



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: July 17, 2009 REPORT NO. HRB-09-052

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of June 25, 2009

SUBJECT: **ITEM 15 – VILLAGE OF YSTAGUA, AREA #1**

APPLICANT: CLL Roselle LLC represented by RBF Consulting

LOCATION: Not Permitted to List, Torrey Pines, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property listed above as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Village of Ystagua, Area #1 (CA-SDI-4609) as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource exemplifies special elements of the City's archaeological and cultural development associated with prehistoric habitation of CA-SDI-4609, a portion of the Kumeyaay Village of Ystagua and is of cultural significance to the Kumeyaay people of San Diego.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 • Fax (619) 533-5951

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed discretionary project located in the Torrey Pines community of the City of San Diego, east of Interstate 5 within Sorrento Valley. The project includes grading and contouring imported fill, creating a pad with decomposed granite surface, and provision of adequate drainage. A future office trailer is proposed for the site requiring sewer and water connections.

The site is located in a culturally and archaeologically rich area of the City, within the known area identified as the Kumeyaay Village of Ystagua. Other portions of this significant archaeological site have been listed on the National Register of Historic Places and designated by the Historical Resources Board under a different site name.

ANALYSIS

A cultural resources study was prepared by Affinis which concludes the property lies within an area of Sorrento Valley with known significant cultural sensitivity associated with the Kumeyaay village of *Ystagua*. The report concludes the property represents an important archaeological site and significant traditional cultural property and is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion A, staff concurs with that determination, as follows:

CRITERION A -Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

This property is located within the boundaries of an area that Native Americans, historians, and archaeologists believe to be the historic Kumeyaay village of *Ystagua*. First recorded in 1974 by as [CAL]:E:4:18, additional portions of the village were subsequently recorded as CA-SDI-5443, CA-SDI-4513, and CA-SDI-4609. The Museum of Man assigned the number SDM-W-654 to an area that includes the sites just listed. The parcel that is the focus of this project is within the area recorded as CA-SDI-4609. The assignment of different number to different parts of this village reflects both the archaeological history of the area, with different parts being surveyed at different times for different projects, and the discontinuous nature of the deposits. Natural features such as ravines and streams separate the site into discrete parts.

The area is composed of several large midden areas. Shell and artifacts scatters are also present, and human burials have been found in several parts of the village complex. Portions of the site, particularly those in the valley bottom like the subject parcel, have deep, stratified deposits, while other portions located on hillsides have deposits that are more shallow and have been subject to mixing.

A number of archaeological surveys and excavations have taken place on portions of the village of *Ystagua*. These include both private and public projects. Most of the archaeological work in the village area has been summarized in a San Diego State MA thesis by Carol A. Schultze which sought to synthesize the work that had been done on the site up to that time.

The archaeological fieldwork conducted at this property identified the presence of both intact and disturbed cultural deposits within the parcel. Previous land use and relic hunting have disturbed part of the parcel, as has the installation and repair of a water main by the City of San Diego. This disturbance has left most of the deposits on the subject parcel intact, and those intact portions of the resource retain archaeological significance due to their research potential. The archaeological study summarizes a survey of the parcel, monitoring of posthole excavation, and work done to mitigate impacts to deposits from a water main break. Prior to the placement of fill on the parcel, artifacts or ecofacts were commonly found on the site surface. Although artifacts were found in the posthole monitoring, the most informative collection from the property resulted from the water line monitoring. The archaeological monitors collected 2,878 artifacts and over 200 g of bone. Artifacts included flaked and ground lithic tools, ceramics, and worked bone. During the monitoring, human bone was found and reburied by the project's Native American Monitor.

Archaeological investigations at the site have documented the presence of stratified deposits, abundant artifacts, and a variety of ecofacts. The artifact assemblage, which includes flaked lithic tools, manufacturing debris, and groundstone, has the potential to answer a number of important questions about San Diego prehistory and history. While sites with similar assemblages are relatively common in coastal San Diego, sites with well preserved stratification are quite rare. The portion of the site on the subject property clearly holds future research potential as an archaeological resource. Additionally, the larger site of *Ystagua* is clearly important, as evidenced by its inclusion on the National Register of Historic Places. The fact that sensitive cultural material is reported both from the subject property and nearby properties increases the importance of the site. Therefore, a data recovery, preservation and monitoring program has been recommended to reduce or minimize project impacts to the resource. The mitigation program was designed to specifically address issues of cultural significance and the potential discovery of human remains.

The site is of cultural significance to the Kumeyaay people, due to the presence of human remains, as well as its archaeological significance. It is a significant resource under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and is considered to be an Important Archaeological Site, as defined in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the City of San Diego and the Historical Resources Regulations of the City of San Diego Municipal Code. As such, the site is eligible for local designation in accordance with the Historical Resources Guidelines. CA-SDI-4609, Village of *Ystagua*, Area #1 meets the Historical Resources Board Criterion A, as it exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's archaeological and cultural development.

Excerpts of the archaeological site investigation were submitted to the San Diego Historical Resources Board to officially document the site investigation and treatment recommendations. In addition, correspondence from the Native American Monitor that worked on the project was provided. This correspondence notes the significance of the site and recommends special treatment of the area due to the proximity of human remains, significance of discovery, and sacredness of this entire site.

HRB staff believes this site has significance as an important archaeological site due to its research potential, cultural significance to the Kumeyaay people, and archaeological significance

of the deposit. Therefore, staff recommends the Board designate the site under Criterion A as the resource exemplifies special elements of the City's archaeological and cultural development associated with prehistoric habitation of CA-SDI-4609, Village of Ystagua Area #1 and is of cultural significance to the Kumeyaay people of San Diego.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted, it is recommended that the HRB designate the site under Criterion A as the resource exemplifies special elements of the City's archaeological and cultural development.



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Excerpts from the Consultant Report (Confidential – not for public distribution)
3. Letter from Red Tail Monitoring & Research, Inc.

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 7/23/2009

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 7/23/2009, to consider the historical designation of the (owned by CLL-Roselle LLC 3565 Riviera Drive, San Diego, CA 92109) located at *not permitted to list*, APN: **000-000-00-00**, further described as **n/a** in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources information prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any alterations to the resource shall be approved by the City.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, Historical Resources Board based its designation of Archaeology Site CA-SDI-11,039 on the following finding:

The resource exemplifies special elements of the City's archaeological and cultural development associated with prehistoric habitation of CA-SDI-4609, a portion of the Kumeyaay Village of Ystagua and is of cultural significance to the Kumeyaay people of San Diego. Specifically, the resource has significance as an important archaeological site due to its research potential, cultural significance to the Kumeyaay people, and archaeological significance of the deposit. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
NINA FAIN
Deputy City Attorney



MEMORANDUM TO RECORD

**Re: Archaeological Resources on a Lot on Roselle Street, San Diego, CA
7-14-09**

Proposed Project

Red Tail Monitoring & Research provided Native American Monitoring services for the Roselle Street Project. The Roselle Street Project consisted of a pedestrian survey of the property and research of past archaeological activity.

Red Tail Personnel and Monitoring Dates

Red Tail personnel: Clint Linton. Monitoring date was as follows:

Date of Monitoring	Monitor on Site
March 31, 2008	Clint Linton

Findings

This project is located on the Kumeyaay village site of Ystagua. The village site extends beyond the Roselle property area. Kumeyaay human remains have been previously discovered within the project boundaries. The likely hood of more human remains on site is very high.

Recommendations

All soils within the APE of this project need to be monitored to the satisfaction of all Native and Archaeological Monitors on site. Any excavation below the imported fill should be excavated by hand due to the presence of human remains. If human remains are encountered, water-screening should be implemented to ensure the highest possible amount of recovery.

The creation of a biological wetland habitat should not be implemented due to the extensive disturbance to the Kumeyaay cultural resources on site and human remains.

Please feel free to contact me with any questions or concerns.

Clint Linton

Red Tail

(760) 803-5694

P.O. Box 507 Santa Ysabel, CA 92070