

# Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	August 11, 2011	REPORT NO. HRB-11-051
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of August 25, 2011	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #6 – David O. Dryden Spec. House	e #1
APPLICANT:	Brian Daugherty and Cynthia Larson-Daugh	nerty
LOCATION:	3221 Homer Street, Peninsula Community,	Council District 2
DESCRIPTION:	Consider an amendment to the David O. Site #952) located at 3221 Homer Street HRB Criterion C.	

# STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Amend the designation of David O. Dryden Spec. House #1 located at 3221 Homer Street to include designation under HRB Criterion C with a period of significance of 1915. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1915 period of significance. Specifically, the house retains its medium pitch, side-gabled roof and exposed rafters; wood shingles; varying styles of wood framed windows including fixed, casement and double-hung; and a reconstructed covered porch consisting of a brick base, gable end with a decorative attic vent above the entry stair, exposed rafter tails and brackets, and groupings of three wood 4x4 inch posts.

# BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board to consider an amendment to the designation of HRB Site #952 located at 3221 Homer Street, in accordance with SDMC Section 123.0205. The historic name of the resource, the David O. Dryden Spec. House #1, was established with the prior designation action and does not require amendment as part of this action.

**Development Services Department** 1222 First Avenue, MS 512 • San Diego, CA 92101-4155 Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 446-5499 The subject property was designated by the Board on March 25, 2010 under Criterion D as the work of David O. Dryden, an established Master Builder. The Board did not designate the property under Criterion C at that time due to concerns that an entry porch may have been present historically and subsequently removed (Attachment 2).

Following the hearing, the property owners conducted additional research which included finding the family descendants of the original owners who had historic photographs of the house which show the Craftsman structure with the original Craftsman style front covered porch (Attachment 3). The owners came to the Design Assistance Subcommittee on August 4, 2010 for guidance on the reconstruction approach for the porch. They presented the Subcommittee members with the historic photos of the structure depicting the front porch still intact as well as evidence from the original Sanborn Maps which show a roof-covered porch area (Attachment 4). The Sanborns show the porch roof stopping short of the entire length of the front façade, however the historic photos show the porch roof possibly extending across the entire length of the front façade. The recommendations by DAS for the reconstruction were to construct the porch to the end of the wall and reassess the length during framing. DAS also recommended using true 4x4 inch posts to support the roof as well as revising the construction drawings to accurately show more shingles between the vent and the beam at the entryway to the porch (Attachment 5). The reconstruction of the Craftsman style covered porch has been completed and the owner is now requesting designation under Criterion C.

# ANALYSIS

Staff has prepared a Continuation Sheet Update to the original report that documents the house with the reconstructed front porch (Attachment 6). In light of the additional information and reconstructed porch, staff recommends that the property be designated under Criterion C as follows:

# CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property was built in 1915 as a two-story single family residence that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style. The house features a medium-pitch, side gable roof, exposed rafters, painted wood shingle siding, and a concrete foundation. The windows are wood frame and sash in double-hung, fixed, and casement operations with muntins. The windows have been replaced in-kind for the "Quieter Home Program" in compliance with the stipulations set forth by the Programmatic Agreement. The feature window on the primary façade is a tripartite window with a fixed unit at the center flanked by double-hung units on either side. The second-story windows are double-hung units that are not centered on the façade. The windows on the primary façade have fixed, painted wood shutters on each side. There is a brick chimney on the east side of the house. A porch is cut into the back corner of the building on the east façade. The south façade includes an early addition with a bay window that overlooks the backyard. A roof-deck is accessible from the second-story above the projected kitchen. There is a concrete sidewalk leading up to the primary façade and there is a combination of concrete and

brick paving in the backyard. A single-car garage and concrete driveway is present on the southeast corner of the property.

The property has undergone restoration consistent with the Secretary of The Interior's Standards to bring the structure back to its 1915 appearance. Much of the previous exterior alterations, including the non-historic horizontal siding along the lower half of the primary façade, have been removed and replaced with shakes that match the original. The Colonial-style molding and shutters have been removed and replaced by Craftsman-style molding.

The original Craftsman style covered porch on the front façade was removed at an unspecified date; however, the foundation of the porch remained and provided the basis for establishing the footprint of the porch. The owners have reconstructed the covered porch to match historic photos based on recommendations from DAS and consistent with the Standards. Due to deterioration and difficulty removing paint, the brick at the foundation of the porch was replaced in kind to match the existing. The gable roof end with a decorative vent located above the existing entry stair was reconstructed as well as the rafter tails and brackets, all of which are clearly visible in the historic photos. Groupings of three wood 4x4 inch posts support the porch roof. Although the Sanborn maps do not show a full-length covered porch, the photos appear to depict the porch roof extending across the full-length of the structure. It was for this reason that DAS recommended the porch roof be reconstructed the entire length of the front façade of the structure. The front porch has been completed and is a primary character-defining feature of the Craftsman style house.

As restored, the David O. Dryden Spec. House #1 retains integrity and embodies many distinctive characteristics of Craftsman-style architecture. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

# CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the designation of the David O. Dryden Spec. House #1 be amended to include designation under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Craftsman style architecture retaining integrity from its 1915 period of significance. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical

Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jeffrey E. Oakley Associate Planner

JO/ks/cw

Attachment(s): 1. Draft Resolution

- 2. HRB Minutes from March 25, 2010
- 3. Historic Photos
- 4. Sanborn Maps
- 5. DAS Minutes from August 4, 2010
- 6. DPR Continuation Sheet Update

Cathy Fritend

Cathy Winterrowd Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

#### RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 8/25/2011

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/25/2011, to consider an amendment to the historical designation of the **David O. Dryden Spec. House #1** (owned by Brian Daugherty and Cynthia Larson-Daugherty, 3221 Homer Street, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **3221 Homer Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92106**, APN: **450-336-01-00**, further described as Block 284, Lot 9 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property was designated on March 25, 2010 under Criterion D as the work of David O. Dryden, an established Master Builder and was added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 952**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

# NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its amendment of the designation of the David O. Dryden Spec. House #1 on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as it embodies distinctive characteristics of Craftsman style architecture through the retention of character defining features and retains architectural integrity from its period of significance, the construction date of 1915. Specifically, the house retains its medium pitch, side-gabled roof and exposed rafters; wood shingles; varying styles of wood framed windows including fixed, casement and double-hung; and a reconstructed covered porch consisting of a brick base, gable end with a decorative attic vent above the entry stair, exposed rafter tails and brackets, and groupings of three wood 4x4 inch posts. This finding is further supported by the staff report and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the amendment of the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as an amendment to Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 952.** 

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

JOHN LEMMO, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, CITY ATTORNEY

BY:

KEITH BAUERLE Deputy City Attorney

# CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF MARCH 25, 2010 202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12<sup>th</sup> FLOOR SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

# CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:10 PM

Chairpargon	John Lemmo	Present
Chairperson		
Vice Chairperson	Salvador Aréchiga	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Absent
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Gail Garbini	Present
Boardmember	Ann Jarmusch	Absent
Boardmember	Linda Marrone	Absent
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present
Staff to the Board in Attendance:	Shannon Anthony, Board Se Cathy Winterrowd, Principal	•
	<b>,</b> 1	
	Kelley Saunders, Senior Plan	
	Jennifer Hirsch, Senior Plan	
	Jeff Oakley, Associate Plann	er
Legal Counsel in Attendance:	Nina Fain, Deputy City Atto	rney

# ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR January 28, 2010 and February 26, 2010

# MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE JANUARY 28, 2010 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini Vote: 5-0-1 Motion Passes (Silvas)

# MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR ARÉCHIGA TO APPROVE THE FEBRUARY 26, 2010 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 5-0-1

**Motion Passes** 

(Berge)

# **ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

# **ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

# A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

# • ABSENCES

Boardmembers Jarmusch, Curry, Bethke, and Marrone have notified Staff that they cannot attend today's meeting.

# • OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION

- ✓ Applicant's request for continuance for Item 7 Johnson's Wilshire Gas Station
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

# • GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

None

# **B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

• CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Chair Lemmo declared a conflict of interest with Item  $5 - 2901 5^{\text{th}}$  Avenue.

• EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

• FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

# C. STAFF REPORT

- The adopted HRB policy on evaluation of Ranch Style architecture was repealed by the Board at its workshop on March 13, 2010. The Modernism Context Statement will be used in its place to evaluate Ranch style architecture.
- Staff is currently accepting nominations for the Board's annual historic preservation awards. Forms are located on the side table and can be accessed on our website at <u>www.sandiego.gov/historic</u>. The deadline for nominations is Friday, April 2, 2010. Please spend a minute and think of a project or person who deserves recognition for excellence in historic preservation. Awards will be presented at the May 27, 2010 HRB meeting.
- A Special Meeting of the Archaeology Subcommittee has been scheduled for Monday, March 29, 2010 at 4:00 PM.
- The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, May 5, 2010. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, April 12, 2010.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 2 referrals from Development Services; a CCDC development permit review; 3 individual homeowner nominations and the HRB Ad-Hoc Incentives Subcommittee. This agenda includes 1 continued item from November 2009. There are 40 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, 21 homeowner nominations in 2009, and 3 homeowner nominations in 2010 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 25, 2010 Page 3 of 6

• Those owners whose property was designated in 2009 or earlier are eligible to apply for a Mills Act agreement beginning in January 2010. Those applications are due no later than March 31, 2010 to be considered this year.

# **D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

Applicant has submitted a written request for a continuance for Item 7 – Johnson's Wilshire Gas Station

# **BOARD ACTION:**

# MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT A 30-DAY CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 7 – JOHNSON'S WILSHIRE GAS STATION AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

# ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 6 – STEPHEN B. AND FANNIE MARKS HOUSE HRB SITE#887 located at 1037 15<sup>th</sup> Street

- ITEM 8 PAGE MANOR/WALTER KELLER HOUSE located at 3580 Jennings Street
- ITEM 9 DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #1 located at 3221 Homer Street
- ITEM 10 –QUALITY BUILDING AND SECURITIES COMPANY SPECULATIVE HOUSE #1 located at 3036 Elliott Street

ITEM 11 – HRB AD-HOC INCENTIVES SUBCOMMITTEE

#### **Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge pulled Item 9 from the consent agenda.

#### BOARD ACTION:

# MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 6, 8, 10 AND 11 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

# **ACTION ITEMS**

# **ITEM 5 – 2901 5<sup>th</sup> AVENUE**

# **Continued from November 2009**

Applicant: Palm Properties LP represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 2901 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1269 7-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2901 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate 2901 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated March 12, 2010, Staff Memo dated November 6, 2009, HRB-08-028 and HRB 07-042

TRAILED FOR 30-DAYS DUE TO LACK OF A QUORUM

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 25, 2010 Page 4 of 6

# ITEM 6 – STEPHEN B. AND FANNIE MARKS HOUSE HRB SITE#887

Applicant: Raul Valderrama, Rachel Lucero and Rebecca Jones represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1037 15<sup>th</sup> Street, 92101, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (**1289 3-C**)

- <u>Description</u>: Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.
- <u>Today's Action</u>: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to designated historical resources.
- <u>Staff Recommendation</u>: The Historical Resources Board recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit related to the designated historical resource as presented.

Report Number: HRB-10-006

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

# ITEM 7 – JOHNSON'S WILSHIRE GAS STATION

<u>Applicant</u>: Sabah Y. Toma, Janan T. Toma, Latif C. Marogy and Faiza M. Marogy represented by Archaeos <u>Location</u>: 4689 Market Street, 92102, Encanto Neighborhoods Community, Council District 4 (**1289 3-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4689 Market Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate Johnson's Wilshire Gas Station located at 4689 Market Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1962 under HRB Criterion C. The recent convenience store building is excluded from the designation.

Report Number: HRB-10-012

CONTINUED FOR 30-DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

# ITEM 8 – PAGE MANOR/WALTER KELLER HOUSE

Applicant: Courtier Escalante Revocable Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 3580 Jennings Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 3-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3580 Jennings Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Page Manor/Walter Keller House located at 3580 Jennings Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1910 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-10-013

# ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

# ITEM 9 -DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #1

Applicant: Cynthia & Brian Daugherty

Location: 3221 Homer Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3221 Homer Street as a historical resource.

- <u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.
- <u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the David O. Dryden Spec. House #1 located at 3221 Homer Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1915 under HRB Criterion C and Criterion D.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 25, 2010 Page 5 of 6

#### Report Number: HRB-10-014

Staff Report by Jeff Oakley

# **Testimony Received:**

In Favor: David Marshall

In Opposition: None

# **Board Discussion:**

- Boardmember Berge would like a physical copy of the Notice of Completion to be included in the file; it was referenced but not included in the report. She would have liked to have seen the photos of the Dryden two-story houses in Valley Vista that were referenced in the Covington journal article; it was not clear if they were included or not. A two-story building is notable for Dryden; she doesn't question Criterion D. Feels there needs more documentation and information for Criterion C, particularly as it relates to a potential front porch.
- Boardmember Garbini questions the building's integrity; flat front looks like it is missing something. Side of the building has a real pretty design look, but the front doesn't look completed. Questions what was there originally and the box beam on the front.
- Vice-Chair Aréchiga wants to how they are going to take care of the brick on the porch and if there was a covered porch originally. He has seen both covered and open front porches on two-story homes.

# **BOARD ACTION:**

# MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #1 UNDER CRITERION D PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

# MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #1 UNDER CRITERION C PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 4-2-0

Motion Fails

(Berge, Garbini)

# ITEM 10 – QUALITY BUILDING AND SECURITIES COMPANY SPECULATIVE HOUSE #1

Applicant: Delaine Davis represented by Johnson & Johnson Architecture

Location: 3036 Elliott Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1268 7-D)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3036 Elliott Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Quality Building and Securities Company Speculative House #1 located at 3036 Elliott Street as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-10-015

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

# ITEM 11 - HRB AD-HOC INCENTIVES SUBCOMMITTEE

<u>Applicant</u>: HRB Policy Subcommittee and CPCI Department <u>Location</u>: N/A <u>Description</u>: Consider dissolving the Ad-Hoc Incentives Subcommittee <u>Today's Action</u>: Dissolve the Ad-Hoc Incentives Subcommittee, or do not dissolve the Ad-Hoc Incentives Subcommittee and return the item to the Policy Subcommittee with comments. <u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Dissolve the Ad-Hoc Incentives Subcommittee and refer three priority items, the Preservation Fund, Land Development Code revisions, and Transfer of Development Rights program, to

the Policy Subcommittee for completion.

Report Number: Staff Memo dated March 16, 2010 and HRB-10-011

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

# **REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: LOCATION:**

Thursday, April 22, 2010 City Administration Building 12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 1:46 PM** 



Photo 1: ca. 1930



Photo 2: 1954



Photo 3: 1925



Photo 4: 1926



Photo 5: 1922



Photo 6: 1924

# CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

# DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE

Wednesday, August 4, 2010, at 4:00 PM 12th Floor Conference Room 12B City Administration Building 202 C Street, San Diego, CA

# **MEETING NOTES**

# 1. ATTENDANCE

Subcommittee Members	Alex Bethke (Chair); Gail Garbini; Ann Jarmusch
Recusals	None
City Staff	
HRB	Kelley Stanco; Jeffrey Oakley; Terra King; Kiley
	Wallace
City Attorney	Nina Fain
Guests	
Item 3A	None
Item 3B	David Marshall and Elizabeth Hammack, Heritage
	Architecture & Planning; Brian Daugherty; Cindy
	Larson
Other	Bruce Coons, SOHO

- 2. Public Comment (on matters not on the agenda)
- 3. Project Reviews

# • <u>ITEM 3A</u>:

Listings: HRB Site #960 Address: 1288 Silverado Street Historic Name: Henry L. Hier Spec House #1 Significance: HRB Criterion C (Architecture) Mills Act Status: No Contract PTS #: 209855 Project Contact: Brandy Dewhurst and Ione Stiegler, IS Architecture; on behalf of the owners, Michael and Deborah Lancaster <u>Treatment</u>: Rehabilitation Project Scope: This rehabilitation project proposes to construct a 690 square ftoot addition at the rear of the house starting 18'-0" back from the front facade; and a secondstory addition of 789 square feet that begins 18'-0" back from the front facade. The lot constraints complicates the siting of the addition. <u>Existing Square Feet</u>: 1,049 <u>Additional Square Feet</u>: 1,472 <u>Total Proposed Square Feet</u>: 2,521 Prior DAS Review: N/A

#### \*\*\*\* THIS ITEM WAS NOT HEARD \*\*\*\*

# • <u>ITEM 3B</u>:

Listings: HRB Site #952 Address: 3221 Homer Street Historic Name: David O. Dryden Spec. House #1 Significance: HRB Criterion D (Master Architect) Mills Act Status: No Contract PTS #: N/A Project Contact: Elizabeth Hammack and David Marshall, Heritage Architecture & Planning; on behalf of the owners, Cindy and David Larson **Treatment: Restoration** Project Scope: This restoration project consists of reconstructing the missing front porch of the Craftsman style residence at 3221 Homer Street. The work is the final step in restoring the residence to its original appearance. The proposed design is based on physical investigations of the existing resource and historic photographic evidence. The proposed design calls for the repair and stabilization of the existing porch walls. The missing porch columns and roof will be constructed as close to the original design as possible. Prior work by the owner includes facade restoration to remove inappropriate Federal style details, uncovering the original wood shingle siding, and selecting a historically appropriate paint. Existing Square Feet: N/A Additional Square Feet: 0 Total Proposed Square Feet: N/A Prior DAS Review: N/A

<u>Staff Presentation</u>: This restoration project consists of reconstructing the missing front porch of a designated historic resource. The reconstruction will be based on available historic photographs. Staff and the applicant are seeking DAS comment on the reconstruction approach and consistency with the Standards.

<u>Applicant Presentation</u>: The house was designated as the work of Master Builder David Dryden. Non-historic Federal style elements were introduced and have since removed. The shingle siding has been restored. The current owners have contact prior owners and obtained historic that show the original porch. The applicant believes the porch was removed in the mid 1950's. The historic photos show porch from almost every angle. The ground level of the porch is original and intact, with the exception of stucco applied over the brick. The stucco can be removed, or minimally painted red. A gable end with decorative vent was located above entry stair. Rafter tails and brackets are visible in the photos and will be reconstructed. Groupings of three wood posts support the porch. The only remaining issue in question is whether the porch roof extended across the entire façade, or stopped a few feet short. The Sanborns show the roof stopping short, but the photos seem to show it extending across. Either scenario is possible. Architecturally is may make sense for it to stop short so that it does not bisect the house. However, one photo seems to show porch extending to the end. The applicants intend to complete the restoration and return to the Board to confirm designation.

# Public Comment:

Name	Comments
Coons	Appears to be one more row of shingles between vent
	and beam on the porch than shown on the plans. Posts
	should be true 4" square posts. Did the applicant look at
	the upstairs windows to see if they were multi-lite or 1-
	over-1? Also, it appears rafter tails at upper floor were
	exposed.

# <u>Q&A</u>:

Subcommittee-member Issue or Question	Applicant's Response
Any other Dryden house like this?	No.
Will the rafter tails at upper floor be re-	Trying to address porch at this point
exposed?	and address rafter tails at upper floor
	at a later date as part of a Mills Act
	agreement.
How did you determine it was three posts	Based on configuration of porch floor
and not four?	and the oblique angles of some photos
	which would have shown fourth post.
Is it possible to do a photo rendering to	Possible through photo rendering, but
recreate historic photo and determine porch	expensive. Could also do story poles.
roof width?	
Could we agree that the exact point of	Won't make or break, but we should
where the porch ends is not critical?	come to a consensus.
Would applicant prefer to construct short or	Could plan to construct to end of the
long? Which would be easier to correct in	wall and change during framing if
the construction phase?	needed.

Subcommittee Discussion and Comment:

Subcommittee-member	Comments
Jarmusch	Research has been excellent. Thinks length of porch is
	critical and believes it went to the end of the wall.
Garbini	Believes the porch roof went to the end of the wall.
Bethke	Complete work according to Sanborn, which is the best
	we know; and if it is short by 2 feet, then that's not the

Subcommittee-member	Comments
	end of the world. Agrees that true 4x4 should be used
	and that there are more shingles between the vent and the
	beam. Proceed with the roof as drawn (stopping short).

Staff Comment:

Staff Member	Comments
Oakley	Shadow effect in photo of little girl and the geraniums
	shows that it went to the end. (General agreement
	between most people that that is the case.)

<u>Recommended Modifications</u>: Construct the porch to end of the wall and reassess during framing. Modify the porch if necessary during construction. True 4x4 posts should be used at the porch and the drawings must be revised to accurately show more shingles between the vent and the beam.

Consensus:

Consistent with the Standards

Consistent with the Standards if modified as noted

Inconsistent with the Standards and needs revision and additional review

Inconsistent with the Standards but is the best feasible alternative

Inconsistent with the Standards

4. Adjourned at 4:50 PM

The next regularly-scheduled Subcommittee Meeting will be on September 1, 2010 at 4:00 PM.

For more information, please contact Kelley Stanco at KStanco@sandiego.gov or 619.236.6545

State of California — The Resourd DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND R		Primary # HRI#
<b>CONTINUATION SHE</b>	ET	Trinomial
Dama i af i	*Deserves News and (A. 1. 1)	

Page 1 of 1

\*Resource Name or # (Assigned by recorder) David O. Dryden Spec. House #1

\*a. County: San Diego

\*Recorded by: Jeffrey E. Oakley, Assoc. Planner, City of San Diego \*Date: 08/25/2011 □ Continuation

#### \*P2. Location: I Not for Publication I Unrestricted

and (P2b and P2c or P2d. Attach a Location Map as necessary.)

c. Address: 3221 Homer Street

City: San Diego Zip: 92106 e. Other Locational Data: (e.g., parcel #, directions to resource, elevation, etc., as appropriate) Elevation: APN 450-336-0100

\*P3a. Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)

The original Craftsman style covered porch on the front facade was removed at an unspecified date; however, the foundation of the porch remained and provided the basis for establishing the footprint of the porch. The owners have reconstructed the covered porch to match historic photos based on recommendations from DAS and consistent with the standards. Due to deterioration and difficulty removing paint, the brick at the foundation of the porch was replaced in kind to match the existing. The gable roof end with a decorative vent located above the existing entry stair was reconstructed as well as the rafter tails and brackets, all of which are clearly visible in the historic photos. Groupings of three wood 4x4 inch posts support the porch roof. Although the Sanborn maps do not show a full-length covered porch, the photos appear to depict the porch roof extending across the full-length of the structure. It was for this reason that DAS recommended the porch roof be reconstructed the entire length of the front facade of the structure. The front porch has been completed and is a primary character-defining feature of the craftsman style house.



#### B1. Historic Name: David O. Drvden Spec. House #1

B6. Construction History: (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations)

The reconstructed Craftsman style covered porch on the front façade of the house was submitted for a construction permit to the Development Services Department (PTS #219897) and was approved on September 21, 2010 by the Historical Resources staff. A construction change to this approved construction permit was submitted for review (PTS #232245) and was also approved on March 7, 2011 by the Historical Resources staff. The reconstruction was based on historic photos under the direction of staff and DAS.

#### **B9a.** Architect:

B10. Significance: Theme: Architecture

Applicable Criteria: C

Period of Significance: 1915 (Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as defined by theme, period, and geographic scope. Also address integrity.)

The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as it embodies distinctive characteristics of Craftsman style architecture through the retention of character defining features and retains architectural integrity from its period of significance, the construction date of 1915. Specifically, the house retains its medium pitch, side-gabled roof and exposed rafters; wood shingles; varying styles of wood framed windows including fixed, casement and double-hung; and a reconstructed covered porch consisting of a brick base, gable end with a decorative attic vent above the entry stair, exposed rafter tails and brackets. and groupings of three wood 4x4 inch posts.

P5b. Description of Photo: (View, date, accession #)

Looking South 7/8/2011

\*P6. Date Constructed/Age and Sources X Historic DPrehistoric DBoth

**X** Update

Date of Construction: 1915 Source: Notice of Completion

#### \*P7. Owner and Address:

Brian Daugherty & Cynthia Larson-Daugherty 3221 Homer Street San Diego, CA. 92106

\*P11. Report Citation: (Cite survey report and other sources, or enter "none.")

David O. Dryden Spec. House #1 Heritage Architecture & Planning February 10, 2010