

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	August 12, 2010	REPORT NO. HRB-10-038	
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of August 26, 2010		
SUBJECT:	ITEM #8 – 5007 Raymond Place		
APPLICANT:	Keith and Karen Hughes, property owners Represented by Rob Balentine, consultant		
LOCATION:	5007 Raymond Place, Normal Heights Community, Council District 3		
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the property loa as a historical resource.	cated at 5007 Raymond Place	

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 5007 Raymond Place under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. This two story single family residence was built in circa 1926 in the Craftsman style. The subject property is located in the Normal Heights Community, in a single family residential neighborhood.



ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Rob Balentine the consultant, on behalf of the property owners, Keith and Karen Hughes which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff disagrees with the determination that the site is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The house located at 5007 Raymond Place is a two story single family home constructed in c.1926 in the Craftsman style. The house contains character defining features of the Craftsman style although overtime there has been several alterations to the original design. A side facing gable roof tops the first floor, on the second story there is a hipped roof. The overhanging eaves are deep with exposed wood rafter tails and beams. A front facing gable roof tops the partial width front porch which is supported by tapered square columns decorated at the base with broken stone. The exterior finish of the house is horizontal redwood siding. The fenestration of the house is comprised of mostly wood framed doors and windows, several are non-historic. Windows are primarily double hung, with some fixed. To the north of the front door is a single pane wood window flanked by two narrow double hung windows. There are two chimneys which are covered with broken stone, the original chimney is located on the left side elevation (north) and the non-original chimney is located on the rear elevation (east). On the north elevation of the property there is a detached garage which also has similar features to the main structure with a gable roof and horizontal redwood siding. The main entrance is surrounded by an approximately 2ft high broken stone wall that wraps around the property.

Originally designed in c.1926, the home was asymmetrical with a rectangular shape. In 1955, there was a 2nd story bathroom addition, as well as a remodel to the kitchen. In 1962, a central heating system was installed. In 2004, a two story addition was added to the left side elevation (north) of the home (see attachment). The detailed scope of work is described as a first floor addition consisting of a large great room, laundry room and rear deck, with stairs adjoining a new exterior second floor deck. The second floor addition consists of a master bedroom with exterior balcony, a master bath and master dressing/walk-in closet. The prominent addition is highly visible and has compromised the integrity of the c.1926 building, clearly impacting the original Craftsman style design.

The specific modifications in 2004 which have affected the overall integrity of the structure are as follows:

Modifications to the left side elevation (north):

- A two story addition, added around 1,700 square feet to the left side of the structure altering the original Craftsman design.
- Installation of an additional wood burning fireplace and chimney.

- It appears that several original wood windows were replaced with non-historic wood windows.
- It appears several non-historic doors were added.

Additional modifications may have occurred to the front elevation (west). The covering of the chimney and front porch columns with broken stone appears to be contradictory to the c.1926 construction. Also, the 2ft stone wall added along the front sidewalk appears to compromise the original setting.

The modifications listed above are inconsistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation which states, "Designing a new addition so that its size and scale in relation to the historic building are out of proportion, thus diminishing the historic character." The Standards also states it does not recommend, "Using the same wall plane, roof line, cornice height, materials, siding lap or window type to make additions appear to be a part of the historic building." Alterations have negatively impacted the building's integrity as it relates to materials, workmanship, design, setting and feeling which are all significant aspects of integrity related to the c.1926 architectural Craftsman design. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation of 5007 Raymond Place under HRB Criterion C.

In addition to the identified loss of integrity, staff notes that the research report is not consistent with required guidelines. If the Historical Resources Board wishes to consider designation of the home at 5007 Raymond Place, staff recommends the report be returned to the applicant for revisions consistent with adopted guidelines.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

For designation under Criterion D, there is insufficient evidence to support the establishment of H. Arth Grigsby as a master builder or architect. According to Historical Resource Board (HRB) he is not recognized on the HRB master list. The discussion in the nomination with Zelda Detrich the previous owner from 1978-2003, does not provide enough information about H. Arth Grigsby for staff to establish him as a master.

In addition, the discussion with the previous owner does not provide enough information about the artist Ernest A. Batcheldor, for staff to associate the design of the interior fireplace with his work. Also, the brief statement in the report concerning the artist's well-known tile work and association in Southern California is lacking information for staff to establish this person as a master artist. Therefore staff does not recommend the property at 5007 Raymond Place under Criterion D for the reason that the information provided is inadequate.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 5007 Raymond Place should not be designated under any adopted HRB Criteria. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Terra King Planning Intern

Cathy Furternol

Cathy Winterrowd Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

TK/cw

Attachments: 1. 2004 Addition Site Plans 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover







SCALE 1/4"-1'-0"

FRONT ELEVATION (WEST)

NEW CONDITIONS

NEW CONDITIONS REAR ELEVATION (EAST)

SCALE 1/4"-1'-0"

86

DECORATIVE GLAZED TILE, 6' SQ. SIM. TO MALIBU POTTERY STAINED WOOD MANTLE STAINED WOOD BASE CABINETS TYPICAL. STAINED WOOD WALL CABINETS TYPICAL. SPIRAL STAIR BY "CARROLL METAL WORKS, INC.". CITY OF SAN DIEGO MASTER PLAN "IIO. STAINED WOOD TRIM TYPICAL. IV2' STYROFOAM INSUL. IN FURRED WALL. NEW FOOTINGS PER STRUCTURAL TYPICAL. BUILT-IN ENT. CENTER. DECORATIVE BEAMS. WOOD WINE STORAGE SHELVES.	94. 95. 96. 97. 98. 99. 100.	STAINED WOOD PANELING BY OWNER. WOOD BASE BY OWNER. 12' MARBLE TILE. WASHER & DRYER BY OWNER.
--	--	--

	BY	
T/13/04 (PLAN CHECK	RMB	
CORRECTIONS)	RMB	
CHANGES 8/6/04 3 CLARIFICATION	DHC	
C		
HODGES & HODGES ARCHITECTS 7777 Girard Av enue, Suite 203 La Jolla, California 92037 (858) 551-9225 fax (858) 551-9226		-
ES ARCHITEC e, Suite 203 92037 (858) 551-9226		
HIT 11-9	c	
RC te 2 7 7 55	hodges.com	
Sui Sui 203	ges.	
GE 92 8 (8 8 8	ŝpo	
DDG enue fax	lioh	
HODGES & HOI 7777 Girard Av e La Jolla, Californ (858) 551-9225 f	attp://www.studic	
S & ard Cal	S'M	
Gire JES Ja, 551	MM	
)DO() Jol (8)	//:d	
HC 177 (85 (85	btt	
Z		
\underline{O}		
	10	e e m
AL AL	021	gan Gai
ШО), CA 92116	~
S S S	U .	• •
	С С	
	Щ.	5.5
D D S I I S	Z	
HUGHES RESIDENCE ADDITION 5007 RAYMOND PLACE	SAN DIEGO, CA 92116	
HUG RES 50071	SAN DIEGC	
HUG RES 50071	SAN	
HUG RES 50071	SAN	
HUG RES 50071	SAN	
	SANE	
NEW CONDITIONS FRONT & REAR ELEVATIONS ELEVATIONS	SAN E SALE: AS NOTED	
	SCALE: AS NOTED	
NEW CONDITIONS FRONT & REAR ELEVATIONS	SCALE: AS NOTED	
REVERANCE ONDITIONS FRONT & REAR DONATO C HODGES C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856	SCALE: AS NOTED	
NEW CONDITIONS REVEAR BEARDING CONDITIONS FENERATIONS ELEVATIONS FENEWAL DATE 1-31-05	SCALE: AS NOTED	
REVERANCE ONDITIONS FRONT & REAR DONATO C HODGES C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856 C-10856	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SNOILIONS BERARD BENDARS C-10826 C-10826 C-10826 RENEWAL DATE C-10826 RENEWAL DATE C-10826 RENEWAL DATE C-10826	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SUDITIONS REVEAR BENERAL DATE I-31-05 CF CALIFO DRAWN RENEWAL DATE I-31-05 CF CALIFO DRAWN RENEWAL DATE	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SUDITIONS REVEAL DATE CENEED ARCH DONALD C HODGES C-10826 NENEWAL DATE C-10826 NENEWAL DATE C-10826 NENEWAL DATE C-10826 NENEWAL DATE C-10826 NENEWAL DATE	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SOULIONS RENEWAL DATE DONALD C HODGES C-10826 RENEWAL DATE 1-31-05 DF CALIFO DRAWN RENEWAL DATE 1-31-05 DF CALIFO DRAWN RENEWAL DATE 1-31-05	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SOULIONS SUULIONS SUULIONS SUULIONALD C HODDES C-10826 C-1086 C-1086 C-1086 C-1086 C-1086 C-1086 C-108	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SOULIONS SOULIONS SUULIA & LOUDINOS SUULIA & LOUDINOS SUULIA & LOUDINS SUULIA & SUULIA SUULIA & SUULIA & SUULIA & SUULIA SUULIA & SUULIA & SUULIA & SUULIA & SUULIA SUULIA & SUULIA & SUULIA & SUULIA & SUULIA & SUULIA & SUULIA SUULIA & SUULIA & SUULI	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SOULD AROUND AN A CONDITIONS AND A CONDITIONS AND A CONDITIONS AND A CHORES C-10826 A A A A A RENEWAL DATE 1-31-05 OF CALLED A	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SOULIDION SOULIDION SUCCED SUC	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SOULD AROUND AN A CONDITIONS AND A CONDITIONS AND A CONDITIONS AND A CHORES C-10826 A A A A A RENEWAL DATE 1-31-05 OF CALLED A	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SOULD AROUND AN A CONDITIONS AND A CONDITIONS AND A CONDITIONS AND A CHORES C-10826 A A A A A RENEWAL DATE 1-31-05 OF CALLED A	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SOULD AROUND AN A CONDITIONS AND A CONDITIONS AND A CONDITIONS AND A CHORES C-10826 A A A A A RENEWAL DATE 1-31-05 OF CALLED A	SCALE: AS NOTED	
SOULD AROUND AN A CONDITIONS AND A CONDITIONS AND A CONDITIONS AND A CHORES C-10826 A A A A A RENEWAL DATE 1-31-05 OF CALLED A	SCALE: AS NOTED	

