



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: April 14, 2011 REPORT NO. HRB-11-023

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of April 28, 2011

SUBJECT: **ITEM # 10 – Lisbon and Margaret Durham/Thomas Shepherd House**

APPLICANT: Stephen and Phyllis Pfeiffer represented by Vonn Marie May

LOCATION: 364 Via Del Norte, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Lisbon and Margaret Durham/Thomas Shepherd House located at 364 Via Del Norte as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Lisbon and Margaret Durham/Thomas Shepherd House located at 364 Via Del Norte as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1948-1951 under HRB Criteria C and D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the California Ranch style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1948-1951 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a one-story structure with an L-shaped compound plan, a low-pitched hipped roof with boxed eaves, a covered outdoor loggia adorned by two decorative iron posts, wood framed double hung windows flanked by wooden shutters, sets of multi-light French doors, a floor to ceiling focal window with multi-lights, and a recessed front door with neo-colonial influences flanked by sidelights.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect, Thomas Shepherd and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is representative of Shepherd's California Ranch design and exhibits several of his unique master influences.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owners' desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The single-family residence is located in the La Jolla Hermosa Subdivision. The subdivision map was filed in October of 1923 making this area one of the earlier planned communities in San Diego.

The historic name of the resource, the Lisbon and Margaret Durham/Thomas Shepherd House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the original owners who had the home constructed as their personal residence and Thomas L. Shepherd the Master Architect who designed the home.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Vonn Marie May, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A, C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D, but not HRB Criterion A. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The applicant's report suggests that the property is significant under Criterion A, as an example of a transitional period of architectural development in the La Jolla Hermosa Subdivision. The applicant provides historical information on the development of the subdivision, but does not provide a clear analysis of how this resource contributes to the transition from the Community Development Era (1930-1945) to the Post-War Expansion Era (1946-1962). There is little to no discussion of the resource's eligibility under HRB Criterion A, particularly relating to how the resource reflects a special element that marked the beginning of the Post War Expansion Era that would be distinct from similar homes in the neighborhood with the same style and architectural period. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion A.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The home is significant under Criterion C due to the retention of character defining features of the California Ranch style and retains architectural integrity from its 1948-1951 period of significance. The building was constructed in 1948 and in 1951, Thomas Shepherd returned to design a small rear addition at the northwest corner. This addition measures 13'4" x 16' and encompasses the exterior brick chimney within the design, architectural plans for the original design and the 1951 addition are included in the nomination report.

The resource features a one-story, L-shaped floor plan with a stucco exterior and brick chimney. The hipped roof has a low pitch with boxed eaves and exhibits a variety of roof heights to provide light and views from each room. The recessed entry door has neo-colonial influences and is flanked by sidelights. To the east of the entry, is a double hung window flanked by wood shutters, and a projecting, bay window. To the west of the entry is a focal window, which is unique in that it encompasses a corner of the front façade, the window features floor to ceiling multi-lights. According to the nomination report, all exterior cladding, windows, shutters, doors, support columns, eaves and fireplace are original historic fabric and have been well maintained for over 60 years.

Located between the garage and main entrance, is a long covered loggia adorned by two decorative iron posts. This outdoor leisure area accesses four entries leading to the home or garage. Set apart from the typical postwar tract home, the design of the garage was carefully thought out to minimize the dominating effect of the typical front-facing garage. Shepherd's design allows the double car garage to be a secondary feature rather than dominating the front elevation.

Overtime, the resource has undergone minor modifications. The perimeter wall, which surrounds the entire property, is original; it appears that since the nomination report was submitted the wall was altered. The front columns were made taller, the light fixtures were replaced and it appears that the wrought iron gate was altered with an arched extension. Also, the original roof material was replaced in 2009 with a faux wood shingle. The home remains intact with a significant level of integrity from its date of construction with very few modifications. Therefore, Staff recommends designation under Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The resource is significant under Criterion D, as representative of a notable work by Master Architect Thomas Shepherd, who is recognized for his prominent involvement in the architectural design of several homes in La Jolla. Shepherd's California Ranch design is distinguished by his Anglo influences, different from the design of his former Hermosa cohort Cliff May.

Mr. Shepherd's prominence in La Jolla came from his ability to collaborate several style techniques developing a finished product that best represented each of his clients. His work can

be found in many La Jolla neighborhoods including the Barber Tract, the Country Club area and La Jolla Hermosa. He also designed structures in Rancho Santa Fe, Coronado, Mt. Helix and Orange County. Several of his La Jolla structures are historically designated by the City of San Diego, to name a few, HRB Site # 181-The Little Hotel by the Sea on Jenner Street; HRB Site # 230-The Parker Office Building on Girard Avenue; HRB Site # 514 the Mabel Scruggs residence on Vista Del Mar; HRB Site # 560-with Herbert Mann the Henry and May Turner House on Via Del Norte, and HRB Site # 849- the Cassuis and Kate Peck/Thomas Shepherd House also on Via Del Norte.

As the California Ranch style home is representative of Master Architect Thomas Shepherd's work in quality of design and detail, staff recommends designation of the Lisbon and Margaret Durham/Thomas Shepherd House under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS


If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Lisbon and Margaret Durham/Thomas Shepherd House located at 364 Via Del Norte be designated with a period of significance of 1948-1951 under HRB Criteria C and D, for the retention of character defining features of the California Ranch architectural style and the resource's association with Master Architect Thomas Shepherd. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Terra King
Planning Intern



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

TK/cw

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 4/28/2011

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 4/28/2011, to consider the historical designation of the **Lisbon and Margaret Durham/Thomas Shepherd House** (owned by Stephen M. and Phyllis K. Pfeiffer Living Trust, 364 Via del Norte, San Diego, CA 92037) located at **364 Via del Norte, San Diego, CA 92037**, APN: **357-022-05-00**, further described as BLK 9 LOT 7 ELY 20 FT MEAS AT R/A TO ELY LI LOT & ALL in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Lisbon and Margaret Durham/Thomas Shepherd House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the California Ranch style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1948-1951 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features of a one-story structure with an L-shaped compound plan, a low-pitched hipped roof with boxed eaves, a covered outdoor loggia adorned by two decorative iron posts, wood framed double hung windows flanked by wooden shutters, sets of multi-light French doors, a floor to ceiling focal window with multi-lights, and a recessed front door with neo-colonial influences flanked by sidelights. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Architect, Thomas Shepherd and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is representative of Shepherd's California Ranch design and exhibits several of his unique master influences. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
KEITH BAUERLE
Deputy City Attorney