



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: April 14, 2011 REPORT NO. HRB-11-021

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of April 28, 2011

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – 7311 Eads Avenue**

APPLICANT: Mayo-Cotman Family Trust

LOCATION: 7311 Eads Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 7311 Eads Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 7311 Eads Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity. If the Board wishes to consider designation of the property under one or more HRB Criteria, the applicant's Historical Resource Research Report should be returned for additional analysis consistent with the Board's adopted research report and criteria guidelines.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a one-story single family home located in the J.G Burne's Addition to La Jolla Park, a residential area of La Jolla.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Danna Cotman, the owner and applicant, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion A. Staff does not concur that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion A or any other criteria, due to a lack of integrity. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The applicant's report and application recommends designation of the property at 7311 Eads Avenue under HRB Criterion A as a resource that embodies a special element of the City's historical and architectural development. The report does not provide much elaboration on this recommendation other than that the house is a classic example of Craftsman Bungalow style architecture and reflects the "Village Development Phase" of La Jolla from 1918-1929. There is no information to suggest that the house reflects a special element of Craftsman Bungalow architecture.

As to significance related to the "Village Development Phase (1918-1929)" of La Jolla, this term came from the 2001 Draft La Jolla Survey and was used to describe a period of La Jolla history that focused on improvements to La Jolla's infrastructure and expansion of its suburbs prior to the Great Depression. However, the estimated date of construction for this house is c.1910, as supported by the 1912 historic photo that includes the subject house. Therefore, evaluation within the context of the "Village Development Phase", referred to in the last draft as the "Village Development Era (1919-1929)" would not be appropriate. The applicable period identified in the draft survey would be the "Education and Cultural Development Era (1895-1918)", which related to development of stable housing and peripheral businesses, as well as the establishment of arts and education. The 2001 La Jolla survey remains draft, and the historic context, significant themes, and evaluation criteria have not been fully developed. Furthermore, the nomination does not provide research or analysis to demonstrate the significance of this theme and how the subject property reflects a special element of that theme. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The nomination notes that the house was owned and occupied by Thomas P. Low from 1921 until his death in 1938. Low was a Scottish football (soccer) player in the late 1800s who played for Scotland and later played in Canada and Pasadena before coming to San Diego and taking up golf. He was an accomplished golfer as well, and was active in many local organizations. The nomination does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion B. Staff would concur that Low does not appear to be a historically significant individual, and recommends against designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property at 7311 Eads Avenue was built c.1910 in the Craftsman Bungalow style and features wide, low-pitch cross gable roofs; asphalt shingles; overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails; wood clapboard siding over wood frame construction; and a rubble foundation. The house is set above the street and is accessed by a walkway leading to a centered, front gable covered porch supported on tapered columns and cobble piers. Fenestration consists of 6-over-1 and 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows and a solid wood entry door with four vertical beveled lites and original hardware. The original garage was been removed and replaced with a detached second unit over a multi-car garage at the rear of the lot, constructed sometime between 1971 and 1980.

Historic photographs provided in the report reveal that the house has been substantially modified since its original construction. Cobble and abalone shell were used extensively in the original design and construction. Cobble could be found at all four piers; along the base of the house at the foundation; at the walls and piers flanking the entry steps; and at the retaining wall along the street. Abalone can be seen as accent at the walls flanking the porch steps in the historic photographs. The cobble wall along the street was demolished and replaced with new retaining walls in 1977, as evidenced in the building permit history. The cobble walls and piers flanking the entry steps have been removed, and simple stucco piers now flank the steps at the top of the porch. The cobble at the pier located at the southeast corner of the porch has been covered with cement on all sides except the back. Other modifications include the addition of thick stucco to the tapered columns at the porch; the extension of the porch floor to the right of the gable under the trellis; removal and replacement of the entire porch floor (presumably when the porch floor was extended); addition of a non-historic cement finish at the base of the house to the left of the entry porch; removal of the scored concrete walkway and steps which have been replaced with stone; and the addition of a chimney with some decorative stonework just beyond the ridge line.

The modifications noted significantly altered the key character defining feature of this bungalow, i.e., the distinctive and extensive use of cobble and abalone shell. The modifications adversely impact integrity as it relates to design, workmanship, materials and feeling to the extent that the house is no longer eligible for designation under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the original Craftsman Bungalow design dating to c.1910. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The architect and builder of the subject property at 7311 Eads Avenue have not been identified. Therefore, the property is not eligible for listing under HRB Criterion D at this time.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that property located at 7311 Eads Avenue not be designated under any HRB Criteria due to lack of integrity. If the Board is inclined to designate the property under one or more HRB Criteria, the applicant's Historical Resource Research Report should be returned for additional analysis consistent with the Board's adopted research report and criteria guidelines. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

KS/cw

Attachment(s): Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover