

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

| DATE ISSUED: | June 11, 2010 | REPORT NO. HRB-10-025 |
|--------------|--|-----------------------|
| ATTENTION: | Historical Resources Board Agenda of June 24, 2010 | |
| SUBJECT: | ITEM #6 – 1010 Leroy Street | |
| APPLICANT: | Gregg and Heidi Morton, property owners Represented by Scott Moomjian, consultant | |
| LOCATION: | 1010 Leroy Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 | |
| DESCRIPTION: | Consider the designation of 1010 Leroy Street as a historical resource. | |
| | | |

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the house at 1010 Leroy Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board at the owner's request to have the house and site designated as a historical resource. The home at 1010 Leroy Street was built in 1949 by contractor Henry L. Wheeler for Doris Helen Tovrea. The house was constructed in the Tract Ranch style.



City Planning & Community Investment 202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865 Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott Moomjian, the consultant on behalf of the property owners, Gregg and Heidi Morton, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff disagrees with the determination that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The one-story Tract Ranch home was built in 1949. The home features a side gable roof with wide eave overhangs and exposed roof rafters. The wall cladding includes a variety of stucco and board and batten siding. An attached garage is located along the street facing façade (east elevation) and the garage door is adorned with wood molding in a diamond pattern. Other elements along the east elevation include a double multi-paned casement window with wood shutters and another double casement window flanked by two louvered windows. A wood window grille covers these windows. The main entrance to the home is also located along the east elevation and features a wood slated door in a zig-zag pattern.

Through the main entrance there is a central courtyard described in the historical report as a *corredor* – an open-air hallway. The original flooring (likely concrete) in the courtyard has been replaced with large tiles. The applicant's report compares this feature to designs by Cliff May in his article titled "Western Ranch Houses." The applicant also describes the home as a Modern Western Ranch rather than a Tract Ranch home. While the home does feature some elements described in May's article, no association can be made to May or another master architect or builder.

The San Diego Modernism Historic Context Statement (Modernism Context) identifies characterdefining features and provides evaluation criteria for Tract Ranch homes in San Diego. Primary character defining features include horizontal massing, low sloped gable roofs with deep overhangs, and homes are typically one-story. Secondary character-defining features include attached carports or garages, the use of traditional details emphasizing the street façade such as wood shutters, and the use of traditional building materials (wood shingle roofing, wood siding, brick, stucco, and stone). The Modernism Context also states due to the mass production of Tract Ranch homes following World War II, examples of the style are abundant and will gain their significance through a district context. In addition, the Modernism Context states candidates for individual listing may be associated with a master architect or builder. The Modernism Context states, "Although it is not anticipated that many examples of Tract Ranch architecture will be eligible for individual listing, it may be possible for some unique or distinguished examples of the style to be found significant as individual resources." The home at 1010 Leroy Street is not a unique or distinguished example of the Tract Ranch style and does not meet the evaluation criteria described in the Modernism Context. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended to not designate the house at 1010 Leroy Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criterion. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jennifer Hirsch Senior Planner

Cathy Furternol

Cathy Winterrowd Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

jh/cw

Attachment: Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover