on Board Criteria.~~
~~**Site Survey**: Properties within the district boundaries are evaluated as the opportunity allows, and individual sites are identified whenever scientific data is available, as contributing or non contributing to the historical significance of the district. DPR-523 Forms are provided for all properties within the District boundaries.~~

~~**Contributing Sites**: Contributing sites are those where specific archaeological resources are known to exist, and are therefore deemed historical resources. These sites shall enjoy all the benefits and responsibilities of historic designation, including the application of the Historical Building Code, only to the degree it preserves the resource, Tax Incentives, and use of US Secretary of Interior Standards for development impacting subsurface areas.~~
~~**Potentially Contributing Sites:** Potentially contributing sites are those that have yet to be studied in detail and which once analyzed have a high probability of containing significant resources to be the cultural character of the district.~~

~~**Vacant or Unsurveyed Parcels**: Vacant or unsurveyed parcels within the boundaries of an archaeological district will be deemed to have significance (contributing site) if they relate to the quality and character of the district. Until site research proves that a site cannot provide future archaeological significance, any subsurface alteration will be reviewed and subject to archaeological monitoring unless and until, the site is found to be a non-contributing site. Sites may be removed from the district, or may be identified as non-contributing based on ongoing research results.~~

~~**Non-contributing Sites**: Non-contributing sites are those that have been studied with no archaeological information found. Typically these are substantially disturbed or modified, so that the site no longer is known to contain any archaeological value, and therefore does not contribute to the historical integrity of the district.~~

~~**District Features**: The Board will determine upon designation of an Archaeological District those features and characteristics deemed essential to the maintenance of the district's archaeological integrity.~~

~~**Development Guidelines**: All subsurface development will be required to undergo archaeological monitoring. In special cases where the quality of the built environment may be critical to the future integrity of the Archaeological District the Board may prepare development guidelines to be available for project review.~~

~~**Demolition and Alteration**: No permit for the alteration of subsurface areas shall be issued without review and recommendation by Board consistent with Section 126.0503, 126.0504, and 143.0201 et sec. of the Land Development Code.~~

~~**Inter-Department and Agency Support**: Participation of appropriate City departments will be sought in assisting with the preparation of an archaeological district program. Upon designation actions of Departments which could affect an archaeological district, including proposed subsurface construction and grading will be forwarded to the Board for review in a manner consistent with the applicable archaeological district program as provided by Section 111.0206d(4) of the City of San Diego Land Development Code.~~

## 7. BOARD ACTION

The following actions are required for the City of San Diego Historical Resources Board to establish a historical district:

a. **Designation request**: Any organization, or individual can bring forth a request for historical district designation, as detailed in the District Nomination Guidelines. The request should also include a petition endorsed by a substantial number or a majority of the affected property owners~~, or in the case of Emerging and Voluntary/Traditional Districts by all affected property owners~~. If the request is brought forth by the City, based on comprehensive historical studies available to the City, staff shall include information showing the extent of community support and involvement in the preparation of the Historic District Document. For all nominations, staff will solicit the level of support and opposition from property owners within the proposed district boundary consistent with the process outlined in the District Nomination Guidelines, and shall provide that information to the Board.

b **Historical Report**: The request shall include a Historical Report with information about the proposed historical district, including a Methods section, Context, Statement of Significance, Period of Significance, boundaries or area of effect, DPR-523 Forms~~ as required for the type of district sought~~, and Development Guidelines as needed. Information will be submitted to staff of the Historical Resources Board for review.

~~c. **Volunteered Sites:** For Historical Districts that are voluntary based (Voluntary/Traditional and Emerging districts) a listing shall be provided of all owners who have expressed an interest in having their sites/properties designated within the District. The listing of voluntary properties shall be provided to the Board for review.~~

d. **Board Review**: Two meetings of the Board are required to establish a historical district. Upon receipt of a complete historical district designation package, the Historical Resources Board staff shall schedule the item for review by the Board. At this time the Board shall evaluate the completeness and adequacy of the information submitted establishing the significance of the proposed historical district at a regularly scheduled Board meeting. If the information submitted is found adequate, a second noticed public hearing shall be scheduled for the next available Board hearing.

e **Noticing**: Notices will be mailed as required by the San Diego Land Development Code Section 123.0202 (b) to all affected property owners, and community planning groups, neighborhood associations, historical societies, and other interested parties.

f. **Site Visit**: Historical Resources Board members are required to physically visit the district area and view the sites within the district's boundary before taking any action.

g. **Board Hearing**: The Board will hear public testimony on the establishment of the historical district, and take appropriate action. The action of the Board to designate a historical district may be appealed to the City Council as established by the San Diego Land Development Code Section 123.0203.

h. **Implementation**: Upon Board designation of a historical district the boundaries of said district shall be transmitted to all affected City departments so they may be aware of the Board's interest and involvement in any actions that could potentially affect the historical integrity and significance of the district. The Board shall review any development request affecting a significant historical resource as established by the various sections of the City of San Diego Land Development Code, to provide the appropriate recommendations to the decision maker. Additionally, contributing sites within a historical district shall be eligible for the Mills Act Program provided they meet the standards of the program.

# Guidelines for
# Preparing a Historic District Nomination
# in Consultation with Staff

**Implemented by the City of San Diego**

**City Planning & Community Investment Department**

**Urban Form Division**

**July 14, 2008**

## INTRODUCTION

With the adoption of the General Plan update in March of 2008, the City acknowledged the importance of historic districts to the preservation of the unique character of San Diego; and reaffirmed its commitment to the establishment of new historic districts where concentrations of buildings, structures, sites, landscapes and objects are identified. The General Plan update also provides the opportunity for the identification of potential historic districts through policies that require the development of context statements and the completion of historic resource reconnaissance surveys.

As these surveys are completed and potential historic districts are identified, it is anticipated that community members and property owners wishing to preserve the historic character and quality of their neighborhoods will wish to pursue establishment of historic districts identified by the surveys. Because the surveys' resources will be limited to reconnaissance level work and will not include the intensive level survey work required to establish a historic district, it is also anticipated that community members and property owners will express interest in preparing and submitting historic district nominations rather than relying on the availability of limited City resources. These Historic District Nomination Guidelines have been prepared to encourage and facilitate community-lead efforts to survey and nominate historic districts.

These Guidelines do not establish new policy, but instead provide guidance within the framework of the adopted Historic District Policy on the process of preparing a nomination of a historic district previously identified by a reconnaissance survey. Proposed districts not previously identified as a potential historic district will first need to consult with HRB staff, prepare a context statement, and complete a reconnaissance survey consistent with the City's *Historic Resource Survey Manual* prior to initiating a nomination consistent with these Guidelines.

Proposed districts within an area previously surveyed but not identified as a potential historic district are unlikely to retain sufficient integrity to convey significance and would therefore not be eligible for designation as a historic district. Rare exceptions may be in cases where the resource type was not considered during the survey and/or where the resource type has achieved significance since the completion of the survey. Once again, these proposed districts will need to consult with HRB staff, prepare a context statement, and complete a reconnaissance survey consistent with the City's *Historic Resource Survey Manual* prior to initiating a nomination.

Finally, the information in these Guidelines is intended primarily for residential and, to a lesser extent, neighborhood-serving commercial areas. If a proposed district contains other types of properties or resources, please contact Historical Resources Board (HRB) staff for guidance.

## GETTING STARTED

*Reconnaissance vs. Intensive Surveys*

In preparing a district nomination, it is important to understand the difference between the two types of historic resource surveys: **reconnaissance** and **intensive** level surveys. A reconnaissance survey includes a "once over" inspection of a community or neighborhood, and is

useful in characterizing resources in an area. Reconnaissance surveys are used to form the basis for more intensive, detailed survey efforts. During a reconnaissance survey, descriptive information about buildings, structure, and objects are collected and analyzed primarily through architecture and dates of construction. Potential historic districts may be identified as a result of a reconnaissance survey; however, a reconnaissance level survey does not involve a sufficient amount of research, documentation or evaluation to establish a historic district. Historic resource surveys completed in support of community plan updates will be completed at the reconnaissance level.

An intensive survey is designed to identify precisely and completely all historic resources in an area. It involves detailed background research and a thorough documentation of all historic properties in the field, and should produce enough information to evaluate historic properties and generate an inventory. Intensive level surveys are required to nominate a historic district for designation, and include a methodology, district-specific context statement, Statement of Significance, Period of Significance, boundary description and justification, and a parcel-by-parcel survey of each property within the district boundary which provides detailed analysis of the property and its integrity.

*Applicant Team*

Ideally, to ensure that submitted nominations are complete at the time of submittal and allow processing of nominations as efficiently as possible, a qualified historic consultant who meets the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualifications for architectural history or history would be retained to prepare the nomination. However, volunteers can be very effective in the preparation of district nominations under the supervision and training of a qualified historic consultant. Communities interested in preparing and submitting a historic district nomination through volunteer efforts should assemble a volunteer team and contract with a qualified historic consultant who meets the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualifications for architectural history or history (see "References") to provide guidance and training on the preparation of all aspects of the nomination, including:

- Research and development of the historic context statement;
- Developing the Statement of Significance;
- Establishment and justification of the Period of Significance;
- Establishment and justification of the district boundary; and
- Conducting intensive level survey work, including completion of architectural descriptions, identification of modifications and assessing integrity, and completing all survey forms correctly.

A list of qualified historic consultants can be found on the Historical Resources Board website.

**STEP 1: Review of Technical Documents**

Prior to conducting any archival research or initiating any survey work, the applicant team must review all applicable technical documents, including City policies, criteria and guidelines; National Register Bulletins; California Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) documents; and

prior context statements and surveys. These documents, which have also guided the preparation of this document, provide a foundation of sound preservation theory and practice related to the establishment of historic districts. (Weblinks to these documents have been provided in the "References" section of this document.)

*"National Register Bulletin: Historic Residential Suburbs, Guidelines for Evaluation and Documentation for the National Register of Historic Places", 2002.*

This Bulletin is an excellent, comprehensive resource for the evaluation and documentation of residential subdivisions. It provides an introduction to the concept of historic contexts and how to use them to evaluate eligibility for designation. It also provides an overview of suburbanization in the United States from 1830-1960 which can be used to place San Diego's development and the development of the subject subdivision into a broader historic context and perspective. Lastly, this Bulletin provides assistance with the identification, evaluation, documentation and registration of residential suburbs; including guidance on conducting research and developing a historic context, surveying properties within the proposed district boundaries, and evaluating the integrity and eligibility of the district and the resources within the district boundary. Although this Bulletin specifically addresses eligibility under National Register Criteria, the information and principles presented in this Bulletin can be applied to local adopted designation criteria. (More information on applying these principles to local designation criteria will be provided later.)

*"National Register Bulletin: Defining Boundaries for National Register Properties", 1997(revised)*

Although the district nomination is for local designation and not National Register listing, this bulletin provides excellent guidance on the selection and justification of district boundaries, which is critical to a successful district nomination. The principles in this bulletin can be applied easily to local designation criteria and the local district policy.

*"Instructions for Recording Historical Resources" from the California Office of Historic Preservation, 1995.*

District nominations must be prepared on California Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) inventory forms. For most residential historic districts, a DPR-D (District Record) form will be required for the recordation of the district itself, and a DPR-A (Primary Record) form and DPR-B (Building, Structure and Object Record) form will be required for each property within the district boundary. This manual provides detailed instructions on the completion of these forms.

*"Historical Resources Board Policy 4.1: Historical District Policy on Establishing Historical Districts", 2002.*

The Historical Resources Board's adopted District Policy provides local district designation policy and the requirements for establishing a historic district.

*"Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria" 2008.*

The significance of a historic district must be established under local adopted HRB designation criteria. The Designation Criteria Guidelines assist with the understanding and application of each HRB designation criterion and explain the aspects of each criterion and how significance may be established.

*"Guidelines for Preparing a Historic District Nomination in Consultation with Staff"*

In addition to breaking down the nomination process into a logical and manageable sequence with regular review and oversight, this document is also intended to clarify the local application of the principles and procedures presented in the National Register Bulletins.

*All available context statements and surveys applicable to the area in question.*

The applicant must review all prior context statements and surveys applicable to the proposed district area. District nominations may only be submitted if a reconnaissance survey has been completed which identifies the proposed district as a potential historic district. The reconnaissance survey will provide a starting point for the applicant in the development of the context statement, Statement of Significance, Period of Significance, and classification of contributing and non-contributing resources required in a district nomination.

**STEP 2: Prepare and Submit a District Nomination Proposal**

The applicant team must complete and submit a District Nomination Proposal form with attachments for HRB staff review and comment. The purpose of the District Nomination Proposal is to make staff aware of the proposed district; to ensure that the proposed district has been previously identified by a reconnaissance survey; to identify the applicant team and the qualified historic consultant; and to establish a course of action for the applicant team through a draft Methodology.

The Nomination Proposal form can be obtained through the Historical Resources website and provides staff with the following information:

- Proposed District name
- Preliminary boundary description
- Names and contact information for the volunteers on the applicant team
- Names, contact information and resume for the qualified historic consultant who will supervise the nomination effort and provide training for the applicant team

The Nomination Proposal also consists of several attachments:

- Resume from the qualified historic consultant to verify that the selected consultant meets the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualifications in architectural history or history.

- A copy of the context statement, boundary description and DPR forms from all prior surveys that identified the subject area as a potential historic district. This information will be reviewed by staff to ensure that the district boundaries proposed by the applicant team reflect the district boundaries identified by the reconnaissance survey. Staff may provide some feedback and additional direction to the applicant team based on this information.
- A draft Methodology. A detailed draft Methodology provides the basis for the intensive level research and survey work involved in preparing a district nomination and will guide the survey effort. The Methodology should outline what is currently known about the proposed district area, as well as the work that will be undertaken for both archival and field research. The draft Methodology provides the structure for the survey, and will need to be revised as needed once the survey is complete to reflect the final survey effort. The draft Methodology must include the following elements:
    a. Project Objective: A clear statement regarding the purpose of the survey and how it is intended to be used.
    b. Explanation and justification of survey boundaries: Description of the boundaries and number of acres in the project area. The number of buildings to be surveyed should be noted.
    c. Technical documents reviewed as part of the survey preparation (i.e. City policies, criteria and guidelines; National Register Bulletins; California Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) documents; and prior context statements and surveys.)
    d. Brief description of the archival research techniques including:
        - Who will be conducting the archival research.
        - Research institutions to be utilized (i.e. Historical Society Archives, California Room and the Downtown San Diego Public Library, University of California San Diego (UCSD), San Diego State University (SDSU), University of San Diego (USD), South Coastal Information Center (SCIC), local community historical societies, etc.)
        - Primary research documents to be reviewed (i.e. original subdivision maps, Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, lot and block books, newspapers, deeds, directories, first-hand oral histories, etc.)
        - Secondary research documents to be reviewed (i.e. second-hand oral histories, Journal articles, prior intensive surveys for individual properties within the proposed district boundary, etc.)
    e. Brief description of the field survey methods, including:
        - Who will be conducting the field survey.
        - How the field survey will be conducted.
        - How the date of construction will be ascertained.
        - How the modifications to the individual properties will be identified.
        - How a property's significance to the district will be established.
        - How the integrity of a property will be evaluated.

Staff will review the Nomination Proposal and provide written feedback regarding the proposal, with a follow-up meeting with the applicant team and their consultant to answer questions and provide feedback. Revisions to the proposal may be necessary. At this time, staff will also informally poll property owners within the district boundary to get a sense of the level of support

for the district nomination. Once this process is complete, the applicant team may proceed to preparation of a district-specific context statement, Statement of Significance, Period of Significance, and a detailed boundary justification.

**STEP 3: Conduct Intensive Level Research and Prepare a District Record Form (DPR-D)**

Under the supervision of the qualified historic consultant, the applicant team must develop a district-specific context statement, Statement of Significance, Period of Significance, and detailed boundary description and justification. The information must be contained within a DPR-D District Record form (instructions for correctly completing this form can be found in the *Instructions for Recording Historical Resources* from the California Office of Historic Preservation).

*Context Statement*

A historic context is an organizational format that groups information about related historic properties, based on a theme, geographic limits and chronological period. A single historic context describes one or more aspects of the historic development of an area and identifies the significant patterns that individual properties represent. Historic contexts establish the themes and property types that are important in a community or neighborhood. Without an adequate historic context, surveys may fail to identify significant resources or contain biases.

Historic contexts are developed on the basis of archival research and background data on a community's history. The context statement prepared as part of the reconnaissance survey will provide the foundation for the development of the district-specific context statement, which should provide a context for the development of the proposed district and place it in the broader reconnaissance level context statement. The archival research design established in the draft Methodology will provide the framework for the research involved in developing a district-specific context statement. (More detailed information on context statements can be found in the National Register Bulletin on Historic Residential Suburbs.)

Research <u>not required</u> as part of the context statement (or the later field survey) includes detailed property history consisting of title searches or directory searches. This information is not typically required *unless* the district is being nominated under HRB Criterion B for an association with a historically significant individual or individuals, in which case the ownership and residency history of the properties within the district would be especially important.

*Detailed Boundary Description and Justification*

More often than not, the boundaries of a proposed historic district within a residential suburb will reflect the boundaries of the original underlying subdivision. However, this may not always be the case; especially in instances where the subdivision as a whole does not retain sufficient integrity for designation, or when the significant theme of the district is not related or tied to the underlying subdivision. In all cases, however, the applicant team must identify and justify the boundaries of the proposed district based upon the historic context and the significance of the district under adopted HRB designation criteria.

*Statement of Significance and Period of Significance*

In order for a proposed district to be eligible for designation, it must meet one or more of the following HRB designation criteria:

A. Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.
B. Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.
C. Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.
D. Is representative of the notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.
E. Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the California State Office of Historic Preservation for listing on the California Register of Historical Resources.

Criterion F, which states that a resource must be “a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City” is applied to contributing resources within a historic district and is not used to establish the significance of the district itself.

The Statement of Significance must evaluate the historic context against the designation criteria to determine whether or not the district is significant under locally adopted designation criteria. Assistance with applying the designation criteria can be found in the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria.*

Lastly, the applicant team must identify the period of time which reflects the Statement of Significance. This is known as the Period of Significance. For instance, if a subdivision is significant for its representation of varying architectural styles over a period of time, the Period of Significance would likely span from the construction of the first house within the subdivision through the general build-out of the subdivision (when new development largely ceased, with a few in-fill exceptions). Or, if a proposed district is significant as the work of a Master Builder or Architect, the Period of Significance would reflect the years in which the Master Builder or Architect was designing and/or building homes within that district.

Staff will review the submittal and provide written feedback, with a follow-up meeting with the applicant team and their consultant to answer questions and provide feedback. Revisions to the submittal may be necessary. Once staff accepts the submittal, it will be docketed for review by the Policy Subcommittee. The Subcommittee will review the submittal (consisting of the district-specific context statement, Statement of Significance, Period of Significance, and detailed

boundary justification) as well as the DPR forms from the reconnaissance survey and will provide comment. Additional revisions based on this comment may be necessary.

Once the district-specific context statement, Statement of Significance, Period of Significance and detailed boundary description and justification are finaled, the applicant team may proceed with the field survey work. It should be noted that the field survey work will likely reveal additional information which may require additional research and could result in modifications to the Statement of Significance, Period of Significance and/or proposed boundary. This is typical during the intensive survey process. However, thorough research; a sound context statement; and a well justified Statement of Significance, Period of Significance and boundary are a crucial foundation for the field survey.

**STEP 4: Conduct an Intensive Level Field Survey of the District**

Surveys are typically conducted from the public right-of-way, street or alley. Access to private property is not required for most surveys. If access to private property is necessary, permission must be obtained from the property owner. As the intensive field survey begins, staff will mail a letter to all property owners reminding them of the district nomination effort and informing them that the survey is underway. Answers to frequently asked questions regarding district designation will be provided, and property owners will be invited to submit any relevant information regarding their property.

Under the supervision and training of a qualified historic consultant, an intensive level field survey of all properties within the district boundary must be completed using DPR-A (Primary Record) and DPR-B (Building, Structure and Object Record) forms (instructions for correctly completing these forms can be found in the *Instructions for Recording Historical Resources* from the California Office of Historic Preservation). The applicant team will be required to complete all fields within DPR-A and DPR-B forms, unless specifically stated otherwise in these Guidelines. Fields not required include the NRHP Status Code and the Historic Name. Status Codes will be assigned by staff once the nomination is processed. The historic name of the property is not applicable because the HRB's adopted Resource Naming Policy states that properties within a designated historic district shall be identified as a contributing or non-contributing resource to that district, and not by the historic name.

When conducting an intensive field survey, the integrity of each property within the district must be assessed. In order to assess the integrity of a property, all modifications must be accurately identified. Modifications to individual properties surveyed must be identified in detail in section B.6 of the Building, Structure and Object Record (BSOR). Many modifications can be identified on sight. Other modifications may require more research and analysis to accurately identify. Modifications to properties can be identified through permit searches at the City of San Diego Development Services Department Records Section; Residential Building records at the County Assessor's Office; and through Sanborn Map analysis (see "references"). All of these resources should be consulted when identifying modifications and assessing a building's integrity.

Once the modifications are identified, the impact of those modifications on the building's ability to convey the significance of the district must be analyzed. The National Park Service identifies

seven aspects of integrity (discussed in the "National Register Bulletin on Historic Residential Suburbs" and "National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation":

- Location: the place where the historic property was constructed or the place where the historic event occurred.
- Design: the combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style of a property.
- Setting: the physical environment of a historic property. Whereas location refers to the specific place where a property was built or an event occurred, setting refers to the *character* of the place in which the property played its historical role.
- Materials: the physical elements that were combined or deposited during a particular period of time and in a particular pattern or configuration to form a historic property.
- Workmanship: the physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history or prehistory.
- Feeling: a property's expression of the aesthetic or historic sense of a particular period of time.
- Association: the direct link between an important historic event or person and a historic property.

Location, design, setting and feeling are important aspects of integrity for the district as a whole. Aspects of design, materials and workmanship are better examined at a property-by-property level. For instance, if the proposed district is significant as an embodiment of distinctive characteristics of Craftsman and Spanish architecture, all contributing properties within the district boundaries must retain sufficient integrity of design, materials and workmanship that characterize Craftsman and Spanish architecture within the Period of Significance.

Finally, once the survey is complete, the applicant must group the DPR-A and DPR-B forms first by contributing and non-contributing resources, and then alpha-numerically by street within those two categories. Contributing resources are those resources which were built within the period of significance, are reflective of and contribute to the significance of the district, and retain sufficient integrity to convey that significance. Contributing resources typically include buildings and structures, but may include landscaping, trees, and streetscapes (palm trees, parkways, sidewalk color and scoring, stamps and curb cuts) which are characteristic of the period of significance and architectural design. Non-contributing resources are those resources which either were built outside of the period of significance and are therefore not eligible for designation as part of the district; or were built within the period of significance but have been altered to such an extent that they no longer retain sufficient integrity to convey the significance of the district.

The applicant team will also be required to submit a spreadsheet or database which summarizes the field survey data. The template will be provided by staff and completed by the applicant team. Staff will review the submittal and provide written feedback, with a follow-up meeting with the applicant team and their consultant to answer questions and provide feedback. Revisions to the field survey may be necessary. Once staff accepts the field survey, the applicant will be required to provide a complete nomination consisting of a final Methodology; the DPR-D District Record form (containing the context statement, Statement of Significance, Period of

Significance, and detailed boundary description and justification); and the intensive level survey (DPR-A and DPR-B forms for all properties within the district boundary and associated spreadsheet). The applicant will be required to provide a hard copy and an electronic copy (MS Word) of the complete nomination.

**STEP 5: City Processing**

Once the nomination has been accepted by the City, it will be processed consistent with the adopted Historic District Policy. Currently, the adopted Historic District Policy requires the following to process a historic district nomination:

- A City-sponsored workshop for property owners and residents within the district boundary to present the nomination and answer questions regarding historic district designation.
- A petition signed by a substantial number or a majority of the property owners within the district in support of the nomination. Based on prior experience staff has modified this requirement from a simple applicant-circulated petition to a mail-balloting effort coordinated and controlled by the City. The balloting effort will follow the workshop and precede any hearings before the full HRB.
- First Hearing by the HRB. At this hearing the Board reviews the nomination to ensure that it is complete and ready for a designation hearing. If the nomination is complete, it will be forwarded to a second hearing by the full HRB to consider designation.
- Second Hearing by the HRB. At this hearing the Board reviews the nomination and takes action on the designation of the district. If the district is designated, that designation becomes final 10 business days from the date of the designation once the appeal period is over.